2

3 4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19 20

21 22

24

25 26 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

NO. CIV. S-06-2376 LKK/GGH

ORDER

JASON CAMPBELL and SARAH SOBEK, individually, and on behalf of all other similarly situated current and former employees of

PricewaterhouseCoopers, LLP,,

Plaintiffs,

PRICEWATERHOUSECOOPERS, LLP, a Limited Liability Partnership;,

and DOES 1-100, inclusive,

Defendant.

The court recently reviewed the sealed documents and motions to seal filed in this case. After conducting this review, the court noticed that many motions have only been tentatively granted and some were never ruled upon. The court also determined that many documents were not properly filed after the court ruled on the motions to seal. Specifically, some documents were filed under seal even though the court never found that they should be sealed and several sealed versions and redacted versions of the documents at

issue were never filed. Thus, the court issues the following order to dispose of these issues.

A. Pending Motions to Seal

Pending before the court are several motions by defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers seeking to seal various documents filed in this case. This order concerns four of these motions, Doc. Nos. 128, 142, 147, and 174. On January 11, 2008, the court issued an order as to three of these four motions, Doc. Nos. 128, 142, and 147, tentatively granting defendant's requests to seal, "subject to further order of the court as . . . appropriate." Doc. No. 153. On March 7, 2008, the court issued an order tentatively granting the fourth motion to seal discussed in the instant order, also subject to further order of the court. Doc. No. 180.

After conducting a more thorough analysis, the court invites the parties to provide reasons why the court should not vacate the January 11, 2008 and March 7, 2008 orders and seal only the following:

- Doc. No. 82, PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 134, Declaration of Carrie Allen in Support of
 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
 - Doc. No. 83, Declaration of Michael Anderson in Support of

 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To

 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- 26 Doc. No. 87, Declaration of Margaret Barron in Support of

Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification at page 1, lines 8-9; page 2, lines 27-28; page 3, lines 1-4, 18-28; pages 4-6; and page 7, lines 1-21.

1

2

3

4

8

9

10

20

21

- Doc. No. 131, Declaration of Mark Bates in Support of
 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
 - Doc. No. 88, Declaration of Lindsay Beigle in Support of

 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To

 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 85, Declaration of Michael Corey in Support of
 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 129, Declaration of Jesse Dang in Support of
 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
 - Doc. No. 91, Declaration of Maile Dexheimer in Support of

 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To

 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 90, Declaration of Sandeep Dhillon in Support of
 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- 26 Doc. No. 93, Declaration of Brian Donahue in Support of

Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.

- Doc. No. 92, Declaration of Rodney Dowell in Support of

 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To

 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 97, Declaration of Thomas Erginsoy in Support of Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- 9 Doc. No. 94, Declaration of Andrea Evans in Support of
 10 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
 11 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 95, Declaration of Erica Gellerman in Support of
 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
 - Doc. No. 96, Declaration of Daniel Goepp in Support of Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 98, Declaration of Joseph Gomez in Support of
 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
 - Doc. No. 130, Declaration of Joseph Hillsted in Support of Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.

¹ The court assumes that the declaration of Joseph Hillsted is the same declaration defendant refers to as the "Declaration of Joe Hilstead in Support of Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification."

- Doc. No. 99, Declaration of Brian Hunt in Support of Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 101, Declaration of Samantha Keh in Support of

 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To

 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 100, Declaration of Paul Klopping in Support of
 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 103, Declaration of Blair Krebs in Support of
 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 102, Declaration of Jason Ashley Krein in Support of
 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 125, Declaration of Angela Lam in Support of
 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 104, Declaration of Keith Larson in Support of
 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 126, Declaration of Ryann Celine Lucas in Support of
 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.

2

3

4

5

Doc. No. 124, Declaration of Irina Majstrovain² in Support of Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

17

18

24

- Doc. No. 108, Declaration of Dana S. Matsuno in Support of Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition Τo Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 109, Declaration of Michael McCarvel in Support of Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition То Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- 10 Doc. No. 110, Declaration of Denise McCurry in Support of Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers 11 LLP's Opposition То Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification. 12
- 13 Doc. No. 111, Declaration of Clair Menzies in Support of Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers 14 LLP's Opposition To 15 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- 16 Doc. No. 112, Declaration of Curt Moldenhauer in Support of Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- 19 Doc. No. 133, Declaration of Jeffrey Mollenhauer in Support 20 of Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To 21 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- 22 Doc. No. 113, Declaration of Jennifer Nielsen in Support of 23 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition То

² The court assumes that the declaration of Irina Majstrovain is the same declaration defendant refers to as the "Declaration of Irina Majstrova in Support of Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification."

1 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

23

24

- Doc. No. 84, Declaration of Carl Lee Overstreet³ in Support of Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification at 1, lines 13-18; pages 2-11; page 12, lines 1-14; page 13, lines 6-15; page 15, lines 9-10.
- Doc. No. 114, Declaration of Ashlee Pierce in Support of Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 132, Declaration of Lindsey Piziali in Support of
 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 115, Declaration of James Bennett Richter in Support of Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 116, Declaration of Travis Salha in Support of
 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- 22 Doc. No. 118, Declaration of Jack Slade in Support of

The court assumes that the declaration of Carl Lee Overstreet is the same declaration defendant refers to as the "Declaration of Curtis Lee Overstreet in Support of Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification."

- Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 86, Declaration of Nipun Soni in Support of
 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 119, Declaration of Benson Thomander in Support of
 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- 9 Doc. No. 120, Declaration of John Toriello in Support of
 10 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
 11 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 122, Declaration of Jennifer Tsai in Support of
 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 121, Declaration of Timothy Vance in Support of
 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 123, Declaration of Steve White in Support of
 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 105, Declaration of Jacquie Wilson in Support of
 Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To
 Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 106, Declaration of Jennifer Windmueller in Support of Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.

• Doc. No. 107, Declaration of Gavin Wolfe⁴ in Support of Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification.

- Doc. No. 76, Exhibit 38 ("Capabilities/Skills At-a-Glance/Expectations") to the Declaration of Victoria R. Carradero in Support of Defendant's Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 76-6, Exhibit 44 ("Performance Coaching & Development Responsibility Framework") to the Declaration of Victoria R. Carradero in Support of Defendant's Motion For Class Certification.
- Doc. No. 76-7, Exhibit 45 (The Declaration of Michael G. Ueltzen) to the Declaration of Victoria R. Carradero in Support of Defendant's Motion For Class Certification at page 10, lines 23-28 and page 11, lines 1-12.
- Doc. No. 78, Exhibit 54 (Draft of the Declaration of Michael G. Ueltzen) to the Declaration of Victoria R. Carradero in Support of Defendant's Motion For Class Certification at page 10 starting with the paragraph following(f) and ending after the first paragraph on page 11.
- Doc. No. 150, Exhibit A (PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Corrected Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for Class Certification) to Errata Re: PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's

⁴ The court assumes that the declaration of Gavin Wolf is the same declaration defendant refers to as the "Declaration of Gavin C. Wolfe in Support of Defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Opposition To Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification."

Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for Class Certification.

- Doc. No. 161, Plaintiff's Reply to Defendant's Opposition to Motion for Class Certification at page 12, footnote 13; page 14, lines 9-21, footnote 17; page 15, lines 12-17, 22-23; page 16, lines 1-2, 20-24, footnote 20; page 17, lines 1-4, footnotes 20 (continued from page 16) and 21; page 18, lines 8-18, footnotes 22-25.
- Doc. No. 162, Declaration of Stuart C. Talley in Support of Plaintiff's Reply to Defendant's Opposition to Motion for Class Certification at Exhibit 1, copies of pages of the deposition of Ashlee Pierce at pages 18-27, 30-31, 49-51, 68-69, 91-93, 95, 111-114, and 140-144; Exhibit 2, copies of pages of the deposition of Jennifer Windmueller at pages 35-37, 40, 63-64, 104, 125-126, and 151; Exhibit 3, copies of pages of the deposition of Brian Hunt at pages 63-67; Exhibit 4, copies of pages of the deposition of Thomas Erginsoy at pages 86-91, 115-116, 152, 155-157, and 175-177; Exhibit 5, copies of pages of the deposition of Lindsay Beigle at pages 68 and 84; Exhibit 6 in its entirety; and Exhibit 7 in its entirety.

B. Documents Missing from the Docket

1. Sealed Document Missing

The court ordered the following documents permanently sealed in their entirety, but there is no sealed version on the docket. The court orders the party who filed the following documents to file a sealed version of each documents in the manner described

below:

- PWC's Objection to Plaintiffs' Evidence submitted in support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Summary Judgment on the Affirmative Defense of Exemption (Ordered Sealed on 3/5/09 Doc. No. 383).
- PWC's Statement of Additional Facts Precluding MSJ on the Affirmative Defense of Exemption (Ordered Sealed on 3/5/09 Doc. No. 383).
- PWC's Response to Plaintiff's Statement of Undisputed Facts in Support of Motion for Summary Judgment on Affirmative Defense of Exemption (Ordered Sealed on 3/5/09 Doc. No. 383).
- Declaration of Birgett Borgett in Support of PWC's Class

 Motion for Summary Judgment (Ordered Sealed on 3/4/09 Doc.

 No. 380).
 - Declaration of Annie Kurosaki in Support of PWC's Class Motion for Summary Judgment (Ordered Sealed on 3/4/09 Doc. No. 380).
 - PWC's Objection to Evidence Submitted in Support of Plaintiff's Opposition to PWC's Motion for Summary Judgment (Ordered Sealed on 3/5/09 Doc. No. 382).
 - PWC's Reply to Plaintiff's Response to PWC's Statement of
 Undisputed Facts in Support of Motion for Summary Judgment
 (Ordered Sealed on 3/5/09 Doc. No. 382).

2. Sealed and Redacted Document Missing

The court ordered the following document sealed in part. No

sealed version or redacted version appears on the docket. Thus, the party who filed the following document must file a sealed and a redacted version of the document in the manner described below:

• Declaration of Julie Totten in Support of PWC's Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for Summary Judgment (Ordered Sealed on (3/5/09 - Doc. No. 383).

3. Redacted Document Missing

The court ordered the following documents permanently sealed in part, however, no redacted versions of the documents are filed on the docket. The court orders the party who filed the following documents to file a redacted version of each document in the manner described below:

- Plaintiff's Statement of Undisputed Material Facts in Support of Motion for Summary Judgment on Affirmative Defense of Exemption (Ordered Sealed on 10/17/08 Doc. No. 252).
- Plaintiff's Motion for Summary Judgment on Affirmative Defense of Exemption (Ordered Sealed on 10/17/08 Doc. No. 252).
- Declaration of William Kershaw in Support of Plaintiffs'
 Motion for Summary Judgment on the Affirmative Defense of
 Exemption (Ordered Sealed on 10/17/08 Doc. No. 252).
- Declaration of Norman C. Hile in Support of PWC's Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for Summary Judgment on Breach of Legal Duty (Doc. No. 468-6; Ordered Sealed on 6/4/09 Doc. No. 443).
- PWC's Statement of Additional Facts Precluding Motion for

- Summary Judgment on Breach of Legal Duty (Doc. No. 468-5; Ordered Sealed on 6/4/09 Doc. No. 443).
- PWC's Objections to Plaintiffs' Evidence Submitted in Support
 Of Motion for Summary Judgment on Breach of Legal Duty (Doc.
 No. 468-3; Ordered Sealed on 6/4/09 Doc. No. 443).

- Declaration of William Kershaw in Support of Plaintiffs'

 Motion for Summary Judgment on Breach of Legal Duty (Doc.

 No. 274; Ordered Sealed on 6/4/09 Doc. No. 443).
- Plaintiff's Motion for Summary Judgment on Breach of Legal

 Duty (Doc No. 272; Ordered Sealed on 6/4/09 Doc. No. 443).
- PWC's reponse to Plaintiffs' Statement of Undisputed Material Facts in Support of Motion for Summary Judgment on Breach of Legal Duty (Doc. No. 468-4; Ordered Sealed on 6/4/09 Doc. No. 443).
- Plaintiffs' Response to PWC's Objections to Evidence Submitted in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Summary Judgment on Affirmative Defense of Exemption (Doc. No. 290; Ordered Sealed on 6/4/09 Doc. No. 445).
- Plaintiffs' Reply to PWC's Opposition to Motion for Summary Judgment on Affirmative Defense of Exemption (Doc. No. 291; Ordered Sealed on 6/4/09 Doc. No. 445).

4. Sealed Document Missing, Redacted Version Filed

The court ordered the following documents permanently sealed in part. There is a redacted version of these documents on the docket, but there are no sealed versions. The court orders the party who filed the following documents to file a sealed version

of each document in the manner described below.

- PWC's Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for Summary Judgment on the Affirmative Defense of Exemption (Ordered Sealed on 3/5/09 Doc. No. 383).
- Declaration of Amber Benson in Support of PWC's Motion for Summary Judgment (Ordered Sealed on 3/4/09 Doc. No. 380).
- Declaration of James Clous in Support of PWC's Motion for Summary Judgment (Ordered Sealed on 3/4/09 Doc. No. 380).
- Declaration of Robert Mercado in Support of PWC's Motion for Summary Judgment (Ordered Sealed on 3/4/09 Doc. No. 380).
- Declaration of Michael Moomaw in Support of PWC's Motion for Summary Judgment (Ordered Sealed on 3/4/09 Doc. No. 380).
- Declaration of Melania Rappa in Support of PWC's Motion for Summary Judgment (Ordered Sealed on 3/4/09 Doc. No. 380).
- Declaration of Carrie Schleicher in Support of PWC's Motion for Summary Judgment (Ordered Sealed on 3/4/09 - Doc. No. 380).

C. Documents Filed Under Seal Without Court Order

Several documents were filed under seal without a motion to seal and any court order sealing them. As such, the court orders that these documents shall be unsealed unless a party moves to seal them within fourteen (14) days of the issuance of this order. Upon the court's receipt of such motion, if any, the court will determine whether sealing is appropriate. The relevant documents are the following:

• Declaration of Dr. Jon A. Krosnick in Support of Plaintiffs'

- Opposition to PriceWaterhouseCoopers' Motions for Summary Judgment (Filed on 11/20/08).
- Plaintiffs' Motion to Exclude Testimony of Donna Dell Filed in Support of PriceWaterhouseCoopers LLP's Motions for Summary Judgment (Filed on 11/20/08).
- Plaintiffs' Motion to Exclude Testimony of Michael Moomaw,
 Ph.D. Filed in Support of PriceWaterhouseCoopers LLP's
 Motions for Summary Judgment (Filed 11/20/08).

D. CONCLUSION

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

The court ORDERS the following:

With respect to the pending motions to seal (Section (1)A.), the parties MAY, within fourteen (14) days of the issuance of this order, file in writing an explanation as to why the court should deviate from the above proposal to vacate the orders of January 11, 2008, Doc. No. 153, and March 7, 2008, Doc. No. 180; grant in part defendant PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP's Motion to Seal Documents filed on December 10, 2007, Doc. No. 128 (amending Doc. Nos. 62 & 63) and Defendant's Ex Parte Motion to Seal Select Exhibits to the Declaration of Victoria R. Carradero in Support of Defendant's Motion for Class Certification; Objections to Evidence and Motion to Strike Evidence filed on December 13, 2007, 142; full Doc. No. and grant in defendant. PricewaterhouseCooper LLP's Ex Parte Motion to Seal Its Corrected Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for Class

Certification filed on December 27, 2007, Doc. No. 147.

(2) With respect to the missing documents, the party who filed each document shall file the missing document within fourteen (14) days of the issuance of this order as described below:

Mail two compact discs ("CDs") to the Clerk of Court. The first CD should be labeled "Sealed Filings," and include complete PDF versions of all sealed documents identified in this order. The second CD should be labeled "Redacted Filings," and include redacted PDF versions of all sealed documents identified in this order. With each CD, the parties shall enclose a letter listing all the documents on each CD. This list shall include a short title for the document, the file name for the document, as saved on the CD, and the date upon which the document was initially filed. The CDs and the letters shall also include the case number and party name. Please direct any questions concerning the filing of the sealed documents to Ana Rivas, Courtroom Deputy, at (916) 930-4133.

- (3) The documents listed in Section C shall be unsealed absent the filing of a motion to seal within fourteen (14) days of the issuance of this order. If such a motion is filed, the court will then determine whether these documents should be sealed.
- (4) The court invites the parties to inform the court if any

of its findings concerning the missing documents were in error. Such notices must be filed within seven (7) days of the issuance of this order.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

DATED: December 13, 2010.

LAWRENCE K. KARLTON

SENIOR JUDGE

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT