

1 IGNACIA S. MORENO  
 Assistant Attorney General  
 2 ALISON D. GARNER (DC Bar No. 983858)  
 3 KATHRYN M. LIBERATORE (NY Bar No. 4317780)  
 Trial Attorneys  
 4 U.S. Department of Justice  
 Environment & Natural Resources Division  
 5 Natural Resources Section  
 6 601 D Street, NW,  
 Washington, D.C., 20004  
 7 Telephone: (202) 514-2855  
 Telephone: (202) 616-5082  
 8 Facsimile: (202) 305-0506  
 9 alison.garner@usdoj.gov  
 kathryn.liberatore@usdoj.gov  
 10 *Attorneys for Defendants*

11  
 12 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
 FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
 13 SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

14	CALIFORNIA RESOURCES AGENCY, <i>et</i>	)	Case Nos. 08-01185-MHP
15	<i>al.</i> ,	)	and 08-03884-MHP
16		)	
16	Plaintiffs,	)	
17	v.	)	
17		)	<b>EIGHTH STIPULATION TO</b>
18	UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF	)	<b>STAY REMEDY BRIEFING</b>
18	AGRICULTURE, <i>et al.</i> ,	)	
19		)	
20	Defendants.	)	Judge Marilyn H. Patel
20		)	
21	CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL	)	
21	DIVERSITY, <i>et al.</i> ,	)	
22		)	
22	Plaintiffs,	)	
23		)	
24	v.	)	
24		)	
25	UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF	)	
25	AGRICULTURE, <i>et al.</i> ,	)	
26		)	
26	Defendants.	)	
27		)	

1 Plaintiffs and Defendants in the above-captioned case, by and through their attorneys,  
2 have conferred and hereby STIPULATE as follows:

3 On February 27, 2009, Plaintiffs filed motions for summary judgment in the above-  
4 captioned matters. Dkt. Nos. 46 and 28. On April 16, 2009, Defendants filed cross-motions  
5 for summary judgment. Dkt. Nos. 50 and 33. The Court held a hearing on the motions on  
6 July 31, 2009.

7 On September 29, 2009, the Court entered judgment, granting in part and denying in part  
8 the parties' motions for summary judgment. Dkt. No. 60. The Court ordered the parties to  
9 submit, by November 3, 2009, simultaneous briefs proposing the appropriate forms of relief to  
10 remedy the deficiencies found by the Court in the Southern California Forest Plans Final  
11 Environmental Impact Statement.

12 The parties have entered settlement discussions in an attempt to develop the appropriate  
13 forms of relief in this matter. To facilitate those discussions, the parties requested stays of  
14 briefing, Dkt. Nos. 61 and 46, 63 and 50, 65 and 52, 67 and 54, 69 and 56, and 71 and 58 and the  
15 Court entered orders staying further briefing schedules. Dkt. Nos. 47, 51, 66 and 70.

16 The parties met to discuss settlement on November 18, 2009, January 29, 2010 and June  
17 25, 2010. The parties requested a seventh stay of briefing, Dkt. Nos. 72 and 59, on November  
18 15, 2010, which the Court granted on November 16, 2010. Dkt. No 73.

19 The parties have reached a settlement agreement, in principle, subject to approval by the  
20 appropriate government officials and Plaintiff organization representatives. The Defendants  
21 require additional time in which to seek approval from the appropriate government officials. The  
22 parties therefore request an eighth order staying all briefing on the issue of remedy until  
23 December 15, 2010. On that date, the parties will advise the Court on the status of the settlement  
24 approval process. The parties will promptly notify the Court if a settlement is approved.

1 **IT IS SO STIPULATED**

2 Dated: December 2, 2010

3 **IGNACIA S. MORENO**  
4 Assistant Attorney General

5 /s/Alison D. Garner  
6 **ALISON D. GARNER**  
7 **KATHRYN M. LIBERATORE**  
8 Trial Attorneys  
9 United States Department of Justice  
10 Environment and Natural Resources Division  
11 Natural Resources Section  
12 P.O. Box 663, Ben Franklin Station  
13 Washington, D.C. 20044-0663  
14 Telephone: (202) 514-2855  
15 Telephone: (202) 616-5082  
16 Facsimile: (202) 305-0506  
17 alison.garner@usdoj.gov  
18 kathryn.liberatore@usdoj.gov  
19 Attorneys for Defendants U.S. Forest Service, *et al.*

20 /s/ Erin M. Tobin (authorized)  
21 Erin M. Tobin  
22 Trent W. Orr  
23 Earthjustice  
24 426 17th Street, 5th Floor  
25 Oakland, CA 94612  
26 Tel.: (510) 550-6725  
27 Fax: (510) 550-6749  
28 etobin@earthjustice.org  
torr@earthjustice.org  
Attorneys for Plaintiffs Ctr. for Biological Diversity, *et al.*

29 /s/ Brian Hembacher (authorized)  
30 Brian Hembacher  
31 Deputy Attorney General  
32 California Attorney General's Office  
33 300 South Spring Street, Suite 1702  
34 Los Angeles, CA 90013  
35 Tel.: 213-897-2638  
36 Fax: 213-897-2802  
37 Brian.Hembacher@doj.ca.gov  
38 Attorney for People of the State of California, *ex rel.*  
California Attorney General Edmund G. Brown, Jr.

39 /s/ Peter Southworth (authorized)  
40 Peter Southworth  
41 Deputy Attorney General  
42 California Attorney General's Office  
43 Land Law Section  
44 1300 I Street, 15th Floor  
45 Sacramento, CA 95814  
46 Tel.: (916) 445 1685

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

Fax: (916) 327 2319  
Peter.Southworth@doj.ca.gov  
Attorney for California Resources Agency and California  
Department of Forestry and Fire Protection

/s/ Paul A. Turcke (authorized)  
Paul A. Turcke  
Moore Smith Buxton & Turcke, Chartered  
950 West Bannock, Suite 520  
Boise, Idaho 83702  
Tel.: 208-331-1807  
Fax: 208-331-1202  
pat@msbtlaw.com  
Attorney for Intervenors Blue Ribbon Coalition

IT IS SO ORDERED      12/2/2010

Hon. Marilyn Hall Patel  
United States District Judge

