1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
9	FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
10	
11	SIONE MOTUAPUAKA, No. C-10-4733 TEH (PR)
12	Plaintiff,
13	v. ORDER OF SERVICE
14	SAN MATEO COUNTY JAIL, et. al.,
15	Defendant(s).
16	/
17	
18	Plaintiff, a prisoner incarcerated at Centinela State
19	Prison in Imperial, California, has filed a pro se Complaint under
20	42 U.S.C. § 1983 alleging that San Mateo County Sheriff's Deputy
21	Fuentes was deliberately indifferent to his safety while he was
22	detained at that facility. In this Order, the Court will conduct
23	its initial review of the Complaint pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1915A.
24	
25	I
26	Federal courts must engage in a preliminary screening of
07	
27	cases in which prisoners seek redress from a governmental entity or

United States District Court For the Northern District of California

The court must identify cognizable claims or dismiss the complaint, 1 2 or any portion of the complaint, if the complaint "is frivolous, 3 malicious, or fails to state a claim upon which relief may be 4 granted," or "seeks monetary relief from a defendant who is immune 5 from such relief." Id. § 1915A(b). Pleadings filed by pro se 6 litigants, however, must be liberally construed. Hebbe v. Pliler, 7 627 F.3d 338, 342 (9th Cir. 2010); Balistreri v. Pacifica Police 8 Dep't., 901 F.2d 696, 699 (9th Cir. 1990).

9 To state a claim under 42 U.S.C. § 1983, a plaintiff must 10 allege two essential elements: (1) that a right secured by the 11 Constitution or laws of the United States was violated, and (2) that 12 the alleged violation was committed by a person acting under the 13 color of state law. <u>West v. Atkins</u>, 487 U.S. 42, 48 (1988).

II

16 The Eighth Amendment requires that prison officials take 17 reasonable measures to guarantee the safety of prisoners. Farmer v. 18 Brennan, 511 U.S. 825, 832 (1994). In particular, prison officials 19 have a duty to protect prisoners from violence at the hands of other 20 Id. at 833; Hearns v. Terhune, 413 F.3d 1036, 1040 (9th prisoners. 21 Cir. 2005); Hoptowit v. Ray, 682 F.2d 1237, 1250 (9th Cir. 1982); 22 Gillespie v. Civiletti, 629 F.2d 637, 642 & n.3 (9th Cir. 1980).

A pretrial detainee is not protected by the Eighth
 Amendment, however, because he has not been convicted of a crime.
 See Bell v. Wolfish, 441 U.S. 520, 535 & n.16 (1979). Instead,
 pretrial detainees are afforded protection under the Due Process
 Clause of the Fourteenth Amendment. See United States v. Salerno,

14

481 U.S. 739, 746-47 (1987); <u>Bell</u>, 441 U.S. at 535-36. 1 The 2 protections of the Due Process Clause are at least as great as those 3 of the Eighth Amendment. See Revere v. Massachusetts General Hosp., 463 U.S. 239, 244 (1983); Gary H. v. Hegstrom, 831 F.2d 1430, 1432 4 5 (9th Cir. 1987). In the Ninth Circuit, "deliberate indifference is 6 the level of culpability that pretrial detainees must establish for 7 a violation of their personal security interests under the 8 [F]ourteenth [A]mendment." Redman v. County of San Diego, 942 F.2d 9 1435, 1443 (9th Cir. 1991) (en banc).

Here, Plaintiff, who was a protective custody trustee in the San Mateo County Jail, alleges that on November 10, 2009, Deputy Fuentes opened the general population cell doors while Plaintiff was returning to his cell, an action which resulted in Plaintiff being "attacked and brutally assaulted by two northern gang members from general population." Doc. #1 at 3. Plaintiff seeks damages.

Liberally construed, Plaintiff's allegations against
Deputy Fuentes described above appear to state a cognizable 42
U.S.C. § 1983 claim for a due process violation and Defendant San
Mateo Sheriff's Deputy Fuentes will be served. Named Defendant "San
Mateo County Jail" is DISMISSED.

III

For the foregoing reasons and for good cause shown:
 1. Named Defendant "San Mateo County Jail" is DISMISSED.
 2. The Clerk shall issue summons and the United States
 Marshal shall serve, without prepayment of fees, copies of the
 Complaint in this matter and all attachments thereto and copies of

3

21

22

this order on Defendant San Mateo County Sheriff's Deputy Fuentes.
 The Clerk also shall serve a copy of this order on Plaintiff.

3 3. To expedite the resolution of this case, the Court
4 orders as follows:

5 No later than ninety (90) days from the date of a. 6 this order, Defendant shall file a motion for summary judgment or 7 other dispositive motion. A motion for summary judgment shall be 8 supported by adequate factual documentation and shall conform in all 9 respects to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 56, and shall include as 10 exhibits all records and incident reports stemming from the events 11 at issue. If Defendant is of the opinion that this case cannot be 12 resolved by summary judgment or other dispositive motion, he shall 13 so inform the Court prior to the date his motion is due. All papers 14 filed with the Court shall be served promptly on Plaintiff.

b. Plaintiff's opposition to the dispositive motion
 shall be filed with the court and served upon Defendant no later
 than thirty (30) days after Defendant serves Plaintiff with the
 motion.

19 Plaintiff is advised that a motion for summary c. 20 judgment under Rule 56 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure will, 21 if granted, end your case. Rule 56 tells you what you must do in 22 order to oppose a motion for summary judgment. Generally, summary 23 judgment must be granted when there is no genuine issue of material 24 fact - that is, if there is no real dispute about any fact that 25 would affect the result of your case, the party who asked for 26 summary judgment is entitled to judgment as a matter of law, which 27 will end your case. When a party you are suing makes a motion for

28

1 summary judgment that is properly supported by declarations (or 2 other sworn testimony), you cannot simply rely on what your 3 Complaint says. Instead, you must set out specific facts in 4 declarations, depositions, answers to interrogatories, or 5 authenticated documents, as provided in Rule 56(e), that contradict 6 the facts shown in Defendant's declarations and documents and show 7 that there is a genuine issue of material fact for trial. If you do 8 not submit your own evidence in opposition, summary judgment, if 9 appropriate, may be entered against you. If summary judgment is 10 granted, your case will be dismissed and there will be no trial. 11 Rand v. Rowland, 154 F.3d 952, 962-63 (9th Cir. 1998) (en banc) 12 (App. A).

Plaintiff also is advised that a motion to dismiss for failure to exhaust administrative remedies under 42 U.S.C. § 1997e(a) will, if granted, end your case, albeit without prejudice. You must "develop a record" and present it in your opposition in order to dispute any "factual record" presented by the Defendant in his motion to dismiss. <u>Wyatt v. Terhune</u>, 315 F.3d 1108, 1120 n.14 (9th Cir. 2003).

d. Defendant shall file a reply brief within
 fifteen (15) days of the date on which Plaintiff serves him with the
 opposition.

e. The motion shall be deemed submitted as of the
 date the reply brief is due. No hearing will be held on the motion
 unless the court so orders at a later date.

264. Discovery may be taken in accordance with the Federal27Rules of Civil Procedure. No further court order is required before

1 the parties may conduct discovery.

5. All communications by Plaintiff with the Court must
be served on Defendant, or Defendant's counsel once counsel has been
designated, by mailing a true copy of the document to Defendant or
Defendant's counsel.

6 6. It is Plaintiff's responsibility to prosecute this 7 case. Plaintiff must keep the Court and all parties informed of any 8 change of address and must comply with the Court's orders in a 9 timely fashion. Failure to do so may result in the dismissal of 10 this action pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 41(b).

IT IS SO ORDERED.

03/22/2011

the flanderson

THELTON E. HENDERSON United States District Judge

27 G:\PRO-SE\TEH\CR.10\Motuapuaka-10-4733-order of service.wpd

United States District Court For the Northern District of California

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

28

DATED