Begaj v. Infoblox Inc., et al

Doc. 14

Pursuant to Civil Local Rules 3-12(b) and 7-11 of the United States

District Court for the Northern District of California, Paul Ansfield, the plaintiff
in the putative related *Ansfield* case (as defined below), hereby moves the Court
to consider whether the following three cases, all filed in the Northern District
of California, qualify as related actions:

Case Name	Case Number	Judge Assigned	Date Filed
Ansfield v. Infoblox	No. 14-cv-	Hon. Vince	May 30, 2014
Inc., et. al. ("Ansfield")	02500-VC	Chhabria	
Begaj v. Infoblox	No. 14-cv-	Hon. Phyllis J.	June 4, 2014
Inc., et al. ("Beqaj")	02564-PJH	Hamilton	June 4, 2014
Achey, et al. v. Infoblox Inc., et al. ("Achey")	No. 14-cv- 02644-BLF	Hon. Beth Labson Freeman	June 9, 2014

Civil Local Rule 3-12(a) provides that an action is related to another when "(1) The actions concern substantially the same parties, property, transaction or event; and (2) It appears likely that there will be an unduly burdensome duplication of labor and expense or conflicting results if the cases are conducted before different Judges." These criteria are met here.

All three cases are putative class actions, brought on behalf of Infoblox Inc. stockholders. Plaintiffs in all the actions name the same defendants and allege similar claims of securities fraud pursuant to Sections 10(b) and 20(a) of the Securities Exchange Act of 1934 and Rule 10b-5 promulgated thereunder.

Given that the same parties, transactions and events are involved in all three cases, it appears likely that there will be an unduly burdensome duplication of labor and expense and possible conflicting results, if the three cases are conducted before different Judges. Accordingly, the Court should relate these actions under Civil Local Rule 3-12.

In compliance with Local Rule 7-11, movant obtained a stipulation from the plaintiffs in both actions, agreeing that the cases should be related. Movant also conferred with counsel for the defendant, who stated defendant has no

1	objection to the filing of this A	dministrative Motion, nor to the relation of the
2	actions. For the foregoing reasons, plaintiff respectfully requests the Court	
3	enter an order relating the <i>Ansfield</i> , <i>Begaj</i> and <i>Achey</i> actions.	
4		
5	Dated: June 16, 2014	GARDY & NOTIS, LLP
6		s/ Jennifer Sarnelli
7		Jennifer Sarnelli (SBN 242510) jsarnelli@gardylaw.com
8		Mark C. Gardy mgardy@gardylaw.com
9		James S. Notis inotis@gardylaw.com
10		Tower 56 126 East 56th Street, 8th floor
11		New York, NY 10022 Tel: 212-905-0509
12		Fax: 212-905-0508
13		Robert S. Green (SBN 136183) rsg@classcounsel.com Lesley E. Weaver (SBN 191305)
14		lew@classcounsel.com
15		GREEN & NOBLIN, P.C. 700 Larkspur Landing Circle, Suite 275 Larkspur, CA 94939
16		Tel: 415-477-6700 Fax: 415-477-6710
17		rax. 413-477-0710
18		Counsel for Plaintiff Ansfield
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
	11	· ,

CERTIFICATION OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on June 16, 2014, I authorized the electronic filing of the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the e-mail addresses denoted on the attached Electronic Mail Notice List, and I hereby certify that I caused to be mailed the foregoing document or paper via email to any non-CM/ECF participants.

I certify under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on June 16, 2014.

GARDY & NOTIS, LLP

s/ Jennifer Sarnelli
Jennifer Sarnelli (SBN 242510)
jsarnelli@gardylaw.com
Mark C. Gardy
mgardy@gardylaw.com
James S. Notis
jnotis@gardylaw.com
Tower 56
126 East 56th Street, 8th floor
New York, NY 10022
Tel: 212-905-0509
Fax: 212-905-0508

-3-

	1	
1	Robert S. Green (SBN 136183) rsg@classcounsel.com	
2	Lesley E. Weaver (SBN 191305) lew@classcounsel.com	
3	GREEN & NOBLIN, P.C. 700 Larkspur Landing Circle, Suite 275	
4	Larkspur, CA 94939 Tel: 415-477-6700	
5	Fax: 415-477-6710	
6	Mark C. Gardy	
7	mgardy@gardylaw.com James S. Notis	
8	jnotis@gardylaw.com Jennifer Sarnelli (SBN 242510)	
9	jsarnelli@gardylaw.com GARDY & NOTIS, LLP	
10	Tower 56 126 East 56th Street, 8th floor	
11	New York, NY 10022 Tel: 212-905-0509	
	Fax: 212-905-0508	
12 13	Counsel for Plaintiff Paul Ansfield	
14	UNITED STATES DI	STRICT COURT
15	NORTHERN DISTRICT SAN FRANCISC	OF CALIFORNIA
10		O DI VISION
16	PAUL ANSFIELD, Individually and	Case No. 3:14-cv-2500-VC
	PAUL ANSFIELD, Individually and On Behalf of All Others Similarly	Case No. 3:14-cv-2500-VC
16	PAUL ANSFIELD, Individually and	
16 17	PAUL ANSFIELD, Individually and On Behalf of All Others Similarly Situated,	Case No. 3:14-cv-2500-VC STIPULATION AND (PROPOSED) ORDER
16 17 18	PAUL ANSFIELD, Individually and On Behalf of All Others Similarly Situated, Plaintiff,	Case No. 3:14-cv-2500-VC STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED] ORDER RELATING ACTIONS
16 17 18 19	PAUL ANSFIELD, Individually and On Behalf of All Others Similarly Situated, Plaintiff, v. INFOBLOX INC., ROBERT D. THOMAS, and REMO E. CANESSA,	Case No. 3:14-cv-2500-VC STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED] ORDER RELATING ACTIONS
16 17 18 19 20	PAUL ANSFIELD, Individually and On Behalf of All Others Similarly Situated, Plaintiff, v. INFOBLOX INC., ROBERT D.	Case No. 3:14-cv-2500-VC STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED] ORDER RELATING ACTIONS
16 17 18 19 20 21	PAUL ANSFIELD, Individually and On Behalf of All Others Similarly Situated, Plaintiff, v. INFOBLOX INC., ROBERT D. THOMAS, and REMO E. CANESSA,	Case No. 3:14-cv-2500-VC STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED] ORDER RELATING ACTIONS
116 117 118 119 220 221 222	PAUL ANSFIELD, Individually and On Behalf of All Others Similarly Situated, Plaintiff, v. INFOBLOX INC., ROBERT D. THOMAS, and REMO E. CANESSA, Defendants.	Case No. 3:14-cv-2500-VC STIPULATION AND PROPOSED ORDER RELATING ACTIONS Date Filed: May 30, 2014
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	PAUL ANSFIELD, Individually and On Behalf of All Others Similarly Situated, Plaintiff, v. INFOBLOX INC., ROBERT D. THOMAS, and REMO E. CANESSA,	Case No. 3:14-cv-2500-VC STIPULATION AND PROPOSED ORDER RELATING ACTIONS Date Filed: May 30, 2014
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	PAUL ANSFIELD, Individually and On Behalf of All Others Similarly Situated, Plaintiff, v. INFOBLOX INC., ROBERT D. THOMAS, and REMO E. CANESSA, Defendants.	Case No. 3:14-cv-2500-VC STIPULATION AND PROPOSED ORDER RELATING ACTIONS Date Filed: May 30, 2014
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26	PAUL ANSFIELD, Individually and On Behalf of All Others Similarly Situated, Plaintiff, v. INFOBLOX INC., ROBERT D. THOMAS, and REMO E. CANESSA, Defendants.	Case No. 3:14-cv-2500-VC STIPULATION AND PROPOSED ORDER RELATING ACTIONS Date Filed: May 30, 2014
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27	PAUL ANSFIELD, Individually and On Behalf of All Others Similarly Situated, Plaintiff, v. INFOBLOX INC., ROBERT D. THOMAS, and REMO E. CANESSA, Defendants.	Case No. 3:14-cv-2500-VC STIPULATION AND PROPOSED ORDER RELATING ACTIONS Date Filed: May 30, 2014
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26	PAUL ANSFIELD, Individually and On Behalf of All Others Similarly Situated, Plaintiff, v. INFOBLOX INC., ROBERT D. THOMAS, and REMO E. CANESSA, Defendants.	Case No. 3:14-cv-2500-VC STIPULATION AND PROPOSED ORDER RELATING ACTIONS Date Filed: May 30, 2014

1 2	DONNA L. ACHEY and LINDSAY E. DURHAM, Individually and on Behalf of All Others Similarly Situated	Case No. 5:14-cv-02644-BLF Date Filed: June 9, 2014
3	Plaintiffs,	Dute I fied. Julie 7, 2014
4	·	
5	v. INFOBLOX INC., ROBERT D.	
6	THOMAS, and REMO E. CANESSA,	
7	Defendants.	
8	CAEEDIN DEOAL Individually and on	Case No. 4:14-cv-02564-PJH
9	SAFEDIN BEQAJ, Individually and on Behalf of All Others Similarly Situated,	
10	Plaintiff,	Date Filed: June 4, 2014
10	v.	
12	INFOBLOX INC., ROBERT D. THOMAS, and REMO E. CANESSA,	
13	Defendants.	
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
	Stipulation and [Proposed] Order Relating A	Actions Case No. 3:14-cv-2500-VC

1	WHEREAS, between May 30, 2014 and June 9, 2014, the above-	
2	captioned actions ("Related Actions") were filed;	
3	WHEREAS, each action is a purported class action brought by, and on	
4	behalf of, the Infoblox Inc. public stockholders. Plaintiffs in all the Related	
5	Actions name the same defendants and allege similar claims of securities fraud	
6	pursuant to Sections 10(b) and 20(a) of the Securities Exchange Act of 1934 and	
7	Rule 10b-5 promulgated thereunder.	
8	WHEREAS, all parties to the Related Actions agree that these matters	
9	should be related before one Judge;	
10	WHEREAS, all parties to the Related Actions agree that the actions are	
11	likely to result in unduly burdensome duplication of labor and expense or	
12	conflicting results if the cases are conducted before different Judges;	
13	THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED by and between the	
14	Parties to these Related Actions, by and through their respective undersigned	
15	counsel, and agreed that the above captioned actions should be Related pursuant	
16	to Civil Local Rules 3-12, 7-11 and 7-12.	
17	IT IS SO STIPULATED.	
18	Respectfully Submitted By:	
19		
20	Dated: June 16, 2014 GARDY & NOTIS, LLP	
21	/* · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
22	s/ Jennifer Sarnelli Jennifer Sarnelli (SBN 242510)	
23	<u>jsarnelli@gardylaw.com</u> Mark C. Gardy	
24	mgardy@gardylaw.com James S. Notis	
25	<u>inotis@gardylaw.com</u> Tower 56	
26	126 East 56th Street, 8th floor New York, NY 10022	
27	Tel: 212-905-0509 Fax: 212-905-0508	

1 2	Robert S. Green (SBN 136183) rsg@classcounsel.com Leseley E. Weaver (SBN 191305)
3	lew@classcounsel.com GREEN & NOBLIN, P.C. 700 Lorksonn Londing Circle Suite 275
4	700 Larkspur Landing Circle, Suite 275 Larkspur, CA 94939
5	Tel: 415-477-6700 Fax: 415-477-6710
6	Counsel for Plaintiff Ansfield
7	Counsel for I tuning Integrate
8	GLANCY BINKOW & GOLDBERG LLP
9	By: <u>s/Robert V. Prongay</u> Lionel Z. Glancy
10	Michael M. Goldberg Robert V. Prongay
11	1925 Century Park East, Suite 2100
12	Los Angeles, California 90067 Telephone: (310) 201-9150 Facsimile: (310) 201-9160
13	Email: info@glancylaw.com
14	POMERANTZ LLP Jeremy A. Lieberman
15	Francis P. McConville 600 Third Avenue, 20th Floor
16	New York, New York 10016 Telephone: 212-661-1100
17	Facsimile: 212-661-8665
18	POMERANTZ LLP
19	Patrick V. Dahlstrom 10 South La Salle Street, Suite 3505
20	Chicago, Illinois 60603 Telephone: (312) 377-1181
21	BRONSTEIN GEWIRTZ & GROSSMAN LLP
22	Peretz Bronstein 60 E. 42nd Street, Suite 4600
23	New York, New York 10165 Telephone: 212-697-6484
24	Counsel for Plaintiffs
25	Donna L. Achey and Lindsay E. Durham
26	
27	
28	

1	Dated: June 16, 2014	GLANCY BINKOW & GOLDBERG LLP
2		By: s/Robert V. Prongay
3		Lionel Z. Glancy Michael Goldberg Robert V. Prongay
4		Elaine Chang 1925 Century Park East, Suite 2100
5		1925 Century Park East, Suite 2100 Los Angeles, CA 90067 Telephone: (310) 201-9150 Facsimile: (310) 201-9160
6		LAW OFFICES OF HOWARD G. SMITH
7 8		Howard G. Smith 3070 Bristol Pike, Suite 112 Bensalem, PA 19020
9		Telephone: (215) 638-4847 Facsimile: (215) 638-4867
10		Counsel for Plaintiff Safedin Beqaj
11	Dated: June 16, 2014	FENWICK & WEST LLP
12		By: /s/ Kevin P. Muck
13		Kevin P. Muck (CSB No. 120918) kmuck@fenwick.com
14		Catherine D. Kevane (CSB No. 215501) ckevane@fenwick.com
15		Alexis I. Caloza (CSB No. 278804) acaloza@fenwick.com
16		FENWICK & WEST LLP 555 California Street, 12th Floor
17		San Francisco, CA 94104 Telephone: 415.875.2300 Facsimile: 415.281.1350
18 19		Counsel for Defendants Infoblox Inc., Robert D. Thomas and Remo E. Canessa
20		Thomas and Items 21 canessa
21		
22		ROPOSED ORDER
23	•	n of the parties, and good cause appearing, the
24	Court hereby approves the Stip	ulation. IT IS SO ORDERED ES DISTRICT
25	DATED: <u>June 26, 2</u> 014 H	
26		IT IS SO ORDERED
27		5 17 18 30
28		Judge Vince Chhabria
	Stipulation and [Proposed] Ord	

LOCAL RULE 5-1(i)(3) CERTIFICATION

I Jennifer Sarnelli hereby attest that concurrence in the filing of the document has been obtained from each of the other signatories to this Stipulation and [Proposed] Order to Relate Cases.

GARDY & NOTIS, LLP

s/ Jennifer Sarnelli
Jennifer Sarnelli (SBN 242510)
jsarnelli@gardylaw.com
Mark C. Gardy
mgardy@gardylaw.com
James S. Notis
jnotis@gardylaw.com
Tower 56
126 East 56th Street, 8th floor
New York, NY 10022
Tel: 212-905-0509

Fax: 212-905-0508

- 4 -