Doc. 95 Att. 5

Document 95-6

Filed 10/27/2006

Page 1 of 10

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY

| · interior contraction | LATIONNETS ETESONET |
|--|--|
| UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA | 1 APPEARANCES: |
| THE BOARD OF THE TRUSTEES OF THE LELAND STANFORD JUNIOR UNIVERSITY, | For Plaintiff and Counterclaim Defendants The Board of the Trustees of the Leland Stanford Junior University, |
| Plaintiff, vs. No. C-05-04158 MRP | 4 et al.: 5 COOLEY GODWARD LLP |
| ROCHE MOLECULAR SYSTEMS, INC.; | BY: MICHELLE S. RHYU, PH.D. |
| ROCHE DIAGNOSTICS CORPORATION; ROCHE DIAGNOSTICS OPERATIONS, | 6 Attorney at Law |
| INC.; ROCHE DIAGNOSTIC SYSTEMS, INC., | Five Palo Alto Square, 3000 El Camino Real Palo Alto, California 94306-2155 |
| Defendant. | 7 Palo Alto, California 94306-2155 (650) 857-0663 |
| | 8 |
| AND RELATED COUNTERCLAIM. | For Defendants and Counterclaimants Roche Molecular |
| HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL - ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY | 9 Systems, Inc., et al.: 10 QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART OLIVER & HEDGES, LLP |
| VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION OF SHIRLEY YEE KWOK | BY: BRIAN C. CANNON |
| Redwood Shores, California Thursday, August 10, 2006 | 11 Attorney at Law |
| | 555 Twin Dolphin Drive, Suite 560 |
| Reported by: SUZANNE F. BOSCHETTI | 12 Redwood Shores, California 94065 (650) 801-5001 |
| CSR No. 5111 | 13 |
| Job No. 3-50831 | Videographer: |
| | 14 |
| | RAY TYLER SARNOFF COURT REPORTERS AND LEGAL TECHNOLOGIES |
| | San Francisco, California |
| | 16 (415) 274-9977 |
| | 17 |
| | 19 |
| | 20 |
| | 21 |
| | 22 23 |
| | 23 |
| | 25 |
| Page 1 | Page 3 |
| 1 VALUETTO OF LOTTE DISCONDING COLUMN | |
| 1 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT 2 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA | 1 INDEX |
| NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA 3 | 2 WITNESS: EXAMINATION 3 SHIRLEY YEE KWOK |
| 4 THE BOARD OF THE TRUSTEES OF | 4 |
| THE LELAND STANFORD JUNIOR | BY MS. RHYU 7 |
| 5 UNIVERSITY, | 5 |
| 6 Plaintiff, | 6 EXHIBITS 7 DEPOSITION PAGE |
| 7 vs. No. C-05-04158 MHP | 7 DEPOSITION PAGE 8 586 Lab Notebook No. 2119, issued to Shirley 12 |
| 8 ROCHE MOLECULAR SYSTEMS, INC.; | Kwok, Nov. 15th, 1985, Bates Nos. RMS |
| ROCHE DIAGNOSTICS CORPORATION; | 9 068028 - RMS 068232; 205 pages |
| 9 ROCHE DIAGNOSTICS OPERATIONS, | 10 587 Lab notebook No. 2352 issued to Shirley 13 |
| INC.; ROCHE DIAGNOSTIC SYSTEMS, | Kwok, July 29, 1986, Bates Nos. RMS 11 068808 - RMS 069013; 206 pages |
| 10 INC., | 12 588 Lab notebook No. 2597 issued to Shirley 13 |
| 11 Defendant. | Kwok, March 26, 1987, Bates Nos. RMS |
| | 13 069218 - RMS 069420; 203 pages |
| 12 | 14 589 Lab notebook No. 2883 issued to Shirley 14 |
| AND RELATED COUNTERCLAIM. | Kwok, November 2, 1987, Bates Nos. RMS 15 068649 - RMS 068807; 159 pages |
| 13 | 16 590 Lab notebook No. 3153 issued to Shirley 14 |
| 14 | Kwok, 5/18, 1988, Bates Nos. RMS |
| Confidential videotaped deposition of SHIRLEY | 17 068440 - RMS 068648; 209 pages |
| 16 YEE KWOK, taken on behalf of Plaintiff and. 17 Counterclaim Defendants The Board of the Trustees of | 18 591 Lab notebook No. 3456 issued to Shirley 24 |
| | Kwok, Jan 4, 1989, Bates Nos. RMS 19 069606 - RMS 069641; 36 pages |
| 18 the Leland Stanford Junior University, at 555 Twin 19 Dolphin Drive, Suite 560, Redwood Shores, California. | 20 592 Lab notebook No. 3532 issued to Shirley 28 |
| 20 beginning at 9:36 a.m. and ending at 2:23 p.m. on | Kwok, Feb 21, 1989, Bates Nos. RMS |
| 21 Thursday, August 10, 2006, before SUZANNE F. | 21 067714 - RMS 067920; 207 pages |
| 22 BOSCHETTI, Certified Shorthand Reporter No. 5111. | 22 593 Lab notebook No. 4489 issued to Shirley 40 |
| 23 | Kwok, Feb 21, 1991, Bates Nos. RMS 069847 - RMS 070052; 206 pages |
| 24 | 24 594 Agreement between Hoffmann-La Roche, Inc. 34 |
| 25 | and Cetus Corporation, Bates Nos. RMS |
| | 25 0062977 - RMS 0063011; 35 pages |
| Page 2 | Page 4 |

1 (Pages 1 to 4)

| 11:12:24 1 us the ability to quantify. | :16:26 1 Q. And do you recall what time frame he did |
|---|---|
| 11:12:24 2 BY MS. RHYU: 11: | :16:28 2 that work? |
| 11:12:36 3 Q. And when you're describing using HIV 11: | :16:30 3 A. No, I don't. |
| 11:12:38 4 templates of approximate copy numbers and 11: | :16:31 4 Q. Do you have any idea what year he did that |
| 11:12:43 5 specifically referring to the work that you did 11: | :16:33 5 work? |
| 11:12:45 6 between 1986 and 1991, there are you just referring 11: | :16:41 6 A. I don't remember. |
| 11:12:50 7 to HIV DNA templates? | :16:41 7 Q. How about Nancy McKinney, do you know |
| 11:12:54 8 MR. CANNON: Object as to form. 11: | :16:44 8 she did any work using an RNA template for |
| 11:13:01 9 THE WITNESS: Definitely HIV DNA templates 11: | :16:49 9 quantitation of HIV? |
| 11:13:04 10 were used. 11: | :16:50 10 A. Actually, let me there was one other |
| 11:13:04 11 BY MS. RHYU: 11: | :16:52 11 individual, John Mulder, who was also in my group |
| 11:13:11 12 Q. And who else worked with you to in this 11: | :16:59 12 Q. Was John Mulder in your group while at |
| 11:13:16 13 work? Actually, let me withdraw that question. | :17:02 13 Cetus? |
| 11:13:21 14 You said definitely DNA templates. Were 11: | : 17: 03 14 A. I believe so. |
| 11:13:24 15 there any other templates that you worked on in 11: | 17:09 15 Q. You recall John Mulder as an employee of |
| 11:13:27 16 this time period '86 to '91? | 17:13 16 Cetus? |
| 11:13:30 17 A. It's the time period that I'm not I don't 11: | 17:13 17 A. Yes. Or during yes, during that |
| 11:13:32 18 have a good recollection of. We worked with DNA as 11: | 17:16 18 transition. Either before or around the transition |
| 11:13:36 19 well as RNA templates, but it's the time frame that 11: | 17:19 19 period. I don't remember exactly, but I do remember |
| 11:13:39 20 I'm not sure of. 11: | 17:22 20 him being at Cetus. |
| | 17:25 21 Q. Is it possible that I'm sorry? |
| 1 | 17:28 22 A. He was hired while we were at Cetus. |
| | 17:30 23 Q. He was hired while you were at Cetus? |
| 1 | 17:32 24 A. Mm-hmm. |
| 11:13:51 25 using DNA templates? | 17:34 25 Q. Is it possible that he was a Roche |
| Page 49 | Page 5: |
| 11:13:54 1 A. David Kellogg, Nancy McKinney. I don't think 11:1 | 17:36 1 employee that worked with you at Cetus just prior |
| | 17:36 1 employee that worked with you at Cetus just prior to the transition where Roche acquired some Cetus |
| | 17:50 3 assets? |
| | 17:58 4 A. It's possible, but that's not my |
| | 18:00 5 recollection. |
| | 18:01 6 Q. Okay. How about Nancy McKinney; do you |
| 144 44 40 - | 18:06 7 know if she did any work with RNA quantification, |
| | 18:10 8 HIV RNA quantification? |
| las as many and the second of | 18:15 9 A. I believe she did. |
| | 18:17 10 Q. And do you have any memory of what time |
| 11:15:08 11 Q. And do you specifically recall whether 11:1 | 18:19 11 frame she did that work? |
| | 18:22 12 A. I don't remember. |
| 11:15:15 13 RNA? 11:1 | .8:30 13 Q. Did any of these three people, David |
| 11:15:27 14 A. 1991. Yes, he did. | .8:32 14 Kellogg, Nancy McKinney or John Mulder, use RNA |
| 11:15:30 15 Q. And what do you recall about that? | .8:41 15 quantitation techniques on samples from treated |
| 11:15:34 16 A. My recollection is that he worked on a | .8:47 16 patients, treated HIV patients? |
| 1 | 8:50 17 MR. CANNON: Objection as to form. |
| | 8:57 18 THE WITNESS: Are you asking specifically |
| 1 | 8:59 19 during this time period? |
| 11:15:59 20 anything to me. 11:18 | 8:59 20 BY MS. RHYU: |
| I | 9:01 21 Q. Yes. 1986 to 1991. |
| l | 9:12 22 A. I don't remember. |
| I | 9:12 23 Q. You don't remember one way or the other or |
| • • | 9:14 24 you don't think so? |
| | 9:16 25 A. No, I don't I don't remember. We worked |
| Page 50 | Page 52 |

13 (Pages 49 to 52)

| 1 | | | |
|---|--|---|--|
| 11:19:18 1 | with a lot of samples, but I don't I don't recall | 11:22:19 1 | trip to Stanford with John Sninsky. Do you |
| 11:19:22 2 | specifically whether they were treated or untreated or | 11:22:23 2 | remember when it was, approximately what year? |
| 11:19:25 3 | a combination of both. | 11:22:27 3 | A. No. I have I only remember going there. |
| 11:19:46 4 | Q. So as to the HIV quantitation work that | 11:22:32 4 | I don't have any recollection of what was discussed. |
| 11:19:49 5 | was going on at Cetus in the 1986 to 1991 time | 11:22:37 5 | Q. Do you remember if any reagents were taken |
| 11:19:52 6 | frame, is it fair to say that the people doing that | 11:22:40 6 | to Stanford on that occasion? |
| 11:19:56 7 | work at Cetus were you, David Kellogg, Nancy | 11:22:42 7 | A. I don't remember. |
| 11:20:04 8 | McKinney and John Mulder? | 11:22:43 8 | Q. Do you remember who you talked to |
| 11:20:06 9 | MR. CANNON: Objection as to form. | 11:22:45 9 | besides or do you remember if you talked to |
| 11:20:11 10 | THE WITNESS: As far as I can remember. | 11:22:48 10 | anyone besides Dr. Merigan on that trip? |
| 11:20:11 11 | BY MS. RHYU: | 11:22:52 11 | A. There was another person present, but I can't |
| 11:20:13 12 | Q. You don't remember anyone else doing RNA | 11:22:55 12 | remember who it was. |
| 11:20:16 13 | quantitation work with HIV at Cetus during the 1986 | 11:22:58 13 | Q. And do you remember anything about the |
| 11:20:20 14 | to 1991 time frame? | 11:23:00 14 | subject matter of those discussions that |
| 11:20:22 15 | MR. CANNON: Objection as to form. | 11:23:02 15 | discussion? |
| 11:20:22 16 | BY MS. RHYU: | 11:23:03 16 | A. No. |
| 11:20:29 17 | Q. As the HIV project supervisor? | 11:23:04 17 | Q. Do you remember how long you were there? |
| 11:20:32 18 | A. This was just my small group of four people, | 11:23:07 18 | A. No. It was in the afternoon. It wasn't |
| 11:20:34 19 | so three or four people at the time, so yes. | 11:23:12 19 | hours. It was it was relatively short, but |
| 11:20:36 20 | Q. But that was the HIV group, correct? | 11:23:24 20 | Q. Did you ever give Dr. Merigan any |
| 11:20:39 21 | A. Right. In terms of developing that was at | 11:23:29 21 | materials, scientific materials or reagents? |
| 11:20:44 22 | least the group that I was responsible for that was | 11:23:33 22 | A. Not that I recall. |
| 11:20:47 23 | doing the work. | 11:23:39 23 | Q. Did you ever talk to him specifically |
| 11:20:47 24 | Q. And that was the group at Cetus that was | 11:23:41 24 | about your experiments? |
| 11:20:50 25 | responsible for developing a for developing | 11:23:43 25 | A. No. |
| | Page 53 | | Page 55 |
| 11:20:58 1 | quantitative assays for detecting HIV nucleic | 11:23:47 1 | Q. Did you ever give Dr. Merigan any |
| 11:21:06 2 | acids, correct? | 11:23:49 2 | confidential any information that was |
| 11:21:07 3 | A. Mm-hmm. | 11:23:51 3 | confidential to Cetus? |
| 11:21:07 4 | Q. Is that a yes? | 11:23:53 4 | A. I didn't speak to him. |
| 1 | A. Yes. | ! | |
| 11:21:08 5 | | 11:24:00 5 | Q. Do you know Dr. Mark Holodniy? |
| 11:21:08 5 | Q. Do you know Dr. Thomas Merigan? | 11:24:00 5 11:24:04 6 | • |
| | | | Q. Do you know Dr. Mark Holodniy? |
| 11:21:25 6 | Q. Do you know Dr. Thomas Merigan? | 11:24:04 6 | Q. Do you know Dr. Mark Holodniy?A. I know who he is. |
| 11:21:25 6 11:21:28 7 | Q. Do you know Dr. Thomas Merigan?A. I know of him. | 11:24:04 6 11:24:05 7 | Q. Do you know Dr. Mark Holodniy?A. I know who he is.Q. Have you met him? |
| 11:21:25 6 11:21:28 7 11:21:29 8 | Q. Do you know Dr. Thomas Merigan?A. I know of him.Q. Have you ever met him? | 11:24:04 6 11:24:05 7 11:24:07 8 | Q. Do you know Dr. Mark Holodniy?A. I know who he is.Q. Have you met him?A. Yes. |
| 11:21:25 6 11:21:28 7 11:21:29 8 11:21:31 9 | Q. Do you know Dr. Thomas Merigan?A. I know of him.Q. Have you ever met him?A. I've met him. | 11:24:04 6 11:24:05 7 11:24:07 8 11:24:07 9 | Q. Do you know Dr. Mark Holodniy?A. I know who he is.Q. Have you met him?A. Yes.Q. And when do you recall meeting him? |
| 11:21:25 6 11:21:28 7 11:21:29 8 11:21:31 9 11:21:32 10 | Q. Do you know Dr. Thomas Merigan?A. I know of him.Q. Have you ever met him?A. I've met him.Q. When have you met him? | 11:24:04 6 11:24:05 7 11:24:07 8 11:24:07 9 11:24:16 10 | Q. Do you know Dr. Mark Holodniy?A. I know who he is.Q. Have you met him?A. Yes.Q. And when do you recall meeting him?A. I don't have a specific date. |
| 11:21:25 6 11:21:28 7 11:21:29 8 11:21:31 9 11:21:32 10 11:21:37 11 | Q. Do you know Dr. Thomas Merigan? A. I know of him. Q. Have you ever met him? A. I've met him. Q. When have you met him? A. A long time many, many years ago. I don't | 11:24:04 6 11:24:05 7 11:24:07 8 11:24:07 9 11:24:16 10 11:24:18 11 | Q. Do you know Dr. Mark Holodniy? A. I know who he is. Q. Have you met him? A. Yes. Q. And when do you recall meeting him? A. I don't have a specific date. Q. Do you have a general memory of meeting |
| 11:21:25 6 11:21:28 7 11:21:29 8 11:21:31 9 11:21:32 10 11:21:37 11 11:21:41 12 | Q. Do you know Dr. Thomas Merigan? A. I know of him. Q. Have you ever met him? A. I've met him. Q. When have you met him? A. A long time many, many years ago. I don't remember. | 11:24:04 6 11:24:05 7 11:24:07 8 11:24:07 9 11:24:16 10 11:24:18 11 11:24:21 12 | Q. Do you know Dr. Mark Holodniy? A. I know who he is. Q. Have you met him? A. Yes. Q. And when do you recall meeting him? A. I don't have a specific date. Q. Do you have a general memory of meeting him? |
| 11:21:25 6 11:21:28 7 11:21:29 8 11:21:31 9 11:21:32 10 11:21:37 11 11:21:41 12 11:21:41 13 | Q. Do you know Dr. Thomas Merigan? A. I know of him. Q. Have you ever met him? A. I've met him. Q. When have you met him? A. A long time many, many years ago. I don't remember. Q. Do you remember where you met him? | 11:24:04 6 11:24:05 7 11:24:07 8 11:24:07 9 11:24:16 10 11:24:18 11 11:24:21 12 11:24:22 13 | Q. Do you know Dr. Mark Holodniy? A. I know who he is. Q. Have you met him? A. Yes. Q. And when do you recall meeting him? A. I don't have a specific date. Q. Do you have a general memory of meeting him? A. It was probably in when I was at Cetus. |
| 11:21:25 6 11:21:28 7 11:21:29 8 11:21:31 9 11:21:32 10 11:21:37 11 11:21:41 12 11:21:41 13 11:21:46 14 | Q. Do you know Dr. Thomas Merigan? A. I know of him. Q. Have you ever met him? A. I've met him. Q. When have you met him? A. A long time many, many years ago. I don't remember. Q. Do you remember where you met him? A. I think I met him at Stanford. | 11:24:04 6 11:24:05 7 11:24:07 8 11:24:07 9 11:24:16 10 11:24:18 11 11:24:21 12 11:24:22 13 11:24:28 14 | Q. Do you know Dr. Mark Holodniy? A. I know who he is. Q. Have you met him? A. Yes. Q. And when do you recall meeting him? A. I don't have a specific date. Q. Do you have a general memory of meeting him? A. It was probably in when I was at Cetus. Q. So do you have a memory of seeing |
| 11:21:25 6 11:21:28 7 11:21:29 8 11:21:31 9 11:21:32 10 11:21:37 11 11:21:41 12 11:21:44 13 11:21:46 14 11:21:49 15 | Q. Do you know Dr. Thomas Merigan? A. I know of him. Q. Have you ever met him? A. I've met him. Q. When have you met him? A. A long time many, many years ago. I don't remember. Q. Do you remember where you met him? A. I think I met him at Stanford. Q. And what were you doing at Stanford? | 11:24:04 6 11:24:05 7 11:24:07 8 11:24:07 9 11:24:16 10 11:24:18 11 11:24:21 12 11:24:22 13 11:24:28 14 11:24:32 15 | Q. Do you know Dr. Mark Holodniy? A. I know who he is. Q. Have you met him? A. Yes. Q. And when do you recall meeting him? A. I don't have a specific date. Q. Do you have a general memory of meeting him? A. It was probably in when I was at Cetus. Q. So do you have a memory of seeing Dr. Holodniy at Cetus? |
| 11:21:25 6 11:21:28 7 11:21:29 8 11:21:31 9 11:21:32 10 11:21:37 11 11:21:41 12 11:21:41 13 11:21:46 14 11:21:49 15 11:21:51 16 | Q. Do you know Dr. Thomas Merigan? A. I know of him. Q. Have you ever met him? A. I've met him. Q. When have you met him? A. A long time many, many years ago. I don't remember. Q. Do you remember where you met him? A. I think I met him at Stanford. Q. And what were you doing at Stanford? A. I don't remember the exact specifics. My | 11:24:04 6 11:24:05 7 11:24:07 8 11:24:16 10 11:24:18 11 11:24:21 12 11:24:22 13 11:24:28 14 11:24:32 15 11:24:35 16 | Q. Do you know Dr. Mark Holodniy? A. I know who he is. Q. Have you met him? A. Yes. Q. And when do you recall meeting him? A. I don't have a specific date. Q. Do you have a general memory of meeting him? A. It was probably in when I was at Cetus. Q. So do you have a memory of seeing Dr. Holodniy at Cetus? A. Yes, I did see him at Cetus, but I didn't |
| 11:21:25 6 11:21:28 7 11:21:29 8 11:21:31 9 11:21:37 11 11:21:41 12 11:21:41 13 11:21:46 14 11:21:49 15 11:21:51 16 11:21:56 17 | Q. Do you know Dr. Thomas Merigan? A. I know of him. Q. Have you ever met him? A. I've met him. Q. When have you met him? A. A long time many, many years ago. I don't remember. Q. Do you remember where you met him? A. I think I met him at Stanford. Q. And what were you doing at Stanford? A. I don't remember the exact specifics. My boss and I went to talk to them one afternoon. But I | 11:24:04 6 11:24:05 7 11:24:07 8 11:24:16 10 11:24:18 11 11:24:21 12 11:24:22 13 11:24:28 14 11:24:32 15 11:24:35 16 11:24:38 17 | Q. Do you know Dr. Mark Holodniy? A. I know who he is. Q. Have you met him? A. Yes. Q. And when do you recall meeting him? A. I don't have a specific date. Q. Do you have a general memory of meeting him? A. It was probably in when I was at Cetus. Q. So do you have a memory of seeing Dr. Holodniy at Cetus? A. Yes, I did see him at Cetus, but I didn't interact with him. |
| 11:21:25 6 11:21:28 7 11:21:29 8 11:21:31 9 11:21:37 11 11:21:41 12 11:21:41 13 11:21:46 14 11:21:49 15 11:21:51 16 11:21:56 17 11:22:02 18 | Q. Do you know Dr. Thomas Merigan? A. I know of him. Q. Have you ever met him? A. I've met him. Q. When have you met him? A. A long time many, many years ago. I don't remember. Q. Do you remember where you met him? A. I think I met him at Stanford. Q. And what were you doing at Stanford? A. I don't remember the exact specifics. My boss and I went to talk to them one afternoon. But I don't remember the context of those discussions. | 11:24:04 6 11:24:05 7 11:24:07 8 11:24:16 10 11:24:18 11 11:24:21 12 11:24:22 13 11:24:28 14 11:24:32 15 11:24:35 16 11:24:38 17 11:24:40 18 | Q. Do you know Dr. Mark Holodniy? A. I know who he is. Q. Have you met him? A. Yes. Q. And when do you recall meeting him? A. I don't have a specific date. Q. Do you have a general memory of meeting him? A. It was probably in when I was at Cetus. Q. So do you have a memory of seeing Dr. Holodniy at Cetus? A. Yes, I did see him at Cetus, but I didn't interact with him. Q. So you didn't have any conversations with |
| 11:21:25 6 11:21:28 7 11:21:29 8 11:21:31 9 11:21:37 11 11:21:41 12 11:21:41 13 11:21:46 14 11:21:49 15 11:21:51 16 11:21:56 17 11:22:02 18 11:22:05 19 | Q. Do you know Dr. Thomas Merigan? A. I know of him. Q. Have you ever met him? A. I've met him. Q. When have you met him? A. A long time many, many years ago. I don't remember. Q. Do you remember where you met him? A. I think I met him at Stanford. Q. And what were you doing at Stanford? A. I don't remember the exact specifics. My boss and I went to talk to them one afternoon. But I don't remember the context of those discussions. Q. Your boss is John Sninsky? | 11:24:04 6 11:24:05 7 11:24:07 8 11:24:16 10 11:24:18 11 11:24:21 12 11:24:22 13 11:24:28 14 11:24:32 15 11:24:35 16 11:24:38 17 11:24:40 18 11:24:42 19 | Q. Do you know Dr. Mark Holodniy? A. I know who he is. Q. Have you met him? A. Yes. Q. And when do you recall meeting him? A. I don't have a specific date. Q. Do you have a general memory of meeting him? A. It was probably in when I was at Cetus. Q. So do you have a memory of seeing Dr. Holodniy at Cetus? A. Yes, I did see him at Cetus, but I didn't interact with him. Q. So you didn't have any conversations with him about science? |
| 11:21:25 6 11:21:28 7 11:21:29 8 11:21:31 9 11:21:37 11 11:21:41 12 11:21:41 13 11:21:46 14 11:21:51 16 11:21:56 17 11:22:02 18 11:22:05 19 11:22:08 20 | Q. Do you know Dr. Thomas Merigan? A. I know of him. Q. Have you ever met him? A. I've met him. Q. When have you met him? A. A long time many, many years ago. I don't remember. Q. Do you remember where you met him? A. I think I met him at Stanford. Q. And what were you doing at Stanford? A. I don't remember the exact specifics. My boss and I went to talk to them one afternoon. But I don't remember the context of those discussions. Q. Your boss is John Sninsky? A. Correct. | 11:24:04 6 11:24:05 7 11:24:07 8 11:24:07 9 11:24:16 10 11:24:18 11 11:24:21 12 11:24:22 13 11:24:28 14 11:24:32 15 11:24:35 16 11:24:38 17 11:24:40 18 11:24:42 19 11:24:46 20 | Q. Do you know Dr. Mark Holodniy? A. I know who he is. Q. Have you met him? A. Yes. Q. And when do you recall meeting him? A. I don't have a specific date. Q. Do you have a general memory of meeting him? A. It was probably in when I was at Cetus. Q. So do you have a memory of seeing Dr. Holodniy at Cetus? A. Yes, I did see him at Cetus, but I didn't interact with him. Q. So you didn't have any conversations with him about science? A. Not that I recall. |
| 11:21:25 6 11:21:28 7 11:21:29 8 11:21:31 9 11:21:37 11 11:21:41 12 11:21:41 13 11:21:46 14 11:21:51 16 11:21:56 17 11:22:02 18 11:22:05 19 11:22:08 20 11:22:08 21 | Q. Do you know Dr. Thomas Merigan? A. I know of him. Q. Have you ever met him? A. I've met him. Q. When have you met him? A. A long time — many, many years ago. I don't remember. Q. Do you remember where you met him? A. I think I met him at Stanford. Q. And what were you doing at Stanford? A. I don't remember the exact specifics. My boss and I went to talk to them one afternoon. But I don't remember the context of those discussions. Q. Your boss is John Sninsky? A. Correct. Q. And I guess your boss was John Sninsky at that time? | 11:24:04 6 11:24:05 7 11:24:07 8 11:24:07 9 11:24:16 10 11:24:18 11 11:24:21 12 11:24:22 13 11:24:28 14 11:24:32 15 11:24:35 16 11:24:38 17 11:24:40 18 11:24:40 18 11:24:46 20 11:24:53 21 | Q. Do you know Dr. Mark Holodniy? A. I know who he is. Q. Have you met him? A. Yes. Q. And when do you recall meeting him? A. I don't have a specific date. Q. Do you have a general memory of meeting him? A. It was probably in when I was at Cetus. Q. So do you have a memory of seeing Dr. Holodniy at Cetus? A. Yes, I did see him at Cetus, but I didn't interact with him. Q. So you didn't have any conversations with him about science? A. Not that I recall. Q. Did you give any reagents or materials to |
| 11:21:25 6 11:21:28 7 11:21:29 8 11:21:31 9 11:21:32 10 11:21:37 11 11:21:41 12 11:21:41 13 11:21:46 14 11:21:51 16 11:21:56 17 11:22:02 18 11:22:08 20 11:22:08 21 11:22:13 22 | Q. Do you know Dr. Thomas Merigan? A. I know of him. Q. Have you ever met him? A. I've met him. Q. When have you met him? A. A long time many, many years ago. I don't remember. Q. Do you remember where you met him? A. I think I met him at Stanford. Q. And what were you doing at Stanford? A. I don't remember the exact specifics. My boss and I went to talk to them one afternoon. But I don't remember the context of those discussions. Q. Your boss is John Sninsky? A. Correct. Q. And I guess your boss was John Sninsky at that time? A. Still is. | 11:24:04 6 11:24:05 7 11:24:07 8 11:24:07 9 11:24:16 10 11:24:18 11 11:24:21 12 11:24:22 13 11:24:28 14 11:24:35 16 11:24:38 17 11:24:40 18 11:24:40 18 11:24:40 20 11:24:53 21 11:24:57 22 | Q. Do you know Dr. Mark Holodniy? A. I know who he is. Q. Have you met him? A. Yes. Q. And when do you recall meeting him? A. I don't have a specific date. Q. Do you have a general memory of meeting him? A. It was probably in when I was at Cetus. Q. So do you have a memory of seeing Dr. Holodniy at Cetus? A. Yes, I did see him at Cetus, but I didn't interact with him. Q. So you didn't have any conversations with him about science? A. Not that I recall. Q. Did you give any reagents or materials to Dr. Holodniy? |
| 11:21:25 6 11:21:28 7 11:21:29 8 11:21:31 9 11:21:37 11 11:21:41 12 11:21:41 13 11:21:46 14 11:21:51 16 11:21:56 17 11:22:02 18 11:22:05 19 11:22:08 20 11:22:08 21 11:22:13 22 11:22:13 23 | Q. Do you know Dr. Thomas Merigan? A. I know of him. Q. Have you ever met him? A. I've met him. Q. When have you met him? A. A long time many, many years ago. I don't remember. Q. Do you remember where you met him? A. I think I met him at Stanford. Q. And what were you doing at Stanford? A. I don't remember the exact specifics. My boss and I went to talk to them one afternoon. But I don't remember the context of those discussions. Q. Your boss is John Sninsky? A. Correct. Q. And I guess your boss was John Sninsky at that time? A. Still is. Q. And I just want to make sure that I | 11:24:04 6 11:24:05 7 11:24:07 8 11:24:07 9 11:24:16 10 11:24:18 11 11:24:21 12 11:24:22 13 11:24:28 14 11:24:32 15 11:24:35 16 11:24:38 17 11:24:40 18 11:24:40 18 11:24:40 20 11:24:53 21 11:24:57 22 11:24:59 23 | Q. Do you know Dr. Mark Holodniy? A. I know who he is. Q. Have you met him? A. Yes. Q. And when do you recall meeting him? A. I don't have a specific date. Q. Do you have a general memory of meeting him? A. It was probably in when I was at Cetus. Q. So do you have a memory of seeing Dr. Holodniy at Cetus? A. Yes, I did see him at Cetus, but I didn't interact with him. Q. So you didn't have any conversations with him about science? A. Not that I recall. Q. Did you give any reagents or materials to Dr. Holodniy? A. Not that I recall. |

| · | | | |
|-------------|--|--|---|
| 11:25:22 | Q. Did you ever tell Dr. Mark Holodniy any | 11:28:57 1 | A. I would have known. |
| 11:25:27 | information that was confidential to Cetus? | 11:28:58 2 | |
| 11:25:31 | A. I don't think so. I don't recall having | 11:29:05 3 | |
| 11:25:36 | - | 11:29:25 4 | MS. RHYU: I'm going to have to walk over |
| 11:25:47 | Q. So you never discussed quantitation of HIV | 11:29:28 5 | - · |
| 11:25:52 | • | 11:29:30 6 | |
| 11:25:54 | | 11:29:50 7 | |
| 11:25:58 8 | | 11:29:53 8 | marked as Exhibit 518. It's a document, first |
| 11:26:02 9 | | 11:30:00 9 | page it's called the "Acquisition by |
| 11:26:06 1 | | 11:30:03 10 | • |
| 11:26:10 1: | BY MS. RHYU: | 11:30:08 11 | |
| 11:26:10 1: | Q. You said that you knew who Mark Holodniy | 11:30:11 12 | |
| 11:26:18 1: | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · | 11:30:11 13 | |
| 11:26:23 1 | • | 11:30:32 14 | • |
| 11:26:28 1 | | 11:30:32 15 | |
| 11:26:34 1 | Q. And how have you come to that | 11:30:34 16 | |
| 11:26:36 1 | | 11:30:39 17 | |
| 11:26:38 18 | A. He was I believe he participated in some | 11:30:41 18 | MR. CANNON: I think you've given me part |
| 11:26:44 19 | | 11:30:43 19 | _ |
| 11:26:51 20 | | 11:30:44 20 | MS. RHYU: Is it all one? I apologize. It |
| 11:26:54 21 | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · | 11:30:46 21 | looks like we have just one copy of the document, |
| 11:27:02 22 | | 11:30:49 22 | which is a very large document. |
| 11:27:04 23 | A. On certain occasions. They were some some | 11:30:50 23 | Q. And I don't expect you to look through the |
| 11:27:07 24 | | 11:30:52 24 | entire document at all. Do you have an |
| 11:27:12 25 | participated in the in some of the evaluations or | 11:30:54 25 | understanding that at some point Roche acquired |
| | Page 57 | ************************************** | Page 59 |
| | | | |
| 11:27:15 1 | in the collection of specimens for the studies. | 11:30:57 1 | certain assets from Cetus? |
| 11:27:21 2 | er i min i just mant to mante sure were mining | 11:31:00 2 | A. Yes. |
| 11:27:23 3 | about we're clear about what time frame we're | 11:31:00 3 | Q. And what's your understanding of what |
| 11:27:28 4 | talking about. | 11:31:04 4 | Roche acquired from Cetus? |
| 11:27:28 5 | A. Yeah. This is not early. We're talking | 11:31:06 5 | MR. CANNON: Objection. |
| 11:27:32 6 | | 11:31:06 6 | THE WITNESS: That I don't have a good |
| 11:27:32 7 | Q. Can you give me the approximate year, a | 11:31:09 7 | understanding |
| 11:27:35 8 | range that you're talking about with respect to | 11:31:09 8 | BY MS. RHYU: |
| 11:27:37 9 | your interactions with Dr. Holodniy with the ACTG? | 11:31:11 9 | Q. Okay. |
| 11:27:48 10 | , | 11:31:11 10 | A of the specifics. |
| 11:27:50 11 | , | 11:31:12 11 | Q. And I ask you to turn to RMS 6503. It's a |
| 11:27:55 12 | Ç | 11:31:29 12 | section of the document that's entitled "PCR |
| 11:28:01 13 | | 11:31:32 13 | Agreements MTAs Only Collaborators Database," and |
| 11:28:04 14 | | 11:31:38 14 | this page is bears the date 12/05/1991. |
| 11:28:08 15 | F | 11:31:46 15 | Did you have any strike that. |
| 11:28:12 16 | 8 | 11:31:56 16 | Did you did you use material transfer |
| 11:28:20 17 | e i jui jui jui jui jui jui jui jui jui j | 11:32:04 17 | agreements while you were at Cetus? |
| 11:28:23 18 | who worked in your HIV group give any reagents to | 11:32:06 18 | MR. CANNON: Objection as to form. |
| 11:28:30 19 | Dr. Holodniy? | 11:32:09 19 | THE WITNESS: Yes, we did. |
| 11:28:32 20 | A. No. | 11:32:09 20 | BY MS. RHYU: |
| 11:28:38 21 | Q. Would would you have known if the | 11:32:12 21 | Q. Did you specifically have any role in |
| 11:28:42 22 | people working in the HIV group were interacting | 11:32:16 22 | distributing material transfer agreements? |
| 11:28:46 23 | with Dr. Holodniy related to quantitation of HIV? | 11:32:19 23 | A. In distributing? |
| 11:28:56 24 | A. Yes. | 11:32:21 24 | Q. Yes, |
| 11:28:56 25 | Q. You would have known that? | 11:32:26 25 | A. Can you clarify that? |
| | Page 58 | | Page 60 |
| | | | |

| | | | |
|--|--|-------------|--|
| 01:24:04 1 | A John Sninsky on the status of HIV-2 and | 01:27:16 1 | A. Mm-hmm. |
| 01:24:10 2 | talked about the difficulties of the project, and also | 01:27:17 2 | Q it says "HIV 2s from Varnier," and that |
| 01:24:15 3 | the fact that HIV-2 was not going to be the major | 01:27:21 3 | page is dated May 1991. |
| 01:24:24 4 | epidemic that people were originally concerned it | 01:27:23 4 | A. Okay. |
| 01:24:28 5 | wasn't clear at the time, since this is early in the | 01:27:23 5 | Q. Okay. Does that help your recollection |
| 01:24:31 6 | epidemic, whether HIV-1 or HIV-2 were going to be | 01:27:27 6 | that the memorandum starting at page 69 of your |
| 01:24:35 7 | major players. And it soon became apparent that HIV-2 | 01:27:31 7 | notebook was written sometime after May of 1991? |
| 01:24:39 8 | wasn't, and therefore devoting a lot more time on | 01:27:39 8 | A. That would be consistent. |
| 01:24:42 9 | HIV-2 didn't make a lot of sense to me at the time. | 01:27:42 9 | Q. That's consistent with your memory? |
| 01:24:51 10 | | 01:27:47 10 | A. Consistent with my memorandum. I don't have |
| 01:24:53 11 | | 01:27:51 11 | a good memory. |
| 01:24:59 12 | | 01:28:03 12 | Q. The first sentence of your memorandum |
| 01:25:01 13 | | 01:28:06 13 | |
| 01:25:02 14 | Q. When is when you wrote it up? | 01:28:06 14 | "The HIV-1 and HTLV assays developed in |
| 01:25:04 15 | | 01:28:11 15 | our lab are currently being finalized at |
| 01:25:07 16 | | 01:28:15 16 | RDS." |
| 01:25:10 17 | • | 01:28:15 17 | Can you tell me which HIV-1 assay you're |
| 01:25:13 18 | | 01:28:19 18 | referring to there? |
| 01:25:17 19 | • | 01:28:32 19 | A. It's HIV DNA assays PCR based. |
| 01:25:25 20 | | 01:28:35 20 | Q. And is that an HIV DNA assay for detection |
| 01:25:30 21 | | 01:28:38 21 | of HIV in peripheral blood mononuclear cells? |
| 01:25:35 22 | • | 01:28:44 22 | A. Yes. |
| 01:25:36 23 | Q. And then your memorandum itself refers to | 01:28:50 23 | Q. Being a DNA assay, is that assay useful |
| 01:25:41 24 | starting the HIV project in May of 1990, and that | 01:28:54 24 | for monitoring effectiveness of HIV therapy? |
| 01:25:46 25 | that project was initiated in the previous year | 01:28:58 25 | MR. CANNON: Objection. |
| | Page 85 | | Page 87 |
| | | | |
| 01:25:50 1 | from the year that you wrote the memo, correct? | 01:28:59 1 | THE WITNESS: Potentially. Potentially. |
| 01:25:52 2 | MR. CANNON: Object as to form. The document | 01:28:59 2 | BY MS, RHYU: |
| 01:25:56 3 | says what it says. | 01:29:04 3 | Q. What do you mean by potentially? |
| 01:26:00 4 | THE WITNESS: Yeah, I don't remember. | 01:29:05 4 | A. I don't think investigators have looked into |
| 01:26:00 5 | BY MS. RHYU: | 01:29:09 5 | that carefully or systematically. We can quantify DNA |
| 01:26:02 6 | Q. Is there any reason I'm sorry. | 01:29:16 6 | from peripheral blood, but I don't think any assay |
| 01:26:06 7 | A. I don't remember the specifics. | 01:29:24 7 | any studies have been done to look at DNA in response |
| 01:26:07 8 | Q. Okay. Just from reading the memorandum | 01:29:29 8 | to therapy over time that I'm aware of. |
| 01:26:09 9 | which you wrote, do you have any doubt in your mind | 01:29:31 9 | Q. And that's as of today? |
| 01:26:12 10 | that this that you wrote this memorandum in | 01:29:35 10 | A. I don't know about today. I haven't been |
| 01:26:15 11 | 1991? | 01:29:37 11 | following the literature. |
| 01:26:18 12 | A. It probably was written in '91. | 01:29:38 12 | Q. So as of what date are you is your |
| 01:26:30 13 | Q. Do you have any reason to think that it | 01:29:41 13 | testimony? |
| 01:26:32 14 | wasn't written in 1991? | 01:29:41 14 | A. Well, certainly at this time, at the time |
| 01:26:33 15 | A. No. | 01:29:45 15 | that this was written and probably after that as well, |
| 01:26:41 16 | Q. And just to help your recollection, in the | 01:29:49 16 | but I can't pin down the date. |
| 01:26:44 17 | second paragraph, midway through the paragraph, | 01:29:51 17 | Q. Okay. So just to make clear, make it |
| 01:26:47 18 | there's a sentence that says: | 01:29:54 18 | clear on the record, is it your testimony that as |
| 01:26:49 19 | "We have recently initiated a | 01:29:57 19 | of approximately May of 1991, the HIV-1 proviral |
| 01:26:50 20 | collaboration with Dr. Varnier at the | 01:30:09 20 | DNA assay that was developed in your lab, that |
| 01:26:55 21 | University of Genova in Italy." | 01:30:15 21 | lab that assay had not been shown to be |
| 01:26:58 22 | Do you see that? | 01:30:24 22 | effective for monitoring the effectiveness of an |
| 01:26:58 23 | A. Mm-hmm. | 01:30:29 23 | HIV therapeutic treatment? |
| 01:26:59 24 | Q. And if you flip back to RMS 69904, under | 01:30:32 24 | MR. CANNON: Object as to form. |
| 01:27:09 25 | the title at the top of the page | 01:30:38 25 | THE WITNESS: I don't recall it being used |
| ************************************** | Page 86 | | Page 88 |
| | | ···· | |

| | | | |
|----------------------------|--|----------------------------|---|
| 01:30:39 | for that purpose. | 01:33:27 | 1 had not yet begun to develop a procedure for |
| 01:30:39 2 | BY MS. RHYU: | 01:33:29 | quantitation of HIV-1 viral load in infected |
| 01:30:42 3 | Q. And no one had shown that it's useful for | 01:33:33 | |
| 01:30:45 4 | that purpose? | 01:33:33 | MR. CANNON: Object as to form. |
| 01:30:46 5 | MR. CANNON: Object as to form. | 01:33:49 | |
| 01:30:47 6 | TILL WITH LOOK I NOT MALE I'M AWARE OI. | 01:33:53 | hadn't begun some limited studies. It's just that if |
| 01:31:01 7 | BY MS. RHYU: | 01:33:56 | |
| 01:31:01 8 | Q. Were there any other this assays that you | 01:33:59 | transfer to to Roche or to whoever, it would |
| 01:31:04 9 | to the man to the man that the | 01:34:05 | require dedicated effort to really look at all the |
| 01:31:06 10 | outcome outer than the tit v province DIVA assay that | | r by and mattering. So I can't say that we |
| 01:31:11 11 | you just mondoned. | 01:34:14 1: | 1 hadn't done some exploratory work. |
| 01:31:12 12 | The additional doc | 01:34:14 1 | By MS. RHYU: |
| 01:31:32 13 | Q. 50 if you it tall to the next page, 09924, | 01:34:17 13 | , y , |
| 01:31:39 14 | me seems paragraph states. | 01:34:18 14 | 1, 304 |
| 01:31:41 15 | - propose that father than devote the | 01:34:28 1 | The product with a dedicated citoft to |
| 01:31:44 16 | the to the to the population of the population o | 01:34:35 16 | |
| 01:31:48 17 | process to quantitation of the vital | 01:34:40 17 | 12. 12. 11. |
| 01:31:52 18 | patients, | 01:34:41 18 | Q. Zitado ino to look at the parameters |
| 01:31:55 19 | | 01:34:43 19 | to do to oping a quantituit ve assay for |
| 01:31:55 20 | | 01:34:46 20 | quantitation of the vital load; |
| 01:31:37 21 | e i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i | 01:34:50 21 | nau ora troit. Object as to form. |
| 01:32:00 22 | restriction of the second | 01:34:50 22 | 51 MS. IGI1 C. |
| 01:32:08 24 | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · | 01:34:52 23 | ę. 33.1301. |
| 01:32:09 25 | of a first to the control of the con | 01:34:53 24 | of a state of the |
| 01.32.0323 | The state of the s | 01:34:54 25 | 1112 Williams, it was not |
| | Page 89 | _ | Page 91 |
| 01:32:10 1 | Q. Was the entire lab devoted to developing | 01:34:56 1 | a dedicated effort where an entire lab was devoted to |
| 01:32:13 2 | an HIV-2 assay prior to the time that you wrote | 01:35:00 2 | it. I can't say that nothing was done. It's just not |
| 01:32:16 3 | this memorandum? | 01:35:03 3 | a devoted effort at that point. |
| 01:32:22 4 | A. I can't say for sure. | 01:35:03 4 | BY MS. RHYU: |
| 01:32:24 5 | Q. Why can't you say for sure? | 01:35:06 5 | Q. Can you say that something was done? |
| 01:32:26 6 | A. I don't know that the entire lab was devoted | 01:35:07 6 | A. I don't know for sure. |
| 01:32:28 7 | to HIV-2. | 01:35:12 7 | Q. Can you point to any documents that would |
| 01:32:30 8 | Q. And do you know what you're referring to | 01:35:17 8 | show that work had been done prior to July of 1991 |
| 01:32:32 9 | here in the sentence where you say "rather than | 01:35:23 9 | on quantitating HIV-1 viral load in infected |
| 01:32:34 10 | devote the entire lab to HIV-2"? | 01:35:28 10 | patients at Cetus? |
| 01:32:36 11 | A. It may mean going forward. I don't know. | 01:35:31 11 | A. I don't know if anybody in my group had done |
| 01:32:41 12 | Q. Do you think it was being considered that | 01:35:34 12 | some small experiments on the side. That I can't I |
| 01:32:44 13 | the entire lab should be devoting itself to HIV-2? | 01:35:40 13 | don't remember. |
| 01:32:47 14 01:32:48 15 | A. I'm sorry? | 01:35:40 14 | Q. But as a supervisor |
| 01:32:48 15 | Q. Do you think that at that time folks were | 01:35:41 15 | A. But as – as a supervisor and as a dedicated |
| 01:32:50 16 | considering devoting the entire lab to HIV-2 assay | 01:35:45 16 | project, there wasn't a dedicated effort up till that |
| 01:32:54 17 | development? | 01:35:51 17 | point. |
| 01:32:56 19 | MR. CANNON: Object as to form. | 01:35:53 18 | Q. Do you have any recollection if anybody |
| 01:32:36:19 | THE WITNESS: I don't remember. BY MS. RHYU: | 01:35:55 19 | within your group would have done a small |
| 01:33:09 20 | | 01:35:57 20 | experiment on the side related to quantitation of |
| 01:33:09 21 | - , | 01:36:01 21 | HIV viral load in infected patients? |
| 01:33:12 22 | | 01:36:12 22 | A. I couldn't say for sure. |
| 01:33:19 24 | | 01:36:19 23 01:36:21 24 | Q. What does it mean to you when you say |
| 01:33:22 25 | | 01:36:21 24 | viral load there in that first sentence of the |
| | Page 90 | UI.30:25 25 | second paragraph? |
| | raye 70 | | Page 92 |

| | | ., | |
|--|---|---|--|
| 01:36:28 1 | A. The amount of virus in a patient's sample. | 01:39:51 1 | hypothetical, and I object to the form of the |
| 01:36:40 2 | Q. Is it intrinsic in the use of that term | 01:39:57 2 | question. I don't know if you're asking about her |
| 01:36:44 3 | that you would be looking at the RNA? | 01:40:00 3 | understanding today, her opinion today, or her opinion |
| 01:36:48 4 | MR. CANNON: Object as to form. | 01:40:02 4 | back when she wrote the memo. |
| 01:36:50 5 | THE WITNESS: Not necessarily. But in the | 01:40:02 5 | BY MS. RHYU: |
| 01:36:55 6 | context of this memo, I believe we were addressing | 01:40:10 6 | Q. I'm asking for your opinion back when you |
| 01:37:00 7 | RNA. | 01:40:12 7 | wrote the memo, if you can remember that. |
| 01:37:00 8 | BY MS. RHYU: | 01:40:15 8 | A. I actually don't, and yeah, I don't really |
| 01:37:00 9 | Q. And why do you think that? | 01:40:23 9 | know the difference. |
| 01:37:02 10 | A. Because it says here. | 01:40:24 10 | Q. Do you have an understanding today? |
| 01:37:03 11 | Q. Where are you pointing to? | 01:40:27 11 | A. Probably less of an understanding today. |
| 01:37:04 12 | A. (Reading): | 01:40:35 12 | Q. Do you have an understanding of what type |
| 01:37:04 13 | "A quantitative assay for HIV RNA by PCR | 01:40:37 13 | of RNA you ultimately did target in the |
| 01:37:08 14 | would fill this need." | 01:40:41 14 | quantitation assay that you ultimately did work on? |
| 01:37:11 15 | Q. And do you know why at this point you have | 01:40:45 15 | A. It's viral, the viral RNA. |
| 01:37:14 16 | directed your efforts to an assay for quantitating | 01:40:50 16 | Q. And do you know how you decided to focus |
| 01:37:18 17 | RNA? | 01:40:54 17 | on viral particulate RNA? |
| 01:37:28 18 | A. Because of the reputation of HIV going from | 01:40:59 18 | A. I believe it might have been based on |
| 01:37:30 19 | RNA to DNA actively replicating virus would have we | 01:41:01 19 | literature. I don't recall at this time. |
| 01:37:36 20 | assume at that time would have detectable RNA. | 01:41:05 20 | Q. I'm handing you what was previously marked |
| 01:37:41 21 | Q. And at that time did you assume that | 01:41:08 21 | as Exhibit 1. |
| 01:37:44 22 | following the RNA levels would give you a more | 01:41:08 22 | (Previously marked Exhibit 1 was |
| 01:37:49 23 | sensitive measure of viral load than following DNA? | 11:43:24 23 | presented to the witness.) |
| 01:37:53 24 | A. We felt that it would be. | 11:43:24 24 | BY MS. RHYU: |
| 01:38:04 25 | Q. So you list some considerations in | 01:41:18 25 | Q. Do you recognize Exhibit 1? It's a |
| | Page 93 | | Page 95 |
| 01:38:06 1 | developing a quantitative assay for HIV RNA; is | 01:41:21 1 | publication from 1991 in the Journal of Infectious |
| 01:38:00 1 | that correct? | 01:41:27 2 | Diseases. The first author is Mark Holodniy. |
| 01:38:13 3 | A. That's correct. | 01:41:33 3 | A. Yes. |
| 01:38:22 4 | Q. And if you'll turn to 69926, RMS 69926. | 01:41:38 4 | Q. This article was first published in April |
| 01:38:34 5 | This is following a heading that says "Standards," | 01:41:41 5 | 1991. When did you first become aware of the |
| 01:38:39 6 | the subparagraph 1 under that heading says | 01:41:45 6 | article? |
| 01:38:43 7 | "Internal standard to monitor sample recovery." | 01:41:47 7 | A. I don't remember. |
| 01:38:45 8 | Are you there with me? | 01:41:47 8 | Q. Do you remember reading it while you were |
| 01:38:46 9 | A. Mm-hmm. | 01:41:49 9 | at Cetus? |
| 01:38:47 10 | Q. And the first sentence in that paragraph | 01:41:50 10 | A. I don't recall. |
| 01:38:49 11 | says: | 01:41:52 11 | Q. Do you remember discussing with Cetus |
| 01:38:49 12 | "We need to first determine whether | 01:41:59 12 | employees the detection and quantification of HIV |
| 01:38:52 13 | intracellular genomic RNA, viral particulate | 01:42:08 13 | RNA in patient's serum using PCR as described in |
| 01:39:00 14 | RNA, or mRNA should be targeted." | 01:42:14 14 | Exhibit 1? |
| 01:39:01 15 | Do you see that? | 01:42:17 15 | A. I don't recall these discussions. |
| 01:39:01 16 | A. Yes, I do. | 01:42:21 16 | Q. Do you think they happened? |
| 01:39:02 17 | Q. So at this point in mid-1991, you had not | 01:42:25 17 | A. Given that they're using my primers, primer |
| 01:39:02 17 | yet decided on which category of RNA to target | 01:42:30 18 | sequences, I would assume they got that information |
| 01:39:11 19 | to for quantification; is that correct? | 01:42:30:18 | from me, but I don't recall any specific discussions |
| | | | nomino, our ruoni recan any specific discussions |
| | | 01-42-34-20 | about it |
| 01:39:15 20 | A. That appears to be correct. | 01:42:34 20 | about it. |
| 01:39:15 20 01:39:34 21 | A. That appears to be correct.Q. And what are the relevant distinctions | 01:42:39 21 | Q. I just want to understand what you just |
| 01:39:15 20 01:39:34 21 01:39:37 22 | A. That appears to be correct. Q. And what are the relevant distinctions between genomics RNA, viral particulate RNA, and | 01:42:39 21 01:42:41 22 | Q. I just want to understand what you just said. You said given that they're using your |
| 01:39:15 20 01:39:34 21 01:39:37 22 01:39:43 23 | A. That appears to be correct. Q. And what are the relevant distinctions between genomics RNA, viral particulate RNA, and mRNA when you're considering quantification assays? | 01:42:39 21 01:42:41 22 01:42:44 23 | Q. I just want to understand what you just said. You said given that they're using your primer sequences, you would assume that they got |
| 01:39:15 20 01:39:34 21 01:39:37 22 | A. That appears to be correct. Q. And what are the relevant distinctions between genomics RNA, viral particulate RNA, and | 01:42:39 21 01:42:41 22 | Q. I just want to understand what you just said. You said given that they're using your |

| 1.42 2.53 3 sequence of the primers from you? Is that what 0.1 4.5 6.2 3 3 3 3 3 3 3 3 3 | | | | |
|--|---|---|-------------|--|
| 10.1-42:15-6 2 you're saying? | 01:42:53 | sequence of the primers from you? Is that what | 01:46:01 | 1 MR CANNON: Objection Incomplete |
| 10.143:04 5 397 | 01:42:56 | | 1 | de la complete |
| 101:43:10 4 O, And are you referring to primers 145 and 101:43:10 6 A And 38 and 39 101:43:10 7 Q, 38 101:43:10 9 Q, 30 And are you referring to primers 145 and 101:43:10 9 Q, 30 And are you referring to primers 101:43:10 9 Q, 30 And are you referring to primers 101:43:10 9 Q, 30 And are you referring to primers 101:43:23 1 published in the literature? 101:43:23 1 published in the literature? 101:43:34 1 39 maybe. 101:43:43 13 39 maybe. 101:43:43 15 primer sequences from the literature rather than obtaining them directly from you, cornect? 101:43:49 15 primer sequences from the literature rather than obtaining them directly from you, cornect? 101:43:49 15 primer sequences from the literature rather than obtaining them directly from you, cornect? 101:43:49 15 primer sequences from the literature rather than obtaining them directly from you, cornect? 101:43:49 15 primer sequences from the literature rather than obtaining them directly from you, cornect? 101:43:49 15 primer sequences from the literature rather than obtaining them directly from you, cornect? 101:43:19 101:43:19 101:43:19 101:43:19 101:43:19 101:44:19 22 101:43:19 101:44:19 22 101:44:19 22 101:44:19 22 101:44:19 22 101:44:19 23 101:43:19 101:44:19 101 | 01:42:56 | | | *1 |
| 101:43:104 5 | 01:43:00 | O. And are you referring to primers 145 and | ł | |
| 101-43:10 | 01:43:04 5 | | 1 | |
| 1.43:10 7 Q 38 1.43:10 9 A And 19 and 145, yes O1:46:21 8 1.43:13 9 Q As of -as of the time that -well, 1.43:13 19 O1:43:39 12 1.43:39 12 O2:46:30 13 1.43:41 12 O2 O3:40 1.43:41 13 O3:40 O3:40 1.43:53 17 O3:40 O3:40 1.44:31 24 O3:40 O3:40 1.44:31 25 O3:40 O3:40 1.44:31 26 O3:40 O3:40 1.44:31 27 O3:40 O3:40 1.44:31 28 O3:40 O3:40 1.44:31 29 O3:40 O3:40 1.44:31 29 O3:40 O3:40 1.44:31 25 O3:40 O3:40 1.44:31 25 O3:40 O3:40 1.44:31 26 O3:40 O3:40 1.44:31 27 O3:40 O3:40 1.44:31 28 O3:40 O3:40 1.44:31 29 O3:40 O3:40 1.44:31 29 O3:40 O3:40 1.44:31 25 O3:40 O3:40 1.44:31 26 O3:40 O3:40 1.44:31 27 O3:40 O3:40 1.44:31 28 O3:40 O3:40 1.44:31 29 O3:40 O3:40 1.44:31 20 O3:40 O3:40 1.44:31 25 O3:40 O3:40 1.44:31 25 O3:40 O3:40 1.44:31 25 O3:40 O3:40 O3:40 1.44:31 26 O3:40 O3:40 O3:40 O3:40 1.44:31 27 O3:40 | 01:43:04 | 5 A. And 38 and 39. | | Q. Do you see that there are authors on the |
| 101:43:10 9 | 01:43:07 | | į. | |
| 101:43:10 9 Q. As of — as of the time that — well, 01:43:21 31 101 let's just say as of 1990, were those primers 01:43:39 12 A. I would assume so. Some of them anyway, 38, 01:43:34 13 39, maybe. 01:43:43 13 39, maybe. 01:43:43 13 39, maybe. 01:43:43 14 Q. So the authors could have obtained the primer sequences from the literature rather than 01:43:53 15 obtaining them directly from you, cornect? 01:43:53 15 obtaining them directly from you, cornect? 01:43:53 17 obtaining them directly from you, cornect? 01:43:53 17 obtaining them directly from you, cornect? 01:44:02 19 references. If they're talking about my primers, 01:44:02 19 references. If they're talking about my primers, 01:44:02 19 obtaining them directly from you cornect? 01:44:31 24 obtaining them directly from you cornect? 01:44:31 25 obtaining them directly from you, cornect? 01:44:02 19 obtaining them directly from you, cornect? 01:44:19 22 obtaining them directly from you, cornectly 01:44:19 22 obtaining them directly from you obtaining them dire | 01:43:07 8 | - | ł | |
| 11:46:31:19 10 10:49:31:19 | 01:43:10 9 | | 1 | |
| 11-43-12-31 published in the literature? 1-46-33-31 11-43-33-31 21-43-33-31 39, maybe. 11-43-33-31 31-43-33- | 1 | | 1 | Q. Did you and and by mat im |
| 01: 43: 39 12 | i | junious printers | l l | 8,, terr em.p.s, 21.0 |
| 11:46:42 13 Cetus? | · · | | l . | |
| 01:43:44 14 Q. So the authors could have obtained the 01:43:49 15 more sequences from the literature rather than 01:43:49 15 more sequences from the literature rather than 01:43:53 17 MR CANNON: Object as to form. 01:44:01 18 THE WITNESS: Well, we should look at their references. If they're talking about my primers, 01:44:06 20 more requences from the literature rather than 01:46:51 16 01:47:18 12 01: | 01:43:43 13 | | 1 | 7 7 |
| 101:43:49 15 primer sequences from the literature rather than obtaining them directly from you, correct? 101:44:10118 | | - · , · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · | 1 | |
| 1.44:35 116 Obtaining them directly from you, correct? O1:46:51 16 O1:46:53 17 O1:44:02 19 O1:44:02 19 O1:44:02 19 O1:44:02 19 O1:44:19 21 O1:44:19 21 O1:44:19 22 O1:44:19 24 O1:47:14 22 O1:47:14 23 | | | 1 | 11. 100. |
| 01:44:01 18 THE WITNESS: Well, we should look at their references. If they're talking about my primers, references. If they're talking about my primers, policitation of the work of that Mark Holodniy did related to detection and optication? 10:44:01 21 The Witness: Well, we should look at their references. If they're talking about my primers, policitation of the work that Mark Holodniy did related to detection and optications of the Work 1:45:23 10.145:37 16 10:45:37 16 10:45:37 17 10:45:37 16 10:45:37 16 10:45:37 17 10:45:37 16 10:45:37 17 10:45:43 20 10:45:43 20 10:45:43 20 10:45:43 20 10:45:47 2a reveal any attorney-client communications. 10:45:45:29 25 as an author on this publication? 10:45:59 25 as an author on this publication? 10:46:58 17 10:47:02 18 10:47:10 218 10:4 | ı | | | |
| 11:44:01 18 | 1 | | ı | |
| 01:44:02 19 01:44:02 20 01:44:19 21 01:44:19 22 01:44:19 22 01:44:27 23 01:44:27 23 01:44:31 25 01:44:31 25 01:44:31 25 01:44:31 25 01:44:31 25 01:44:31 25 01:44:31 25 01:44:31 25 01:44:31 25 01:44:37 1 01:44:47 3 01:44:37 1 01:44:47 3 01:44:37 2 01:44:37 3 01:44:37 1 01:44:47 3 01:44:37 3 01:44:37 1 01:44:37 3 01:44:37 1 01:44:47 3 01:45:51 5 01:45:51 5 01:45:51 5 01:45:51 5 01:45:51 7 01:45:31 3 01:47:31 3 01:47:32 3 01:47:32 3 01:47:32 3 01:47:31 3 01:47:32 3 01:47:32 3 01:47:32 3 01:47:32 3 01:47:32 3 01:47:32 3 01:47:32 3 01:47:32 3 01:47:32 3 01:47:32 3 01:47:32 3 01:47:32 3 01:47:31 3 01:47:32 3 01:47:32 3 01:47:32 3 01:47:32 3 01:47:31 3 01:47:32 3 01:47:32 3 01:47:32 3 01:47:32 3 01:47:32 3 01:47:33 3 01:47:34 3 01:47:35 6 01:47:36 6 01:45:17 8 01:45:37 16 01:45:36 15 01:45:36 15 01:45:37 16 01:45:37 16 01:45:38 18 01:45:37 16 01:45:38 18 01:45:38 18 01:45:38 20 01:45:38 22 01:45:47 22 01:45:47 22 01:45:48 21 01:45:48 2 | | The Color Color as to form: | | and the state of t |
| 01:44:06 20 presumably they referred to it. 01:44:19 21 BY MS. RHYU: | į. | | | 11. The fit the work that we were doing. |
| 01:44:19 21 BY MS. RHYU: 0.0 page 865 where the references or the 01:44:19 22 0.0 page 865 where the references or the 01:44:31 24 0.0 page 865 where the references or the 01:47:16 23 0.0 page 865 where the references in which you 01:47:16 23 0.0 page 865 where the references in which you 01:47:16 23 0.0 page 865 where the references in which you 01:47:16 23 0.0 page 865 where the references in which you 01:47:16 23 0.0 page 865 where the references in which you 01:47:16 23 0.0 page 865 where the references in which you 01:47:16 23 0.0 page 865 where the references in which you 01:47:16 23 0.0 page 865 where the references in which you 01:47:18 24 0.0 when do you remember seeing him? 01:47:22 25 0.0 page 899 01:47:23 1 0.0 page 899 01:47:28 2 0.0 page 865 where the references in which you 01:47:28 2 0.0 page 865 where the references or the 01:47:22 25 0.0 page 865 where the references or the 01:47:22 25 0.0 page 865 where the references or the 01:47:22 25 0.0 page 865 where the references or the 01:47:22 25 0.0 page 865 where the references or the 01:47:22 25 0.0 page 865 where the references in which you 01:47:28 2 0.0 page 899 01:47:28 2 0. | i | | | |
| 01:44:19 22 Q. On page 865 where the references or the 01:44:27 23 listing begins 01:44:31 24 A. Mm-hmm. 01:44:31 25 Q do you see any references in which you Page 97 Page 99 10:44:31 2 | | | | 1 |
| 01:44:27 23 listing begins = | | | ı | 11. 100,1401 |
| 01:44:31 24 A. Mrn-hmm. 01:44:31 25 Q. —do you see any references in which you Page 97 01:44:37 1 would have disclosed the sequence of SK38, 39 or 01:47:28 2 A. I don't remember seeing him? 01:44:47 2 145? 01:44:47 3 A. I believe reference 9. 01:44:46 4 Q. You said you recognized Exhibit 1. From 01:45:01 5 what do you recognized Exhibit 1? 01:45:05 6 A. Actually, I was given a copy of this to look 01:45:17 8 tiff I had seen it carlier. 01:45:21 10 Exhibit 1 earlier? 01:45:22 11 A. I had no recollection. 01:45:28 13 that Mark Holodniy did related to detection and 01:45:31 14 quantification of HIV RNA in patient serum using 01:45:37 15 A. No. 01:45:39 18 You can answer that question. 01:45:47 22 b. A. A I might have in passing, but I don't recall any long collaborations or extensive discussions with him. 01:47:54 8 at Cetus or at Stanford? 01:47:28 2 A. Cetus. 01:47:49 6 to 1:47:49 5 Q. Do you remember interacting with him? 01:47:49 6 to 1:47:54 8 at Cetus? 01:47:54 8 at Cetus or at Stanford? 01:47:49 6 to 1:47:49 6 to 1:47:44 5 or at Cetus. 01:47:49 6 to 1:47:49 6 to 1:47:54 8 at Cetus. 01:47:49 6 to 1:47:49 6 to 1:47:54 8 at Cetus. 01:47:49 6 to 1:47:49 6 to 1:47:54 8 at Cetus. 01:47:49 6 to 1:47:49 6 to 1:47:54 8 at Cetus. 01:47:49 6 to 1:47:49 6 to 1:47:49 6 to 1:47:54 8 at Cetus. 01:47:49 6 to 1:47:49 6 to 1:47:49 6 to 1:47:54 8 at Cetus. 01:47:49 6 to 1:47:49 6 to 1:47:49 6 to 1:47:54 8 at Cetus. 01:47:49 6 to 1:47:49 6 to 1:47:49 6 to 1:47:54 8 at Cetus. 01:47:49 6 to 1:47:44 5 to 1:47:49 6 to 1:47:44 5 to 1:47:54 8 at Cetus. 01:47:49 6 to 1:47:44 5 to 1:47:44 5 to 1:47:54 8 at Cetus. 01:47:49 6 to 1:47:44 5 to 1:47:54 8 to 1:47:54 8 to 1:47:55 10 Q. Do you remember interacting with him? 01:47:44 5 to 1:47:45 8 to 1:47:49 6 to 1:47:45 8 | | Q. on page out where the references of the | | Q. Do you know Bavid Beliwaitz: |
| 01:44:31 25 Q. — do you see any references in which you Page 97 01:44:37 1 would have disclosed the sequence of SK38, 39 or 01:47:28 1 Q. Was it at Cetus or at Stanford? 01:44:46 2 145? 01:44:46 3 A. I believe reference 9. 01:44:56 4 Q. You said you recognized Exhibit 1. From 01:45:01 5 what do you recognize Exhibit 1. From 01:45:17 8 this if I had seen it earlier. 01:45:19 9 Q. But prior to yesterday, you had seen 01:45:21 10 Exhibit 1 2 ardier? 01:45:22 11 A. I had no recollection. 01:45:26 12 Q. Did you have any recollection of the work 01:45:31 14 quantification of HIV RNA in patient serum using 01:45:37 17 A. No. 01:45:37 17 MR. CANNON: Objection. Lacks foundation. 01:45:41 19 THE WITNESS: No, I had no recollection up 01:45:43 20 until yesterday when I was reminded. 01:45:47 23 BY MS. RHYU: 01:45:58 24 Q. Do you believe that you should be listed 01:45:59 25 an author on this publication? 01:46:38 25 Variety of the sequence of SK38, 39 or 01:47:28 1 Q. Was it at Cetus or at Stanford? 01:47:23 1 Q. Was it at Cetus or at Stanford? 01:47:31 3 Q. Do you remember interacting with him? 01:47:31 3 Q. Do you remember interacting with him? 01:47:45 6 A. I might have in passing, but I don't recall ontil 47:45 6 Di:47:54 7 Q. Do you remember the context of why he was at Cetus. 01:47:54 7 3 A. I might have in passing, but I don't recall ontil 47:45 6 Di:47:54 7 Q. Do you remember the context of why he was at Cetus. 01:47:54 8 any long collaborations or extensive discussions with him? 01:47:54 8 any long collaborations or extensive discussions with him. 01:47:54 8 at Cetus. 01:47:53 1 Q. Do you remember interacting with him? 01:47:54 8 any long collaborations or extensive discussions with him. 01:47:54 9 A. No. 01:47:54 9 A. No. 01:47:55 9 A. No. 01:47:56 9 A. No. 01:47:56 9 A. No. 01:48:04 11 A. I don't remember when. 01:48:04 1. Oi:47:49 6 him. 10:47:49 6 Di:47:49 6 Di:47:49 6 Di:47:49 6 Di:47:49 6 Di:47:49 6 Di:47:55 9 A. No. 01:48:04 11 A. I don't remember the context of why he was at Cetus. 01:48:04 11 A. I don't | | 1101116 0051110 | | |
| Page 97 Page 97 Page 99 Page | 1 | *************************************** | 1 | |
| 01:44:37 1 would have disclosed the sequence of SK38, 39 or 01:44:44 2 145? 01:44:44 2 145? 01:44:47 3 A. I believe reference 9. 01:44:56 4 Q. You said you recognized Exhibit 1. From 01:45:05 6 A. Actually, I was given a copy of this to look 01:45:11 7 at just yesterday. I had completely forgotten about 01:45:19 9 Q. But prior to yesterday, you had seen 01:45:21 10 Exhibit 1 earlier? 01:45:26 12 Q. Did you have any recollection of the work 01:45:28 13 that Mark Holodniy did related to detection and 01:45:37 17 Q. Do you remember the context of why he was 01:45:37 17 Q. Do you remember the context of why he was 01:45:37 17 Q. Do you remember the context of why he was 01:47:54 00:47:55 00:47:55 00:47:55 00:47:55 00:47:55 00:48:05 12 Q. Did you ever give him any reagents? 01:45:37 17 MR. CANNON: Objection. Lacks foundation. 01:45:37 17 MR. CANNON: Objection. Lacks foundation. 01:45:46 21 MR. CANNON: Caution the witness not to 01:45:46 21 MR. CANNON: Caution the witness not to 01:45:58 24 Q. Do you believe that you should be listed 01:45:59 25 as an author on this publication? | 01.44.31.23 | Q. 20 you see any references in which you | 1 | A. I don't remember when. |
| 01:44:44 2 145? 01:44:47 3 A. I believe reference 9. 01:44:56 4 Q. You said you recognized Exhibit 1. From 01:45:01 5 what do you recognize Exhibit 1? 01:45:05 6 A. Actually, I was given a copy of this to look 01:45:11 7 at just yesterday. I had completely forgotten about 01:45:17 8 this if I had seen it earlier. 01:45:19 9 Q. But prior to yesterday, you had seen 01:45:21 10 Exhibit 1 earlier? 01:45:26 12 Q. Did you have any recollection. 01:45:33 13 Q. Do you remember interacting with him? 01:47:49 6 him. 01:47:49 6 him. 01:47:54 8 at Cetus? 01:47:56 9 A. No. 01:47:58 10 Q. Did you ever give him any reagents? 01:45:26 12 Q. Did you have any recollection of the work 01:45:31 14 quantification of HIV RNA in patient serum using 01:45:37 17 MR. CANNON: Objection. Lacks foundation. 01:45:37 17 MR. CANNON: Objection. Lacks foundation. 01:45:41 19 THE WITNESS: No, I had no recollection up 01:45:43 20 until yesterday when I was reminded. 01:45:47 22 reveal any attorney-client communications. 01:45:47 23 BY MS. RHYU: 01:45:58 24 Q. Do you believe that you should be listed 01:45:59 25 as an author on this publication? 01:48:38 25 your decision to begin to develop a procedure for | *************************************** | Page 97 | | Page 99 |
| 01:44:44 2 145? 01:44:47 3 A. I believe reference 9. 01:44:56 4 Q. You said you recognized Exhibit 1. From 01:45:01 5 what do you recognize Exhibit 1? 01:45:05 6 A. Actually, I was given a copy of this to look 01:45:11 7 at just yesterday. I had completely forgotten about this if I had seen it earlier. 01:45:19 9 Q. But prior to yesterday, you had seen 01:45:21 10 Exhibit 1 earlier? 01:45:22 11 A. I had no recollection. 01:45:28 13 that Mark Holodniy did related to detection and 01:45:31 14 quantification of HIV RNA in patient serum using 01:45:37 16 A. No. 01:45:37 16 A. No. 01:45:43 20 until yesterday when I was reminded. 01:45:41 21 THE WITNESS: No, I had no recollection up 01:45:46 21 MR. CANNON: Caution the witness not to 10:45:47 23 BY MS. RHYU: 01:45:58 24 Q. Do you believe that you should be listed 01:45:59 25 as an author on this publication? 01:46:38 25 A. Cetus. 01:47:31 3 Q. Do you remember interacting with him? 01:47:31 3 Q. Do you remember interacting with him? 01:47:39 4 A. I might have in passing, but I don't recall o1:47:49 5 any long collaborations or extensive discussions with him. 01:47:51 7 Q. Do you remember the context of why he was at Cetus? 01:47:56 9 A. No. 01:47:56 9 A. No. 01:47:58 10 Q. Did you ever give him any reagents? 01:48:01 14 A. I don't remember. 01:48:01 14 A. I don't remember. 01:48:01 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:01 14 A. Oh, I don't think so. 01:48:10 14 A. Oh, I don't think so. 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any equipment, Cetus equipment? 01:48:23 18 MR. CANNON: We've been going for about an hour. Would it be a good time for a break soon? 01:48:31 22 MR. CANNON: Sure. 01:48:31 22 MR. CANNON: Sure. 01:48:33 24 Q. Did this article, Exhibit I, influence your decision to begin to develop a procedure for | 01:44:37 1 | would have disclosed the sequence of SK38 39 or | 01:47:23 1 | O. Was it at Catus or at Stanford? |
| 01:44:47 3 A. I believe reference 9. 01:44:47 3 A. I believe reference 9. 01:44:56 4 Q. You said you recognized Exhibit 1. From 01:45:01 5 what do you recognize Exhibit 1? 01:45:05 6 A. Actually, I was given a copy of this to look 01:45:11 7 at just yesterday. I had completely forgotten about 01:45:17 8 this if I had seen it earlier. 01:45:19 9 Q. But prior to yesterday, you had seen 01:45:21 10 Exhibit 1 earlier? 01:45:22 11 A. I had no recollection. 01:45:28 13 that Mark Holodniy did related to detection and 01:45:31 14 quantification of HIV RNA in patient serum using 01:45:37 16 A. No. 01:45:37 17 MR. CANNON: Objection. Lacks foundation. 01:45:43 20 until yesterday when I was reminded. 01:45:47 22 reveal any attorney-client communications. 01:45:58 24 Q. Do you believe that you should be listed on the context of why he was any long collaborations or extensive discussions with him. 01:47:49 6 him. 01:47:49 6 him. 01:47:49 6 him. 01:47:51 7 Q. Do you remember the context of why he was at Cetus? 01:47:56 9 A. No. 01:47:58 10 Q. Did you ever give him any reagents? 01:48:04 11 A. I don't remember. 01:48:05 12 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:01 14 A. I don't remember. 01:48:01 12 A. I don't think so. 01:48:01 13 information? 01:48:01 14 A. No. 01:48:01 15 A. No. 01:48:01 14 A. No. 01:48:01 15 A. No. 01:48:01 15 A. No. 01:48:01 14 A. No. 01:48:01 15 A. No. 01:48:01 14 A. No. 01:48:01 15 A. No. 01:48:01 14 A. I don't remember. 01:48:01 15 A. No. 01:48:01 14 A. I don't remember. 01:48:01 15 A. No. 01:48:01 14 A. I don't remember. 01:48:01 14 A. I don't remember. 01:48:01 15 A. No. 01:48:01 14 A. No. No. I don't think | 01:44:44 2 | | | |
| 01:44:56 4 Q. You said you recognized Exhibit 1. From 01:45:01 5 what do you recognize Exhibit 1? 01:45:05 6 A. Actually, I was given a copy of this to look 01:45:17 8 this if I had seen it earlier. 01:45:19 9 Q. But prior to yesterday, you had seen 01:45:21 10 Exhibit 1 earlier? 01:45:22 11 A. I had no recollection. 01:45:31 14 Quantification of HIV RNA in patient serum using 01:45:31 14 Quantification of HIV RNA in patient serum using 01:45:37 16 A. No. 01:45:37 17 MR. CANNON: Objection. Lacks foundation. 01:45:43 20 | 01:44:47 3 | A. I believe reference 9. | 1 | 1 |
| 01:45:01 5 what do you recognize Exhibit 1? 01:45:05 6 A. Actually, I was given a copy of this to look of 1:45:11 7 01:45:17 8 this if I had seen it earlier. 01:45:19 9 Q. But prior to yesterday, you had seen of 1:45:21 10 O1:45:22 11 O1:45:26 12 Q. Did you have any recollection of the work of 1:45:28 13 O1:45:31 14 O1:45:31 14 O1:45:37 16 A. No. O1:45:39 18 You can answer that question. O1:45:41 19 THE WITNESS: No, I had no recollection up o1:45:47 22 O1:45:47 22 O1:45:47 23 O1:45:58 24 Q. Do you believe that you should be listed o1:45:59 25 One you remember the context of why he was at Cetus? O1:47:56 9 A. No. O1:47:56 9 A. I don't remember. O1:48:04 11 A. I don't remember. O1:48:05 12 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? O1:48:05 12 Q. Did you ever give him any equipment, Cetus equipment? O1:48:05 12 O2:48:10 14 A. Oh, I don't think so. O1:48:15 16 O1:48:15 16 O1:48:15 16 O1:48:15 16 O1:48:15 16 O1:48:23 18 O1:48:24 20 O1:48:24 20 O1:48:24 20 O1:48:24 20 O1:48:24 20 O1:48:24 20 O1:48:34 20 O | 01:44:56 4 | | 1 | |
| 01: 45: 05 6 A. Actually, I was given a copy of this to look 01: 45: 11 7 at just yesterday. I had completely forgotten about 10: 45: 17 8 01: 45: 19 9 Q. But prior to yesterday, you had seen 01: 45: 21 10 01: 45: 22 11 01: 45: 26 12 01: 45: 28 13 01: 45: 31 14 01: 45: 31 14 01: 45: 31 15 01: 45: 31 16 01: 45: 31 17 01: 45: 31 17 01: 45: 31 18 01: 45: 31 18 01: 45: 31 19 01: 45: 31 10 01: 47: 58 10 01: 47: 58 10 01: 48: 04 11 01: 48: 04 11 01: 48: 05 12 01: 48: 10 10 01: 48: 10 10 01: 48: 10 10 01: 48: 10 10 01: 48: 10 10 01: 48: 10 10 01: 48: 10 10 01: 48: 10 10 01: 48: 10 10 01: 48: 10 10 01: 48: 10 10 01: 48: 10 10 01: 48: 10 10 01: 48: 10 10 01: 48: 10 10 01: 48: 10 10 01: 48: 10 10 01: 48: 10 10 01: 48: 10 10 01: 48: | 01:45:01 5 | | ŀ | |
| 01:45:11 7 at just yesterday. I had completely forgotten about this if I had seen it earlier. 01:45:17 8 this if I had seen it earlier. 01:45:19 9 Q. But prior to yesterday, you had seen 01:45:21 10 Exhibit 1 earlier? 01:45:22 11 A. I had no recollection. 01:45:26 12 Q. Did you have any recollection of the work that Mark Holodniy did related to detection and quantification of HIV RNA in patient serum using 01:45:31 14 quantification of HIV RNA in patient serum using 01:45:37 16 A. No. 01:45:37 16 A. No. 01:45:37 17 MR. CANNON: Objection. Lacks foundation. 01:45:39 18 You can answer that question. 01:45:41 19 THE WITNESS: No, I had no recollection up 01:45:42 20 until yesterday when I was reminded. 01:45:47 22 MR. CANNON: Caution the witness not to 01:48:47 22 RIS MR. CANNON: Caution the witness not to 01:48:47 23 BY MS. RHYU: 01:45:59 25 BY MS. RHYU: 01:45:59 25 BY MS. RHYU: 01:45:59 25 BY MS. RHYU: 01:48:38 25 DI Q. Do you remember the context of why he was at Cetus? 01:47:54 8 at Cetus? 01:47:54 8 at Cetus? 01:47:55 9 A. No. 01:47:58 10 Q. Did you ever give him any reagents? 01:47:58 10 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:08 13 information? 01:48:01 14 A. Oh, I don't think so. 01:48:10 14 A. Oh, I don't think so. 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any equipment, Cetus equipment? 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:10 14 A. Oh, I don't think so. 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any equipment, Cetus equipment? 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:10 14 A. Oh, I don't think so. 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any equipment, Cetus equipment? 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any equipment, Cetus equipment? 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any equipment have a good time for a break soon? 01:48:11 15 P. A. No. 01:48:11 15 P. A. | 01:45:05 6 | | 1 | |
| 01:45:17 8 this if I had seen it earlier. 01:45:19 9 Q. But prior to yesterday, you had seen 01:45:21 10 Exhibit I earlier? 01:45:22 11 A. I had no recollection. 01:45:26 12 Q. Did you have any recollection of the work 01:45:31 14 quantification of HIV RNA in patient serum using 01:45:37 16 A. No. 01:45:37 17 MR. CANNON: Objection. Lacks foundation. 01:45:39 18 You can answer that question. 01:45:43 20 until yesterday when I was reminded. 01:45:47 22 reveal any attorney-client communications. 01:45:58 24 Q. Do you believe that you should be listed 01:45:59 25 as an author on this publication? 01:45:19 9 Q. But prior to yesterday, you had seen 01:47:54 8 at Cetus? 01:47:56 9 A. No. 01:47:56 9 A. No. 01:47:56 9 A. No. 01:48:04 11 A. I don't remember. 01:48:05 12 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:08 13 information? 01:48:10 14 A. Oh, I don't think so. 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any equipment, Cetus equipment? 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any equipment, Cetus equipment? 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any equipment, Cetus equipment? 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:21 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:21 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:21 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:21 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:21 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:21 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:21 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:21 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:21 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:21 15 | 01:45:11 7 | | | |
| 01:45:19 9 Q. But prior to yesterday, you had seen 01:45:21 10 Exhibit 1 earlier? 01:45:22 11 A. I had no recollection. 01:45:26 12 Q. Did you have any recollection of the work 01:45:31 14 quantification of HIV RNA in patient serum using 01:45:37 16 A. No. 01:45:37 17 MR. CANNON: Objection. Lacks foundation. 01:45:39 18 You can answer that question. 01:45:41 19 THE WITNESS: No, I had no recollection up 01:45:43 20 until yesterday when I was reminded. 01:45:47 22 reveal any attorney-client communications. 01:45:58 24 Q. Do you believe that you should be listed 01:45:59 25 as an author on this publication? O1:45:30 20 A. No. 01:47:58 9 A. No. 01:48:05 12 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:08 13 information? 01:48:10 14 A. Oh, I don't think so. 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any equipment, Cetus equipment? 01:48:15 16 equipment? 01:48:16 17 A. No. 01:48:15 16 equipment? 01:48:23 18 MR. CANNON: We've been going for about an hour. Would it be a good time for a break soon? 01:48:28 20 MS. RHYU: Sure, let me just ask one more question and a follow-up if necessary. 01:48:31 22 MR. CANNON: Sure. 01:48:33 24 Q. Did this article, Exhibit 1, influence your decision to begin to develop a procedure for | 1 | | 1 | * |
| O1:45:21 10 Exhibit 1 earlier? | 1 | | | |
| 01:45:22 11 A. I had no recollection. 01:45:26 12 Q. Did you have any recollection of the work 01:45:28 13 that Mark Holodniy did related to detection and 01:45:31 14 quantification of HIV RNA in patient serum using 01:45:37 16 A. No. 01:45:37 17 MR. CANNON: Objection. Lacks foundation. 01:45:41 19 THE WITNESS: No, I had no recollection up 01:45:43 20 until yesterday when I was reminded. 01:45:47 22 BY MS. RHYU: 01:45:58 24 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:05 12 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:05 12 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:08 13 information? 01:48:10 14 A. Oh, I don't think so. 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any reagents? 01:48:05 12 Q. Did you ever give him any reagents? 01:48:05 12 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:08 13 information? 01:48:10 14 A. Oh, I don't think so. 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:10 14 A. Oh, I don't think so. 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:10 14 A. Oh, I don't think so. 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:10 14 A. Oh, I don't think so. 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:10 14 A. Oh, I don't think so. 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:10 14 A. Oh, I don't think so. 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:10 14 A. Oh, I don't think so. 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:10 14 A. Oh, I don't think so. 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:10 14 A. Oh, I don't think so. 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:10 14 A. Oh, I don't remember. 01:48:10 14 A. Oh, I don't think so. 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:10 14 A. No. 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any confidential information? 01:48:10 | 01:45:21 10 | | 1 | 1 |
| 01:45:26 12 Q. Did you have any recollection of the work 01:45:28 13 that Mark Holodniy did related to detection and 01:45:31 14 quantification of HIV RNA in patient serum using 01:45:37 16 A. No. 01:45:37 17 MR. CANNON: Objection. Lacks foundation. 01:45:39 18 You can answer that question. 01:45:41 19 THE WITNESS: No, I had no recollection up 01:45:43 20 until yesterday when I was reminded. 01:48:40 21 MR. CANNON: Caution the witness not to 01:45:47 22 reveal any attorney-client communications. 01:45:58 24 Q. Do you believe that you should be listed 01:48:33 25 your decision to begin to develop a procedure for | 01:45:22 11 | | 1 | |
| 01:45:28 13 that Mark Holodniy did related to detection and 01:45:31 14 quantification of HIV RNA in patient serum using 01:45:36 15 PCR? 01:45:37 16 A. No. 01:45:37 17 MR. CANNON: Objection. Lacks foundation. 01:45:39 18 You can answer that question. 01:45:41 19 THE WITNESS: No, I had no recollection up 01:45:43 20 until yesterday when I was reminded. 01:45:47 22 reveal any attorney-client communications. 01:45:47 23 BY MS. RHYU: 01:45:58 24 Q. Do you believe that you should be listed 01:45:59 25 as an author on this publication? 01:48:38 25 Q. Did you ever give him any equipment, Cetus 01:48:10 14 A. Oh, I don't think so. 01:48:10 14 A. Oh, I don't think so. 01:48:10 14 A. Oh, I don't think so. 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any equipment, Cetus equipment? 01:48:16 17 A. No. 01:48:16 17 A. No. 01:48:23 18 MR. CANNON: We've been going for about an hour. Would it be a good time for a break soon? MS. RHYU: Sure, let me just ask one more 01:48:30 21 question and a follow-up if necessary. 01:48:31 22 MR. CANNON: Sure. 01:48:31 23 BY MS. RHYU: 01:48:33 24 Q. Did this article, Exhibit 1, influence your decision to begin to develop a procedure for | 1 | | 1 | 4 |
| 01:45:31 14 quantification of HIV RNA in patient serum using 01:45:36 15 PCR? 01:45:37 16 A. No. 01:45:37 17 MR. CANNON: Objection. Lacks foundation. 01:45:39 18 You can answer that question. 01:45:41 19 THE WITNESS: No, I had no recollection up 01:45:43 20 until yesterday when I was reminded. 01:45:46 21 MR. CANNON: Caution the witness not to 01:45:47 22 reveal any attorney-client communications. 01:45:59 25 BY MS. RHYU: 01:45:59 25 as an author on this publication? 01:48:10 14 A. Oh, I don't think so. 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any equipment, Cetus 01:48:15 16 equipment? A. No. 01:48:16 17 A. No. 01:48:23 18 MR. CANNON: We've been going for about an 01:48:26 19 hour. Would it be a good time for a break soon? 01:48:30 21 question and a follow-up if necessary. 01:48:31 22 MR. CANNON: Sure. 01:48:33 24 Q. Did this article, Exhibit 1, influence 01:48:33 24 your decision to begin to develop a procedure for | 1 | Q. = 14 you may a may reconcerted of the work | 1 | |
| 01:45:36 15 PCR? 01:45:37 16 A. No. 01:45:37 17 MR. CANNON: Objection. Lacks foundation. 01:45:41 19 THE WITNESS: No, I had no recollection up onlike a good time for a break soon? 01:45:46 21 MR. CANNON: Caution the witness not to onlike an any attorney-client communications. 01:45:47 22 BY MS. RHYU: 01:45:59 25 A. No. 01:48:11 15 Q. Did you ever give him any equipment, Cetus equipment? 01:48:15 16 On; 148:15 16 On; 148:15 17 A. No. 01:48:15 16 On; 148:15 16 On; 148:15 17 A. No. 01:48:15 16 On; 148:15 16 On; 148:16 17 A. No. 01:48:15 16 On; 148:15 16 On; 148:16 17 A. No. 01:48:15 16 On; 148:15 16 | 1 | | 1 | i |
| 01:45:37 16 O1:45:37 17 O1:45:39 18 O1:45:41 19 O1:45:43 20 O1:45:45 21 O1:45:47 22 O1:45:47 23 O1:45:47 23 O1:45:47 23 O1:45:59 25 A. No. O1:48:15 16 O1:48:15 16 O1:48:16 17 A. No. O1:48:23 18 O1:48:23 18 O1:48:26 19 O1:48:28 20 O1:48:28 20 O1:48:30 21 O1:48:30 21 O1:45:47 22 O1:45:47 22 O1:45:47 23 O1:45:47 24 O1:45:47 25 O1:45:47 25 O1:48:31 25 O1:48:31 26 O1:48:31 27 O1:48:31 28 O1:48:31 29 O1:48:31 20 O1: | 1 | - | 1 | ! |
| O1:45:37 17 MR. CANNON: Objection. Lacks foundation. O1:45:39 18 You can answer that question. O1:45:41 19 THE WITNESS: No, I had no recollection up O1:45:43 20 until yesterday when I was reminded. O1:45:46 21 MR. CANNON: Caution the witness not to O1:45:47 22 reveal any attorney-client communications. O1:45:47 23 BY MS. RHYU: O1:45:58 24 Q. Do you believe that you should be listed O1:45:59 25 as an author on this publication? MR. CANNON: Objection. Lacks foundation. O1:48:16 17 A. No. O1:48:23 18 MR. CANNON: We've been going for about an hour. Would it be a good time for a break soon? O1:48:28 20 MS. RHYU: Sure, let me just ask one more O1:48:30 21 question and a follow-up if necessary. O1:48:31 22 MR. CANNON: Sure. BY MS. RHYU: O1:48:33 24 Q. Did this article, Exhibit 1, influence O1:48:38 25 your decision to begin to develop a procedure for | 1 | | } | |
| O1:45:39 18 You can answer that question. O1:45:41 19 THE WITNESS: No, I had no recollection up O1:45:43 20 until yesterday when I was reminded. O1:45:46 21 MR. CANNON: Caution the witness not to O1:45:47 22 reveal any attorney-client communications. O1:45:47 23 BY MS. RHYU: O1:45:58 24 Q. Do you believe that you should be listed O1:45:59 25 as an author on this publication? O1:48:23 18 MR. CANNON: We've been going for about an O1:48:26 19 hour. Would it be a good time for a break soon? O1:48:28 20 MS. RHYU: Sure, let me just ask one more O1:48:30 21 question and a follow-up if necessary. O1:48:31 22 MR. CANNON: Sure. O1:48:31 23 BY MS. RHYU: O1:48:33 24 Q. Did this article, Exhibit 1, influence O1:48:38 25 your decision to begin to develop a procedure for | ł | | | |
| O1:45:41 19 THE WITNESS: No, I had no recollection up o1:45:43 20 until yesterday when I was reminded. O1:45:46 21 O1:45:47 22 reveal any attorney-client communications. O1:45:47 23 O1:45:58 24 O1:45:59 25 MR. CANNON: Caution the witness not to o1:48:30 21 question and a follow-up if necessary. O1:48:31 22 O1:48:31 23 O1:48:33 24 OR. CANNON: Sure. O1:48:33 24 OR. CANNON: Sure. O1:48:33 24 OR. CANNON: We've been going for about an out an hour. Would it be a good time for a break soon? O1:48:28 20 MS. RHYU: Sure, let me just ask one more o1:48:30 21 O1:48:31 22 O1:48:31 23 O1:48:33 24 OR. CANNON: We've been going for about an hour. Would it be a good time for a break soon? O1:48:28 20 O1:48:30 21 O1:48:31 22 OR. CANNON: We've been going for about an hour. Would it be a good time for a break soon? O1:48:28 20 O1:48:30 21 O1:48:31 22 OR. CANNON: Sure, let me just ask one more o1:48:31 22 O1:48:31 23 O1:48:33 24 OR. CANNON: Sure, let me just ask one more o1:48:33 24 O1:48:31 25 O1:48:33 24 OR. CANNON: Sure, let me just ask one more o1:48:33 24 O1:48:33 25 O1:48:33 24 OR. CANNON: We've been going for about an hour. Would it be a good time for a break soon? O1:48:28 20 O1:48:38 25 O1:48:30 21 O1:48:30 21 O1:48:30 21 O1:48:31 22 OR. CANNON: Sure, let me just ask one more o1:48:30 21 O1:48:31 22 O1:48:31 23 O1:48:31 23 O1:48:33 24 OR. CANNON: Sure, let me just ask one more o1:48:30 21 O1:48:31 22 O1:48:31 23 O1:48:31 23 O1:48:31 25 O1:48:31 | i | | 1 | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · |
| 01:45:43 20 until yesterday when I was reminded. 01:45:46 21 MR. CANNON: Caution the witness not to 01:45:47 22 reveal any attorney-client communications. 01:45:58 24 Q. Do you believe that you should be listed 01:45:59 25 as an author on this publication? 01:48:28 20 MS. RHYU: Sure, let me just ask one more question and a follow-up if necessary. 01:48:31 22 MR. CANNON: Sure. 01:48:31 23 BY MS. RHYU: 01:48:33 24 Q. Did this article, Exhibit 1, influence your decision to begin to develop a procedure for | 1 | • | | |
| 01:45:46 21 MR. CANNON: Caution the witness not to 01:45:47 22 reveal any attorney-client communications. 01:45:58 24 Q. Do you believe that you should be listed 01:45:59 25 as an author on this publication? O1:48:38 25 MR. CANNON: Sure, question and a follow-up if necessary. 01:48:31 22 MR. CANNON: Sure, 01:48:31 23 MR. CANNON: Sure, 01:48:33 24 Q. Did this article, Exhibit 1, influence your decision to begin to develop a procedure for | | • | Į. | |
| 01:45:47 22 reveal any attorney-client communications. 01:45:47 23 BY MS. RHYU: 01:45:58 24 Q. Do you believe that you should be listed 01:45:59 25 as an author on this publication? 01:48:31 22 MR. CANNON: Sure. 01:48:31 23 BY MS. RHYU: 01:48:33 24 Q. Did this article, Exhibit 1, influence 01:48:38 25 your decision to begin to develop a procedure for | ŧ. | | ž | |
| 01:45:47 23 BY MS. RHYU: 01:45:58 24 Q. Do you believe that you should be listed 01:45:59 25 as an author on this publication? 01:48:38 25 MR. CANNON: Sure. 01:48:31 23 BY MS. RHYU: 01:48:33 24 Q. Did this article, Exhibit 1, influence 01:48:38 25 your decision to begin to develop a procedure for | | | | |
| 01:45:58 24 Q. Do you believe that you should be listed 01:45:59 25 as an author on this publication? O1:48:38 25 your decision to begin to develop a procedure for | | | | 1 |
| 01:45:59 25 as an author on this publication? 01:48:38 25 your decision to begin to develop a procedure for | | | | i |
| your decision to begin to develop a procedure for | | | | |
| Page 98 Page 100 | UI.45:59 Z5 | - | U1:48:38 25 | your decision to begin to develop a procedure for |
| | | Page 98 | | Page 100 |

| 02:09:31 1 | Q. Do you see where it says: | 02:12:44 1 | MS. RHYU: Yes. |
|-------------|---|-------------|---|
| 02:09:33 2 | "NOTE! Shirley Kwok summarized the | 02:12:46 2 | MR. CANNON: Clear a spot for you. |
| 02:09:36 3 | results from several HIV viremia studies in | 02:12:52 3 | BY MS. RHYU: |
| 02:09:40 4 | the following chart." | 02:12:52 4 | Q. Do you have 596 in front of you? |
| 02:09:41 5 | Do you remember preparing the chart that's on | 02:12:55 5 | A. Yes, I do. |
| 02:09:43 6 | this page? | 02:12:56 6 | Q. Did you read a manuscript of this |
| 02:09:50 7 | A. I don't remember it, but | 02:12:58 7 | publication let me withdraw that question. |
| 02:09:55 8 | Q. Do you see that the Holodniy article | 02:13:01 8 | Did you help prepare this manuscript for |
| 02:09:59 9 | regarding amplification of HIV-1 RNA in sera is | 02:13:04 9 | publication? |
| 02:10:03 10 | - | 02:13:04 10 | A. No, I didn't. |
| 02:10:08 11 | chart? | 02:13:05 11 | Q. Did you read a copy of the manuscript |
| 02:10:09 12 | MR. CANNON: Object as to form. | 02:13:08 12 | |
| 02:10:13 13 | THE WITNESS: I see that. | 02:13:12 13 | A. I I assume so. |
| 02:10:13 14 | BY MS. RHYU: | 02:13:15 14 | Q. Would it have been your practice to read a |
| 02:10:15 15 | Q. Does that refresh your recollection as to | 02:13:18 15 | |
| 02:10:19 16 | | 02:13:21 16 | |
| 02:10:25 17 | A. It doesn't help me now, but given that this | 02:13:22 17 | • |
| 02:10:28 18 | was in '92 | 02:13:25 18 | Q. And if you turn to page 711 in the |
| 02:10:35 19 | Q. Does that | 02:13:29 19 | manuscript, reference No. 14; do you see that? |
| 02:10:36 20 | A I must have seen something, but I don't | 02:13:35 20 | A. Mm-hmm. |
| 02:10:38 21 | have any recollection today. | 02:13:37 21 | Q. That reference is actually referring to |
| 02:10:43 22 | Q. You must have seen the Holodniy reference | 02:13:40 22 | the publication in Exhibit 46. Generally would you |
| 02:10:48 23 | referred to there by June 16th, 1992? | 02:13:49 23 | have been aware of the references cited in the |
| 02:11:01 24 | A. Assuming the date on this is correct, yes. | 02:13:54 24 | manuscript on which you're a coauthor? |
| 02:11:17 25 | Q. I'm handing you what was previously marked | 02:13:57 25 | MR. CANNON: Objection as to form. |
| | Page 105 | | Page 107 |
| | | | |
| 02:11:20 1 | as Exhibit 46. | 02:14:00 1 | THE WITNESS: I think I was most concerned |
| 02:11:20 2 | (Previously marked Exhibit 46 was | 02:14:03 2 | with making sure that the entries that were |
| 02:11:20 3 | presented to the witness.) | 02:14:08 3 | particularly pertinent to our contribution to the |
| 02:11:20 4 | BY MS. RHYU: | 02:14:10 4 | manuscript were correct. In that case we'd be looking |
| 02:11:26 5 | Q. Do you recognize Exhibit 46? It's an | 02:14:14 5 | over the procedure. I usually don't pay that much |
| 02:11:30 6 | article from the Journal of Clinical Investigation | 02:14:18 6 | attention to the references. |
| 02:11:33 7 | published in November of 1991. Mark Holodniy is | 02:14:18 7 | BY MS. RHYU: |
| 02:11:37 8 | the first author. | 02:14:28 8 | Q. So the fact that the Holodniy reference, |
| 02:11:41 9 | A. I don't recognize this. | 02:14:30 9 | Exhibit 46, is listed as a reference in |
| 02:11:43 10 | Q. Do you remember ever having seen this | 02:14:34 10 | Exhibit 596, doesn't refresh your recollection one |
| 02:11:48 11 | publication? | 02:14:36 11 | way or another whether you were aware of the JCI |
| 02:11:48 12 | A. I don't recall. | 02:14:42 12 | publication, Exhibit 46? |
| 02:11:53 13 | Q. At the time you were working on methods | 02:14:44 13 | A. No, it doesn't. |
| 02:11:57 14 | for quantitating HIV, did you try to keep abreast | 02:14:45 14 | Q. Okay. |
| 02:12:01 15 | of developments in the field of HIV quantitation | 02:14:56 15 | I'm handing you what was previously marked |
| 02:12:06 16 | using PCR? | 02:14:58 16 | as Exhibit 115. It's a patent on which Tom Merigan |
| 02:12:09 17 | A. I tried as much as I could, but in those days | 02:15:06 17 | is the first named inventor, the patent is the |
| 02:12:12 18 | I don't remember there being electronic journals, and | | I'll refer to it in shorthand as the '730 patent. |
| 02:12:19 19 | I don't remember seeing these particular articles — | 02:15:09 19 | (Previously marked Exhibit 115 was |
| 02:12:23 20 | this particular article. | 11:43:24 20 | presented to the witness.) |
| 02:12:24 21 | Q. Can you go back to Exhibit 596. It's the | 11:43:24 21 | BY MS. RHYU: |
| 02:12:28 22 | article where R.W. Coombs is the first author. | 02:15:15 22 | Q. Have you ever seen it before? |
| 02:12:33 23 | A. Coombs. | 02:15:16 23 | A. No, I haven't. |
| 02:12:34 24 | Q. Coombs, thank you. | 02:15:20 24 | Q. I'm handing you what was previously marked |
| 02.12.43.23 | MR. CANNON: Are you done with this? Page 106 | 02:15:22 25 | as Exhibit 16, the '705 patent. |
| | raye IVO | | Page 108 |

| | 1 | |
|----|--|---|
| 1 | | |
| 1 | 2 | |
| | 3 | |
| 1 | 1 | |
| | 5 | |
| (| 5 | |
| | 7 | |
| 1 | I, SHIRLEY YEE KWOK, do hereby declare | |
| 9 | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · | |
| 1 | I I . J I | |
| 1: | | |
| 1: | | , |
| 1 | ,,,, | |
| 1: | , | |
| 1 | | |
| 1. | Automotive Contraction of the Co | |
| 10 | 6, 20, at | |
| 1 | 7 | |
| 18 | B (City) (State) | |
| 19 | 9 | |
| 20 |) · | |
| | SHIRLEY YEE KWOK | |
| 21 | | |
| 22 | a de la companya del companya de la companya de la companya del companya de la co | |
| 23 | | |
| 24 | | |
| | | |
| 25 | | |
| | Page 113 | |
| | | |
| 1 | | |
| 2 | I, the undersigned, a Certified Shorthand | |
| 3 | Reporter of the State of California, do hereby | i de la companya de |
| 4 | certify: | į |
| 5 | That the foregoing proceedings were taken | |
| 6 | before me at the time and place herein set forth; that | |
| 7 | any witnesses in the foregoing proceedings, prior to | |
| 8 | testifying, were placed under oath; that a verbatim | |
| 9 | record of the proceedings was made by me using machine | |
| 10 | shorthand which was thereafter transcribed under my | |
| | | |
| 11 | direction; further, that the foregoing is an accurate | |
| 12 | transcription thereof. | |
| 13 | I further certify that I am neither | |
| 14 | financially interested in the action nor a relative or | |
| 15 | employee of any attorney of any of the parties. | |
| 16 | IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have this date | |
| 17 | subscribed my name. | |
| 18 | * Andrews | |
| 19 | Dated: | |
| 20 | | |
| 21 | talification of the state of th | |
| 22 | **Charactery** | |
| 23 | companies to | |
| 23 | CUZANIE E DOCCUERRA | |
| | SUZANNE F. BOSCHETTI | |
| 24 | CSR No. 5111 | |
| 25 | | |
| | Page 114 | |
| | | |

29 (Pages 113 to 114)