

1 Steven D. Hemminger (CA State Bar No. 110665)
 ALSTON & BIRD LLP
 2 Two Palo Alto Square
 3000 El Camino Real, Suite 400
 3 Palo Alto, California 94306-2112
 Telephone: (650) 838-2000
 4 Facsimile: (650) 838-2001
 steve.hemminger@alston.com

5
 6 Michael S. Connor (admitted *pro hac vice*)
 Lance A. Lawson (admitted *pro hac vice*)
 Brian F. McMahon (CA State Bar No. 235373)
 7 Miranda M. Olvera (admitted *pro hac vice*)
 Jessica J. Sibley (admitted *pro hac vice*)
 8 ALSTON & BIRD LLP
 101 South Tryon Street, Suite 4000
 9 Charlotte, North Carolina 28280-4000
 Telephone: (704) 444-1000
 10 Facsimile: (704) 444-1111
 mike.connor@alston.com
 11 lance.lawson@alston.com
 brian.mcmahon@alston.com

12
 13 Marissa R. Ducca (admitted *pro hac vice*)
 ALSTON & BIRD LLP
 950 F Street, N.W.
 14 Washington, DC 20004-1404
 Telephone: (202) 756-3369
 15 Facsimile: (202) 654-4982
 marissa.ducca@alston.com

16 Attorneys for Defendant AGA MEDICAL CORPORATION

17
 18 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
 19 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
 20 SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

21 MEDTRONIC, INC., a Minnesota corporation,

22 Plaintiff,

23 v.

24 AGA MEDICAL CORPORATION, a
 25 Minnesota corporation,

26 Defendant.
 27
 28

Case No. 3:07-cv-00567 MMC (EMC)

**~~[PROPOSED]~~ ORDER GRANTING
 AGA'S ADMINISTRATIVE REQUEST
 TO FILE UNDER SEAL AGA'S
 OPPOSITION TO MEDTRONIC'S
 MOTION *IN LIMINE* NO. 13 TO
 PRECLUDE AGA FROM CALLING ANY
 WITNESSES AT TRIAL IN SUPPORT OF
 ITS LACHES DEFENSE**

1 On December 2, 2009, Defendant AGA Medical Corporation (“AGA”) filed AGA’s
2 Opposition to Medtronic’s Motion *in Limine* No. 13 to Preclude AGA from Calling Any Witnesses
3 at Trial in Support of Its Laches Defense. AGA filed an Administrative Request to file its
4 Opposition under Seal and a supporting declaration, stating that the Opposition refers to AGA
5 confidential business information. The confidential information cited in AGA’s Opposition includes
6 the amount AGA expended on clinical trials from 2002 through 2007 and is of a highly sensitive
7 nature. Moreover, the Court previously granted AGA’s request to seal documents including this
8 information. *See* Dkt. No. 420. For the reasons stated in AGA’s administrative request and
9 declaration, it is hereby ordered that page 9, lines 12-13 of AGA’s Opposition shall be filed under
10 seal.

11 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

12
13
14 Dated: January 5, 2010 ~~2009~~

15 
16 HONORABLE MAXINE M. CHESNEY
17 UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE