IGNACIA S. MORENO
Assistant Attorney General
ALISON D. GARNER (DC Bar No. 983858)
KATHRYN M. LIBERATORE (NY Bar No. 4317780)
Trial Attorneys
U.S. Department of Justice
Environment & Natural Resources Division
Natural Resources Section
601 D Street, NW,
Washington, D.C., 20004
Telephone: (202) 514-2855
Telephone: (202) 616-5082
Facsimile: (202) 305-0506
alison.garner@usdoj.gov
kathryn.liberatore@usdoj.gov
Attorneys for Defendants

## IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

CALIFORNIA RESOURCES AGENCY, et al.,	) Case Nos. 08-01185-MHP ) and 08-03884-MHP
Plaintiffs,	) )
v. UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE, et al.,	THIRD STIPULATION TO STAY REMEDY BRIEFING
Defendants.	) )
CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY, et al.,	) ) )
Plaintiffs, v.	) ) )
UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE, et al.,	) ) )

Plaintiffs and Defendants in the above-captioned case, by and through their attorneys, have conferred and hereby STIPULATE as follows:

On February 27, 2009, Plaintiffs filed motions for summary judgment in the above-

captioned matters. Dkt. Nos. 46 and 28. On April 16, 2009, Defendants filed cross-motions for summary judgment. Dkt. Nos. 50 and 33. The Court held a hearing on the motions on July 31, 2009.

On September 29, 2009, the Court entered judgment, granting in part and denying in part the parties' motions for summary judgment. Dkt. No. 60. The Court ordered the parties to submit, by November 3, 2009, simultaneous briefs proposing the appropriate forms of relief to remedy the deficiencies found by the Court in the Southern California Forest Plans Final Environmental Impact Statement.

The parties have entered settlement discussions in an attempt to develop the appropriate forms of relief in this matter. To facilitate those discussions, the parties requested a stay of briefing, Dkt. Nos. 61, 46, and on October 27, 2009, the Court entered an order staying further briefing schedules until January 15, 2010. Dkt. Nos. 62, 47.

The parties met to discuss settlement on November 18, 2009. After the meeting, Plaintiffs provided written settlement points, and Defendants responded in writing. To allow time for an additional in-person meeting and further discussions, the parties requested a second stay of briefing, Dkt. Nos. 63, 50, and on January 22, 2010, the Court entered an order staying further briefing schedules until March 15, 2010. Dkt. Nos. 64, 51.

The parties met for a second time on January 29, 2010 to discuss settlement. Plaintiffs provided additional written settlement points on February 19, 2010 and March 3, 2010. Defendants are reviewing these points, and are preparing their written response. The parties will continue to engage in good faith settlement discussions, and agree that an additional stay to allow time for such discussions is in the best interests of the litigants and the Court. The parties therefore request a third order staying all briefing on the issue of remedy until May 14, 2010. On that date, the parties will advise the Court on the status of their settlement discussions and whether a further stay of briefing is appropriate or whether a new remedy briefing schedule

should be set. The parties reserve the right to seek prompt reinstatement of a remedy briefing schedule at any time.

## IT IS SO STIPULATED

Dated: March 15, 2010

IGNACIA S. MORENO Assistant Attorney General

/s/ Kathryn M. Liberatore
KATHRYN M. LIBERATORE
ALISON D. GARNER
Trial Attorneys
United States Department of Justice
Environment and Natural Resources Division
Natural Resources Section
P.O. Box 663, Ben Franklin Station
Washington, D.C. 20044-0663
Telephone: (202) 514-2855
Telephone: (202) 616-5082

Telephone: (202) 616-5082 Facsimile: (202) 305-0506 alison.garner@usdoj.gov kathryn.liberatore@usdoj.gov Attorneys for Defendants U.S.

Attorneys for Defendants U.S. Forest Service, et al.

## /s/ Erin M. Tobin (authorized)

Erin M. Tobin
Trent W. Orr
Earthjustice
426 17th Street, 5th Floor
Oakland, CA 94612
Tel.: (510) 550-6725
Fax: (510) 550-6749
etobin@earthjustice.org

torr@earthjustice.org Attorneys for Plaintiffs Ctr. for Biological Diversity, et al.

## /s/ Brian Hembacher (authorized)

Brian Hembacher Deputy Attorney General California Attorney General's Office 300 South Spring Street, Suite 1702 Los Angeles, CA 90013 Tel.: 213-897-2638

Tel.: 213-897-2638 Fax: 213-897-2802 Brian.Hembacher@doj.ca.gov Attorney for People of the State of California, *ex rel*. California Attorney General Edmund G. Brown, Jr.

/s/ Peter Southworth (authorized)

Peter Southworth
Deputy Attorney General
California Attorney General's Office
Land Law Section
1300 I Street, 15th Floor
Sacramento, CA 95814

Tel.: (916) 445 1685 Fax: (916) 327 2319

Peter.Southworth@doj.ca.gov

Attorney for California Resources Agency and California

Department of Forestry and Fire Protection

/s/ Paul A. Turcke (authorized)

Paul A. Turcke Moore Smith Buxton & Turcke, Chartered 950 West Bannock, Suite 520 Boise, Idaho 83702

Tel.: 208-331-1807 Fax: 208-331-1202 pat@msbtlaw.com

Attorney for Intervenors Blue Ribbon Coalition



3/16/2010