

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

RONALD OLAJIDE,
Plaintiff,
v.
EDMUND G. BROWN, et al.,
Defendants.

No. 2:17-cv-02168-TLN-KJN

ORDER

On December 8, 2017, plaintiff Ronald Olajide, who proceeds without counsel, filed a motion for default judgement against eighteen of the thirty-one named defendants.¹ (ECF No. 24.) Previously, on November 30, 2017, defendants Sue Frost, Patrick Kennedy, Susan Peters, and Phil Serna filed a motion to dismiss. (ECF No. 21.) The motion to dismiss is still pending, and set to be heard before the undersigned on January 25, 2018, at 10:00 a.m.

With respect to multi-defendant cases, Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 54(b) provides that “the court may direct entry of a final judgment as to one or more, but fewer than all, claims or parties only if the court expressly determines that there is no just reason for delay.” The Ninth Circuit Court of Appeals has characterized the Supreme Court’s holding in Frow v. De La Vega,

¹ Specifically, plaintiff moved for default judgment against defendants Edmund G. Brown, Nancy Skinner, Rob Bonita, Jon Chiang, Xavier Becerra, Michael Sparks, Tevor Dewar, Jared Metcalf, Elizabeth Dunas, Michelle Gregory, Nason Namikawa, Tera Mackey, Brian Cardwell, Sean Kelly, Thomas Asker, Taylor Herrlinger, Mike Robertson, and John Winn.

1 82 U.S. 552 (1872), a leading case addressing the grant of default judgments in multi-defendant
2 cases, as follows:

3 The Court held in Frow that, where a complaint alleges that
4 defendants are jointly liable and one of them defaults, judgment
5 should not be entered against the defaulting defendant until the
6 matter has been adjudicated with regard to all defendants. It
follows that if an action against the answering defendants is decided
in their favor, then the action should be dismissed against both
answering and defaulting defendants.

7 Nelson v. Chang (In re First T.D. & Inv., Inc.), 253 F.3d 520, 532 (9th Cir. 2001) (internal
8 citations and footnote omitted) (citing Frow, 82 U.S. at 554).² In In re First T.D. & Inv., Inc., the
9 Ninth Circuit Court of Appeals followed the Eleventh Circuit Court of Appeals and extended the
10 rule from Frow beyond jointly liable parties to parties that are “similarly situated,” even if not
11 jointly liable or jointly and severally liable. See 253 F.3d at 532; accord Wordtech Sys., Inc. v.
12 Integrated Network Solutions, Corp., No. 2:04-cv-01971-MCE-EFB, 2009 WL 3246612, at *2
13 (E.D. Cal. Oct. 6, 2009) (unpublished) (observing that the rule from Frow “has been extended in
14 cases even if the defendants are not jointly liable, as long as they are similarly situated”).

15 In this case, plaintiff alleges that all thirty-one named defendants were involved in a
16 conspiracy that resulted in breach of contract, breach of the implied covenant of public trust, and
17 violations of the Fourteenth Amendment to the United States Constitution. (See ECF No. 1.) All
18 defendants appear to be similarly situated with respect to plaintiff’s allegations, as plaintiff brings
19 all claims against all defendants, without differentiation. (See Id.) Consequently, the risk of
20 incongruous or inconsistent judgments is not insignificant, if the court were to grant a default
21 judgment against the eighteen defendants named in plaintiff’s motion, but the defendants moving
22 to dismiss were to prevail on the merits.

23 Accordingly it is HEREBY ORDERED that:

24 ///

25 ///

26 ///

27 _____
28 ² In Frow, the Court stated that “a final decree on the merits against the defaulting defendant
alone, pending the continuance of the cause, would be incongruous and illegal.” 82 U.S. at 554.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1. Plaintiff's motion for default judgement (ECF No. 24) is DENIED without prejudice,
as premature.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: December 13, 2017



KENDALL J. NEWMAN
UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE

14/17-2168.olajide.default judgment multiple defendants