

PETER P. EDRINGTON, Esq. (074355)
JAMES M. MARZAN, Esq. (133931)
EDRINGTON, SCHIRMER & MURPHY LLP
2300 Contra Costa Boulevard, Suite 450
Pleasant Hill, CA 94523-3936
Telephone: (925) 827-3300
Facsimile: (925) 827-3320

Attorneys for Defendants CITY OF PINOLE, TIM CAUWELS
(erroneously sued and served herein as TIM COUWELS),
CHRIS FODOR, ZACH BLUME, PAUL M. CLANCY,
CITY OF RICHMOND and CHRIS MAGNUS

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

IFETAYO R. AZIBO-BOYNTON, an
individual; and the estate of LEVI B.
BOYNTON, JR., by and through personal
representative, IFETAYO R. AZIBO-
BOYNTON,

Plaintiffs,

vs.

CITY OF PINOLE, a city governmental
entity; CITY OF RICHMOND, a city
governmental entity; TIM COUWELS, an
individual; CHRIS FODOR, an individual;
ZACH BLUME, an individual; PAUL M.
CLANCY, an individual; CHRIS MAGNUS,
an individual; and DOES 1-50, inclusive,

Defendants.

**Reassigned to JUDGE RICHARD
SEEBORG**

CASE NO.: C10-04151 RS

**DEFENDANTS CITY OF RICHMOND
AND CHRIS MAGNUS' ANSWER TO
PLAINTIFFS' COMPLAINT**

(JURY TRIAL DEMANDED)

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10
- 11
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25
- 26
- 27
- 28

2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
0
1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
0
1
2
3
4
5
6
7

3
4
5
6
7
8
9
0
1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
0
1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8

4
5
6
7
8
9
0
1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
0
1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8

6
7
8
9
0
1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
0
1
2
3
4
5
6
7

8
9
0
1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
0
1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8

10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

22
23
24
25
26
27
28

26
27
28

1 wrongful actions, deny any violation of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights and deny plaintiffs are
2 entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

3 7. As to the allegations of Paragraph 7, defendants admit that ZACK BLUME is
4 employed as a police officer for the CITY OF PINOLE. Defendants deny any wrongful actions,
5 deny any violation of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any
6 recovery or award of damages.

7 8. As to the allegations of Paragraph 8, defendants admit that PAUL M. CLANCY is
8 employed as the Chief of Police for the CITY OF PINOLE. Defendants deny any wrongful
9 actions, deny any violation of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights and deny plaintiffs are entitled to
10 any recovery or award of damages.

11 9. As to the allegations of Paragraph 9, defendants admit that CHRIS MAGNUS is the
12 Chief of Police for the CITY OF RICHMOND. Defendants deny any wrongful actions, deny any
13 violation of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or
14 award of damages.

15 10. As to the allegations of Paragraph 10, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny any
16 violation of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or
17 award of damages. As to the remainder of the allegations of Paragraph 10, defendants respond that
18 they lack sufficient information to admit said allegations and therefore deny them.

19 11. As to the allegations of Paragraph 11, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny any
20 violation of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or
21 award of damages.

22 12. As to the allegation of Paragraph 12, defendants admit that plaintiffs presented
23 governmental claims to the CITY OF PINOLE and the CITY OF RICHMOND on or about March
24 12, 2010. Said claims were rejected.

25 13. As to the allegations of Paragraph 13, defendants respond that they lack sufficient
26 information to admit said allegations and therefore deny them.

27 14. As to the allegations of Paragraphs 14 and 15, defendants respond that during the
28

1 early morning hours of September 12, 2009, decedent and two of his friends, Charles Davis and
2 DeVauria Clay-Holland, were driving within the CITY OF PINOLE to commit a carjacking and
3 armed robbery. They saw a Jeep Cherokee parked in the parking lot of the McDonald's Restaurant
4 in Pinole with an occupant inside; decedent and Davis then carjacked the vehicle at gunpoint while
5 Clay-Holland waited parked nearby. They then drove the Jeep Cherokee to Clay-Holland's
6 girlfriend's apartment where decedent, Davis and Clay-Holland ransacked the interior of the Jeep
7 Cherokee for valuables. Decedent, Davis and Clay-Holland then decided to drive to San Francisco
8 to commit a robbery. Corporal Fodor initially observed a vehicle matching the description of the
9 carjacked vehicle in the area of San Pablo Avenue and Tara Hills Road in Pinole. Cpl. Fodor
10 called in the vehicle's license plate to dispatch, which confirmed it was the vehicle stolen in the
11 carjacking. Cpl. Fodor followed the Jeep Cherokee westbound on San Pablo Avenue but did not
12 activate his emergency lights and siren at that time. Cpl. Fodor was instructed by Sergeant Tim
13 Cauwels to wait until a sufficient number of units were on scene before affecting a traffic stop.
14 Once Sgt. Cauwels and Officer Zach Blume arrived on scene, Sgt. Cauwels radioed to activate
15 lights and sirens. After the police emergency lights and sirens were activated, the carjacked
16 vehicle failed to stop and continued traveling on the Richmond Parkway and then Atlas Road in
17 the CITY OF RICHMOND. While on Atlas road, the carjacked vehicle began to slow down and
18 the vehicle doors opened at least once. According to Davis and Clay-Holland, a decision was
19 made to slow the vehicle so all of the occupants could jump from the moving vehicle to evade
20 arrest while the police continued to follow the Jeep Cherokee. The Jeep Cherokee slowed down
21 but before decedent, Davis and Clay-Holland could jump from the vehicle, it went off of the
22 roadway and into a ravine. Sgt. Cauwels exited his squad car and began moving towards the
23 location of where the Jeep Cherokee came to a rest. As he did, Sgt. Cauwels heard a gunshot
24 coming from the direction of the carjacked vehicle; the bullet sailed by the left side of his head. In
25 fear for his life and the lives of the other officers, Sgt. Cauwels returned fire. Cpl. Fodor and
26 Officer Blume also returned fire, fearing for their lives and the lives of other officers. No
27 Richmond Police Officer discharged a weapon at any time and Chief Magnus had no involvement

1 in the events leading up to and precipitating the incident.

2 Defendant denies that it caused the Jeep Cherokee to go off of the road and into a ravine.
3 Defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were
4 violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages. The remaining
5 allegations of these Paragraphs are denied for lack of information and belief to permit defendants
6 to respond. Defendants further object to allegations in these Paragraph as being vague and
7 ambiguous.

8 15. As to the allegations of Paragraph 16, defendants deny that they used excessive
9 force in attempting to apprehend the carjacking suspect, LEVI B. BOYNTON, JR. Shots were
10 fired from the direction of the vehicle that decedent had carjacked. Officers were legally justified
11 in returning fire in defense of themselves and others present.

12 16. As to the allegations of Paragraph 17, defendants deny each and every allegation
13 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
14 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

15 17. Answering the allegations of Paragraph 18, defendants deny each and every
16 allegation contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or
17 plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of
18 damages.

19 18. As to the allegations of Paragraph 19, defendants deny each and every allegation
20 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
21 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

22 19. As to the allegations of Paragraph 20, defendants deny each and every allegation
23 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
24 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

25 20. As to the allegations of Paragraph 21, defendants deny each and every allegation
26 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
27 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.
28

1 21. As the allegations of Paragraph 22, defendants deny each and every allegation
2 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
3 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

4 22. As to the allegations of Paragraph 23, defendants deny each and every allegation
5 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
6 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

7 23. As to the allegations of Paragraph 24, defendants deny each and every allegation
8 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
9 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

10 24. As to the allegations of Paragraph 25, defendants deny each and every allegation
11 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
12 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

13 25. As to the allegations of Paragraph 26, defendants deny each and every allegation
14 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
15 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

16 26. As to the allegations of Paragraph 27, defendants deny each and every allegation
17 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
18 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

19 27. As to the allegations of Paragraph 28, defendants deny each and every allegation
20 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
21 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

22 28. As to the allegations of Paragraph 29, defendants deny each and every allegation
23 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
24 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

25 29. As to the allegations of Paragraph 30, defendants deny each and every allegation
26 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
27 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.
28

1 30. As to the allegations of Paragraph 31, defendants deny each and every allegation
2 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
3 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

4 31. As to the demand for a jury trial in this action contained in Paragraph 32,
5 defendants also demand a jury trial.

6 32. As to the allegations of Paragraph 33, defendants incorporate by reference their
7 answers to the allegations in Paragraphs 1 through 32.

8 33. As to the allegations of Paragraph 34, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny that
9 any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any
10 recovery or award of damages.

11 34. As to the allegations of Paragraph 35, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny that
12 any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any
13 recovery or award of damages.

14 35. As to the allegations of Paragraph 36, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny that
15 any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any
16 recovery or award of damages.

17 36. As to the allegations of Paragraph 37, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny that
18 any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any
19 recovery or award of damages.

20 37. As to the allegations of Paragraph 38, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny that
21 any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any
22 recovery or award of damages.

23 38. As to the allegations of Paragraph 39, defendants incorporate by reference their
24 answers to the allegations in Paragraphs 1 through 38.

25 39. As to the allegations of Paragraph 40, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny that
26 any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any
27 recovery or award of damages.

1 40. As to the allegations of Paragraph 41, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny that
2 any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any
3 recovery or award of damages.

4 41. As to the allegations of Paragraph 42, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny that
5 any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any
6 recovery or award of damages.

7 42. As to the allegations of Paragraph 43, defendants incorporate by reference their
8 answers to the allegations in Paragraphs 1 through 42.

9 43. As to the allegations of Paragraph 44, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny that
10 any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any
11 recovery or award of damages.

12 44. As to the allegations of Paragraph 45, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny that
13 any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any
14 recovery or award of damages.

15 45. As to the allegations of Paragraph 46, defendants incorporate by reference their
16 answers to the allegations in Paragraphs 1 through 45.

17 46. As to the allegations of Paragraph 47, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny that
18 any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any
19 recovery or award of damages.

20 47. As to the allegations of Paragraph 48, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny that
21 any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any
22 recovery or award of damages.

23 48. As to the allegations of Paragraph 49, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny that
24 any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any
25 recovery or award of damages.

26 49. As to the allegations of Paragraph 50, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny that
27 any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any
28

1 recovery or award of damages.

2 50. As to the allegations of Paragraph 51, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny that
3 any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any
4 recovery or award of damages.

5 51. As to the allegations of Paragraph 52, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny that
6 any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any
7 recovery or award of damages.

8 52. As to the allegations of Paragraph 53, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny that
9 any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any
10 recovery or award of damages.

11 53. As to the allegations of Paragraph 54, defendants incorporate by reference their
12 answers to the allegations in Paragraphs 1 through 53.

13 54. As to the allegations of Paragraph 55, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny that
14 any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any
15 recovery or award of damages.

16 55. As to the allegations of Paragraph 56, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny that
17 any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any
18 recovery or award of damages.

19 56. As to the allegations of Paragraph 57, defendants incorporate by reference their
20 answers to the allegations in Paragraphs 1 through 56.

21 57. As to the allegations of Paragraph 58, defendants deny each and every allegation
22 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
23 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

24 58. As to the allegations of Paragraph 59, defendants deny each and every allegation
25 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
26 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

27 59. As to the allegations of Paragraph 60, defendants deny each and every allegation
28

1 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
2 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

3 60. As to the allegations of Paragraph 61, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny that
4 any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any
5 recovery or award of damages.

6 61. As to the allegations of Paragraph 62, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny that
7 any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights guaranteed under the Fourth and/or Fourteenth
8 Amendment were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

9 62. As to the allegations of Paragraph 63, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny that
10 any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any
11 recovery or award of damages.

12 63. As to the allegations of Paragraph 64, defendants incorporate by reference their
13 answers to the allegations in Paragraphs 1 through 63.

14 64. As to the allegations of Paragraph 65, defendants respond that they lack sufficient
15 information to admit said allegations and therefore deny them. Defendants deny any wrongdoing,
16 deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled
17 to any recovery or award of damages.

18 65. As to the allegations of Paragraph 66, defendants admit that decedent did not file a
19 legal action before his death. Defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or
20 plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of
21 damages.

22 66. As to the allegations of Paragraph 67, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny that
23 decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny that plaintiffs are entitled to any
24 recovery or award of damages.

25 67. As to the allegations of Paragraph 68, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny that
26 any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any
27 recovery or award of damages.

1 68. As to the allegations of Paragraph 69, defendants incorporate by reference their
2 answers to the allegations in Paragraphs 1 through 68.

3 69. As to the allegations of Paragraph 70, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny they
4 were negligent, deny that decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny that plaintiffs
5 are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

6 70. As to the allegations of Paragraph 71, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny they
7 were negligent, deny that decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny that plaintiffs
8 are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

9 71. As to the allegations of Paragraph 72, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny they
10 were negligent, deny that decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny that plaintiffs
11 are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

12 72. As to the allegations of Paragraph 73, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny they
13 were negligent, deny that decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny that plaintiffs
14 are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

15 73. As to the allegations of Paragraph 74, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny they
16 were negligent, deny that decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny that plaintiffs
17 are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

18 74. As to the allegations of Paragraph 75, defendants incorporate by reference their
19 answers to the allegations in Paragraphs 1 through 74.

20 75. As to the allegations of Paragraph 76, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny they
21 were negligent, deny that decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny that plaintiffs
22 are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

23 76. As to the allegations of Paragraph 77, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny they
24 were negligent, deny that decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny that plaintiffs
25 are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

26 77. As to the allegations of Paragraph 78, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny they
27 were negligent, deny that decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny that plaintiffs
28

1 are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

2 78. As to the allegations of Paragraph 79, defendants deny any wrongdoing, deny they
3 were negligent, deny that decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny that plaintiffs
4 are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

5 79. As to the allegations of Paragraph 80, defendants incorporate by reference their
6 answers to the allegations in Paragraphs 1 through 79.

7 80. As to the allegations of Paragraph 81, defendants deny each and every allegation
8 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
9 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

10 81. As to the allegations of Paragraph 82, defendants deny each and every allegation
11 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
12 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

13 82. As to the allegations of Paragraph 83, defendants deny each and every allegation
14 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
15 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

16 83. As to the allegations of Paragraph 84, defendants deny each and every allegation
17 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
18 rights were violated and deny plaintiff are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

19 84. As to the allegations of Paragraph 85, defendants deny each and every allegation
20 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
21 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

22 85. As to the allegations of Paragraph 86, defendants deny each and every allegation
23 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
24 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

25 86. As to the allegations of Paragraph 87, defendants deny each and every allegation
26 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
27 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.
28

1 87. As to the allegations of Paragraph 88, defendants deny each and every allegation
2 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
3 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

4 88. As to the allegations of Paragraph 89, defendants deny each and every allegation
5 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
6 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

7 89. As to the allegations of Paragraph 90, defendants incorporate by reference their
8 answers to the allegations in Paragraphs 1 through 89.

9 90. As to the allegations of Paragraph 91, defendants deny each and every allegation
10 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny they were negligent, deny that any of
11 decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery
12 or award of damages.

13 91. As to the allegations of Paragraph 92, defendants deny each and every allegation
14 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny they were negligent, deny that any of
15 decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery
16 or award of damages.

17 92. As to the allegations of Paragraph 93, defendants deny each and every allegation
18 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny they were negligent, deny that any of
19 decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery
20 or award of damages.

21 93. As to the allegations of Paragraph 94, defendants deny each and every allegation
22 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny they were negligent, deny that any of
23 decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery
24 or award of damages.

25 94. As to the allegations of Paragraph 95, defendants deny each and every allegation
26 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny they were negligent, deny that any of
27 decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery
28

1 or award of damages.

2 95. As to the allegations of Paragraph 96, defendants deny each and every allegation
3 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny they were negligent, deny that any of
4 decedent's or plaintiffs' civil rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery
5 or award of damages.

6 96. As to the allegations of Paragraph 97, defendants incorporate by reference their
7 answers to the allegations in Paragraphs 1 through 96.

8 97. As to the allegations of Paragraph 98, defendants deny each and every allegation
9 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
10 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

11 98. As to the allegations of Paragraph 99, defendants deny each and every allegation
12 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
13 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

14 99. As to the allegations of Paragraph 100, defendants incorporate by reference their
15 answers to the allegations in Paragraphs 1 through 99.

16 100. As to the allegations of Paragraph 101, defendants deny each and every allegation
17 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
18 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

19 101. As to the allegations of Paragraph 102, defendants deny each and every allegation
20 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
21 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

22 102. As to the allegations of Paragraph 103, defendants deny each and every allegation
23 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
24 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

25 103. As to the allegations of Paragraph 104, defendants deny each and every allegation
26 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing, deny that any of decedent's or plaintiffs' civil
27 rights were violated and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery or award of damages.

1 104. As to the allegations of Paragraph 105, defendants incorporate by reference their
2 answers to the allegations in Paragraphs 1 through 104.

3 105. As to the allegations of Paragraph 106, defendants deny each and every allegation
4 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery
5 or award of damages.

6 106. As to the allegations of Paragraph 107, defendants deny each and every allegation
7 contained in said Paragraph, deny any wrongdoing and deny plaintiffs are entitled to any recovery
8 or award of damages.

9 **AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES**

10 **QUALIFIED IMMUNITY**

11 AS AND FOR A SEPARATE AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE to the Complaint and the
12 causes of action asserted therein, defendants allege that the individually named defendants, as
13 public employees, are immune under the common law doctrine of qualified immunity.

14 AS AND FOR A FURTHER, SEPARATE AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE to the Complaint
15 and the causes of action asserted therein, defendants allege that they are immune from suit for
16 damages under 42 U.S.C. Section 1983 under the Eleventh Amendment to the Constitution of the
17 United States.

18 **FAILURE TO STATE A CAUSE OF ACTION**

19 AS AND FOR A FURTHER, SEPARATE, AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE to the Complaint,
20 defendants allege that plaintiffs' Complaint fails to state a cause of action against said defendants.

21 **STATUTE OF LIMITATIONS**

22 AS AND FOR A FURTHER, SEPARATE, AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE to the Complaint,
23 defendants allege that plaintiffs' causes of action are barred by California Code of Civil Procedure
24 Section 335.1 and 340(c).

25 **THIRD PARTY NEGLIGENCE**

26 AS AND FOR A FURTHER, SEPARATE, AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE to the Complaint,
27 defendants allege that certain persons and entities not presently named in this action as plaintiffs or
28

1 defendants were careless and negligent in and about the matters alleged in the Complaint and that
2 the carelessness and negligence on the part of said persons and entities proximately contributed to
3 the happening of the incident and to plaintiff's injuries, and to plaintiff's loss and damages
4 complained of, if any there were.

5 **PLAINTIFF'S COMPARATIVE NEGLIGENCE**

6 AS AND FOR A FURTHER, SEPARATE, AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE to the Complaint,
7 defendants deny any wrongdoing, negligence, or liability on their part. However, should it be
8 determined that defendants are liable, then defendants further allege that plaintiffs/decedent also
9 contributed to his own injuries and losses, if any there were, and by virtue of the decision in the
10 case of Li v. Yellow Cab Company (1975) 13 Cal.3d 804, defendants ask that any judgment
11 entered against them be proportionally reduced to the extent that plaintiffs'/decedent's own
12 negligence proximately contributed to his own injuries, death and/or losses, if any there were.

13 **FAILURE TO MITIGATE**

14 AS AND FOR A FURTHER, SEPARATE, AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE to the Complaint,
15 defendants allege that plaintiffs were bound to exercise reasonable care and diligence to avoid loss
16 and to minimize damages, if any there were, and that the plaintiffs may not recover for losses
17 which could have been prevented by reasonable efforts on their part or by expenditures that they
18 might reasonably have made.

19 **PRIVILEGED ACTS**

20 AS AND FOR A FURTHER, SEPARATE, AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE to the Complaint,
21 defendants allege that the acts set forth in the Complaint are privileged.

22 **NO VIOLATION OF CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS**

23 AS AND FOR A FURTHER, SEPARATE, AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE to the Complaint,
24 defendants allege that decedent/plaintiffs were not deprived of any constitutional right, whether
25 federal or state, at any time, as alleged herein.

26 **LAWFUL DETENTION**

27 AS AND FOR A FURTHER, SEPARATE, AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE to the Complaint,
28

1 these defendants allege that the decedent was detained as the circumstances were such to indicate
2 to a reasonable person in a like position that such a course of action was called for in the proper
3 discharge of the officers' duties. The officers had a good faith suspicion warranting detention of
4 the decedent for investigative reasons. The officers had a rational belief that the plaintiff was
5 connected to criminal activity and that the detention of decedent was necessary for reasonable
6 investigative procedures.

7 **SELF-DEFENSE/DEFENSE OF OTHERS**

8 AS AND FOR A FURTHER, SEPARATE, AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE to the Complaint,
9 these defendants allege they acted in self-defense and in defense of the lives of others.

10 **GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 820.2 and 815.2(b)**

11 AS AND FOR A FURTHER SEPARATE, AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE to the Complaint,
12 defendants allege that to the extent the acts complained of were within the discretion of public
13 employees, defendants are immune from liability pursuant to the provisions of Government Code
14 Sections 820.2 and 815.2(b).

15 **GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 905**

16 AS AND FOR A FURTHER, SEPARATE, AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE to the Complaint,
17 defendants allege that plaintiffs' action is barred to the extent that plaintiffs have failed to comply
18 with Government Code Section 905.

19 **GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 900, ET SEQ.**

20 AS AND FOR A FURTHER, SEPARATE, AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE to the Complaint,
21 defendants allege that plaintiffs' Complaint exceeds the scope of their claim, both in respect to
22 theories of liability asserted and to injuries and damages claimed. It is therefore barred pursuant to
23 Government Code Section 900, et seq.

24 **GOOD FAITH IMMUNITY**

25 AS AND FOR A FURTHER, SEPARATE, AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE to the Complaint,
26 defendants allege that at all times relevant herein, defendants acted with a good faith belief that its
27 actions were proper and lawful and did not violate clearly established law, and consequently,
28

1 defendants are entitled to immunity.

2 **PUNITIVE DAMAGES**

3 AS AND FOR A FURTHER, SEPARATE, AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE to the Complaint,
4 defendants are immune from claims for punitive damages, pursuant to California Government
5 Code Section 818, and under federal law.

6 **CALIFORNIA GOVERNMENT CODE IMMUNITIES**

7 AS AND FOR A FURTHER, SEPARATE, AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE to the Complaint,
8 defendants allege that they are immune from suit herein under applicable California immunity
9 statutes, including, but not limited to, California Government Code sections 815.2, 818, 818.2,
10 818.4, 818.8, 820.2, 820.4, 820.6, 820.8, 821, 821.2, 821.6, 821.8, and 822.2.

11 **WILLFUL CONTRIBUTORY NEGLIGENCE**

12 AS AND FOR A FURTHER, SEPARATE, AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE to the Complaint,
13 defendants allege that plaintiffs/decedent was willfully careless and negligent in and about the
14 matters alleged in the Complaint and that said willful carelessness and negligence on said
15 plaintiffs'/decedent's own part proximately contributed to the happening of the incident and to the
16 injuries and to the loss and damages complained of, if any there were.

17 **PRAYER**

18 WHEREFORE, defendants pray for relief as follows:

- 19 1. That plaintiffs take nothing by this action;
20 2. That plaintiffs' prayer for costs and attorney's fees be denied;
21 3. That plaintiffs be ordered to pay defendants' attorney's fees and costs incurred in the
22 defense of this action; and,
23 4. For any such relief that justice requires and this Court deems proper.

24 DATED: January 24, 2011

EDRINGTON, SCHIRMER & MURPHY LLP

25 By /s/Peter P. Edrington

Peter P. Edrington

26 Attorney for Defendants CITY OF PINOLE, TIM
27 CAUWELS, CHRIS FODOR, ZACH BLUME, PAUL
28 M. CLANCY, CITY OF RICHMOND and CHRIS
MAGNUS