

1 REID, AXELROD
 2 Donald S. Honigman, SB# 106914
 3 315 Montgomery Street, Suite 800
 4 San Francisco, CA 94104
 5 Phone: (415) 451-3300
 6 Fax: (415) 451-3307
 7 Email: dsh@rarmllaw.com

8 Attorneys for Defendant
 9 DELTA AIR LINES, INC.

10 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
 11 FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

12 DAMIAN J. WILLIAMS,

CASE NO.: 2:16-cv-02089-VC

13 Plaintiff,

**STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER
 FOR STANDARD LITIGATION**

14 vs.

15 NORTH CAROLINA AVIATION SERVICES
 16 dba/aka GLOBAL AVIATION SERVICES,
 17 LLC, DELTA AIRLINES, and DOES 1
 18 through 10, inclusive,

19 Defendants.

20
 21 This Stipulated Protective Order is copied from the Model Protective Order except the
 22 last paragraph. We are identifying this deviation pursuant to the Court’s standing Order Para 16.

23 1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

24 Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production of
 25 confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public
 26 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted.
 27 Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following
 28 Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket

1 protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from
2 public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to
3 confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as
4 set forth in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to
5 file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that
6 must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the
7 court to file material under seal.

8 **2. DEFINITIONS**

9 2.1 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of
10 information or items under this Order.

11 2.2 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is
12 generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal
13 Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c).

14 2.3 Counsel (without qualifier): Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as
15 well as their support staff).

16 2.4 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items
17 that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

18 2.5 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the
19 medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other
20 things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures
21 or responses to discovery in this matter.

22 2.6 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent
23 to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or
24 as a consultant in this action.

25 2.7 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this action. House
26 Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.

27 2.8 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other
28

1 legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

2 2.9 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this
3 action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this action and have appeared in this
4 action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of
5 that party.

6 2.10 Party: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors, employees,
7 consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).

8 2.11 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery
9 Material in this action.

10 2.12 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support services
11 (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and
12 organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and
13 subcontractors.

14 2.13 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as
15 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

16 2.14 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a
17 Producing Party.

18
19 **3. SCOPE**

20 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected
21 Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected
22 Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any
23 testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal
24 Protected Material. However, the protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order do not
25 cover the following information: (a) any information that is in the public domain at the time of
26 disclosure to a Receiving Party or becomes part of the public domain after its disclosure to a
27 Receiving Party as a result of publication not involving a violation of this Order, including
28 becoming part of the public record through trial or otherwise; and (b) any information known to

1 the Receiving Party prior to the disclosure or obtained by the Receiving Party after the
2 disclosure from a source who obtained the information lawfully and under no obligation of
3 confidentiality to the Designating Party. Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed
4 by a separate agreement or order.

5 4. DURATION

6 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by
7 this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court
8 order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all
9 claims and defenses in this action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after
10 the completion and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this
11 action, including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time
12 pursuant to applicable law.

13 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

14 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each Party
15 or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care
16 to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards.
17 The Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents,
18 items, or oral or written communications that qualify – so that other portions of the material,
19 documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept
20 unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

21 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are
22 shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to
23 unnecessarily encumber or retard the case development process or to impose unnecessary
24 expenses and burdens on other parties) expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

25 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it designated for
26 protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other
27 Parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.
28

1 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this Order
2 (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered,
3 Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly
4 so designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

5 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

6 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but
7 excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing
8 Party affix the legend “CONFIDENTIAL” to each page that contains protected material. If only
9 a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also
10 must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the
11 margins).

12 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents or materials available for inspection need
13 not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which material it
14 would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the
15 material made available for inspection shall be deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the
16 inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party
17 must determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order.
18 Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the
19 “CONFIDENTIAL” legend to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or
20 portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly
21 identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

22 (b) for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial proceedings, that the
23 Designating Party identify on the record, before the close of the deposition, hearing, or other
24 proceeding, all protected testimony.

25 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any
26 other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the
27 container or containers in which the information or item is stored the legend
28

1 “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection,
2 the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

3 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to
4 designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party’s
5 right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a
6 designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is
7 treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

8 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

9 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of
10 confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating Party’s confidentiality
11 designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic
12 burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a Party does not waive its right to
13 challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the
14 original designation is disclosed.

15 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution
16 process by providing written notice of each designation it is challenging and describing the
17 basis for each challenge. To avoid ambiguity as to whether a challenge has been made, the
18 written notice must recite that the challenge to confidentiality is being made in accordance with
19 this specific paragraph of the Protective Order. The parties shall attempt to resolve each
20 challenge in good faith and must begin the process by conferring directly (in voice to voice
21 dialogue; other forms of communication are not sufficient) within 14 days of the date of service
22 of notice. In conferring, the Challenging Party must explain the basis for its belief that the
23 confidentiality designation was not proper and must give the Designating Party an opportunity
24 to review the designated material, to reconsider the circumstances, and, if no change in
25 designation is offered, to explain the basis for the chosen designation. A Challenging Party may
26 proceed to the next stage of the challenge process only if it has engaged in this meet and confer
27 process first or establishes that the Designating Party is unwilling to participate in the meet and
28

1 confer process in a timely manner.

2 6.3 Judicial Intervention. If the Parties cannot resolve a challenge without court
3 intervention, the Designating Party shall file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality under
4 Civil Local Rule 7 (and in compliance with Civil Local Rule 79-5, if applicable) within 21 days
5 of the initial notice of challenge or within 14 days of the parties agreeing that the meet and
6 confer process will not resolve their dispute, whichever is earlier. Each such motion must be
7 accompanied by a competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet
8 and confer requirements imposed in the preceding paragraph. Failure by the Designating Party
9 to make such a motion including the required declaration within 21 days (or 14 days, if
10 applicable) shall automatically waive the confidentiality designation for each challenged
11 designation. In addition, the Challenging Party may file a motion challenging a confidentiality
12 designation at any time if there is good cause for doing so, including a challenge to the
13 designation of a deposition transcript or any portions thereof. Any motion brought pursuant to
14 this provision must be accompanied by a competent declaration affirming that the movant has
15 complied with the meet and confer requirements imposed by the preceding paragraph.
16

17 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating
18 Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose
19 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to
20 sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived the confidentiality designation by failing to
21 file a motion to retain confidentiality as described above, all parties shall continue to afford the
22 material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's
23 designation until the court rules on the challenge.

24 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

25 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed
26 or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this case only for
27 prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Such Protected Material may be
28 disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order.

1 When the litigation has been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of
2 section 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

3 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and
4 in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

5 7.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless otherwise
6 ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may
7 disclose any information or item designated “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

8 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this action, as well as
9 employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the
10 information for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be
11 Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A;

12 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving
13 Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the
14 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

15 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is
16 reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and
17 Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

18 (d) the court and its personnel;

19 (e) court reporters and their staff, professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors,
20 and Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who
21 have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

22 (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is reasonably
23 necessary and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A),
24 unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed
25 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material must be separately
26 bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this
27 Stipulated Protective Order.
28

1 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or
2 other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

3 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER
4 LITIGATION

5 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that
6 compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as
7 “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

8 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a
9 copy of the subpoena or court order;

10 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in
11 the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to
12 this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order;
13 and

14 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the
15 Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

16
17 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the
18 subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as
19 “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order
20 issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s permission. The Designating Party
21 shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material
22 – and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a
23 Receiving Party in this action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

24 9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN THIS
25 LITIGATION

26 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in
27 this action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information produced by Non-Parties in
28 connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order.

1 Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking
2 additional protections.

3 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a
4 Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement
5 with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's confidential information, then the Party
6 shall:

7 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some
8 or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;

9 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective
10 Order in this litigation, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description
11 of the information requested; and

12 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party.

13 (c) If the Non-Party fails to object or seek a protective order from this court within
14 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may
15 produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the
16 Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any
17 information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the
18 Non-Party before a determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-
19 Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected
20 Material.
21

22 10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

23 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected
24 Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective
25 Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the
26 unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the
27 Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were
28 made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the

1 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

2 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED
3 MATERIAL

4 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently
5 produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the
6 Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This
7 provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery
8 order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of
9 Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of
10 a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product
11 protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order
12 submitted to the court.

13 12. MISCELLANEOUS

14 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to
15 seek its modification by the court in the future.

16 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective
17 Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing
18 any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order.
19 Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the
20 material covered by this Protective Order.

21 12.3 Filing Protected Material. Without written permission from the Designating
22 Party or a court order secured after appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not
23 file in the public record in this action any Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under
24 seal any Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may
25 only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific
26 Protected Material at issue. Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 79-5, a sealing order will issue only
27 upon a request establishing that the Protected Material at issue is privileged, protectable as a
28

1 trade secret, or otherwise entitled to protection under the law. If a Receiving Party's request to
2 file Protected Material under seal pursuant to Civil Local Rule 79-5(d) is denied by the court,
3 then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public record pursuant to Civil Local
4 Rule 79-5(e) unless otherwise instructed by the court.

5 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

6 Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all
7 pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda,
8 correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and
9 consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such
10 archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective
11 Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

12 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

14 DATED: April 13, 2017

/s/ Daniel Schneiderman

Daniel G. Schneiderman
Attorneys for Plaintiff
Damian J. Williams

18 DATED: April 13, 2017

/s/ Robert E. Davies

Robert E. Davies
Attorneys for Defendant
North Carolina Aviation Services dba/aka
Global Aviation Services, LLC

22 DATED: April 13, 2017

/s/ Donald S. Honigman

Donald S. Honigman
Attorneys for Defendant
Delta Air Lines, Inc.

1 PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.

2
3 DATED: April 20, 2017



4 _____
United States District Judge

5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28