1 THE WESTON FIRM **BECK & LEE BUSINESS TRIAL** GREGORY S. WESTON (239944) **LAWYERS** 888 Turquoise Street JARED H. BECK (233743) San Diego, CA 92109 ELIZABETH LEE BECK (233742) 3 Telephone: (858) 488-1672 28 West Flagler Street, Suite 555 Miami, FL 33130 Facsimile: (480) 247-4553 4 Telephone: (305) 789-0072 greg@westonfirm.com Facsimile: (786) 664-3334 5 iared@beckandlee.com JACK FITZGERALD (257370) 6 2811 Sykes Court elizabeth@beckandlee.com Santa Clara, CA 95051 7 Telephone: (408) 459-0305 jack@westonfirm.com 8 9 **Attorneys for Plaintiffs and the Proposed Classes** UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT 10 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA 11 CASE NO. 10-CV-02351 MHP CATS AND DOGS ANIMAL HOSPITAL, 12 INC.; ASTRO APPLIANCE SERVICE; Pleading Type: Class Action BLEEDING HEART, LLC; CALIFORNIA 13 Action Filed: February 23, 2010 FURNISHINGS, INC.; CELIBRÉ, INC.; J.L. FERRI ENTERTAINMENT, INC.; LE 14 PLAINTIFFS' SUPPLEMENTAL PETITE RETREAT DAY SPA, LLC; SAN MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF FRANCISCO BAY BOAT CRUISES, LLC; **DESIGNATING BECK & LEE** WAG MY TAIL, INC.; and ZODIAC **BUSINESS TRIAL LAWYERS AND** 16 RESTAURANT GROUP, INC., on behalf of THE WESTON FIRM AS LEAD themselves and all others similarly situated, 17 COUNSEL AND PROPOSED SIX-MONTH DISCOVERY PLAN Plaintiffs, 18 v. 19 YELP! INC., 20 Defendant. 21 Case No. 10-CV-01321 MHP BORIS Y. LEVITT, on behalf of himself and 22 all others similarly situated, 23 Judge: Hon. Marilyn Hall Patel Plaintiff, 24 v. 25 YELP! INC.; and DOES 1 through 100, inclusive, 26 Defendants. 27 28

Cats and Dogs Animal Hospital, Inc.et al. v. Yelp! Inc., Case No. 3:10-CV-02351 MHP SUPP. MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF DESIGNATING BECK & LEE BUSINESS TRIAL LAWYERS AND THE WESTON FIRM AS LEAD COUNSEL & SIX-MO. DISCOVERY PLAN

#### I. INTRODUCTION

Pursuant to this Court's July 20, 2010 Order on Defendant Yelp! Inc.'s Motion to Consolidate Related Cases for All Purposes and to Set Dates for Consolidated Amended Complaint and Response Thereto ("Consolidation Order"), the law firms of Beck & Lee Business Trial Lawyers ("Beck & Lee") and The Weston Firm ("Weston") hereby respectfully and jointly move to be appointed co-lead counsel in the consolidated action and submit their proposed six-month discovery plan. The grounds discussed for appointment of Beck & Lee and Weston as co-lead counsel are: (1) the history of effective cooperation between Beck & Lee and Weston in prosecuting class actions, and the history of their cooperation with other law firms; (2) the firms' extensive contacts with members of the Class; (3) Beck & Lee's and Weston's ability and proposal to streamline and effectively manage the litigation to facilitate economies for the Court and the Class, including streamlining discovery; (4) Beck & Lee's and Weston's considerable work on behalf of the Class and investment in this case thus far; and (5) the collective experience of Beck & Lee and Weston in pursuing plaintiffs' rights.

#### II. FACTUAL AND PROCEDURAL BACKGROUND

Cats and Dogs Animal Hospital, Inc. v. Yelp! Inc. (hereinafter, "Cats and Dogs") is the first-filed class action against Yelp. Plaintiff Cats and Dogs Animal Hospital, Inc. filed the Complaint on February 23, 2010 in the Central District of California. The First Amended Complaint was filed on March 16, 2010, adding 9 more representative Plaintiffs. Three of the newly added Plaintiffs, Astro Appliance Service, California Furnishings, Inc. and San Francisco Bay Boat Cruises, LLC, are located in the Northern District of California. Counsel for Cats and Dogs are the law firms of Beck & Lee and Weston.

Cats and Dogs has become the public face of the nationwide fight by small businesses against Yelp's extortionate conduct. The New York Times, Wall Street Journal, ABC News,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Nick Bilton, <u>Yelp Is Sued After Dispute Over a Review</u>, N.Y. Times, Feb. 24, 2010, *available at* http://bits.blogs.nytimes.com/2010/02/24/yelp-is-sued-after-dispute-over-a-review/.

newspapers, magazines, radio and TV shows, and online blogs, have written or broadcasted about the *Cats and Dogs* lawsuit. Dr. Gregory Perrault, the owner of Plaintiff Cats and Dogs Animal Hospital, Inc., and attorneys from Beck & Lee and Weston have been interviewed for and quoted in numerous articles, and have appeared on television and radio discussing the lawsuit.<sup>8</sup>

Bloomberg Businessweek, Wired Magazine, CNET, TechCrunch, and dozens of other

Levitt v. Yelp! Inc. was the third putative class action complaint to be lodged against Yelp. The Levitt action began in San Francisco County Superior Court, and was subsequently removed by Yelp to this Court (Beck & Lee and Weston were jointly substituted in as counsel for the plaintiff in the second-filed action, LaPausky v. Yelp! Inc.). To date, undersigned counsel is not aware of any other class actions against Yelp. Plaintiff's counsel in the Levitt action are the law firms of Murray & Associates ("Murray") and Ongaro Burtt LLP ("Ongaro Burtt") (collectively, the "Levitt counsel").

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Ashby Jones, <u>Real People. Real Reviews. Real Extortion Scheme?</u>, The Wall Street Journal, Feb. 26, 2010, *available at* http://blogs.wsj.com/law/2010/02/26/real-people-real-reviews-real-extortion-scheme/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Ki Mae Heussner, <u>Yelp Faces Extortion Claim, Class Action Suit</u>, ABC News/Technology, Feb. 26, 2010, *available at* http://abcnews.go.com/Technology/TheLaw/yelp-faces-extortion-claim-class-action-suit/story?id=9944826; ABC 7 News (SF Bay Area), Feb. 26, 2010, *available at* http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=h\_y9k4ycO08.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Edvard Pettersson & JosephGalante, <u>Yelp.com Accused of Extortion by California Veterinary Hospital</u>, Bloomberg Businessweek, Feb. 25, 2010, *available at* http://www.businessweek.com/news/2010-02-25/yelp-com-accused-of-extortion-by-california-veterinary-hospital.html; Peter Burrows & Joseph Galante, <u>Yelp: Advertise or Else?</u>, Bloomberg Businessweek, March 3, 2010, *available at* http://www.businessweek.com/magazine/content/10 11/b4170027355708.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Kim Zetter, <u>Yelp Accused of Extortion</u>, Wired Magazine, Feb. 24, 2010, *available at* http://www.wired.com/threatlevel/tag/yelp/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Caroline McCarthy, <u>New Class Action Lawsuit Targets Yelp</u>, CNET News, Feb. 24, 2010, *available at* http://news.cnet.com/8301-13577\_3-10459197-36.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Robin Wauters, <u>Yelp Hit With Class Action Lawsuit For Running An "Extortion Scheme"</u>, TechCrunch, Feb. 24, 2010, *available at* http://techcrunch.com/2010/02/24/yelp-class-action-lawsuit/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> See, e.g., CBS Los Angeles, "Yelp Lawsuit," Feb. 26, 2010, available at http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=kP3OgInCsMc; G4tv's "Attack of the Show," Feb. 25, 2010, available at http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jbPjK6cTqAc.

Yelp moved to transfer *Cats and Dogs* to the Northern District of California, and related *Cats and Dogs* to *Levitt*. Oon June 4, 2010, *Cats and Dogs* was assigned to this Court. The Court's Consolidation Order combined the two actions and directed counsel to file a six-month discovery plan and submissions in aid of the Court's lead counsel determination.

#### III. BECK & LEE AND WESTON ARE BEST SUITED TO BE APPOINTED CO-LEAD COUNSEL

#### A. <u>Beck & Lee and Weston Have a Proven Track Record of Working Together</u> Effectively and Cooperatively on Behalf of Plaintiffs.

#### 1. The Two Firms' Principals Have a Longstanding, Close Relationship

The law firms of Beck & Lee and Weston began their formal cooperation in 2007 during a hotly contested state-court class action involving real estate in Miami, Florida, but the attorneys have known each other since their law school days. Jared Beck of Beck & Lee and Gregory Weston met and became close friends during their first year at Harvard Law School in 2001, and Elizabeth Lee Beck of Beck & Lee was introduced to Mr. Weston in 2003 (the two Beck & Lee attorneys, Jared Beck and Elizabeth Lee Beck, are husband and wife). Jack Fitzgerald joined Weston in 2010. Together, the firms have a total of four attorneys: Mr. Beck and Ms. Lee Beck of Beck & Lee, and Mr. Weston and Mr. Fitzgerald of The Weston Firm. *See* Composite Exhibit A (biographies of attorneys).

## 2. Beck & Lee and Weston Have Combined the Resources of Their Two Firms to Jointly Represent Plaintiffs in Numerous Class Actions

Beck & Lee and Weston currently jointly represent plaintiffs in 17 federal actions, <u>14 of</u> which are pending in California, and three of which are pending in the Middle and Southern Districts of Florida. Of these, 10 are consumer class actions bringing claims under California's Unfair Competition Law and three are pending in the Northern District of California (including the instant action). The cases that Beck & Lee and Weston have successfully litigated together include:

Becker v. TRG Columbus Dev. Venture, Ltd. et al., Case No. 08-05068 CA 09
 (class action in the Eleventh Judicial Circuit of Florida, settled in 2009);

fixing/antitrust class action against providers of less-than-truckload shipping services.

In addition, Beck & Lee and Weston are presently working with Lieff Cabraser in connection with a recently-filed nationwide class action against Apple Inc. and AT&T Mobility LLC, currently pending in the Northern District of California.

B. Beck & Lee and Weston Have had Extensive Interactions With the Class,
Have Been Contacted by Hundreds of Class Members, and Beck & Lee Has
Been Retained by 70 Individuals and Businesses Throughout the Country to
Date.

Since Cats and Dogs Animal Hospital retained Beck & Lee and Weston to represent it in its fight against Yelp, the firms have formed deep and extensive contacts with the geographically dispersed Class members impacted by Yelp's conduct.

1. Beck & Lee's Contacts With the Named Plaintiffs and Potential Plaintiffs Include Interviewing Around 380 Businesses and Being Retained by 69 of Them as Counsel

Since *Cats and Dogs* was filed, approximately 380 businesses throughout the country have contacted Beck & Lee, of which 69 have formally retained the firm to represent their interests. A plurality of these Class members are located in California, but as a whole, they are scattered throughout the U.S., reflecting Yelp's wide-ranging impact. To this day, Beck & Lee continues to receive contacts from additional Class members on a near-daily basis, and expects many more to retain the firm as counsel. Currently, Beck & Lee's Class member clients include the following:

- 1. Nationwide bowling alley chain headquartered in New York
- 2. Historic night club in New York
- 3. Salon in California
- 4. Dentist in Colorado
- 5. Restaurant in New Jersey
- 6. Grocery store in Maine

	1			
1	7.	Full service salon in Pennsylvania		
2	8.	Dog walking service in California		
3	9.	Restaurant in Washington, DC		
4	10.	Chiropractor in California		
5	11.	Spa in California		
6	12.	Doctor in California		
7	13.	Dentist in New York		
8	14.	Restaurant in Washington		
9	15.	Day spa in California		
10	16.	Game store in California		
11	17.	Coffee shop in Colorado		
12	18.	Restaurant in Florida		
13	19.	Tarp supplier in Illinois		
14	20.	Property management company in California		
15	21.	Upholstery store in California		
16	22.	Entertainment company in New York		
17	23.	Cruise company in California		
18	24.	Consulting firm in California		
19	25.	Appliance service company in California		
20	26.	Financial services company in California		
21	27.	7. Restaurant/bakery in California		
22	28.	Dentist in California		
23	29.	Psychiatrist in California		
24	30.	Restaurant in Illinois		
25	31.	Auto mechanic in California		
26	32.	Restaurant in Massachusetts		
27	33.	Wedding planner in California		
28		6		
		Dogs Animal Hospital, Inc.et al. v. Yelp! Inc., Case No. 2:10-cv-01340-VBF-SS EMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF DESIGNATING BECK & LEE BUSINESS TRIAL LAWYERS		
		The state Whenever Francis and Francis and Constant of		

AND THE WESTON FIRM AS LEAD COUNSEL & SIX-MO. DISCOVERY PLAN

- 1		
1	34.	Dentist in California
2	35.	Bakery in Illinois
3	36.	Realtor in California
4	37.	Doctor in California
5	38.	Pet store in California
6	39.	Art studio in Illinois
7	40.	Dentist in California
8	41.	Auto mechanic in California
9	42.	Restaurant in California
10	43.	Doctor in California
11	44.	Photographer in South Carolina
12	45.	Yogurt shop in California
13	46.	Auto mechanic in California
14	47.	Restaurant in Washington
15	48.	Disc jockey in Colorado
16	49.	Salon in California
17	50.	Salon in New York
18	51.	Paving company in California
19	52.	Restaurant in California
20	53.	Restaurant in Florida
21	54.	Pet store in Illinois
22	55.	Moving and storage company in California
23	56.	Furniture store in California
24	57.	Caterer in Washington
25	58.	Spa in Massachusetts
26	59.	Dentist in California
27	60.	Wine bar in Washington
28		7
	Cata and	Dogs Animal Hagnital Ind. et al. v. Valul Ind. Coco No. 2:10 av. 01240 VDE SS

1	61.	Health center in California		
2	62.	Restaurant in California		
3	63.	Art gallery in Ohio		
4	64.	Auto mechanic in California		
5	65.	Bakery in Illinois		
6	66.	Restaurant in California		
7	67.	Comic store in California		
8	68.	Financial advisor in California		
9	69.	Realtor in Washington		
10	This list provides a window into the diversity of the Class members' vocations and fa			
11	flung geographic scope. Beck & Lee has held conference calls, fielded questions, and conducte			
12	interviews (both in-person and over the phone), all in an effort to gather valuable information			
13	and personally address the concerns of business owners as they seek out information about the			
14	claims against Yelp and look to retain legal counsel.			
15	In contrast to many class actions, the Class members in this case have substanti			
16	individual and personal stakes in the outcome of this litigation. Yelp has intruded into their liv			
17	and livelihoods by extorting or attempting to extort them into paying for "advertising" on Yelp			
18	website; if they say "no" to Yelp's overtures, then they suffer the consequences of Yelp			
19	employees manipulating content about them on the website. As a result, the Class member			
20	have incurred, and are incurring, significant disruption to their ability to run their businesses,			
21	addition to substantial monetary harm. The Class members listed above have chosen Beck			
22	Lee to represent them in righting the wrongs exacted by Yelp.			
23	2. Weston's Extensive Contacts With the Named Plaintiffs and Potentia			
24		Plaintiffs Include Being Contacted by Over 150 Businesses		
25	Westo	n has been contacted by over 150 businesses throughout the country seeking		
26	additional information on the pending lawsuit, and has signed several of them as clients. T			
27	firm has held conference calls, fielded questions, and conducted interviews (both in-person as			
28				

over the phone), all in an effort to gather valuable information and personally address the concerns of business owners as they seek out information about their claims against Yelp and look to retain legal counsel. To this day, Weston continues to receive contacts from new Class members on a near-daily basis.

### 3. In Contrast to Beck & Lee, the *Levitt* Counsel Do Not Represent any Class Members Who Paid Yelp for Advertising

The sole plaintiff in the *Levitt* action, Boris Levitt, did not pay Yelp for any advertising. Businesses which have paid money towards advertising comprise a vital subclass in this action, as reflected in the *Cats and Dogs* First Amended Complaint which defines a "Sponsor Class" of those who were extorted by Yelp into paying for advertising. By contrast, Beck & Lee's clients include five businesses which have paid Yelp for advertising, and therefore are best suited to adequately represent the entire class of businesses affected by Yelp's conduct.

### 4. Beck & Lee and Weston Have Also Been in Communication With Material Witnesses

Beck & Lee and Weston have also been contacted by, and are in communication with, several confidential informants and material witnesses in possession of valuable information. These include witnesses with first-hand knowledge of Yelp's business practices, as well as a state police investigator.

# C. Beck & Lee and Weston are Committed to Obtaining Justice on Behalf of The Plaintiffs and the Class in an Efficient, Streamlined, and Economical Manner.

#### 1. Beck & Lee and Weston's Proposal for Efficient Division of Tasks

Beck & Lee and Weston submit the following proposal for the division of tasks to efficiently meet the demands of this action while best serving the interests of the Class:

Q

1	Document	The attorneys of Beck & Lee and Weston will review documents, assisted by
2	Review	staff to the extent necessary and appropriate relative to the size of
3		productions. The firms will fully utilize appropriate technology (e.g., ftp
4		download, electronic TIFF/PDF review) to minimize or eliminate any impact
5		of their offices' physical locations on the efficiency of document review.
6	Donositions	Elizabeth Lee Beck and Jared Beck will take the lead in taking and defending
7	Depositions	depositions.
8		depositions.
9	Discovery	Jared Beck and Jack Fitzgerald anticipate handling the bulk of discovery
10	drafting	drafting in this matter.
11	Briefing and	Jack Fitzgerald, Jared Beck and Gregory Weston anticipate handling the bulk
12	Motion Practice	of the motion practice and briefing.
13	Without I factice	of the motion practice and offering.
14	Court	The firms anticipate that Jack Fitzgerald will appear for any discovery
15	Appearances	hearings or case management/status conferences to take advantage of his
16		location in Northern California. To the extent that either of the Beck & Lee
17		attorneys appear in Court, travel time and costs will not be billed (see section
18		C.2 below) to minimize the impact of Beck & Lee's Miami location on the
19		Class.
20 21	Trial	Beck & Lee and Weston anticipate that both firms will fully participate in
22		trial. Beck & Lee will not bill for travel time or travel costs.
23		
24		
∠ <del>'1</del>	2.	Beck & Lee and Weston's Proposals for Cost-Effective and Economical Case Management

### **Economical Case Management**

Beck & Lee and Weston submit the following proposal for the cost-effective and economical management of this case:

25

26

27

28

1	Third-party legal	Beck & Lee and Weston will not bill any costs for Westlaw or Lexis legal	
2	research costs	research (the firms have never billed Westlaw or Lexis costs to clients, as a	
3		matter of firm policy).	
4	Travel from	The attorneys of Beck & Lee will not bill travel time or costs to attend court	
3			
6	Miami	hearings.	
7	7 Long-distance Beck & Lee and Weston will not bill any long-distance telephone		
8	calls		
9			
10	In-house copying	Beck & Lee and Weston will not charge for in-house copying.	
11	Depositions	No more than two attorneys will bill for depositions taken (if additional	
12		attorneys attend, the hours will not be billed); and no more than one attorney	
13		will bill for depositions defended (if additional attorneys attend, the hours	
14		will not be billed).	
15			
16	Hearings	No more than two attorneys will bill for attending hearings.	
17	Website	Beck & Lee has established an interactive website	
18		(http://yelpclassaction.wordpress.com) to share information between the	
19		public and the attorneys, and will continue to maintain the website at no	
20		charge to the Class. Thus far, a large number of Class members have reached	
21		out to the firms by using the website.	
22		out to the firms by using the website.	
23	Beck & Lee and Weston welcome and will consider additional proposals to economize		
24	the litigation for the Class.		
25	Pursuant to the ADR Local Rules, Beck & Lee and Weston previously proposed to Yelp		

Pursuant to the ADR Local Rules, Beck & Lee and Weston previously proposed to Yelp that the parties engage in Early Neutral Evaluation ("ENE") with the Court. This presents a number of efficiencies—it is conducted at no cost to the client (unlike private mediation, in

26

27

28

which the mediator receives an hourly rate); the parties will be able to receive input from the Court itself; and the parties will be required to bring along client representatives with authority to settle. While Yelp previously proposed holding private mediation within 45 days after a decision on Yelp's Motion to Dismiss, Beck & Lee and Weston believe an earlier ENE would be useful. Specifically, Beck & Lee and Weston believe that engaging in an ENE after Yelp's motion is fully briefed, but before the hearing and/or decision on the motion, would be useful and help to potentially resolve the action.

### 3. Beck & Lee and Weston's Proposal to Streamline Discovery With the Least Amount of Contention

Beck & Lee and Weston recognize that the most efficient and effective method in resolving discovery disputes is through the attorneys' ongoing commitment to confer in good faith with one other. They will strive to settle disagreements amicably without motion practice or otherwise resorting to court intervention. In support of streamlining discovery, they also propose the following six-month discovery plan.

### 4. Six-Month Discovery Proposal

Beck & Lee and Weston propose limiting discovery during the first six months to class certification, with the following details aimed at making the litigation most efficient:

- (1) Class certification discovery to close six months after decision on Yelp's Motion to Dismiss is issued;
- (2) Documents responsive to already-served document requests to be produced by both sides within one month after decision on Yelp's Motion to Dismiss is issued, with the parties to meet and confer with respect to any outstanding discovery requests and responses, for example, to determine which requests concern issues related to class certification;
- (3) Yelp to make all corporate representatives available for deposition within four months after Yelp's Motion to Dismiss is ruled upon;

- (4) Plaintiffs will designate a total of four businesses in the consolidated complaint, two each from the Sponsor Class and the Non-Sponsor class, to serve as class representatives for purposes of the class certification motion;
- (5) Plaintiffs will make the designated representatives from each class available for deposition within four months after decision on Yelp's Motion to Dismiss;
- (6) Expert discovery (related to class certification) to open four months after decision on Yelp's Motion to Dismiss, and to be completed six months after decision on Yelp's Motion to Dismiss.

#### 5. Beck & Lee and Weston Will Cap Their Attorneys' Fees

Beck & Lee and Weston will not seek fees greater than 25% of any settlement or judgment if it is primarily a monetary award, or 1.5 times the lodestar if settlement or judgment is primarily injunctive relief.

# D. Beck & Lee and Weston Have Already Done Considerable Work and Invested Substantial Labor and Resources on Behalf of the Class Relative to the Levitt Counsel

As a result of their pre-litigation and ongoing investigation, Beck & Lee and Weston already possess a deep understanding of the case that cannot be matched by the *Levitt* counsel. Over 500 individuals have contacted the firms, sharing valuable experiences, information, documents, and data. The firms have conducted extensive interviews with Class members and potential witnesses, and compiled and analyzed data and information in an effort to further understand the breadth and depth of Yelp's conduct.

Furthermore, Beck & Lee and Weston have fully briefed a Rule 12(b)(6) Motion to Dismiss filed by Yelp, affording them intimate familiarity with the key legal issues to be decided in this case. The firms have also propounded and received responses to substantial discovery and are now in a position to quickly exchange documents with Yelp as soon as the Court permits discovery in this case to go forward.

See http://www.rao-ongaro.com/news/080801 perkins.html, accessed 7/23/10 9:23 p.m.

### E. <u>Beck & Lee and Weston Have Dedicated Practices Committed to</u> Representing Plaintiffs

Both Beck & Lee and Weston are proud to jointly represent plaintiffs in class actions throughout the country, but predominantly in California. The two firms are almost 100% dedicated to representing plaintiffs, and have been so since their respective inceptions. They have successfully represented plaintiffs in hundreds of cases, ranging from single-plaintiff matters with small-claims controversy amounts, to pro bono cases, to large nationwide class actions. In every instance, Beck & Lee and Weston have pursued their clients' interests with the utmost dedication and perseverance. As such, Beck & Lee and Weston's counsel vehemently disagree with *Levitt* counsel's questioning of their qualifications and experience to represent the Class in this action. In the area of pursuing plaintiffs' rights in class actions, Beck & Lee and Weston submit that they have substantially *more* experience than *Levitt* counsel.

Indeed, the law firm of Ongaro Burtt has been in existence less than two years. <sup>9</sup> It was founded by two partners who departed Perkins Coie, a firm that is highly regarded but undeniably focused on defending large companies. As for Murray and Associates, it is understood that this firm's involvement in this case will be of a limited nature, if at all, based upon Mr. Ongaro's representation to the Court on July 19, 2010.

#### IV. CONCLUSION

For the foregoing reasons, Plaintiffs respectfully request that the Court appoint Beck & Lee and The Weston Firm as co-lead counsel in the consolidated action.

~signature page follows~

1		
2	$2 \parallel$	Respectfully Submitted,
3	$_{3}\parallel$	// 14 14 5 1
4		/s/Jared H. Beck Jared H. Beck
		BECK & LEE BUSINESS TRIAL
5		LAWYERS
6		JARED H. BECK ELIZABETH LEE BECK
7	/ 11	Courthouse Plaza Building
8		28 West Flagler Street, Suite 555 Miami, FL 33130
9		Telephone: 305 789 0072
10		Facsimile: 786 664 3334
		888 Turquoise Street
11	1	San Diego, CA 92109
12		Telephone: (858) 488-1672 Facsimile: (480) 247-4553
13		greg@westonfirm.com
14	4	IACK EITZGED ALD (257270)
		JACK FITZGERALD (257370) 2811 Sykes Court
15	3	Santa Clara, CA 95051
16		Telephone: (408) 459-0305 jack@westonfirm.com
17	7	
18	D II	Counsel for Plaintiffs and the Proposed Classes
19	9	
20		
21	1	
22	$2 \parallel$	
23	$_{3}\parallel$	
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
	8   15	