

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

IN RE OPTICAL DISK DRIVE PRODUCTS  
ANTITRUST LITIGATION

MDL Docket No. 3:10-md-02143 RS

Case No. 3:13-cv-1877-RS

This document relates to:

STATE OF FLORIDA, OFFICE OF THE  
ATTORNEY GENERAL, DEPARTMENT  
OF LEGAL AFFAIRS,

Plaintiff,

v.

HITACHI-LG DATA STORAGE, INC., et al.

Defendants.

**STIPULATION AND ~~PROPOSED~~ ORDER  
REGARDING THE WITHDRAWAL OF  
CERTAIN AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES,  
AND THE STATE OF FLORIDA'S  
MOTION TO STRIKE**

1 WHEREAS, on January 24, 2014, Defendants filed a Motion to Dismiss the State of  
2 Florida, Office of the Attorney General, Department of Legal Affairs' ("Florida") Amended  
3 Complaint for Damages, Civil Penalties, [and] Injunctive Relief ("Motion to Dismiss") (Dkt. 24);

4 WHEREAS, on April 8, 2014, the Court entered an Order Granting in Part and Denying in  
5 Part Motion to Dismiss State of Florida's Complaint (Dkt. 28);

6 WHEREAS, on May 19, 2014, Florida filed a Second Amended Complaint for Damages,  
7 Civil Penalties, and Injunctive Relief ("Second Amended Complaint") (Dkt. 31);

8 WHEREAS, the undersigned Defendants filed separate Answers to Florida's Second  
9 Amended Complaint on or about June 18, 2014 and June 25, 2014, which individually asserted  
10 various Affirmative Defenses by each Defendant;

11 WHEREAS, on July 9, 2014, Florida filed a Motion to Strike Defendants' Affirmative  
12 Defenses to the State of Florida's Second Amended Complaint ("Motion to Strike") (Dkt. 60),  
13 which seeks dismissal of the following four Affirmative Defenses, to the extent asserted by a  
14 particular Defendant: (i) Lack of Standing Based on *Mack v. Bristol-Myers Squibb Co.*, 673 So.  
15 2d 100 (Fla. 1st DCA 1996) ("*Mack*"); (ii) lack of personal jurisdiction; (iii) improper venue; and  
16 (iv) incorporation of other Defendants' defenses (*see* Dkt. 60, Appendix A-D);

17 WHEREAS, the parties have conferred and reached an agreement whereby Defendants  
18 agree to withdraw the Affirmative Defenses identified in Appendix A-D of Florida's Motion to  
19 Strike from their individual Answers, and Florida agrees to withdraw its Motion to Strike; and

20 WHEREAS, the parties agree that the withdrawal of improper venue as an Affirmative  
21 Defense from any Defendant's Answer shall not preclude any party, including either Florida or  
22 any Defendant, from later moving the Court to change or transfer the venue of this action.

23 NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED and AGREED, subject to Court  
24 approval, that Florida's Motion to Strike (Dkt. 60) shall be deemed withdrawn. In addition, the  
25 following four Affirmative Defenses shall be deemed withdrawn, to the extent asserted by any  
26 Defendant in its Answer to Florida's Second Amended Complaint: (i) lack of standing based on  
27 *Mack*; (ii) lack of personal jurisdiction; (iii) improper venue; and (iv) incorporation of other  
28 Defendants' defenses. The withdrawal of improper venue as an Affirmative Defense from any

1 Defendant's Answer shall not preclude any party from subsequently moving this Court to change  
2 or transfer the venue of this action.

3 IT IS SO STIPULATED.

4 DATED: August 4, 2014

LATHAM & WATKINS LLP

5

By           /s/ Belinda S Lee            
6 BELINDA S LEE

6

7

505 Montgomery Street, Suite 2000  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Telephone: 415-395-8240  
Facsimile: 415-395-8095  
belinda.lee@lw.com

8

9

10

*Counsel for Defendants Toshiba Samsung Storage  
Technology Korea Corporation, Toshiba Samsung  
Storage Technology Corporation, and Toshiba  
Corporation*

11

12

13 DATED: August 4, 2014

O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP

14

By:           /s/ Ian Simmons            
15 IAN SIMMONS

15

16

1625 Eye Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20006  
Telephone: (202) 383-5106  
Facsimile: (202) 383-5414  
isimmons@omm.com

17

18

19

*Counsel for Defendants Samsung Electronics Co.,  
Ltd. and Samsung Electronics America, Inc.*

20

21 DATED: August 4, 2014

BOIES SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP

22

By:           /s/ John F. Cove, Jr.            
23 JOHN F. COVE, JR.

23

24

1999 Harrison Street, Suite 900  
Oakland, CA 94612  
Telephone: (510) 874-1000  
Facsimile: (510) 874-1460  
jcove@bsflp.com

25

26

27

*Counsel for Defendants Sony Corporation, Sony  
Electronics, Inc., Sony Optiarc Inc., and Sony  
Optiarc America Inc.*

28

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

DATED: August 4, 2014

DLA PIPER LLP

By:       /s/ Deana L. Cairo        
DEANA L. CAIRO

500 8th Street, N.W.  
Washington, DC 20004  
Telephone: (202) 799-4523  
Facsimile: (202) 799-5523  
Deana.cairo@dlapiper.com

*Counsel for Defendants TEAC Corporation and  
TEAC America Inc.*

DATED: August 4, 2014

WINSTON & STRAWN LLP

By       /s/ Jeffrey L. Kessler        
JEFFREY L. KESSLER

200 Park Avenue  
New York, NY 10166  
Telephone: (212) 294-6700  
Facsimile: (212) 294-4700  
jkessler@winston.com

*Counsel for Defendants Panasonic Corporation and  
Panasonic Corporation of North America*

DATED: August 4, 2014

WINSTON & STRAWN LLP

By       /s/ Robert B. Pringle        
ROBERT B. PRINGLE

101 California Street  
San Francisco, CA 94111-5894  
Telephone: (415) 591-1000  
Facsimile: (415) 591-1400  
rpringle@winston.com

*Counsel for Defendant NEC Corporation*

DATED: August 4, 2014

ROPES & GRAY LLP

By:       /s/ Mark S. Popofsky        
Mark S. POPOFSKY

One Metro Center  
700 12th Street NW, Suite 900  
Washington, DC 20005-3948  
Telephone: (202) 508-4600  
Facsimile: (202) 508-4650

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

mark.popofsky@ropesgray.com

*Counsel for Defendants Hitachi-LG Data Storage, Inc. and Hitachi-LG Data Storage Korea, Inc.*

DATED: August 4, 2014

BAKER BOTTS LLP

By:           /s/ Evan Werbel            
EVAN WERBEL

1299 Pennsylvania Ave. NW  
Washington, DC 20004  
Telephone: (202) 383-7199  
Facsimile: (202) 383-6610  
evan.werbel@bakerbotts.com

*Counsel for Defendants Koninklijke Philips N.V., Lite-On IT Corp. of Taiwan, Philips & Lite-On Digital Solutions Corp., and Philips & Lite-On Digital Solutions U.S.A., Inc.*

DATED: August 4, 2014

DICKSTEIN SHAPIRO LLP

By:           /s/ Lisa M. Kaas            
LISA M. KAAS

1825 Eye Street NW  
Washington, DC 20006  
Telephone: (202) 420-2200  
Facsimile: (202) 420-2201  
kaasl@dicksteinshapiro.com

*Counsel for Defendants BenQ Corporation and BenQ America Corp.*

DATED: August 4, 2014

VINSON & ELKINS LLP

By:           /s/ Craig P. Seebald            
CRAIG P. SEEBALD

2200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW  
Suite 500 West  
Washington, DC 20037-1701  
Telephone: (202) 639-6500  
Facsimile: (202) 879-8950  
cseebald@velaw.com

*Counsel for Defendant Hitachi, Ltd.*

1 DATED: August 4, 2014

JONES DAY

2 By: /s/ Eric P. Enson  
3 ERIC P. ENSON

4 555 South Flower Street, Fiftieth Floor  
5 Los Angeles, CA 90071  
6 Telephone: (213) 489-3939  
7 Facsimile: (213) 243-2539  
8 epenson@JonesDay.com

9 *Counsel for Defendants Pioneer Electronics (USA)*  
10 *Inc., Pioneer North America, Inc., Pioneer*  
11 *Corporation, and Pioneer High Fidelity Taiwan*  
12 *Co., LTD.*

13 DATED: August 4, 2014

EIMER STAHL LLP

14 By: /s/ Nathan P. Eimer  
15 NATHAN P. EIMER

16 224 South Michigan Avenue, Suite 100  
17 Chicago, IL 60604  
18 Telephone: (312) 660-7601  
19 Facsimile: (312) 692-1718  
20 neimer@eimerstahl.com

21 *Counsel for Defendant LG Electronics, Inc.*

22 DATED: August 4, 2014

DRINKER BIDDLE & REATH LLP

23 By: /s/ Keith A. Walter, Jr.  
24 KEITH A. WALTER, JR.

25 222 Delaware Avenue, Suite 1410  
26 Wilmington, Delaware 19801  
27 Telephone: (302) 467-4200  
28 Facsimile: (302) 467-4201  
keith.walter@dbr.com

*Counsel for Defendants Quanta Storage, Inc. and*  
*Quanta Storage America, Inc.*

DATED: August 4, 2014

STATE OF FLORIDA

By /s/ Nicholas J. Weilhammer  
NICHOLAS J. WEILHAMMER

Office of the Attorney General  
State of Florida  
PL-01, The Capitol  
Tallahassee, Florida 32399-1050

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

Tel: (850) 414-3300  
Fax: (850) 488-9134  
Liz.Brady@myfloridalegal.com  
Nicholas.Weilhammer@myfloridalegal.com

*Counsel for Plaintiff State of Florida*

Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 5-1(i)(3), the filer attests that concurrence in the filing of this document has been obtained from each of the signatories.

**PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.**

DATED: 8/4/14



HONORABLE RICHARD SEBORG  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT JUDGE