

1 Joseph N. Kravec, Jr. (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
 2 Wyatt A. Lison (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
 3 Maureen Davidson-Welling (*pro hac* to be filed)  
**STEMBER FEINSTEIN DOYLE**  
**PAYNE & KRAVEC, LLC**  
 4 Allegheny Building, 17th Floor  
 429 Forbes Avenue  
 5 Pittsburgh, PA 15219  
 6 Tel: (412) 281-8400  
 6 Fax: (412) 281-1007  
 7 Email: [jkkravec@stemberfeinstein.com](mailto:jkkravec@stemberfeinstein.com)  
 7 [wlison@stemberfeinstein.com](mailto:wlison@stemberfeinstein.com)  
 8 [mdavidsonwelling@stemberfeinstein.com](mailto:mdavidsonwelling@stemberfeinstein.com)

Trenton H. Norris (Bar No. 164781)  
 Monty Agarwal (Bar No. 191568)  
 Rhonda S. Goldstein (Bar No. 250387)  
**ARNOLD & PORTER, LLP**  
 Three Embarcadero Center, 7th Floor  
 San Francisco, California 94111  
 Tel: (415) 471-3100  
 Fax: (415) 471-3400  
 Email: [trent.norris@aporter.com](mailto:trent.norris@aporter.com)  
[monty.agarwal@aporter.com](mailto:monty.agarwal@aporter.com)  
[rhonda.goldstein@aporter.com](mailto:rhonda.goldstein@aporter.com)

**ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT**

9 Michael D. Braun (Bar No. 167416)  
**BRAUN LAW GROUP, P.C.**  
 10 10680 W. Pico Blvd., Suite 280  
 Los Angeles, CA 90064  
 11 Phone: (310) 836-6000  
 Fax: (310) 836-6010  
 12 Email: [service@braunlawgroup.com](mailto:service@braunlawgroup.com)

13 Janet Lindner Spielberg (Bar No. 221926)  
**LAW OFFICES OF JANET LINDNER**  
**SPIELBERG**  
 14 12400 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 400  
 15 Los Angeles, CA 90025  
 16 Phone: (310) 392-8801  
 Fax: (310) 278-5938  
 17 Email: [jlspielberg@jlspl.com](mailto:jlspielberg@jlspl.com)

**ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFF**

19 **IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
 20 **FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

22 **CHANEE THURSTON, on behalf of herself**  
 23 **and all others similarly situated,**

**Plaintiff,**

**v.**

26 **SAFEWAY INC.,**

**Defendant.**

**CASE NO.: 3:11-cv-04286-SC**

**~~PROPOSED~~ STIPULATED  
PROTECTIVE ORDER**

1 **1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS**

2 Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production of  
3 confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure  
4 and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly,  
5 the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated Protective  
6 Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures  
7 or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends  
8 only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the  
9 applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below, that  
10 this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under seal;  
11 Civil Local Rule 79-5 and General Order 62 set forth the procedures that must be followed and the  
12 standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under  
13 seal.

14 **2. DEFINITIONS**

15 2.1 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of  
16 information or items under this Order.

17 2.2 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is  
18 generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of  
19 Civil Procedure 26(c).

20 2.3 Counsel (without qualifier): Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well  
21 as their support staff).

22 2.4 Designated House Counsel: House Counsel who seek access to “HIGHLY  
23 CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY” information in this matter.

24 2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it  
25 produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY  
26 CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY.”

27 2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the medium  
28 or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony,

1 transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to  
2 discovery in this matter.

3 2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the  
4 litigation who (1) has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a  
5 consultant in this action, (2) is not a past or current employee of a Party or of a Party's competitor,  
6 and (3) at the time of retention, is not anticipated to become an employee of a Party or of a Party's  
7 competitor.

8 2.8 "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" Information or Items:  
9 extremely sensitive "Confidential Information or Items," disclosure of which to another Party or  
10 Non-Party would create a substantial risk of serious harm that could not be avoided by less  
11 restrictive means.

12 2.9 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this action. House Counsel  
13 does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.

14 2.10 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal  
15 entity not named as a Party to this action.

16 2.11 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this action  
17 but are retained to represent or advise a party to this action and have appeared in this action on  
18 behalf of that party.

19 2.12 Party: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors, employees,  
20 consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).

21 2.13 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery  
22 Material in this action.

23 2.14 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support services (e.g.,  
24 photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and organizing,  
25 storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and subcontractors.

26 2.15 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as  
27 "CONFIDENTIAL," or as "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY."  
28

1           2.16 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a  
2 Producing Party.

3 **3. SCOPE**

4           The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material (as  
5 defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2) all  
6 copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony,  
7 conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.  
8 However, the protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order do not cover the following  
9 information: (a) any information that is in the public domain at the time of disclosure to a Receiving  
10 Party or becomes part of the public domain after its disclosure to a Receiving Party as a result of  
11 publication not involving a violation of this Order, including becoming part of the public record  
12 through trial or otherwise; and (b) any information known to the Receiving Party prior to the  
13 disclosure or obtained by the Receiving Party after the disclosure from a source who obtained the  
14 information lawfully and under no obligation of confidentiality to the Designating Party. Any use of  
15 Protected Material at trial shall be governed by a separate agreement or order.

16 **4. DURATION**

17           Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this  
18 Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order  
19 otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and  
20 defenses in this action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion  
21 and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this action, including the  
22 time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to applicable law.

23 **5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

24           Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each Party or Non-  
25 Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care to limit any  
26 such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. To the extent it is  
27 practical to do so, the Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of material,  
28 documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify – so that other portions of the

1 material, documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept  
2 unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

3 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are shown  
4 to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily  
5 encumber or retard the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on  
6 other parties) expose the Designating Party to sanctions. If it comes to a Designating Party's  
7 attention that information or items that it designated for protection do not qualify for protection at all  
8 or do not qualify for the level of protection initially asserted, that Designating Party must promptly  
9 notify all other parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

10 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this Order (see,  
11 e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or  
12 Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated  
13 before the material is disclosed or produced.

14 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

15 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but excluding  
16 transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party affix the  
17 legend "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" to  
18 each page that contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page  
19 qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g.,  
20 by making appropriate markings in the margins) and must specify, for each portion, the level of  
21 protection being asserted.

22 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents or materials available for inspection  
23 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which material it  
24 would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the material  
25 made available for inspection shall be deemed "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS'  
26 EYES ONLY." After the inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants copied and  
27 produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for  
28 protection under this Order. Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party

1 must affix the appropriate legend (“CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL –  
2 ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY”) to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or  
3 portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly  
4 identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins) and must  
5 specify, for each portion, the level of protection being asserted.

6 (b) for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial proceedings, that the  
7 Designating Party identify on the record, before the close of the deposition, hearing, or other  
8 proceeding, all protected testimony and specify the level of protection being asserted. When it is  
9 impractical to identify separately each portion of testimony that is entitled to protection and it  
10 appears that substantial portions of the testimony may qualify for protection, the Designating Party  
11 may invoke on the record (before the deposition, hearing, or other proceeding is concluded) a right  
12 to have up to 21 days to identify the specific portions of the testimony as to which protection is  
13 sought and to specify the level of protection being asserted. Only those portions of the testimony that  
14 are appropriately designated for protection within the 21 days shall be covered by the provisions of  
15 this Stipulated Protective Order. Alternatively, a Designating Party may specify, at the deposition or  
16 up to 21 days afterwards if that period is properly invoked, that the entire transcript shall be treated  
17 as “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY.”

18 Parties shall give the other parties notice if they reasonably expect a deposition, hearing or  
19 other proceeding to include Protected Material so that the other parties can ensure that only  
20 authorized individuals who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound”  
21 (Exhibit A) are present at those proceedings. The use of a document as an exhibit at a deposition  
22 shall not in any way affect its designation as “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL –  
23 ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY.”

24 Transcripts containing Protected Material shall have an obvious legend on the title page that  
25 the transcript contains Protected Material, and the title page shall be followed by a list of all pages  
26 (including line numbers as appropriate) that have been designated as Protected Material and the level  
27 of protection being asserted by the Designating Party. The Designating Party shall inform the court  
28 reporter of these requirements. Any transcript that is prepared before the expiration of a 21-day

1 period for designation shall be treated during that period as if it had been designated “HIGHLY  
2 CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY” in its entirety unless otherwise agreed. After the  
3 expiration of that period, the transcript shall be treated only as actually designated.

4 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other tangible  
5 items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or  
6 containers in which the information or item is stored the legend “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY  
7 CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY.” If only a portion or portions of the information  
8 or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected  
9 portion(s) and specify the level of protection being asserted.

10 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to  
11 designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party’s  
12 right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a  
13 designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in  
14 accordance with the provisions of this Order.

## 15 **6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS**

16 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of  
17 confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating Party’s confidentiality  
18 designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic burdens,  
19 or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a Party does not waive its right to challenge a  
20 confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the original  
21 designation is disclosed.

22 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution process  
23 by providing written notice of each designation it is challenging and describing the basis for each  
24 challenge. To avoid ambiguity as to whether a challenge has been made, the written notice must  
25 recite that the challenge to confidentiality is being made in accordance with this specific paragraph  
26 of the Protective Order. The parties shall attempt to resolve each challenge in good faith and must  
27 begin the process by conferring directly (in voice to voice dialogue; other forms of communication  
28 are not sufficient) within 14 days of the date of service of notice. In conferring, the Challenging

1 Party must explain the basis for its belief that the confidentiality designation was not proper and  
2 must give the Designating Party an opportunity to review the designated material, to reconsider the  
3 circumstances, and, if no change in designation is offered, to explain the basis for the chosen  
4 designation. A Challenging Party may proceed to the next stage of the challenge process only if it  
5 has engaged in this meet and confer process first or establishes that the Designating Party is  
6 unwilling to participate in the meet and confer process in a timely manner.

7       6.3     Judicial Intervention. If the Parties cannot resolve a challenge without court  
8 intervention, the Designating Party shall file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality under Civil  
9 Local Rule 7 (and in compliance with Civil Local Rule 79-5 and General Order 62, if applicable)  
10 within 21 days of the initial notice of challenge or within 14 days of the parties agreeing that the  
11 meet and confer process will not resolve their dispute, whichever is earlier. Each such motion must  
12 be accompanied by a competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet  
13 and confer requirements imposed in the preceding paragraph. Failure by the Designating Party to  
14 make such a motion including the required declaration within 21 days (or 14 days, if applicable)  
15 shall automatically waive the confidentiality designation for each challenged designation. In  
16 addition, the Challenging Party may file a motion challenging a confidentiality designation at any  
17 time if there is good cause for doing so, including a challenge to the designation of a deposition  
18 transcript or any portions thereof. Any motion brought pursuant to this provision must be  
19 accompanied by a competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet and  
20 confer requirements imposed by the preceding paragraph.

21       The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating  
22 Party. Frivolous challenges and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose  
23 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions.  
24 Unless the Designating Party has waived the confidentiality designation by failing to file a motion to  
25 retain confidentiality as described above, all parties shall continue to afford the material in question  
26 the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the court  
27 rules on the challenge.  
28



1 **7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

2 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or  
3 produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this case only for prosecuting,  
4 defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to  
5 the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the litigation has  
6 been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL  
7 DISPOSITION).

8 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in a  
9 secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

10 7.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered by  
11 the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any  
12 information or item designated “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

13 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this action, as well as employees of  
14 said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for  
15 this litigation;

16 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving Party  
17 to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the  
18 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

19 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is  
20 reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement  
21 to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

22 (d) the court and its personnel;

23 (e) court reporters and their staff, professional jury or trial consultants, and Professional  
24 Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the  
25 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

26 (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is reasonably  
27 necessary and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A),  
28 unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed

1 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material must be separately  
2 bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this  
3 Stipulated Protective Order.

4 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other  
5 person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

6 7.3 Disclosure of “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY”

7 Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the  
8 Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated “HIGHLY  
9 CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY” only to:

10 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this action, as well as employees of  
11 said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for  
12 this litigation;

13 (b) Experts of the Receiving Party (1) to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this  
14 litigation, (2) who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), and  
15 (3) as to whom the procedures set forth in paragraph 7.4(a), below, have been followed;

16 (c) the court and its personnel;

17 (d) court reporters and their staff, professional jury or trial consultants, and Professional  
18 Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the  
19 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A); and

20 (e) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other  
21 person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

22 7.4 Procedures for Approving or Objecting to Disclosure of “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL  
23 – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY” Information or Items to Experts.

24 (a) Unless otherwise ordered by the court or agreed to in writing by the Designating Party, a  
25 Party that seeks to disclose to an Expert (as defined in this Order) any information or item that has  
26 been designated “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY” pursuant to  
27 paragraph 7.3(b) first must make a written request to the Designating Party that (1) identifies the  
28 general categories of “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY” information

1 that the Receiving Party seeks permission to disclose to the Expert, (2) sets forth the full name of the  
2 Expert and the city and state of his or her primary residence, (3) attaches a copy of the Expert's  
3 current resume, (4) identifies the Expert's current employer(s), (5) identifies each person or entity  
4 from whom the Expert has received compensation or funding for work in his or her areas of  
5 expertise or to whom the expert has provided professional services, including in connection with a  
6 litigation, at any time during the preceding five years,<sup>1</sup> and (6) identifies (by name and number of the  
7 case, filing date, and location of court) any litigation in connection with which the Expert has offered  
8 expert testimony, including through a declaration, report, or testimony at a deposition or trial, during  
9 the preceding five years.

10 (b) A Party that makes a request and provides the information specified in the preceding  
11 respective paragraphs may disclose the subject Protected Material to the identified Expert unless,  
12 within 14 days of delivering the request, the Party receives a written objection from the Designating  
13 Party. Any such objection must set forth in detail the grounds on which it is based.

14 (c) A Party that receives a timely written objection must meet and confer with the  
15 Designating Party (through direct voice to voice dialogue) to try to resolve the matter by agreement  
16 within seven days of the written objection. If no agreement is reached, the Party seeking to make the  
17 disclosure to the Expert may file a motion as provided in Civil Local Rule 7 (and in compliance with  
18 Civil Local Rule 79-5 and General Order 62, if applicable) seeking permission from the court to do  
19 so. Any such motion must describe the circumstances with specificity, set forth in detail the reasons  
20 why the disclosure to the Expert is reasonably necessary, assess the risk of harm that the disclosure  
21 would entail, and suggest any additional means that could be used to reduce that risk. In addition,  
22 any such motion must be accompanied by a competent declaration describing the parties' efforts to  
23 resolve the matter by agreement (i.e., the extent and the content of the meet and confer discussions)

24  
25  
26 <sup>1</sup> If the Expert believes any of this information is subject to a confidentiality obligation to a third-  
27 party, then the Expert should provide whatever information the Expert believes can be disclosed  
28 without violating any confidentiality agreements, and the Party seeking to disclose to the Expert  
shall be available to meet and confer with the Designating Party regarding any such engagement.

1 and setting forth the reasons advanced by the Designating Party for its refusal to approve the  
2 disclosure.

3 In any such proceeding, the Party opposing disclosure to the Expert shall bear the burden of  
4 proving that the risk of harm that the disclosure would entail (under the safeguards proposed)  
5 outweighs the Receiving Party's need to disclose the Protected Material to its Expert.

6 **8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER**  
7 **LITIGATION**

8 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels  
9 disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY  
10 CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" that Party must: (a) promptly notify in writing  
11 the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order; (b)  
12 promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation  
13 that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order.  
14 Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and (c) cooperate with  
15 respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected  
16 Material may be affected.<sup>2</sup>

17 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena  
18 or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as "CONFIDENTIAL" or  
19 "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" before a determination by the court  
20 from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party's  
21 permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that  
22 court of its confidential material – and nothing in these provisions should be construed as  
23 authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this action to disobey a lawful directive from  
24 another court.

25  
26 \_\_\_\_\_  
27 <sup>2</sup> The purpose of imposing these duties is to alert the interested parties to the existence of this  
28 Protective Order and to afford the Designating Party in this case an opportunity to try to protect its  
confidentiality interests in the court from which the subpoena or order issued.

1 **9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN**  
2 **THIS LITIGATION**

3 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in this  
4 action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’  
5 EYES ONLY.” Such information produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is  
6 protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be  
7 construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

8 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-  
9 Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the  
10 Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s confidential information, then the Party shall:

- 11 1. promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some  
12 or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;  
13 2. promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective  
14 Order in this litigation, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the  
15 information requested; and  
16 3. make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party.

17 (c) If the Non-Party fails to object or seek a protective order from this court within 14  
18 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the  
19 Non-Party’s confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely  
20 seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or  
21 control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by  
22 the court.<sup>3</sup> Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of  
23 seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

24  
25  
26  
27 <sup>3</sup> The purpose of this provision is to alert the interested parties to the existence of confidentiality  
28 rights of a Non-Party and to afford the Non-Party an opportunity to protect its confidentiality  
interests in this court.

1 **10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

2 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected  
3 Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order,  
4 the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized  
5 disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c)  
6 inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this  
7 Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to  
8 Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

9 **11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED**  
10 **MATERIAL**

11 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced  
12 material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties  
13 are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to  
14 modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production  
15 without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the  
16 parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by  
17 the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement  
18 in the stipulated protective order submitted to the court.

19 **12. MISCELLANEOUS**

20 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek  
21 its modification by the court in the future.

22 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order  
23 no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any  
24 information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no  
25 Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by  
26 this Protective Order.

27 12.3 Filing Protected Material. Without written permission from the Designating Party or a  
28 court order secured after appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file in the

1 public record in this action any Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected  
2 Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5 and General Order 62. Protected Material may  
3 only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected  
4 Material at issue. Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 79-5 and General Order 62, a sealing order will issue  
5 only upon a request establishing that the Protected Material at issue is privileged, protectable as a  
6 trade secret, or otherwise entitled to protection under the law. If a Receiving Party's request to file  
7 Protected Material under seal pursuant to Civil Local Rule 79-5(d) and General Order 62 is denied  
8 by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the Protected Material in the public record pursuant  
9 to Civil Local Rule 79-5(e) unless otherwise instructed by the court.

10 **13. FINAL DISPOSITION**

11 Within 60 days after the final disposition of this action, as defined in paragraph 4, each  
12 Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material.  
13 As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations,  
14 summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether  
15 the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written  
16 certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party)  
17 by the 60-day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material  
18 that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies,  
19 abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected  
20 Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all  
21 pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda,  
22 correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant  
23 and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies  
24 that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in  
25 Section 4 (DURATION).

26  
27  
28

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

DATED: July 31, 2012

By: s/ Joseph N. Kravec, Jr.

JOSEPH N. KRAVEC, JR.  
MAUREEN DAVIDSON-WELLING  
WYATT A. LISON  
MICHAEL D. BRAUN  
JANET LINDNER SPIELBERG

Attorneys for Plaintiff  
CHANEE THURSTON

DATED: July 31, 2012

By: s/Monty Agarwal via email consent

TRENTON H. NORRIS  
MONTY AGARWAL  
RHONDA S. GOLDSTEIN

Attorneys for Defendant  
SAFEWAY INC.

PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.

DATED: August 6, 2012



SAMUEL CONTI  
United States District Judge



EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full name], of \_\_\_\_\_  
[print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Northern District of California on [date] in the case of *Chanee Thurston v. Safeway, Inc.*, Case No.: 3:11-cv-04286-SC. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the Northern District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.

I hereby appoint \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full name] of \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

City and State where sworn and signed: \_\_\_\_\_

Printed name: \_\_\_\_\_  
[printed name]

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_  
[signature]