Drew v. Equifax Inf	ermation Services, LLC et al		Doc.
	Case 3:07-cv-00726-SI Document 370	Filed 03/31/2009 Page 1 of 7	
		NTES DISTRICT	
1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	THOMAS P. QUINN (SBN: 132268) NOKES & QUINN 410 BROADWAY, SUITE 200 LAGUNA BEACH, CA 92651 Tel: (949) 376-3500 Fax: (949) 376-3070 Email: tquin@nokesquinn.com S. STEWART HASKINS [Pro Hac Vice] Georgia Bar No. 336104 J. ANTHONY LOVE [Pro Hac Vice] Georgia Bar No: 459155 K. ANN BROUSSARD [Pro Hac Vice] Georgia Bar No: 100142 KING & SPALDING 1180 PEACHTREE STREET, N.E. ATLANTA, GA 30309 Tel: (404) 572-4600 Fax: (404) 572-5100 Email: shaskins@KSLAW.com tlove@KSLAW.com	TI IS SO ORDERED Judge Susan Illston	ALTORNIA JAI
12	Attorneys for Defendant EQUIFAX		
13	INFORMATION SERVICES LLC		
14			
15		S DISTRICT COURT	
		RICT OF CALIFORNIA CISCO DIVISION	
16			
17	ERIC ROBERT DREW,) Case No. 3:07-cv-00726-SI	
18	Plaintiff,) Case 100. 5.07-ev-00720-51	
19	v.) DEFENDANT EQUIFAX	
		INFORMATION SERVICES LLC	
20	EQUIFAX INFORMATION SERVICES LLC, EXPERIAN INFORMATION) FOR LEAVE TO FILE A MOTION	
21	SOLUTIONS, INC., TRANS UNION LLC,	PARTIAL RECONSIDERATION	
22	NCAC, BANK OF AMERICA, FLEET	SUMMARY JUDGMENT RULING	
23	CREDIT, CARD SERVICE, AT&T UNIVERSAL CARD SERVICES,) EXPEDITED HEARING AND LE	
24	CITIGROUP, BANK ONE CARDMEMBEI	A) APPEAR BY PHONE	
25	SERVICES, FIRST USA BANK, N.A. and DOES 1-100,) Civil Local Rule 7-9	
26	Defendants.	 Date: April 10, 2009 Time: 9:00 a.m. 	
27		Courtroom: 10, 19 th Floor	
28	5659887	Judge: The Honorable Susan Illston	
	DEF	- 1 – ENDANT EQUIFAX INFORMATION SERVIC DTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE MOTION FOR RECONSID Case No: 3:07-c	PARTIAL DERATION

1

2

TO THE COURT AND TO ALL PARTIES AND THEIR ATTORNEYS OF RECORD:

NOTICE OF MOTION

3 PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that pursuant to Civil Local Rule 7-9, Defendant Equifax 4 Information Services LLC ("Equifax"), hereby moves the Court for leave to file a Motion for 5 Partial Reconsideration of the portion of its March 5, 2009 "Order re: Defendants' Motions for 6 Summary Judgment" [Docket No. 327] addressing the Fair Credit Reporting Act ("FCRA") claim against Equifax. The Court dismissed all claims against Equifax except those under § 1681i of 7 8 the FCRA. Equifax seeks clarification that the only underlying fraud account that can be used by 9 Plaintiff to support his § 1681i claim is the Bank of America/FIA account. Further, Equifax 10 moves for partial reconsideration of the Court's Order on the issue of the final dispute that Plaintiff made with Equifax concerning the Bank of America account. It was on this final 11 dispute, received by Equifax in November of 2005, that Equifax removed the Bank of America 12 account from plaintiff's file. Since Equifax removed the Bank of America account in response to 13 this dispute, it is entitled to summary judgment on any § 1681i claim related to this specific 14 15 dispute of the account. Equifax does not move, at this time, for reconsideration of the Court's 16 Order on its handling of the Plaintiff's other disputes of the Bank of America account.

Further, to the extent that the equitable tolling arguments presented in the Motion for
Reconsideration filed by co-defendant FIA Card Services, N.A. apply to Equifax, it adopts them
and joins that motion.

This motion is based on this Notice of Motion and Motion, the accompanying Memorandum of Points and Authorities in support thereof, and all pleadings and papers on file in this action and upon such other matters as may be presented to the Court at the time of the hearing.

К	ING & SPALDING LLP
	/ K. Ann Broussard . ANN BROUSSARD
A	ttorneys for Defendant EQUIFAX
	- 2 –
	CNDANT EQUIFAX INFORMATION SERVICES LLC'S DTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE MOTION FOR PARTIAL RECONSIDERATION Case No: 3:07-cv-00726-SI
	Dated: March 31, 2009 / <u>s</u> K 5659887 DEFE

1

2

MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES

I. **STANDARD FOR MOTION FOR RECONSIDERATION**

3 There are three grounds upon which a party may seek leave to file a motion for 4 reconsideration, one of which applies here. A party may seek leave to file a motion for 5 reconsideration of a court order if there has been "[a] manifest failure by the Court to consider 6 material facts or dispositive legal arguments which were presented to the Court before such 7 interlocutory order." Local Rule 7-9(b). As set forth below, the undisputed material facts 8 support summary judgment in favor of Equifax on Plaintiff's November 2005 dispute of the Bank 9 of America account.

10 II. ARGUMENT

Equifax received Plaintiff's final dispute of the Bank of America account on November 11 21, 2005. See Declaration of Tina Sapere ¶ 32 ("Sapere Decl."), attached as Exhibit A in Support 12 of Equifax's Motion for Summary Judgment [Docket No. 167-2]. The Fair Credit Reporting Act 13 ("FCRA") provides that all reinvestigations must be completed within 30 days of the date they 14 15 are received by the consumer reporting agency. See 15 U.S.C. § 1681i(a)(1)(a). In this case, 16 Equifax received Plaintiff's dispute on November 21, 2005 and removed the Bank of America 17 account from Plaintiff's file as reflected in the results of investigation sent to Plaintiff on 18 December 20, 2005. See Sapere Decl. ¶ 32, 33. Since Equifax removed the account within 30 19 days of its receipt of Plaintiff's dispute and provided Plaintiff with the investigation results on 20 December 20, 2005, there can be no § 1681i liability arising from this one dispute. Accordingly, 21 Equifax requests that the Court enter summary judgment in favor of Equifax as to this dispute.

22 23

Further, Equifax hereby adopts the arguments and authority of the Motion for Reconsideration filed by co-defendant FIA Card Services, N.A. on the issue of equitable tolling 24 of the statute of limitations in this case.

REQUEST FOR EXPEDITED HEARING AND LEAVE TO APPEAR BY

25

26

III.

5659887

TELEPHONE FOR HEARING

- 27
- 28

- 3 -

DEFENDANT EQUIFAX INFORMATION SERVICES LL NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE MOTION FOR PA RECONSIDERATION Case No: 3:07-cv-00726-SI

1	Equifax requests that the hearing on this motion be set for April 10, 2009 along with the			
2	hearings on the motions for reconsideration filed by the co-defendants in this case. Equifax's			
3	motion covers a very narrow issue. In addition, Plaintiff should have sufficient time to respond			
4	prior to the hearing date and will suffer no prejudice if this motion is heard on April 10.			
5	Further, should the	Court permit this motion to be heard on an expedited basis, Equifax		
6	requests that its counsel, based in Atlanta, Georgia, be permitted to appear by telephone for the			
7	April 10 hearing. Equifax shows that the hearing on its motion should be brief in duration and			
8	would require unnecessary time and expense to travel such a lengthy distance for a hearing on a			
9	very narrow and direct issue.			
10	IV. <u>CONCLUSION</u>			
11	For the reasons set for	orth above, Equifax requests that this motion be granted.		
12				
13		KING & SPALDING LLP		
14	Datad: Marah 31, 2000	/s/ V App Provesord		
15	Dated: March 31, 2009	/s/ K. Ann Broussard K. ANN BROUSSARD		
16		Attorneys for Defendant EQUIFAX INFORMATION SERVICES LLC		
17		INFORMATION SERVICES LLC		
18				
19				
20				
21				
22				
23				
24				
25				
26				
27				
28	5659887	- 4		
	NOTICE OF	DEFENDANT EQUIFAX INFORMATION SERVICES LLC'S F MOTION AND MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE MOTION FOR PARTIAL RECONSIDERATION Case No: 3:07-cv-00726-SI		
	11			

	Case 3:07-cv-00726-SI Document 370 Filed 03/31/2009 Page 5 of 7						
1	PROOF OF SERVICE						
2	STATE OF GEORGIA COUNTY OF FULTON						
3							
4 5	I am employed in the County of Fulton, State of Georgia. I am over the age of 18 and not a party to the within action. My business address is 1180 Peachtree Street, N.E., Atlanta, Georgia, 30309.						
_	On March 31, 2009, I served the foregoing document(s) described as DEFENDANT						
6 7	EQUIFAX INFORMATION SERVICES LLC'S NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE MOTION FOR PARTIAL RECONSIDERATION on the interested parties in this action by placing a copy thereof enclosed in a sealed envelope						
8	addressed as follows:						
9 10	[] <u>BY PERSONAL DELIVERY.</u> I delivered such envelope by hand to the offices of the addressee.						
10	[] <u>BY MAIL</u> . I caused such envelope with postage thereon fully prepaid to be placed in						
12	the U.S. Mail at Atlanta, Georgia. I am "readily familiar" with the firm's practice of collection and processing correspondence for mailing. Under that practice, it would be						
13	deposited with the U.S postal service on that same day with postage thereon fully prepaid at Atlanta, Georgia in the ordinary course of business. I am aware that on						
14	motion of the party served, service is presumed invalid if postal cancellation date or postage meter date is more than one day after date of deposit for mailing in affidavit.						
15							
16 17	[] <u>BY FACSIMILE TRANSMISSION</u>. I caused such document to be transmitted to the addressee(s) facsimile number(s) noted herein. The facsimile machine used complies with Rule 2003 and no error was reported by the machine. Pursuant to Rule 2008(e), I						
18	caused the machine to print a transmission record of the transmission, a copy of which is attached to this declaration.						
19	[] <u>BY UNITED PARCEL SERVICE</u> . I caused such document to be deposited with the						
20	United Parcel Service at the offices of King & Spalding LLP for guaranteed one day delivery with delivery charges prepaid. I am "readily familiar" with the firm's						
21	practice of collection and processing correspondence for delivery by United Parcel Service delivery service. Under that practice, it would be deposited with the delivery						
22	service on that same day with delivery charges thereon fully prepaid at Atlanta, Georgia						
23	in the ordinary course of business for delivery to the addressee.						
24	[X] <u>BY ECF.</u> I caused such documents to be e-filed with the Court which were then served via the ECF filing system.						
25							
26	SEE ATTACHED SERVICE LIST						
27							
28	5659887 - 5 -						
	DEFENDANT EQUIFAX INFORMATION SERVICES LLC'S NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE MOTION FOR PARTIAL RECONSIDERATION Case No: 3:07-cv-00726-SI						

	Case 3:07-cv-00726-SI	Ocument 370	Filed 03/31/2009	Page 6 of 7
1	I hereby certify that I and	m employed in th	e office of a member o	f the Bar of this Court at
2	whose direction the service wa	s made.		
3	I hereby certify under the	he penalty of perj	ury under the laws of t	he United States of
4	America that the foregoing is the	rue and correct.		
5				
6			Stephanie Peltier EPHANIE PELTIER	
7				
8	Place of Mailing: Atlanta, Geo	orgia		
9	Executed on March 31, 2009, a	at Atlanta, Georgi	a.	
10				
11				
12				
13				
14				
15				
16 17				
17				
19				
20				
21				
22				
23				
24				
25				
26				
27				
28	5659887		6 –	
				RMATION SERVICES LLC'S
	NOTICE OF M	OTION AND MOT	TION FOR LEAVE TO F	ILE MOTION FOR PARTIAL RECONSIDERATION Case No: 3:07-cv-00726-SI

	Case 3:07-cv-00726-SI Document 370 Filed 03/31/2009 Page 7 of 7						
1	SERVICE LIST						
2	ERIC ROBERT DREW v EQUIFAX, et al, CASE NO: 3:07-cv-00726 SI						
3	John Bradford Keating, Esq.						
4	Attorney At Law						
5	2995 Woodside Road., Ste. 350 Woodside, CA 94062						
6	Tel: (650) 851-5900 Fax: (650) 851-5912						
7	Email: jbkeating@aol.com						
8	Attorney for Plaintiff ERIC ROBERT DREW						
9	George G. Weickhardt, Esq. Pamela J. Zanger, Esq.						
10	Ropers Majeski Kohn & Bentley						
11	201 Spear Street, Suite 1000 San Francisco, CA 94105						
12	Tel: 415-543-4800 Fax: 415-972-6301						
13	Email: gweickhardt@ropers.com						
14	Email: <u>pzanger@ropers.com</u> Attorneys for Defendants BANK ONE CARDMEMBER SERVICES, FIRST USA BANK, N.A.,						
15	CHASE BANK USA, N.A.						
16	Jordan Seungjin Yu, Esq.						
17	Felicia Yangru Yu, Esq. Reed Smith LLP						
18	355 So. Grand Ave., Suite 2900 Los Angeles, CA 90071						
19	Tel: 213-457-8000						
20	Fax: 213-457-8080 Email: jsyu@reedsmith.com						
21	Email: <u>fyu@reedsmith.com</u> Attorneys for Defendants FIA CARD SERVICES, N.A.						
22	Automeys for Defendants I IA CARD SERVICES, N.A.						
23							
24							
25							
26							
27							
28	5659887 - 7 -						
	DEFENDANT EQUIFAX INFORMATION SERVICES LLC'S NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE MOTION FOR PARTIAL RECONSIDERATION Case No: 3:07-cv-00726-SI						