

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

JACKSON NATIONAL LIFE  
INSURANCE COMPANY,

Plaintiff,

v.

BI BI LIM, *et al.*,

Defendants.

Case No. 1:23-cv-00442-CDB

**SCHEDULING ORDER** (Fed. R. Civ. P. 16)

Discovery Deadlines:

- Amend Pleadings: April 26, 2024
- Expert Disclosures: November 22, 2024
- Rebuttal Expert Disclosures: December 13, 2024
- Fact Discovery: October 25, 2024
- Expert Discovery: January 24, 2025
- Mid-Discovery Status Conference: August 29, 2024, at 10:00 a.m., in Bakersfield Federal Courthouse 510 19<sup>th</sup> Street, Bakersfield, CA 93301

Non-Dispositive Motion Deadlines:

- Filing: February 7, 2025
- Hearing: March 11, 2025, at 10:30 a.m., in Bakersfield Federal Courthouse

Dispositive Motion Deadlines:

- Filing: March 24, 2025
- Hearing: May 7, 2025, at 1:30 p.m., in Bakersfield Federal Courthouse

Pre-Trial Conference: June 20, 2025, at 10:30 a.m., in Bakersfield Federal Courthouse

Trial: August 11, 2025, at 8:30 a.m., in Bakersfield Federal Courthouse

1 On March 23, 2023, Plaintiff Jackson National Life Insurance Company (“Plaintiff”) initiated  
2 this action with the filing of a complaint in interpleader. (Doc. 1). Plaintiff filed a motion for leave to  
3 deposit proceeds for attorney fees and costs for discharge from liability and for dismissal with  
4 prejudice on October 6, 2023. (Doc. 33). On February 15, 2024, Plaintiff deposited the interpleader  
5 funds into the Court registry. *See* (Doc.).

6 On February 21, 2024, the Court issued an order granting in part and denying in part Plaintiff’s  
7 motion. (Doc. 45). The Court enjoined and restrained Defendants from instituting or prosecuting  
8 further any proceeding in any state or United States court, including this Court, either at law or in  
9 equity against Plaintiff regarding the life insurance proceeds underlying this action, until further order  
10 from the Court. *Id.* at 10-11. The Court discharged Plaintiff from further liability under 28 U.S.C. §  
11 2361, granted Plaintiff’s request for costs, and dismissed Plaintiff from this action without prejudice.  
12 *Id.* at 11.

13 On February 23, 2024, the parties convened via Zoom videoconference for a scheduling  
14 conference before Magistrate Judge Christopher D. Baker. Kevin Hatanian appeared on behalf of  
15 Defendants Bi Bi Lim, Winston Lim, Celestine Lim, Venancio Lim, Willie Lim, and Peterson Lim.<sup>1</sup>  
16 Justin L. Thomas appeared on behalf of Defendants Kyi Aung and Crystal Aung.

17 **I. Pleading Amendment**

18 Any motions to amend the pleadings must be filed by **April 26, 2024**. The parties should not  
19 construe a timely filing of a motion or stipulation requesting leave to amend the pleadings to  
20 necessarily constitute good cause to modify the existing schedule, if necessary. All proposed  
21 amendments must (A) be supported by good cause pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 16(b) if the amendment  
22 requires any modification to the existing schedule, *see Johnson v. Mammoth Recreations, Inc.*, 975  
23 F.2d 604, 609 (9th Cir. 1992), and (B) establish, under Fed. R. Civ. P. 15(a), that such an amendment  
24 is not (1) prejudicial to the opposing party, (2) the product of undue delay, (3) proposed in bad faith, or  
25 (4) futile. *See Foman v. Davis*, 371 U.S. 178, 182 (1962).

26  
27  
28 

---

<sup>1</sup> On June 16, 2023, Plaintiff filed a notice of suggestion of death as to Defendant Winston  
Lim. (Doc. 17). On February 21, 2024, the Court directed the parties to file any notice of suggestion  
of Defendant Winston Lim’s death with the proper service of notice. (Doc. 46).

1 **II. Discovery Plan and Cut-Off Date**

2 The parties are ordered to complete all discovery pertaining to non-experts on or before  
3 **October 25, 2024**, and all discovery pertaining to experts on or before **January 24, 2025**.

4 The parties are directed to disclose all expert witnesses, in writing, on or before **November 22,**  
5 **2024**, and to disclose all rebuttal experts on or before **December 13, 2024**. The written designation of  
6 retained and non-retained experts shall be made pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. Rule 26(a)(2), (A), (B),  
7 and (C) and shall include all information required thereunder. Failure to designate experts in  
8 compliance with this order may result in the Court excluding the testimony or other evidence offered  
9 through such experts that are not disclosed pursuant to this order.

10 The provisions of Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(b)(4) and (5) shall apply to all discovery relating to  
11 experts and their opinions. Experts must be fully prepared to be examined on all subjects and opinions  
12 included in the designation. Failure to comply may result in the imposition of sanctions, which may  
13 include striking the expert designation and preclusion of expert testimony.

14 The provisions of Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(e) regarding a party's duty to timely supplement  
15 disclosures and responses to discovery requests will be strictly enforced.

16 A mid-discovery status conference is scheduled for **August 29, 2024**, at 10:00 a.m. before  
17 Magistrate Judge Christopher D. Baker. Counsel SHALL file a joint mid-discovery status conference  
18 report no later than **one week before the conference**. Counsel also SHALL lodge the status report via  
19 e-mail to CDBorders@caed.uscourts.gov. The joint status report SHALL outline the discovery  
20 counsel have completed and that which needs to be completed as well as any impediments to  
21 completing the discovery within the deadlines set forth in this order. Counsel SHALL discuss  
22 settlement and certify in the joint status report (1) that they have met/conferred regarding settlement,  
23 and (2) proposed dates for convening a settlement conference with an unassigned magistrate judge.

24 **III. Pre-Trial Motion Schedule / Informal Discovery Dispute Conferences**

25 All non-dispositive pre-trial motions, including any discovery motions, shall be filed by  
26  
27  
28

1 **February 7, 2025<sup>2</sup>** and heard on or before **March 11, 2025**. For these hearings and at the direction of  
2 the Courtroom Deputy Clerk, the Court may direct counsel to appear remotely (via Zoom). For  
3 hearings noticed to occur in-person, the Court may permit counsel to appear remotely (via Zoom)  
4 provided the Courtroom Deputy Clerk receives a written notice of the request to appear remotely no  
5 later than five court days before the noticed hearing date.

6 No motion to amend or stipulation to amend the case schedule will be entertained unless it is  
7 filed at least three days before the first deadline the parties wish to extend.

8 No written discovery motions shall be filed without the prior approval of Judge Baker. A party  
9 with a discovery dispute must first confer with the opposing party in a good faith effort to resolve by  
10 agreement the issues in dispute. If that good faith effort is unsuccessful, the requesting party promptly  
11 shall seek a conference with all involved parties and Judge Baker. To schedule this conference, the  
12 parties should contact the Courtroom Deputy Clerk, Susan Hall, at (661) 326-6620 or via email at  
13 SHall@caed.uscourts.gov. At least two days before the conference, counsel SHALL file a joint,  
14 informal letter brief detailing each party's position. Each party's narrative shall not exceed three  
15 pages, excluding exhibits. At the commencement of the conference, if the parties jointly agree to  
16 Judge Baker's consideration and resolution of the discovery disputes outside the formal Local Rule  
17 251 procedures, the Court will entertain arguments by the parties and issue a ruling. If the parties do  
18 not jointly agree to the informal discovery dispute resolution procedures set forth herein, the  
19 requesting party may then seek relief through motion to compel. Counsel must comply with Local  
20 Rule 251 with respect to discovery disputes or the motion will be denied without prejudice and  
21 dropped from the Court's calendar.

22 All dispositive pre-trial motions shall be filed no later than **March 24, 2025**, and heard on or  
23 before **May 7, 2025**. Motions are heard before Judge Baker at 10:30 a.m., at the United States District  
24 Courthouse, 510 19th Street, Bakersfield, CA.

---

27  
28 <sup>2</sup> Non-dispositive motions related to non-expert discovery SHALL be filed within a reasonable  
time of discovery of the dispute, but in no event later than 30 days after the expiration of the non-expert  
discovery deadline.

1 **IV. Motions for Summary Judgment or Summary Adjudication**

2 At least 21 days before filing a motion for summary judgment or motion for summary  
3 adjudication, the parties SHALL meet, in person or by telephone, to confer about the issues to be  
4 raised in the motion.

5 The purpose of the meeting shall be to: 1) avoid filing motions for summary judgment where a  
6 question of fact exists; 2) determine whether the respondent agrees that the motion has merit in whole  
7 or in part; 3) discuss whether issues can be resolved without the necessity of briefing; 4) narrow the  
8 issues for review by the court; 5) explore the possibility of settlement before the parties incur the  
9 expense of briefing a motion; and 6) to develop a joint statement of undisputed facts.

10 The moving party SHALL initiate the meeting and SHALL provide a complete, proposed  
11 statement of undisputed facts **at least five days before** the conference. The finalized joint statement  
12 of undisputed facts SHALL include all facts that the parties agree, for purposes of the motion, may be  
13 deemed true. In addition to the requirements of Local Rule 260, the moving party shall file the joint  
14 statement of undisputed facts.

15 In the notice of motion, the moving party SHALL certify that the parties have met and  
16 conferred as ordered above, or set forth a statement of good cause for the failure to meet and confer.  
17 Failure to comply may result in the motion being stricken.

18 **V. Pre-Trial Conference**

19 **June 20, 2025**, at 10:30 a.m., located at the United States District Courthouse, 510 19<sup>th</sup> Street,  
20 Bakersfield, CA, before Judge Baker.

21 The parties are ordered to file a Joint Pretrial Statement pursuant to Local Rule 281(a)(2). The  
22 parties are further directed to submit a digital copy of their pretrial statement in Word format, directly  
23 to Judge Baker's chambers, by email at [CDBorders@caed.uscourts.gov](mailto:CDBorders@caed.uscourts.gov).

24 Counsels' attention is directed to Rules 281 and 282 of the Local Rules for the Eastern District  
25 of California, as to the obligations of counsel in preparing for the pre-trial conference. The Court will  
26 insist upon strict compliance with those rules. In addition to the matters set forth in the Local Rules,  
27 the Joint Pretrial Statement shall include a Joint Statement of the case to be used by the Court to  
28 explain the nature of the case to the jury during voir dire.

1 **VI. Trial Date**

2 **August 11, 2025**, at 8:30 a.m., located at the United States District Courthouse, 510 19th  
3 Street, Bakersfield, CA, before Judge Baker.

4 A. This is a jury trial.

5 B. Counsels' Estimate of Trial Time: 3 days

6 C. Counsels' attention is directed to Local Rules of Practice for the Eastern District of  
7 California, Rule 285.

8 **VII. Settlement Conference**

9 The parties SHALL meet and confer and notify the Court prior to the Pre-Trial Conference  
10 whether they wish to convene a Settlement Conference. In the event the parties request a Settlement  
11 Conference, unless otherwise permitted in advance by the Court, the attorneys who will try the case  
12 shall appear at the settlement conference **with the parties** and the person or persons having full  
13 authority to negotiate and settle the case on any terms<sup>3</sup> at the conference. Consideration of settlement  
14 is a serious matter that requires preparation prior to the settlement conference. Set forth below are the  
15 procedures the Court will employ, absent good cause, in conducting the conference.

16 At least twenty-one days before the settlement conference, Plaintiff SHALL submit to  
17 Defendant via fax or e-mail, a written itemization of damages and a meaningful<sup>4</sup> settlement demand  
18 which includes a brief explanation of why such a settlement is appropriate. Thereafter, no later than  
19 fourteen days before the settlement conference, Defendant SHALL respond, via fax or e-mail, with an  
20 acceptance of the offer or with a meaningful counteroffer which includes a brief explanation of why  
21 such a settlement is appropriate.

22  
23 \_\_\_\_\_  
24 <sup>3</sup> Insurance carriers, business organizations, and governmental bodies or agencies whose settlement  
25 agreements are subject to approval by legislative bodies, executive committees, boards of directors or the like  
26 shall be represented by a person or persons who occupy high executive positions in the party organization and  
who will be directly involved in the process of approval of any settlement offers or agreements. To the extent  
possible, the representative shall have authority, if he or she deems it appropriate, to settle the action on terms  
consistent with the opposing party's most recent demand.

27 <sup>4</sup> "Meaningful" means the offer is reasonably calculated to settle the case on terms acceptable to the  
28 offering party. "Meaningful" does not include an offer which the offering party knows will not be acceptable to  
the other party. If, however, the offering party is only willing to offer a settlement which it knows the other party  
will not accept, this should trigger a recognition the case is not in a settlement posture and the parties should  
confer about continuing or vacating the settlement conference via stipulation.

1 If settlement is not achieved, each party SHALL attach copies of their settlement offers to their  
2 Confidential Settlement Conference Statement, as described below. Copies of these documents shall  
3 not be filed on the court docket.

4 CONFIDENTIAL SETTLEMENT CONFERENCE STATEMENT

5 At least five court days prior to the settlement conference, the parties shall submit a  
6 Confidential Settlement Conference Statement via email directly to the chambers of the unassigned  
7 magistrate judge referred to the settlement conference. The statement should not be filed with the  
8 Clerk of the Court nor served on any other party, although the parties may file a Notice of Lodging of  
9 Settlement Conference Statement. Each statement shall be clearly marked "confidential" with the date  
10 and time of the settlement conference indicated prominently thereon.

11 The Confidential Settlement Conference Statement shall include the following:

- 12 A. A brief statement of the facts of the case.
- 13 B. A brief statement of the claims and defenses, i.e., statutory or other grounds upon  
14 which the claims are founded; a forthright evaluation of the parties' likelihood of prevailing on the  
15 claims and defenses; and a description of the major issues in dispute.
- 16 C. A summary of the proceedings to date.
- 17 D. An estimate of the cost and time to be expended for further discovery, pretrial and trial.
- 18 E. The relief sought.
- 19 F. The party's position on settlement, including present demands and offers and a history  
20 of past settlement discussions, offers and demands.

21 **VIII. Request for Bifurcation, Appointment of Special Master, or other Techniques to Shorten**  
22 **Trial**

23 None.

24 **IX. Related Matters Pending**

25 There are no pending related matters.  
26  
27  
28

1 **X. Compliance with Federal Procedure**

2 All counsel are expected to familiarize themselves with the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure  
3 and the Local Rules of the Eastern District of California, and to keep abreast of any amendments  
4 thereto. The Court requires compliance with these Rules to efficiently handle its increasing case load.

5 **XI. Effect of this Order**

6 The foregoing order represents the best estimate of the court and counsel as to the agenda most  
7 suitable to dispose of this case. The trial date reserved is specifically reserved for this case. If the  
8 parties determine at any time that the schedule outlined in this order cannot be met, counsel are  
9 ordered to notify the court immediately of that fact so that adjustments may be made, either by  
10 stipulation or by subsequent status conference.

11 **The dates set in this Order are considered to be firm and will not be modified absent a**  
12 **showing of good cause even if the request to modify is made by stipulation. Stipulations**  
13 **extending the deadlines contained herein will not be considered unless they are accompanied by**  
14 **affidavits or declarations, and where appropriate attached exhibits, which establish good cause**  
15 **for granting the relief requested.**

16 **Failure to comply with this order may result in the imposition of sanctions.**

17 IT IS SO ORDERED.

18 Dated: February 23, 2024

19   
20 UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE