

1 ELECTRONIC FRONTIER FOUNDATION  
 2 CINDY COHN (145997)  
 3 cindy@eff.org  
 4 LEE TIEN (148216)  
 5 tien@eff.org  
 6 KURT OPSAHL (191303)  
 7 kurt@eff.org  
 8 KEVIN S. BANKSTON (217026)  
 9 bankston@eff.org  
 10 CORYNNE MCSHERRY (221504)  
 11 corynne@eff.org  
 12 JAMES S. TYRE (083117)  
 13 jstyre@eff.org  
 14 454 Shotwell Street  
 15 San Francisco, CA 94110  
 16 Telephone: 415/436-9333  
 17 415/436-9993 (fax)

TRABER & VOORHEES  
 BERT VOORHEES (137623)  
 bv@tvlegal.com  
 THERESA M. TRABER (116305)  
 tmt@tvlegal.com  
 128 North Fair Oaks Avenue, Suite 204  
 Pasadena, CA 91103  
 Telephone: 626/585-9611  
 626/ 577-7079 (fax)

10 Attorneys for Plaintiffs

11 [Additional counsel appear on signature page.]

12 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
 13 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
 14

15 TASH HEPTING, GREGORY HICKS, )  
 16 CAROLYN JEWEL and ERIK KNUTZEN, on )  
 17 Behalf of Themselves and All Others Similarly )  
 18 Situated, )  
 19 Plaintiffs, )  
 20 vs. )  
 21 AT&T CORP., et al. )  
 22 Defendants. )

No. C-06-00672-VRW  
CLASS ACTION  
 [PROPOSED] ORDER REGARDING  
 REQUEST FOR JUDICIAL NOTICE  
 The Hon. Vaughn R. Walker, Chief Judge

22  
 23  
 24  
 25  
 26  
 27  
 28

1 Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 201 and the inherent authority of the Court, and having  
2 given full consideration to all of Plaintiffs' papers and the relevant authorities, and all of Defendants'  
3 responses thereto, and good cause appearing, in accordance with Federal Rule of Evidence 201, it is  
4 HEREBY ORDERED as follows:

5 1. The Court takes judicial notice of certain admissions made by the President of the  
6 United States and representatives of the President's Administration about the National Security  
7 Agency ("NSA")'s surveillance program, as more particularly described below:

8 (a) In the fall of 2001 the President authorized the NSA to launch a secret  
9 electronic surveillance program (the "Program");

10 (b) Under the Program, the NSA intercepts electronic communications;

11 (c) The President has reauthorized the Program more than thirty times,  
12 approximately every 45 days, based on periodic review and approval of the Program by the Attorney  
13 General and other officials. The President intends to continue reauthorizing the Program  
14 indefinitely;

15 (d) Under the Program, the NSA conducts "electronic surveillance" as defined by  
16 the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act of 1978 ("FISA"), 50 U.S.C. §1801 *et. seq.*;

17 (e) Under the Program, the NSA conducts surveillance that would not satisfy the  
18 standards of the FISA statute;

19 (f) Under the Program, the NSA intercepts communications without obtaining a  
20 warrant or any other type of judicial authorization;

21 (g) The Program has been used "in lieu of" the procedures specified under the  
22 FISA;

23 (h) The Administration is not using the 72 hour emergency exception to FISA, 50  
24 U.S.C. §1805(f), to conduct the Program;

25 (i) Under the Program, an NSA "shift supervisor" is authorized to approve  
26 interceptions of communications without need for specific approval from the President, the Attorney  
27 General or any judicial authority;

28

1 (j) The Program “is a more . . . ‘aggressive’ program than would be traditionally  
2 available under FISA,” in part because “[t]he trigger is quicker and a bit softer than it is for a FISA  
3 warrant”;

4 (k) Under the Program, communications are intercepted without probable cause to  
5 believe that the surveillance targets have committed or are about to commit any crime, or are foreign  
6 powers or agents thereof. Instead, the NSA claims to intercept communications when the agency  
7 has, in its own judgment, a “*reasonable basis to conclude* that one party to the communication is a  
8 member of al Qaeda, affiliated with al Qaeda, or a member of an organization affiliated with al  
9 Qaeda, or working in support of al Qaeda,” as well as the communications of individuals it deems  
10 suspicious on the basis of its belief that they have some unspecified “link” to al Qaeda or a related  
11 terrorist organization, or “want to kill Americans.” Put another way, when the NSA believes there is  
12 “[i]nherent foreign intelligence value”;

13 (l) Information collected under the Program is retained and disseminated, even  
14 when such information is about an American and gives no indication that the individual is involved  
15 in terrorism; and

16 (m) The Administration has not denied that the warrantless surveillance operations  
17 may extend beyond the conduct that the President has already publicly acknowledged.

18 2. The Court take judicial notice of the following public documents, copies of which are  
19 attached to Plaintiffs’ Request for Judicial Notice, which verify the above-listed facts:

20 (a) President Bush, Radio Address (Dec. 17, 2005);

21 (b) Press Briefing by Attorney General Alberto Gonzales and General Michael  
22 Hayden, Principal Deputy Director for National Intelligence, Dec. 19, 2005;

23 (c) Letter from William E. Moschella, Assistant Attorney General, Office of  
24 Legislative Affairs, Department of Justice, to congressional leaders, December 22, 2005;

25 (d) Michael Hayden, Remarks at the National Press Club on NSA Domestic  
26 Surveillance (Jan. 23, 2006);

27 (e) President Bush, Press Conference (Dec. 19, 2005);

28

1 (f) Letter from William E. Moschella, Assistant Attorney General, Office of  
2 Legislative Affairs, Department of Justice, to Senator Arlen Specter, March 24, 2006;

3 (g) Wartime Executive Power and the NSA's Surveillance Authority Before the  
4 Senate Judiciary Committee, 109th Congress (Feb. 6, 2006); and

5 (h) Letter from Alberto Gonzales to Senator Arlen Specter (February 28, 2006).

6 \* \* \*

7 **ORDER**

8 IT IS SO ORDERED.

9 DATED: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
10 THE HONORABLE VAUGHN R. WALKER  
CHIEF UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

11 T:\CasesSF\AT&T Privacy\ORD00029452.doc

12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on March 31, 2006, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the e-mail addresses denoted on the attached Electronic Mail Notice List, and I hereby certify that I have mailed the foregoing document or paper via FedEx to the non-CM/ECF participants indicated on the attached Manual Notice List.

/s/ REED R. KATHREIN  
REED R. KATHREIN

LERACH COUGHLIN STOIA GELLER  
RUDMAN & ROBBINS LLP  
100 Pine Street, 26th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Telephone: 415/288-4545  
415/288-4534 (fax)

E-mail: [ReedK@lerachlaw.com](mailto:ReedK@lerachlaw.com)

## Mailing Information for a Case 3:06-cv-00672-VRW

### Electronic Mail Notice List

The following are those who are currently on the list to receive e-mail notices for this case.

- **Kevin Stuart Bankston**  
bankston@eff.org
- **Cindy Ann Cohn**  
cindy@eff.org wendy@eff.org;barak@eff.org
- **Bruce A. Ericson**  
bruce.ericson@pillsburylaw.com
- **Jeff D Friedman**  
JFriedman@lerachlaw.com RebeccaG@lerachlaw.com
- **Eric A. Isaacson**  
erici@lerachlaw.com jackiew@lerachlaw.com
- **Reed R. Kathrein**  
reedk@lerachlaw.com e\_file\_sd@lerachlaw.com;e\_file\_sf@lerachlaw.com
- **Corynne McSherry**  
corynne@eff.org
- **Maria V. Morris**  
mariam@mwbhl.com e\_file\_sd@lerachlaw.com;e\_file\_sf@lerachlaw.com
- **Kurt Opsahl**  
kurt@eff.org
- **Shana Eve Scarlett**  
shanas@lerachlaw.com e\_file\_sd@lerachlaw.com;e\_file\_sf@lerachlaw.com
- **Theresa M. Traber, Esq**  
tmt@tvlegal.com
- **James Samuel Tyre**  
jstyre@jstyre.com jstyre@eff.org
- **Bert Voorhees**  
bv@tvlegal.com

### Manual Notice List

The following is the list of attorneys who are **not** on the list to receive e-mail notices for this case (who therefore require manual noticing). You may wish to use your mouse to select and copy this list into your word processing program in order to create notices or labels for these recipients.

**Lee Tien**

Electronic Frontier Foundation  
454 Shotwell Street  
San Francisco, CA 94110

**Lee Tien**

Electronic Frontier Foundation  
454 Shotwell Street  
San Francisco, CA 94110