James A. Bruen (State Bar No. 43880)

(jbruen@fbm.com)

Sandra A. Edwards (State Bar No. 154578)

(sedwards@fbm.com)

FARELLA BRAUN & MARTEL LLP

235 Montgomery Street, 17th Floor

San Francisco, CA 94104

Telephone: (415) 954-4400

Facsimile: (415) 954-4480

Katharine R. Latimer (admitted *pro hac vice*)

(klatimer@hollingsworthllp.com)

Martin C. Calhoun (admitted *pro hac vice*)

(mcalhoun@hollingsworthllp.com)

HOLLINGSWORTH LLP

1350 I Street, N.W.

Washington, DC 20005

Telephone: (202) 898-5800

Facsimile: (202) 682-1639

Attorneys for Defendant

NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS

CORPORATION

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

CHERYL J. WHITE, SUCCESSOR TO WILLIAM WHITE,

Plaintiff,

v.

NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION,

Defendant.

Case No. 2:06-CV-00665-WBS-GGH

Complaint Filed: March 29, 2006

Trial Date: November 16, 2010

ORDER TO SEAL DOCUMENTS

The Court, having considered, pursuant to Civil Local Rule 141, the request by defendant Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation ("NPC") to seal certain exhibits upon which NPC relies in support of NPC's Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for Sanctions to Strike Defendant's Pleadings

and for Further Relief Pursuant to Findings Made by Order of the MDL Court (filed August 16,

2010) (DE #129), and for good cause shown, hereby grants NPC's request and orders that the

following documents be maintained under seal until further order of the Court:

Exhibit 4 to Declaration of Gary I. Rubin in Support of NPC's Opposition to Α.

Plaintiff's Motion for Sanctions to Strike Defendant's Pleadings and for Further Relief Pursuant to Findings Made by Order of the MDL Court (DE

#128).

Exhibit 4: 10/29/03 Core Team Material Clearance Form (ZA-0587648). This document shall

be maintained by the Court under seal.

В. Exhibits 1, 5, 6, and 7 to Declaration of Martin Calhoun in Support of NPC's

Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for Sanctions to Strike Defendant's Pleadings and for Further Relief Pursuant to Findings Made by Order of the

MDL Court (**DE** #130).

Exhibit 1: 4/15/10 Declaration of Gary I. Rubin with Attached Exhibits. This document shall be

maintained by the Court under seal.

Exhibit 5: Excerpts of the Transcript of the 10/15/08 Deposition of Robyn Sterner. This

document shall be maintained by the Court under seal.

Exhibit 6: Excerpts of the Transcript of the 1/8/10 Deposition of Michelle Laties. This

document shall be maintained by the Court under seal.

Exhibit 7: Excerpts of the Transcript of the 8/5/08 Deposition of Margaret Dean. This document

shall be maintained by the Court under seal.

DATED: August 18, 2010

SO ORDERED:

WILLIAM B. SHUBB

UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

silliam Is shabt

Date: August 17, 2010 Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Martin C. Calhoun

Katharine R. Latimer (admitted *pro hac vice*) (klatimer@hollingsworthllp.com)
Martin C. Calhoun (admitted *pro hac vice*) (mcalhoun@hollingsworthllp.com)
HOLLINGSWORTH LLP
1350 I Street, N.W.

Washington, DC 20005 Telephone: (202) 898-5800 Facsimile: (202) 682-1639

James A. Bruen (State Bar No. 43880) (jbruen@fbm.com) Sandra A. Edwards (State Bar No. 154578) (sedwards@fbm.com) FARELLA BRAUN & MARTEL LLP 235 Montgomery Street, 17th Floor San Francisco, CA 94104

Telephone: (415) 954-4400 Facsimile: (415) 954-4480

Attorneys for Defendant Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation