

1 BARBARA J. CHISHOLM (SBN 224656)
 RACHEL ZWILLINGER (SBN 268684)
 2 Altshuler Berzon LLP
 177 Post Street, Suite 300
 3 San Francisco, CA 94108
 Telephone: (415) 421-7151
 4 E-mail: bchisholm@altber.com
 rzwillinger@altber.com

6 JOEL R. REYNOLDS (SBN 85276)
 STEPHEN ZAK SMITH (SBN 228913)
 7 Natural Resources Defense Council
 1314 Second Street
 8 Santa Monica, CA 90401
 Telephone: (310) 434-2300
 9 E-mail: jreynolds@nrdc.org
 zsmith@nrdc.org

11 *Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

12 IGNACIA S. MORENO, Assistant Attorney General
 13 KEVIN W. McARDLE, Trial Attorney
 MICHAEL D. THORP, Senior Attorney
 14 United States Department of Justice
 Environment and Natural Resources Division
 15 Wildlife & Marine Resources Section
 601 D Street, NW, Third Floor
 16 Washington, DC 20004
 17 Tele: (202) 305-0219
 E-mail: kevin.mcardle@usdoj.gov
 18 Michael.Thorp@usdoj.gov

19 *Attorneys for Defendants*

20 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
 21 **NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

22 NATURAL RESOURCES DEFENSE
 23 COUNCIL, INC., *et al.*,

24 Plaintiffs

25 v.

26 REBECCA BLANK, *et al.*,

27 Defendants.

Case No. 12-cv-05380-EDL

**STIPULATION REQUESTING
 REMOVAL FROM THE ADR MULTI-
 OPTION PROGRAM AND
 28 ~~[PROPOSED]~~ ORDER**

1 The undersigned parties appreciate the opportunity to participate in the Court’s ADR multi-
2 option program. The parties, however, agree that the above-captioned administrative review case
3 is not amenable to an intermediate resolution at this time, none of the ADR processes are likely to
4 lead to resolution of the case or deliver benefits sufficient to justify the resources consumed by its
5 use, and the case should continue before the Court. *See* ADR Local Rule 3-5(e)(3). The parties
6 therefore jointly stipulate and request, pursuant to ADR Local Rule 3-3(c) and Civ. Local Rule 7-
7 12, that the Court remove the above-captioned case from its ADR multi-option program.

8
9 Date: December 10, 2012

Respectfully submitted,

11 By: /s/ Barbara J. Chisholm
12 Barbara J. Chisholm

13 BARBARA J. CHISHOLM
14 RACHEL ZWILLINGER
Altshuler Berzon LLP

15 *Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

16
17 Dated: December 10, 2012

18 By: /s/ Kevin W. McArdle, per email authorization
Kevin W. McArdle

19 KEVIN W. MCARDLE
20 MICHAEL THORP
U.S. Department of Justice

21 *Attorneys for Defendants*
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

[PROPOSED] ORDER

Pursuant to stipulation, IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated this 10th day of December, 2012.


THE HONORABLE ELIZABETH D. LAPORTE
United States Magistrate Judge

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28