

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

DOLORES STRINGER, individually, and as  
personal representative of the Estate of decedent  
MELVIN HARDNETT; M.H., a minor, by and  
through her Guardian Ad Litem, Bonita Frazier;  
N.H., a minor, by and through her Guardian Ad  
Litem, Latonya Gray; and ME. H., a minor, by  
and through her Guardian Ad Litem, DOLORES  
STRINGER,

Plaintiffs,

vs.

CITY OF SAN PABLO, a municipal  
corporation; JOSEPH AITA, in his capacity as  
Chief of Police for the CITY OF SAN PABLO;  
FRANK PERINO, individually, and in his  
capacity as police officer for the CITY OF SAN  
PABLO; MARK GALIOS, individually and in  
his capacity as a police officer for the CITY OF  
SAN PABLO; and, San Pablo police officers  
DOES 1-25, inclusive,

Defendants.

---

No. C 07-3544 CW (MEJ)

**ORDER DIRECTING CITY OF  
PITTSBURG TO RETRIEVE  
CONFIDENTIAL PERSONNEL FILE**

On December 19, 2008, the parties submitted a joint discovery dispute letter. (Dkt. #29.) At issue was a supeana directing the City of Pittsburg to turn over certain personnel records of third party, former Pittsburg employee, Ralph Hernandez.

On February 5, 2009, the parties presented oral argument regarding this dispute. (Dkt. #33.)

1 Upon hearing oral argument the Court determined that there was a possibility that Mr. Hernandez's  
2 personnel files were discoverable regarding his character for truthfulness, and ordered the City of  
3 Pittsburg to submit the files for *in camera* review. Accordingly, City of Pittsburg submitted Mr.  
4 Hernandez's personnel files on February, 6, 2009. Upon *in camera* review, the Court found no  
5 documents in Mr. Hernandez's personnel files are discoverable. (Dkt. #34.) As the Court is still in  
6 possession of Mr. Hernandez's confidential personnel files, the Court ORDERS that the City of  
7 Pittsburg send an agent to retrieve those files.

8 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

9

10 Dated: February 13, 2009

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

