

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

CHARLES D. RIEL,

Petitioner,

No. CIV S-01-0507 LKK KJM

vs.

DEATH PENALTY CASE

ROBERT L. AYERS, Jr.,
Warden of San Quentin
State Prison,

Respondent.

ORDER

_____/

Petitioner’s motion for a supplemental protective order came on for hearing August 5, 2009 before the undersigned. Joan Fisher appeared for petitioner. Bob Bacon participated telephonically for petitioner. Paul Bernardino and Heather Gimle appeared for respondent. Petitioner seeks a supplemental protective order for documents to be produced from his trial counsel’s files. Petitioner has provided a proposed order. Respondent accepts many aspects of the proposed protective order but objects primarily to the requirement that he provide petitioner’s counsel with a recording of any interview he conducts with members of petitioner’s trial defense team. Respondent provided a redlined version of petitioner’s proposed order and on August 4, 2009 filed an amended, redlined version.

////

1 After considering the parties' submissions and arguments made during the August
2 5 hearing, and good cause appearing, the undersigned finds the protective order set forth below
3 appropriate at this time for documents and information produced to respondent from petitioner's
4 trial counsel's files. Recognizing that respondent may have a work product interest in questions
5 asked during his counsel's interviews with members of petitioner's trial defense team,
6 respondent will be permitted to submit an in camera request to protect specific portions of his
7 counsel's interviews. Further, petitioner shall use the recordings of respondent's counsel's
8 interviews of the trial defense team only for purposes of protecting his attorney/client privilege.
9 Petitioner may not use those interviews for the purpose of questioning trial defense team
10 members or any other individuals during any interviews or depositions or during the evidentiary
11 hearing.

12 With respect to other issues raised by respondent regarding petitioner's proposed
13 supplemental protective order:

14 1. In paragraph 4(c), petitioner originally objected to respondent's suggestion that
15 he be permitted to show documents from trial counsel's files to members of the trial defense
16 team or other deposition witnesses prior to an interview or deposition. However, petitioner's
17 counsel agreed during the hearing that such a procedure would be acceptable because all persons
18 to be shown documents as proposed will be deposed, and petitioner's counsel would receive
19 notice of the depositions.

20 2. In paragraph 4(d), respondent has proposed changing petitioner's language to
21 allow respondent's counsel to show "summaries" rather than "transcripts" of interviews to
22 refresh recollection. Petitioner objected to showing witnesses anything besides a transcript of
23 their testimony or interviews or a document prepared or affirmed by the witness. Given the rest
24 of the wording in this paragraph, the court agrees. Paragraph 4(d) will permit the use of those
25 sorts of primary documents to refresh an individual's "prior recorded recollection."

26 /////

1 1. All documents produced to respondent pursuant to respondent's request to
2 discover petitioner's trial counsel's files, and including the files of agents of trial counsel made in
3 the course of trial counsel's representation of petitioner whether or not said files were kept in
4 conjunction with trial counsel's files, and including the files of trial counsel's mental health
5 expert, Dr. Edwards (hereinafter "trial defense team's files"), shall be deemed to be confidential.
6 These documents may be used only by counsel for the State and persons working under their
7 direct supervision (including investigating agents and expert consultants) in connection with
8 these habeas proceedings and may be used only for purposes of any proceedings incident to the
9 petition for writ of habeas corpus pending before this court. Disclosure of the contents of the
10 documents and the documents themselves may not be made to any other persons or agencies,
11 including any law enforcement or prosecutorial personnel or agencies, without an order from this
12 court. This order shall continue in effect after the conclusion of the habeas corpus proceedings
13 and specifically shall apply in the event of a retrial of all or any portion of petitioner's criminal
14 case.

15 2. This Supplemental Protective Order does not apply to documents or
16 information obtained from sources independent of petitioner's trial defense team's files
17 previously made public even if that information also is contained in petitioner's trial counsel's
18 files.

19 3. Each page of the materials produced to respondent from trial counsel's files
20 shall be marked with consecutive page numbers in the lower right hand corner or some other
21 consistent location so that every page can be identified by a distinct number.

22 4. For purposes of preparing for the evidentiary hearing,

23 (a) Respondent may take the deposition of petitioner's trial counsel and/or any
24 member of the trial defense team;

25 (b) Alternatively, respondent may conduct interviews with petitioner's trial
26 counsel and/or any member of the trial defense team subject to the attorney-client privilege

1 provided that the entire interview is tape- or video-recorded and the recording served on
2 petitioner at least two (2) weeks prior to the evidentiary hearing and lodged with the court
3 under seal at the time of the evidentiary hearing;

4 (c) At or in preparation for such deposition or recorded interview, respondent may
5 show documents contained in trial counsel's file to the trial attorney or any member of the trial
6 defense team who is being deposed or interviewed, or any other deposition witness;

7 (d) Respondent may show transcripts of interviews or depositions to the
8 individual who was the subject of the interview or deposition and may show declarations or other
9 documents authored or affirmed by an individual to that individual for the purpose of refreshing
10 the individual's prior recorded recollection;

11 (e) Except as provided in paragraphs 4(c) and 4(d), respondent shall not show any
12 documents from trial counsel's files to any individual without prior authorization of the court on
13 motion subject to ten (10) days' notice filed and served on counsel for petitioner. Petitioner may
14 file and serve opposition, if any, five (5) days after service of the motion. Any reply by
15 respondent may be filed and served two (2) days after service of any opposition. The parties
16 agree that the court may issue an order on motion without the necessity of a hearing. Any request
17 to file all or part of a motion or opposition under seal shall be made pursuant to the local rules.

18 (f) Copies of any written communication or correspondence between trial counsel
19 or any member of the trial defense team and respondent shall be served on petitioner at least two
20 (2) weeks prior to the evidentiary hearing and lodged with the court under seal at the time of the
21 evidentiary hearing.

22 The only pre-hearing communications between trial counsel or any member of the
23 trial defense team and respondent regarding the trial representation of petitioner shall be those
24 described in this paragraph 4. As with all documents produced to respondent, the transcripts of
25 depositions and/or recordings of interviews, the information contained therein, or derived
26 therefrom shall be sequestered in the manner described in paragraph 1 above.

1 5. Respondent shall ensure that any person, other than counsel directly involved in
2 this case, to whom respondent reveals information covered by this Supplemental Protective
3 Order is given a copy of this Supplemental Protective Order and signs a statement that he or she
4 has read and understands his or her obligations with respect to this protective order. Respondent
5 shall retain these signed statements.

6 DATED: August 12, 2009.

7
8 
9 _____
10 U.S. MAGISTRATE JUDGE
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25