

1 G. WHITNEY LEIGH (SBN 153457)  
 2 GONZALEZ & LEIGH LLP  
 3 744 Montgomery Street, Fifth Floor  
 4 San Francisco, CA 94111  
 5 Telephone: (415) 912-5950  
 6 Facsimile: (415) 912-5951  
 7 Attorneys for Plaintiff  
 8 DENIZ BOLBOL

9 JOSEPH P. CUVIELLO  
 10 P.O. Box 2834  
 11 Redwood City, CA 94064  
 12 Telephone: (650) 654-9955  
 13 Plaintiff In Pro Se

14 STEPHEN M. MACPHAIL, Bar No. 106522  
 15 BRAGG & KULUVA  
 16 555 S. Flower Street, Suite 600  
 17 Los Angeles, California 90071  
 18 Telephone: (213) 612-5335  
 19 Facsimile: (213) 612-5712  
 20 Attorneys for Defendants,  
 21 SMG, COUNTY OF ALAMEDA,  
 22 RON LITTLE, LEROY "SKEET" ELLIS,  
 23 OAKLAND-ALAMEDA COUNTY COLISEUM AUTHORITY  
 24 OAKLAND COLISEUM JOINT VENTURE

25 RICHARD M. WILLIAMS  
 26 Gray •Duffy, LLP  
 27 702 Marshall Street, Suite 600  
 28 Redwood City, CA 94063  
 Telephone: Office: (650) 365-7343  
 Attorneys for Defendants CITY OF OAKLAND  
 OAKLAND POLICE OFFICER R. VALLADON,  
 OAKLAND POLICE OFFICER R. VILLEGAS

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
 SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

JOSEPH P. CUVIELLO AND  
 DENIZ BOLBOL, INDIVIDUALLY,

Plaintiffs,

v.

CITY OF OAKLAND, A PUBLIC ENTITY,  
 et al.,

Defendants.

Case Nos. 06-cv-05517-EMC  
 and 09-cv-02955-EMC

**[PROPOSED] STIPULATED  
 PERMANENT INJUNCTION**

1 **INTRODUCTION**

2 In accordance with the Court’s Order Granting Plaintiffs’ Motion for Voluntary  
3 Dismissal dated November 15, 2012 (*See* Docket 531), Plaintiffs and Defendants jointly submit  
4 this proposed Stipulated Permanent Injunction (“Injunction”). The parties have consented to  
5 the entry of this Stipulated Permanent Injunction to resolve all matters of dispute between them  
6 in the above-entitled actions. Pursuant to the Court’s November 15, 2012 Order, this proposed  
7 Stipulated Permanent Injunction contains all of the terms of the agreed-upon permanent  
8 injunction for this case.

9 **Permanent Injunction**

10 Plaintiffs and up to (4) four persons acting in concert, shall be permitted to unfettered  
11 access without any ticket requirement the following areas in order to conduct their free speech  
12 activity (i.e., videotaping, displaying signs, leafletting, or otherwise protesting):

13 (1) A three (3)-foot wide walkway running alongside the perimeter wall of the animal  
14 compound. Defendants or Ringling Bros. may construct a fence to demark the three (3)-foot  
15 wide walkway on side of walkway opposite the perimeter wall of the animal compound of the  
16 Ringling Bros. Circus events, located on the North and East sides and West side to the frontage  
17 road entrance gate, at the Oracle Arena in Oakland, California, to create a corridor.

18 (2) The barricaded corridor leading to the animal compound, the area outside of but  
19 directly adjacent to the corridor, and the gap between the corridor and the animal compound  
20 entrance except that there shall be a ten-foot buffer zone surrounding the entrance of the  
21 compound. Plaintiffs may temporarily be moved from the gap to permit movement of  
22 equipment and animals.

23 (3) The upper west landing area, up to the point where the west ramp joins the landing.

24 (4) One specific spot located in the area adjacent to the entrance to the north tunnel,  
25 which has a clear view of the entire tunnel. Here, only one person rather than four shall be  
26 permitted access.

27 (5) The north ramp and landing.

28 (6) The northeast stairs and base of the stairs.

1 Furthermore, Plaintiffs and persons acting in concert with them should be permitted free  
2 access to all exterior areas of the Arena and parking lot which are otherwise open to the public.

3 Defendants are required to distribute copies of the preliminary injunction to any security  
4 manager, security guard, and/or police officer providing security at the Arena during the circus  
5 engagement. Moreover, all security personnel should be briefed as to the material terms of the  
6 injunction.

7 In addition, Defendants shall designate one “point person” during the entirety of the  
8 circus engagement at the Arena, who shall be responsible for communicating with  
9 Mr. CuvIELLO and Ms. Bolbol in the event of a dispute and who has the power to make immediate  
10 decisions in regard thereto.

11 The preliminary injunction need only apply to circus events scheduled at the  
12 Coliseum/Arena, such as the Ringling Brothers Circus.

13 The Court shall retain jurisdiction over any disputes that arise with respect to these cases  
14 and the permanent injunction is hereby entered.

15 **SO STIPULATED.**

16 Dated: November 26, 2012

GONZALEZ & LEIGH LLP

17

18

By: /s/ G. Whitney Leigh  
G. WHITNEY LEIGH  
Attorneys for Plaintiff  
DENIZ BOLBOL

19

20

21

Dated: November 26, 2012

22

23

/s/ Joseph CuvIELLO  
JOSEPH CUVIELLO  
Plaintiff In Pro Per

24

25

26

27

28

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

Dated: November 26, 2012

BRAGG & KULUVA

By: /s/ Stephen M. MacPhail  
STEPHEN M. MacPHAIL  
Attorneys for Defendants  
SMG, COUNTY OF ALAMEDA, RON  
LITTLE, LEROY "SKEET" ELLIS,  
OAKLAND-ALAMEDA COUNTY  
COLISEUM AUTHORITY and  
OAKLAND COLISEUM JOINT  
VENTURE

Dated: November 26, 2012

GRAY DUFFY, LLP

By: /s/ Richard M. Williams  
RICHARD M. WILLIAMS  
Attorneys for Defendants CITY OF  
OAKLAND, OAKLAND POLICE  
OFFICER R. VALLADON, OAKLAND  
POLICE OFFICER R. VILLEGAS

Therefore, Plaintiffs' motion for voluntary dismissal of is hereby **GRANTED**.

Upon the filing of this document, the Clerk of the Court shall enter a final judgment and close the file in this case.

**IT IS SO ORDERED.**

Dated: 11/27/12

