

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

CENTER FOR SIERRA NEVADA)
CONSERVATION, *et al.*,)
)
Plaintiffs,)
)
v.)
)
U.S. FOREST SERVICE, *et al.*,)
)
Defendants.)
)

Case No. 2:09-CV-02523-LKK-JFM

O R D E R

Having considered the parties' statements of position and the Federal Defendants' proposed order, the Court hereby orders as follows:

1. The 42 routes that intersect meadows and are the subject of this Order are listed in Table A attached hereto and incorporated into this Order. The Court hereby sets aside and remands for reconsideration in light of the applicable law that portion of the Forest Service's Final Environmental Impact Statement relating to the Riparian Conservation Objective ("RCO") Analysis for RCO #2 Standards and Guidelines #100 pertaining to the meadows on the 42 routes listed in Table A.
2. Until such time as the Forest Service completes supplemental environmental analysis pursuant to the National Environmental Policy Act ("NEPA") as provided above, public wheeled motorized vehicle use of a route listed in Table A that intersects a meadow shall be prohibited or limited as described in Table B attached to and incorporated into this Order. All other portions of the Forest Service's decision, including the parts of the 42 routes that do not intersect meadows, remain in effect.
3. The extension of the seasonal closing of the 42 routes issued by this Court on February 14, 2012 (*see* ECF No. 106, ¶ 4) is hereby vacated.
4. The Forest Service shall revise its Motor Vehicle Use Map ("MVUM") consistent with this Order and incorporate the changes reflected in the *2012 Meadows Maps for*

1 42 Routes provided to the Court on March 14, 2012 with Federal Defendants' Brief in
2 Support of Proposed Order. Until the revised MVUM is finalized and available for
3 public distribution, the Forest Service shall issue an interim Forest Order consistent
4 with the 2012 Meadows Maps for 42 Routes and Table B.

5 5. Nothing in this order prohibits the Forest Service from exercising its authority to
6 close or restrict uses pursuant to 36 C.F.R. Part 261, Subpart B.

7 6. The Court finds that Forest Service has remedied the Endangered Species Act
8 ("ESA") violation, and therefore no further action from the Court is necessary as to
9 the ESA.

10 7. This Court does not retain further jurisdiction of this matter except to consider any
11 claim for attorney's fees and costs. The Court directs the Clerk to enter final
12 judgment in accordance with Fed. R. Civ. P. 58 and 79.

13
14 IT IS SO ORDERED.

15
16 DATED: July 30, 2012.

17
18
19 

20 LAWRENCE K. KARLTON
21 SENIOR JUDGE
22 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
23
24
25
26
27
28

Table A: 42 Routes with Meadows

8N23B	9N82	10N14	10NY06	12NY06	17E12
8N35	9N83	10N21	11N09A	12NY15	17E16
9N01	9N95	10N26	11N22	13N24	17E17
9N04	10N01	10N32	11N23F	14N05	17E19
9N08	10N03	10N98	11N26F	14N27	17E21
9N15	10N06	10NY04	11N70	14N39	17E24
9N54	10N13	10NY05	11NY32	14N58	17E28

Table B: Prohibition of Public Wheeled Motorized Vehicle Use on 42 Routes

Route	Description	Portion of Route Where Use is Prohibited	Notes	Mileage of Route	Mileage of Route Where Use is Prohibited
08N23B	Route is used for general dispersed recreation.	Prohibit use from first meadow to end of route.		3.35	1.63
08N35	Route is used for general dispersed recreation.	Prohibit use on portion of road within meadow in Section 18.		1.76	0.01
09N01	Access to Blue Lake, Twin Lake, Meadow Lake and dispersed camping.	Prohibit use from meadow to west end of road.		2.44	0.67
09N04	Access to Squaw Ridge 4WD trail; access to hiking opportunities within the western portion of Mokelumne Wilderness.	Prohibit use on portion of route from meadow near Allen Ranch to end where it connects to 09N82.	Limits access to 09N82.	3.46	1.22

Route	Description	Portion of Route Where Use is Prohibited	Notes	Mileage of Route	Mileage of Route Where Use is Prohibited
09N08	Road to Allen Camp Trailhead and Stockton Municipal Organization Camp.	Prohibit use from meadow just past Allen Camp Trailhead to end at Stockton Municipal Camp.	Meadow is at beginning of route. Will limit access to Stockton Municipal Organization Camp.	0.31	0.15
09N15	Road to California Department of Fish and Game land at Leek Spring.	Prohibit use on entire route.	Meadow is at beginning of the route.	0.2	0.2
09N54	Secondary access to Leoni Meadows.	Prohibit use on eastern portion of road on private land.	Meadow is on private land.	1.9	0.56
09N82	Squaw Ridge 4WD route and access to western portion of Mokelumne Wilderness.	Prohibit use on entire route (north and south halves) except for segment on south end, south of first meadow crossing.	Most of route made inaccessible due to closures of connecting routes and meadow crossing at southern end.	11.46	10.66
09N83	Clover Valley/Deer Valley 4WD route; connector between Hwy 88 and Hwy 4; route recognized in Mokelumne Wilderness designation.	Prohibit use on middle section of route from meadow at section 32 to meadow in south portion of section 8.	North end of route remains open for recreation from Blue Lakes area. South end remains open from Hwy 4 on the Stanislaus NF.	4.83	3.18

Route	Description	Portion of Route Where Use is Prohibited	Notes	Mileage of Route	Mileage of Route Where Use is Prohibited
09N95	Route is used for general dispersed recreation.	Prohibit use on entire route.	Meadow is at beginning of route.	0.45	0.45
10N01	Road provides access for dispersed camping near Carson Pass (adjacent to Hwy 88).	Prohibit use on entire route.	One meadow is at western end of route and one is east of dispersed camping areas. Prohibit use for entire route for management purposes.	0.82	0.82
10N03	Access to Devil's Gate Recreation Residence Tract.	Prohibit use before meadow on private land.	Road ends before the private land boundary.	0.54	0.07
10N06	Route is used for general dispersed recreation.	Prohibit use between meadow on west end to intersection with 10N59.		2.21	0.07
10N13	Strawberry 4WD Trail and portion of road connecting County Road with Strawberry 4WD Trail. Significant recreation opportunity that is popular with multiple user groups.	Prohibit use on entire route except for south end from County Road ALP-164 to meadow at Schneider Camp.	Due to locations of meadows along this route, most of route is made inaccessible. Use is prohibited on northernmost portion for management reasons.	7.89	7.26
10N14	Road access to Bucks Pasture Trail.	Prohibit use on entire route.	Meadow is at beginning of route.	2.49	2.49

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Route	Description	Portion of Route Where Use is Prohibited	Notes	Mileage of Route	Mileage of Route Where Use is Prohibited
10N21	Long Canyon 4WD Route. Popular 4WD route away from other dispersed uses.	Prohibit use between meadow near border of sections 4 and 5 to meadow north of 10NY04E.		3.99	1.58
10N26	Road provides access to Cody Lake Trailhead, trail to Cody Lake and Cody Lake Boy Scout Camp.	Prohibit use on entire route.	Meadow is near beginning of northern end of route. Due to locations of meadows on other routes, the remaining portion of the route is inaccessible.	3.06	3.06
10N32	Access for dispersed recreation.	Prohibit use at meadow crossing in Section 11.		5.19	0.02
10N98	Route is used for general dispersed recreation.	Prohibit use on entire route.	Meadow is at beginning of route.	1.94	1.94
10NY04	Route is used for general dispersed recreation.	Prohibit use from meadow at Long Canyon to west end.	Allow use at beginning of road.	2.66	1.31
10NY05	Route is used for general dispersed recreation.	Prohibit use on entire route.	Meadow is at beginning of route.	1.27	1.27
10NY06	Connects to 10N26 and 11N23F in the vicinity of the Long Canyon 4WD Route.	Prohibit use on entire route.	Meadow is at beginning of route.	1.65	1.65

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Route	Description	Portion of Route Where Use is Prohibited	Notes	Mileage of Route	Mileage of Route Where Use is Prohibited
11N09A	Road to Sayles Canyon Trailhead.	Prohibit use from first meadow to west end.	Allow use at beginning of route.	1.98	1.04
11N22	Route is used for general dispersed recreation.	Prohibit use from meadow to southeast end of road.	Allow use on first part of route.	1.99	1.02
11N23F	North Shanty 4WD route.	Prohibit use from meadow to 10NY06.	Allow use on remainder of route to connect to 11N23.	3.21	0.27
11N26F	Barrett Lake 4WD Trail.	Prohibit use on entire route.	Trail has been rerouted around some of the meadows and stream crossing. Most logical place to close route is at the beginning where there is already a gate installed.	5.35	5.35
11N70	Access for dispersed recreation.	Prohibit use where route crosses meadows.		5.32	0.09
11NY32	Access to Aspen Creek Recreation Residence Tract.	Prohibit use on entire route.	Meadow is near beginning of the route.	0.24	0.24
12NY06	Route is used for general dispersed recreation.	Prohibit use on portion of route from meadow to intersection with 12NY06A.	Use allowed on either end of route.	1.32	0.21

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Route	Description	Portion of Route Where Use is Prohibited	Notes	Mileage of Route	Mileage of Route Where Use is Prohibited
12NY15	Access road for dispersed recreation.	Prohibit use from ridgeline to west end of road.	Meadow located near steep slope. Prohibit use at ridgeline to allow vehicles to turn around.	3.78	2.9
13N24	Access to Rubicon River and Deer Creek Trail.	Prohibit use on portion of road crossing meadow.	Remainder of road to remain accessible from both ends, allowing continued access to Rubicon River and Deer Creek Trail.	3.93	0.02
14N05	Road provides access to McKinstry Lake and McKinstry Hiking trail and to County maintained toilets along Rubicon 4WD Trail.	Prohibit use from first meadow crossing in Section 25 to eastern end.	Limits access to 14N58.	5.02	4.84
14N27	Road provides access to Bunker Hill Lookout and beyond.	Prohibit use from meadow at 14N27L to end of road.		8.74	3.45
14N39	Road provides access to Richardson Lake and Sourdough Hill; popular for dispersed recreation.	Prohibit use on entire route.	Connects to Rubicon Trail on Tahoe NF. Meadow is near beginning of route at the Eldorado NF/Tahoe NF boundary.	2.53	2.53

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Route	Description	Portion of Route Where Use is Prohibited	Notes	Mileage of Route	Mileage of Route Where Use is Prohibited
14N58	Access for dispersed recreation.	Prohibit use on entire route	Route is inaccessible due to prohibition of use on 14N05.	1.66	1.66
17E12	Motorcycle trail to Lovers Leap.	Prohibit use on entire route.	Meadow at midpoint on trail. Prohibit use on entire route for management reasons.	1.55	1.55
17E16	Motorcycle trail to Little Round Top, used for general dispersed recreation, dead end.	Prohibit use on entire route.	Made inaccessible due to closure of 10N13.	2.36	2.36
17E17	Bucks Pasture Motorcycle trail.	Prohibit use on entire route.	Made inaccessible due to closure of 10N13 and 10N14.	3.77	3.77
17E19	Allen's Camp Motorcycle trail.	Prohibit use on entire route.	Meadow near beginning of route and several more are along route.	1.97	1.97
17E21	Horse Canyon Trail, motorcycle trail from Horse Canyon Trailhead at Highway 88 to the Squaw Ridge area.	Prohibit use on entire route.	Meadow located near eastern end of trail. Prohibit use on trail for management reasons.	5.01	5.01

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Route	Description	Portion of Route Where Use is Prohibited	Notes	Mileage of Route	Mileage of Route Where Use is Prohibited
17E24	Connects Mud Lake to Squaw Ridge Trail.	Prohibit use on west segment between intersection with Porthole Gap Road (NST1724-B) to a point on other side of meadow south of Mud Lake. Prohibit use on entire east portion from meadow at Allen Ranch to northeast end.	Both ends of west portion to remain accessible. On east portion, meadow is at beginning of route.	8.11	6.67
17E28	Motorcycle trail connection between Mud Lake and Long Valley (Bear River Reservoir Area).	Prohibit use on entire route.	Route inaccessible due to prohibition of use on 17E24 and 9N82.	3.81	3.81
TOTAL				135.52	89.03