

1 Lynn Hubbard III, SBN 69773
 2 Scottlynn J Hubbard IV, SBN 212970
Law Offices of Lynn Hubbard
 3 12 Williamsburg Lane
 4 Chico, Ca. 95926
 5 (530) 895-3252

6 Attorney for Plaintiff

7
 8
 9
 10
 11
 12
 13
 14
 15
 16
 17
 18
 19
 20
 21
 22
 23
 24
 25
 26
 27
 28

United States District Court
 Eastern District Of California

| | | |
|------------------------------|---|-------------------------------|
| Byron Chapman, |) | Case No. 2:04-cv-1339 LKK CMK |
| |) | |
| Plaintiff, |) | Judgment of Permanent |
| |) | Injunction |
| Vs. |) | |
| |) | [Fed. R. Civ. P. 65] |
| Pier 1 Imports (U.S.), Inc., |) | |
| |) | |
| Defendants. |) | |

1 **Judgment of Permanent Injunction**

2 This cause came on to be heard on defendant’s motion for summary
3 judgment and plaintiff’s cross-motion for summary judgment, the
4 declarations submitted in support of and in opposition to the cross-motions,
5 and oral argument in open court. To ensure that persons with disabilities
6 have the “full and equal enjoyment” of defendant’s Vacaville store as stated
7 in the court’s June 27, 2012 order denying defendant’s motion and granting
8 plaintiff’s cross-motion (Dkt. No. 210),¹ and having considered defendant’s
9 objections to plaintiff’s proposed permanent injunction (Dkt. Nos. 211 &
10 212), the court hereby permanently enjoins Defendant from violating Title III
11 of the Americans with Disabilities Act and, California’s Unruh Civil Rights
12 Act and Disabled Persons Act, as follows:

13 **IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED that:**

14 Pier 1, its officers, agents, representative, employees and all persons in
15 active concert and participation with them, are **PERMANENTLY**
16 **ENJOINED** from:


- 17 1. Blocking the aisles of its Vacaville store with
18 merchandise or other obstacles, such that the clear path through the aisles is
19 narrower than 36 inches wide (or permitting such blockages), except for the
20 unavoidable transitory blockages caused by re-stocking or similar activities;
21 and

22
23
24
25 ¹ See also Baughman v. Walt Disney World Company, ___ F.3d ___,
26 Slip Op. at 7-9 (9th Cir. July 28, 2012) (confirming that the ADA means
27 what it says when it prohibits facilities from denying persons with disabilities
28 the “full and equal enjoyment” of their facilities).

1 2. Cluttering the accessible check-out counter at its
2 Vacaville store with merchandise or other material that impede the ability of
3 its disabled customers to use that counter (or permitting such cluttering),
4 except for the unavoidable transitory clutter resulting from the current use of
5 that counter to check-out merchandise.

6
7 IT IS SO ORDERED.

8 DATED: July 20, 2012.

9
10
11 
12 LAWRENCE K. KARLTON
13 SENIOR JUDGE
14 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28