

DISABILITY RIGHTS ADVOCATES  
2001 CENTER STREET, THIRD FLOOR  
BERKELEY, CALIFORNIA 94704-1204  
510.665.8644

1 LAURENCE W. PARADIS (California Bar No. 122336)  
lparadis@dralegal.org  
2 MAZEN M. BASRAWI (California Bar No. 235475)  
mbasrawi@dralegal.org  
3 DISABILITY RIGHTS ADVOCATES  
2001 Center Street, Third Floor  
4 Berkeley, California 94704  
Telephone: (510) 665-8644  
5 Facsimile: (510) 665-8511  
TTY: (510) 665-8716  
6

TODD M. SCHNEIDER (California Bar No. 158253)  
7 tschneider@schneiderwallace.com  
JOSHUA KONECKY (California Bar No. 182897)  
8 jkonecky@schneiderwallace.com  
SCHNEIDER & WALLACE  
9 180 Montgomery Street, Suite 2000  
San Francisco, CA 94104  
10 Telephone: (415) 421-7100  
Fax: (415) 421-7105  
11 TTY: (415) 421-1655

12 DANIEL F. GOLDSTEIN (*pro hac vice*)  
dfg@browngold.com  
13 BROWN, GOLDSTEIN & LEVY, LLP  
120 E. Baltimore St., Suite 1700  
14 Baltimore, MD 21202  
Telephone: (410) 962-1030  
15 Fax: (410) 385-0869

16 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
17 **NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**  
18 **SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION**

19 NATIONAL FEDERATION OF THE  
20 BLIND, the NATIONAL FEDERATION OF  
21 THE BLIND OF CALIFORNIA, on behalf of  
22 their members, and Bruce F. Sexton, on behalf  
of himself and all others similarly situated,

23 Plaintiffs,

24 v.

25 TARGET CORPORATION,

26 Defendant.

Case No.: C 06-01802 MHP

**CLASS ACTION**

**DECLARATION OF ROBERT STIGILE  
IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS' MOTION  
FOR PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION**

Hearing Date: June 12, 2006  
Time: 2:00 p.m.  
Judge: The Honorable Marilyn Hall  
Patel

27  
28

1 I, Robert Stigile, declare as follows:

2 1. The facts in this declaration are based upon my personal knowledge. If called to testify,  
3 I could testify competently to the facts described in this declaration.

4 **Background**

- 5 2. I am 39 years old.  
6 3. I have been legally blind for 20 years.  
7 4. I reside in Reseda, California.  
8 5. I have been a member of the National Federation of the Blind since 1988.  
9 6. I have been a member of the National Federation of the Blind of California since 1988.

10 **Internet Use**

- 11 7. I have used the screen reading software "JAWS" to access computers and, especially, the  
12 internet since 1994.  
13 8. I use the internet every day for a variety of functions and activities in my daily life,  
14 including: browsing, online shopping, information and news gathering, and email.  
15 9. In the past, I have also utilized the internet for work. For nine years, part of my job was  
16 to teach children how to use the internet.  
17 10. I periodically shop online rather than going to a physical store because it is difficult to get  
18 taxis or take the bus, especially if I want to purchase a large amount of goods, and I find it much  
19 easier to complete purchases online.  
20 11. Using my screen reader to access the internet has significantly improved my own view of  
21 my independence to conduct personal business without the help of others.

22 **Experience with Target Retail Stores**

- 23 12. I have shopped at a Target store that is between five and 10 miles from my home.  
24 13. For me, shopping at Target's physical location near my home requires finding a relative  
25 to drive me there, calling a taxi, or taking a bus. If I take a taxi, I must then call and wait for  
26 another taxi in order to return home. If I take a bus, I must then walk a significant distance  
27 through a shopping mall, and must return to the bus stop carrying everything I purchased at the  
28 store. This situation is common, and for that reason I much prefer to shop online.

DISABILITY RIGHTS ADVOCATES  
2001 Center Street, Third Floor  
Berkeley, CA 94704-1204  
(510) 665-8644

**Harms Experienced Because of the Inaccessibility of Target.com**

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

14. I would like to shop at Target.com because traveling to the physical retail location necessitates a significant expense of time, energy, and money.

15. I have attempted on numerous occasions to access Target.com with my screen reader.

16. I have found it extremely difficult, and at times impossible, to browse for products on Target.com using my screen reader.

17. Upon accessing Target.com on several occasions, I have become frustrated with inexplicable code and garbled text that has prevented me from continuing to navigate through the site.

18. I have been told that there are many useful store-related features on the Target.com website, including weekly advertisements, which I would like to use.

19. I attempted to purchase a barbecue and compact discs from Target.com, but I found that completing the purchase was impossible.

20. I have found the entire process of attempting to access Target.com to be extremely frustrating and aggravating.

21. Because the problems I have encountered on Target.com when using my screen reader have prevented me from making purchases, I have decided to avoid their website as well as their physical locations and I have instead shopped elsewhere.

22. My inability to use Target.com thwarts my independence and forces me to rely on others unnecessarily.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed this April day of \_\_\_\_, 2006, at Reseda, California.

\_\_\_\_\_  
ROBERT STIGILE

United States of America that the  
forgoing is true and correct.

Executed this April day of \_\_\_\_\_, 2006, at Reseda,  
California.

---

*Robert Stigije*      *april 24 2006*      Robert