

1 CHRISTOPHER W. WOOD (SBN 193955)
 2 KELSEY J. FISCHER (SBN 292262)
 3 **DREYER BABICH BUCCOLA WOOD**
 4 **CAMPORA, LLP**
 5 20 Bicentennial Circle
 6 Sacramento, CA 95826
 Telephone: (916) 379-3500
 Facsimile: (916) 379-3599
cwood@dbbwlaw.com
kfisher@dbbwlaw.com

7 JOHN P. KRISTENSEN (SBN 224132)
 8 DAVID L. WEISBERG (SBN 211675)
 9 **KRI STENSEN WEI SBERG, LLP**
 10 12304 Santa Monica Boulevard, Suite 100
 Los Angeles, CA 90025
 Telephone: (310) 507-7924
 Facsimile: (310) 507-7906
john@kristensenlaw.com
david@kristensenlaw.com

11 *Attorneys for Plaintiff and all similarly*
 12 *situated*

JEFFREY A. BACKMAN (*Pro Hac Vice*)
 Fla. Bar No. 662501
 RICHARD W. EPSTEIN (*Pro Hac Vice*)
 Fla. Bar No. 229091
GREENSPOON MARDER, P.A.
 200 East Broward Blvd.
 Suite 1800
 Fort Lauderdale, FL 33301
 Telephone: (954) 491-1120
 Facsimile: (954) 213-0140
jeffrey.backman@gmlaw.com
richard.epstein@gmlaw.com

ROBERT S. BOULTER (SBN 153549)
 1101 5th Avenue,
 Suite 235
 San Rafael, CA 94901
 Telephone: (415) 233-7100
rsb@boulter-law.com

Attorneys for Defendant Caribbean Cruise
Line, Inc.

Kenneth C. Mennemeier (SBN 113973)
MENNEMEIER GLASSMAN LLP
 980 9th Street, Suite 2190
 Sacramento, CA 95814
 Telephone: (916) 553-4000
kcm@mgslaw.com

Attorneys for Defendants Sun Bridge
Systems, LLC and The Marketing Source

THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA – SACRAMENTO DIVISION

HOLLY LIVELY, on behalf of herself and all
 others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

CARIBBEAN CRUISE LINES, INC., a
 Florida Corporation; SUNBRIDGE
 SYSTEMS, LLC, a Florida Limited Liability
 Company; THE MARKETING SOURCE,
 INC., a Florida Corporation; and DOES 3
 through 20, inclusive, and each of them,

Defendants.

) Case No.: 14-cv-00953-JAM-CKD

) **CLASS ACTION**

) **STIPULATION AND [Proposed]**
) **ORDER TO TRANSFER VENUE TO THE**
) **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
) **FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF**
) **FLORIDA**

) **[28 U.S.C. § 1404(a)]**

1 **STIPULATION**

2 Plaintiff Holly Lively (“Plaintiff”)¹ and Defendants Caribbean Cruise Line, Inc.
3 (“CCL”), Sun Bridge Systems, LLC (“Sun Bridge”), and The Marketing Source, Inc.
4 (“Marketing Source”) (collectively “Defendants”), by and through their respective
5 undersigned counsel, hereby stipulate and agree as follows:

6 On April 17, 2014, Plaintiff filed the Complaint asserting class action allegations for
7 damages and injunctive relief pursuant to the Telephone Consumer Protection Act, 47
8 U.S.C. § 227, et seq. in the United States District Court, Eastern District of California,
9 naming as a Defendant CCL (the “*Lively* Action”) (Dkt. No. 1.).

10 On January 6, 2015, Plaintiff filed a First Amended Complaint, which included Sun
11 Bridge and Marketing Source as Defendants (Dkt. No. 29.).

12 On March 18, 2015, Sun Bridge filed a Motion to Dismiss for Lack of Personal
13 Jurisdiction (Dkt. No. 44.).

14
15 On April 22, 2015, Plaintiff filed a Motion to Transfer this Matter to the Southern
16 District of Florida pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1404(a), (Dkt. No. 47), where a related action
17 (the *Kilpatrick* Action), against different Defendants, presenting similar factual and legal
18 issues, is presently pending. While there are certain different named Defendants, the
19 alleged core conduct here, *i.e.*, the alleged receipt of telephone calls from “Jennifer at
20 Caribbean Cruise Line”, makes transfer (and eventual relation and consolidation) in the
21 Southern District of Florida appropriate. Indeed, both actions seek relief on behalf of a
22 nationwide class of individuals alleged to have received the “Jennifer calls” in violation of
23

24
25 ¹ Plaintiff *Kilpatrick*, the named Plaintiff in the case pending in the Southern District of Florida,
26 *Kilpatrick v. Caribbean Cruise Line, Inc., et al.*, Case No.: 14-cv-61572-BB (S.D. Fla. 2014) (the
27 “*Kilpatrick* Action”), also consents to the relief sought in this Motion and intends to join the
28 parties in seeking consolidation for all purposes before the Honorable Beth Bloom, the presiding
judge in the *Kilpatrick* Action. Counsel for *Kilpatrick* and *Lively* have also agreed that once
consolidation is effectuated, a Consolidated Class Action Complaint will be filed so that there is
only one action moving forward.

1 the TCPA.² The Motion to Transfer is set for oral argument on June 17, 2015.

2 Since the filing of the Motion to Transfer, the parties in this action and in the
3 *Kilpatrick* Action have conferred and have agreed that a transfer of the *Lively* Action to the
4 Southern District of Florida, so that it can be consolidated for all purposes into the
5 *Kilpatrick* Action and a Consolidated Class Action Complaint can be filed, is appropriate to
6 avoid duplicative litigation, to further the convenience of the parties and witnesses, and to
7 best serve the interests of justice.³ Thus, given the alleged similarities between the two
8 cases, the fact that the same underlying conduct is being challenged, and that some of the
9 Defendants in both cases are alleged to be involved in some fashion, the Parties request
10 that the Court transfer this case to the Southern District of Florida, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §
11 1404(a), so it may ultimately be consolidated with the *Kilpatrick* Action.

12
13 Dated: June 4, 2015

Respectfully submitted,

14 By: /s/ John P. Kristensen

15 Christopher W. Wood (SBN 193955)
16 cwood@dbbwlaw.com
17 Kelsey J. Fischer (SBN 292262)
kfischer@dbbwlaw.com

18 ² Compare the current Complaints in each action, copies of which are attached as Composite
19 Exhibit "A" for the Court's convenience.

20 ³ By joining in Plaintiff's Motion to Transfer, Defendants do not admit or acknowledge the truth
21 or veracity of any of Plaintiff's allegations in either the Amended Complaint or the Motion to
22 Transfer. In fact, Defendants expressly deny those allegations and have set forth their
23 respective defenses in their respective Motions to Dismiss and/or Answers and Affirmative
24 Defenses. Nor do Defendants intend to concede that any of the requisite elements set forth in
25 Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23 are satisfied and nothing contained in this Stipulation or in
26 the Motion to Transfer can be used against Defendants to support any argument for class
27 certification. The purpose of this Stipulation is to have this case transferred to the Southern
28 District of Florida so that it can be consolidated with a similar case and so that the related
proceedings can be coordinated. The idea is to avoid having Defendants be subject to similar
competing putative class actions (to the extent a class is deemed appropriate) throughout the
country and to avoid duplicative discovery and other pre-trial proceedings. Defendants have
consented to the Motion to Transfer solely out of convenience and to avoid the time, expense
and inconsistencies that could sometimes result from multiple class actions pending in different
venues. Finally, Defendants and Plaintiffs agree that they will seek consolidation before the
Kilpatrick court, Plaintiffs will file a Consolidated Class Action Complaint and the parties will
jointly request the implementation of a reasonable schedule moving forward in a coordinated
manner before Judge Bloom in the Southern District of Florida.

1 **Dreyer Babich Buccola**
2 **Wood Campora, LLP**

3 John P. Kristensen (SBN 224132)
4 *john@kristensenlaw.com*

5 David L. Weisberg (SBN 211675)
6 *david@kristensenlaw.com*

7 **Kristensen Weisberg, LLP**

8 *Attorneys for Plaintiff*

9 Jeffrey A. Backman (*Pro Hac Vice*)

10 Fla. Bar No. 662501

11 *Jeffrey.backman@gmlaw.com*

12 Richard W. Epstein (*Pro Hac Vice*)

13 FL Bar No. 229091

14 *richard.epstein@gmlaw.com*

15 **GREENSPOON MARDER, P.A.**

16 ROBERT S. BOULTER (SBN 153549)

17 *rsb@boulter-law.com*

18 *Attorneys for Defendant Caribbean Cruise*
19 *Line, Inc.*

20 Kenneth C. Mennemeier (SBN 113973)

21 980 9th Street, Suite 2190

22 Sacramento, CA 95814

23 Telephone: (916) 553-4000

24 *kcm@mgsllaw.com*

25 **MENNEMEIER GLASSMAN LLP**

26 *Attorneys for Defendants Sun Bridge*
27 *Systems, LLC and The Marketing Source*

28 **ORDER**

Based on the foregoing, and finding that it is in the interests of justice, IT IS
HEBERY ORDERED that this case be transferred to the United States District Court for the
Southern District of Florida, Fort Lauderdale Division, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1404(A).

Dated: June 4, 2015

/s/ JOHN A. MENDEZ
HON. JOHN A. MENDEZ