

1 **MARKUN ZUSMAN & COMPTON LLP**
 2 JEFFREY K. COMPTON, State Bar No. 142969
 3 DARIA DUB CARLSON, State Bar No. 150628
 4 WILLIAM A. BAIRD, State Bar No. 192675
 5 17383 Sunset Boulevard, Suite A380
 Pacific Palisades, California 90272
 Telephone: (310) 454-5900
 Facsimile: (310) 454-5970

6 **LAW OFFICE OF STEVEN ELSTER**
 7 STEVEN ELSTER, State Bar No. 227545
 8 785/E2 Oak Grove Road, #201
 Concord, CA 94518-3617
 Telephone: (925) 324-2159
 Facsimile: (925) 945-1276

9 Attorneys for Plaintiffs,
 10 JAMES BRADY, SARAH CAVANAGH
 AND IVA CHIU

11 **MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP**
 12 LINDA E. SHOSTAK, State Bar No. 64599
 13 JAMES E. BODDY, JR., State Bar No. 65244
 14 KATHRYN M. DAVIS, State Bar No. 203454
 425 Market Street
 San Francisco, California 94105-2482
 Telephone: (415) 268-7000
 Facsimile: (415) 268-7522

15 Attorneys for Defendant
 16 DELOITTE & TOUCHE LLP

17 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
 18 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

20 JAMES BRADY, SARAH CAVANAGH, and
 21 IVA CHIU, individually and on behalf of all
 others similarly situated,

22 Plaintiffs,

23 v.

24 DELOITTE & TOUCHE LLP, a limited liability
 25 partnership; and DOES 1-10, inclusive,

26 Defendants.

Case No. C-08-00177-SI

**STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED]
 ORDER GRANTING LEAVE TO
 FILE UNDER SEAL, VOLUME 2
 OF 2**

27 **PUBLIC VERSION**

1 **STIPULATION**

2 Pursuant to Local Rules 7-12 and 79-5, and the Court's Standing Order, Plaintiffs and
3 Defendant, through their respective counsel, submit the following stipulation and [proposed]
4 order granting Defendant Deloitte & Touche LLP ("Defendant") leave to file permanently under
5 seal the materials described below.

6 WHEREAS, in the course of the discovery the parties have produced and disclosed
7 confidential, proprietary, and other private information related to the parties, as well as
8 Defendant's clients, designated "Confidential" or "Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only"
9 pursuant to the parties' Stipulated Protective Order signed by the Court on March 10, 2009, and
10 filed in the above captioned action on March 11, 2009 ("Designated Produced Materials"), for
11 which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than
12 prosecuting this litigation would be warranted;

13 WHEREAS, the parties agree that confidential, proprietary, and other private information
14 related to the parties, as well as Defendant's clients, will also be included in or discussed in the
15 parties filings on the Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification ("Designated Motion Materials");

16 WHEREAS, the parties agree that the Designated Produced Materials and Designated
17 Motion Materials consist of Defendant's proprietary employee training materials, proprietary
18 guidance for conducting audits, proprietary policies, confidential employee personnel and pay
19 data, and confidential and proprietary audit work papers, as well as the confidential and
20 proprietary information of Defendant's clients.

21 WHEREAS, the parties agree that the Designated Produced Materials, including all
22 information derived from the Designated Produced Materials, and the Designated Motion
23 Materials should be filed permanently under seal on the ground that good cause exists to prevent
24 the disclosure of this confidential, proprietary, and financial information. *See, e.g., In re Adobe*
25 *Systems Inc. Securities Litigation*, 141 F.R.D. 155, 158 (N.D. Cal. 1992) (good cause exists when
26 disclosure of proprietary or financial information would put a company as a competitive
27 disadvantage); *Hirschfeld v. Stone*, 193 F.R.D. 175, 187 (S.D. N.Y. 2000) ("disclosure of
28 confidential information is the quintessential type of irreparable harm that cannot be compensated

1 or undone by money damages); *Encyclopedia Brown Prod., Ltd. v. Home Box Office, Inc.*, 26 F.
2 Supp 2d 606, 614 (S.D. N.Y. 1998) (that party would be irreparably harmed by disclosure of
3 confidential business information supported sealing, even though documents dealt with business
4 information dating back several years).

5 NOW THEREFORE, the parties hereby stipulate, subject to Court approval, that the
6 following materials/information, attached hereto, be filed permanently under seal:

7 **Volume 1**

- 8 1. Exhibit 1— Opposition Of Defendant Deloitte & Touche LLP To Plaintiffs’
9 Motion For Class Certification
- 10 2. Exhibit 2 — Relevant portions of James Brady’s deposition transcript
- 11 3. Exhibit 3 — Relevant portions of Sarah Marie Federico’s (formerly Cavanagh,
12 hereinafter referred to as “Cavanagh”) deposition transcript
- 13 4. Exhibit 4 — Relevant portions of Iva Chiu’s deposition transcript
- 14 5. Exhibit 5 — Relevant portions of Scott Smith’s deposition transcript
- 15 6. Exhibit 6 — Relevant portions of Joseph Young’s deposition transcript
- 16 7. Exhibit 7 — Defendant’s Compendium Of Declarations In Support Of Opposition
17 To Plaintiffs’ Motion For Class Certification, including exhibits consisting of the following:
- 18 8. Exhibit 8 — Relevant portions of the Deloitte Audit Approach Manual (bates-
19 stamped DT 001897-001903, DT 001926-001931, DT 001976-001987, DT 002163-002178;
20 DT 002195-002280, DT 002282-002354, DT 002593-002604, DT 002625-002635, DT 002764-
21 002765, DT 002766-002770, DT 002771-002773, DT 002792, DT 076732-076733)
- 22 9. Exhibit 9 — “Consider Fraud, Control Environment and Engagement Risk” (bates-
23 stamped DT 175168-175212)
- 24 10. Exhibit 10 — Records of Audit Experience (bates-stamped PL 000033, 036524,
25 and 173205-173206)
- 26 11. Exhibit 11 — AERS PSW Certification Policy power point presentation (bates-
27 stamped DT 178618-178623)

1 12. Exhibit 12 — Northern California Attest Experience Certification Requirements
2 memorandum (bates-stamped DT 178624-178627)

3 13. Exhibit 13 — Job posting for Audit Assistant position (bates-stamped DT 000511)

4 14. Exhibit 14 — Job posting for entry level audit position (bates-stamped DT
5 178615-178617)

6 15. Exhibit 15 — Letter to Sarah Cavanagh dated April 13, 2004 (bates-stamped
7 DT 000108)

8 16. Exhibit 16 — AERS National Certification Program Guidelines (bates-stamped
9 DT 078337)

10 17. Exhibit 17 — Deloitte training course listings and training materials (bates-
11 stamped DT 000957-988, DT 079362-367, DT 016193-016256, DT 027358-027425, DT 051040-
12 051075, DT 030170-030182)

13 18. Exhibit 18 — Training records of Sarah Cavanagh and Iva Chiu (bates-stamped
14 DT 000207-000216, DT 173183-173191)

15 **Volume 2**

16 19. Exhibit 19 — AERS Competencies: The Performance Framework to Consistently
17 Deliver Outstanding Service (bates-stamped DT 001089-001112)

18 20. Exhibit 20 — AERS Competency Model: Attest Channel Competencies and Core
19 Competencies (bates-stamped DT 078412-078441)

20 21. Exhibit 21 — Template Great Performances Scorecards for Audit Staff and Audit
21 Seniors (bates-stamped DT 001003-001010)

22 22. Exhibit 22 — Great Performances Scorecards for which James Brady, Sarah
23 Cavanagh, and Iva Chiu are the “Feedback Receiver” or “Feedback Provider” (bates-stamped
24 DT 001121-001145, DT 001152-001166, DT 1171-001183, DT 177370-173374, DT 173387-
25 173390, DT 173412-173415)

26 23. Exhibit 23 — Great Performances Scorecards for which Plaintiffs’ putative class
27 member declarants are either a Feedback Receiver or Feedback Provider (bates-stamped

1 DT 177960-177968, DT 177978-177982, DT 177992-177996, DT 178010-178014, DT 178019-
2 178023, DT 178028-178032, DT 178628-178750) and summary chart

3 24. Exhibit 24 — Deloitte General Guidance About the Model Audit Programs (bates-
4 stamped DT 164728-164741)

5 25. Exhibit 25 — Using Professional Judgment (bates-stamped DT 000955-000956)

6 26. Exhibit 26 — Deloitte General Policy 220 (bates-stamped DT 066344-066357)

7 27. Exhibit 27 — Working Papers for Audit conducted by Iva Chiu (bates-stamped
8 DT 178520-178561)

9 28. Exhibit 28 — AUD policy 25: Prepare, Review & Control Working Papers (bates-
10 stamped DT 070132-070210)

11 29. Exhibit 29 — AUD policy 2: Manage the Audit Engagement (bates-stamped
12 DT 073892-073931)

13 30. Exhibit 30 — Redacted Working Papers for Audit conducted by Sarah Cavanagh,
14 Section 8430, Other Income — MAP (bates-stamped DT 031713-031722)

15 31. Exhibit 31 — Redacted index from audit conducted by Iva Chiu (DT 173530.1-
16 173530.10)

17 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

18 Dated: December 23, 2009

COUNSEL FOR PLAINTIFFS

19
20 By: /s/William A. Baird
WILLIAM A BAIRD
JEFFREY K. COMPTON
Markun Zusman & Compton LLP
STEVE ELSTER
Law Office of Steve Elster

23 Dated: December 23, 2009

COUNSEL FOR DEFENDANTS

24
25 By: /s/Linda E. Shostak
LINDA E. SHOSTAK
JAMES E. BODDY, JR.
Morrison & Foerster LLP

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

ECF CERTIFICATION

I hereby attest that I have obtained concurrence regarding the filing of this document from each of the signatories within the e-filed document.

Dated: December 23, 2009

By: /s/Linda E. Shostak
LINDA E. SHOSTAK

ORDER

PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: _____, 2009



Honorable Susan Illston
United States District Court Judge

EXHIBIT 19