

1 David I. Dalby (SBN 114750)  
 2 HINSHAW & CULBERTSON LLP  
 3 One California Street, 18th Floor  
 4 San Francisco, CA 94111  
 Telephone: 415-362-6000  
 Facsimile: 415-834-9070

5 Attorneys for Defendant  
 6 CREDIT PROTECTION ASSOCIATION

7  
 8 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
 9 **NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**  
 10 **SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION**

12 MILO ZUCCHI, individually and on behalf of all  
 13 others similarly situated,

14 Plaintiff,

15 vs.

16 CREDIT PROTECTION ASSOCIATION,

17 Defendant.

Case No. 3:13-cv-01168-JSC

**STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER**

Hon. Edward M. Chen

19 **1 PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS**

20 Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production of  
 21 confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure  
 22 and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted.  
 23 Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated  
 24 Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on  
 25 all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure  
 26 and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment  
 27 under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3,  
 28

1 below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information  
2 under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 and General Order 62 set forth the procedures that must be  
3 followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file  
4 material under seal

5 **2 DEFINITIONS**

6 2.1. Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of  
7 information or items under this Order.

8 2.2. “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is  
9 generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of  
10 Civil Procedure 26(c).

11 2.3. Counsel (without qualifier): Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well  
12 as their support staff).

13 2.4. Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it  
14 produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

15 2.5. Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the  
16 medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things,  
17 testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or  
18 responses to discovery in this matter.

19 2.6. Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to  
20 the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a  
21 consultant in this action.

22 2.7. House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this action. House  
23 Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.

24 2.8. Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal  
25 entity not named as a Party to this action.  
26  
27  
28

1           2.9. Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this  
2 action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this action and have appeared in this action  
3 on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of that party.

4           2.10. Party: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors, employees,  
5 consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).

6           2.11. Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery  
7 Material in this action.

8           2.12. Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support services  
9 (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and organizing,  
10 storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and subcontractors.

11           2.13. Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as  
12 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

13           2.14. Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a  
14 Producing Party.

15 **3       SCOPE**

16           The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material  
17 (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2) all  
18 copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony,  
19 conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.  
20 However, the protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order do not cover the following  
21 information: (a) any information that is in the public domain at the time of disclosure to a  
22 Receiving Party or becomes part of the public domain after its disclosure to a Receiving Party as a  
23 result of publication not involving a violation of this Order, including becoming part of the public  
24 record through trial or otherwise; and (b) any information known to the Receiving Party prior to the  
25 disclosure or obtained by the Receiving Party after the disclosure from a source who obtained the  
26 information lawfully and under no obligation of confidentiality to the Designating Party. Any use  
27 of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by a separate agreement or order.  
28

1 **4** **DURATION**

2 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this  
3 Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order  
4 otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and  
5 defenses in this action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the  
6 completion and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this action,  
7 including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to  
8 applicable law.

9 **5** **DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

10 5.1. Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each Party or  
11 Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care to  
12 limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The  
13 Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or  
14 oral or written communications that qualify – so that other portions of the material, documents,  
15 items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within  
16 the ambit of this Order.

17 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are shown  
18 to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily  
19 encumber or retard the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens  
20 on other parties) expose the Designating Party to sanctions. If it comes to a Designating Party's  
21 attention that information or items that it designated for protection do not qualify for protection,  
22 that Designating Party must promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken  
23 designation.

24 5.2. Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this Order  
25 (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered,  
26 Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so  
27 designated before the material is disclosed or produced.  
28

1 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

2 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but  
3 excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party  
4 affix the legend “CONFIDENTIAL” to each page that contains protected material. If only a portion  
5 or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly  
6 identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins). A Party or  
7 Non-Party that makes original documents or materials available for inspection need not designate  
8 them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which material it would like  
9 copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the material made  
10 available for inspection shall be deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has  
11 identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which  
12 documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing the  
13 specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the “CONFIDENTIAL” legend to each page  
14 that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for  
15 protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making  
16 appropriate markings in the margins).

17 (b) for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial proceedings, that the  
18 Designating Party identify on the record, before the close of the deposition, hearing, or other  
19 proceeding, all protected testimony.

20 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other  
21 tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container  
22 or containers in which the information or item is stored the legend “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a  
23 portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the extent  
24 practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

25 5.3. Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to  
26 designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party’s  
27 right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a  
28

1 designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated  
2 in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

3 **6 CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS**

4 6.1. Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of  
5 confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating Party's confidentiality  
6 designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic  
7 burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a Party does not waive its right to  
8 challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the  
9 original designation is disclosed.

10 6.2. Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution process  
11 by providing written notice of each designation it is challenging and describing the basis for each  
12 challenge. To avoid ambiguity as to whether a challenge has been made, the written notice must  
13 recite that the challenge to confidentiality is being made in accordance with this specific paragraph  
14 of the Protective Order. The parties shall attempt to resolve each challenge in good faith and must  
15 begin the process by conferring directly (in voice to voice dialogue; other forms of communication  
16 are not sufficient) within 14 days of the date of service of notice. In conferring, the Challenging  
17 Party must explain the basis for its belief that the confidentiality designation was not proper and  
18 must give the Designating Party an opportunity to review the designated material, to reconsider the  
19 circumstances, and, if no change in designation is offered, to explain the basis for the chosen  
20 designation. A Challenging Party may proceed to the next stage of the challenge process only if it  
21 has engaged in this meet and confer process first or establishes that the Designating Party is  
22 unwilling to participate in the meet and confer process in a timely manner.

23 6.3. Judicial Intervention. If the Parties cannot resolve a challenge without court  
24 intervention, the Designating Party shall file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality under  
25 Civil Local Rule 7 (and in compliance with Civil Local Rule 79-5 and General Order 62, if  
26 applicable) within 21 days of the initial notice of challenge or within 14 days of the parties  
27 agreeing that the meet and confer process will not resolve their dispute, whichever is earlier. Each  
28

1 such motion must be accompanied by a competent declaration affirming that the movant has  
2 complied with the meet and confer requirements imposed in the preceding paragraph. Failure by  
3 the Designating Party to make such a motion including the required declaration within 21 days (or  
4 14 days, if applicable) shall automatically waive the confidentiality designation for each challenged  
5 designation. In addition, the Challenging Party may file a motion challenging a confidentiality  
6 designation at any time if there is good cause for doing so, including a challenge to the designation  
7 of a deposition transcript or any portions thereof. Any motion brought pursuant to this provision  
8 must be accompanied by a competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the  
9 meet and confer requirements imposed by the preceding paragraph.

10         The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating  
11 Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose  
12 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions.  
13 Unless the Designating Party has waived the confidentiality designation by failing to file a motion  
14 to retain confidentiality as described above, all parties shall continue to afford the material in  
15 question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation until  
16 the court rules on the challenge.

17         **7 ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

18         7.1. Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or  
19 produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this case only for prosecuting,  
20 defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to  
21 the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the litigation has  
22 been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL  
23 DISPOSITION).

24         Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in  
25 a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.  
26  
27  
28

1           7.2. Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered  
2 by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any  
3 information or item designated “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

4           (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this action, as well as  
5 employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the  
6 information for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be  
7 Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A;

8           (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving  
9 Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the  
10 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

11           (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is  
12 reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement  
13 to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

14           (d) the court and its personnel;

15           (e) court reporters and their staff, professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and  
16 Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have  
17 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

18           (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is reasonably  
19 necessary and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A),  
20 unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed  
21 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material must be separately  
22 bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this  
23 Stipulated Protective Order.

24           (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or  
25 other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.



1 **8** **PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN**  
2 **OTHER LITIGATION**

3 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels  
4 disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party  
5 must:

6 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a  
7 copy of the subpoena or court order;

8 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in  
9 the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to  
10 this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

11 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the  
12 Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

13 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or  
14 court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL”  
15 before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has  
16 obtained the Designating Party’s permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and  
17 expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material – and nothing in these  
18 provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this action to  
19 disobey a lawful directive from another court.

20 **9** **A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN**  
21 **THIS LITIGATION**

22 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in  
23 this action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information produced by Non-Parties in  
24 connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order.  
25 Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking  
26 additional protections.  
27  
28

1 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-  
2 Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the  
3 Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's confidential information, then the Party shall:

4 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some  
5 or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;

6 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective  
7 Order in this litigation, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of  
8 the information requested; and

9 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party.

10 (c) If the Non-Party fails to object or seek a protective order from this court within 14  
11 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the  
12 Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely  
13 seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or  
14 control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination  
15 by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense  
16 of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

17 **10 UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

18 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected  
19 Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective  
20 Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the  
21 unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected  
22 Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the  
23 terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and  
24 Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 **11 INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE**  
2 **PROTECTED MATERIAL**

3 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently  
4 produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the  
5 Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision  
6 is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that  
7 provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence  
8 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a  
9 communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection,  
10 the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to the  
11 court.

12 **12 MISCELLANEOUS**

13 12.1. Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to  
14 seek its modification by the court in the future.

15 12.2. Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order  
16 no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any  
17 information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no  
18 Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by  
19 this Protective Order.

20 12.3. Filing Protected Material. Without written permission from the Designating Party or  
21 a court order secured after appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file in the  
22 public record in this action any Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any  
23 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5 and General Order 62. Protected  
24 Material may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the  
25 specific Protected Material at issue. Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 79-5 and General Order 62, a  
26 sealing order will issue only upon a request establishing that the Protected Material at issue is  
27 privileged, protectable as a trade secret, or otherwise entitled to protection under the law. If a  
28

1 Receiving Party's request to file Protected Material under seal pursuant to Civil Local Rule 79-5(d)  
2 and General Order 62 is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in  
3 the public record pursuant to Civil Local Rule 79-5(e) unless otherwise instructed by the court.

4 **13 FINAL DISPOSITION**

5       Within 60 days after the final disposition of this action, as defined in paragraph 4, each  
6 Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material.  
7 As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations,  
8 summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether  
9 the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written  
10 certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party)  
11 by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected  
12 Material that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained  
13 any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any of  
14 the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an archival  
15 copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda,  
16 correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant  
17 and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival  
18 copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set  
19 forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

20  
21 ///  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

DATED: September 4, 2013

/s/ Todd M. Friedman  
Attorney for Plaintiff,  
Milo Zucchi

DATED: September 4, 2013

/s/ David I. Dalby  
Attorney for Defendant

PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.

DATED: September 9, 2013



1 **EXHIBIT A**

2 **ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND**

3  
4 I, \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full name], of \_\_\_\_\_  
5 [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and  
6 understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for  
7 the Northern District of California on [date] in the case of *Zucchi v. Credit Protection Association,*  
8 *LLC*, Case No. 3:13-cv-01168-EMC (N.D. Cal.). I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the  
9 terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so  
10 comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly  
11 promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this  
12 Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions  
13 of this Order. I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the  
14 Northern District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective  
15 Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.

16 I hereby appoint \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full name] of  
17 \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full address and telephone number]  
18 as my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any proceedings  
19 related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

20  
21 Date: \_\_\_\_\_

22 City and State where sworn and signed: \_\_\_\_\_

23 Printed name: \_\_\_\_\_

24 Signature: \_\_\_\_\_  
25  
26  
27  
28