

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

United States District Court  
Northern District of California

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

ANNETTE DEVINE,  
Plaintiff,  
v.  
HEALTHSTAR CLINICAL EDUCATION  
SOLUTIONS,  
Defendant.

Case No. [15-cv-06034-JSC](#)

**PRETRIAL ORDER**

Following the Case Management Conference held on March 24, 2016, IT IS ORDERED  
THAT:

**I. CASE MANAGEMENT SCHEDULE**

- Fact Discovery Cut-Off: September 30, 2016
- Dispositive Motions Deadline: October 28, 2016
- Expert Witness Disclosures: October 31, 2016
- Oppositions to Dispositive Motions Due By: November 18, 2016
- Replies Due By: December 1, 2016
- Deadline for Hearing Dispositive Motions: December 15, 2016
- Rebuttal Expert Witness Disclosures: December 30, 2016
- Expert Discovery Cutoff: January 31, 2017

The Court refers the parties to the Court-sponsored ADR program for mediation to occur within the next 4 months. In addition, a further Case Management Conference is scheduled for August 25, 2016 at 1:30 p.m. The parties shall submit a joint case management conference statement one week in advance.

1     **II.     TRIAL DATE**

2             A.     Jury trial will begin on May 1, 2017, at 8:30 a.m., in Courtroom F, 15th Floor, U.S.  
3     District Court, 450 Golden Gate, San Francisco, California.

4             B.     The Court is expecting the length of the trial to not exceed 7 court days.

5     **III.    PRETRIAL CONFERENCE**

6             A Final Pretrial Conference shall be held on April 13, 2017, at 2:00 p.m., in Courtroom F,  
7     15th Floor. Lead trial counsel for each party shall attend.

8             A.     At least seven days prior to date of the Final Pretrial Conference the parties shall do  
9     the following:

10            1.     In lieu of preparing a Joint Pretrial Conference Statement, the parties shall  
11     meet and confer in person, and then prepare and file a jointly signed Proposed Final Pretrial Order  
12     that contains: (a) a brief description of the substance of claims and defenses which remain to be  
13     decided; (b) a statement of all relief sought; (c) all stipulated facts; (d) a joint exhibit list in  
14     numerical order, including a brief description of the exhibit and Bates numbers, a blank column  
15     for when it will be offered into evidence, a blank column for when it may be received into  
16     evidence, and a blank column for any limitations on its use; and (e) each party’s separate witness  
17     list for its case-in-chief witnesses (including those appearing by deposition), including, for all such  
18     witnesses (other than party plaintiffs or defendants), a short statement of the substance of his/her  
19     testimony and, separately, what, if any, non-cumulative testimony the witness will offer. For each  
20     witness, state an hour/minute time estimate for the direct examination (only). Items (d) and (e)  
21     should be submitted as appendices to the proposed order. The proposed order should also state  
22     which issues, if any, are for the Court to decide, rather than the jury.

23            2.     File a joint set of proposed instructions on substantive issues of law  
24     arranged in a logical sequence. If undisputed, an instruction shall be identified as “Stipulated  
25     Instruction No. \_\_\_\_ Re \_\_\_\_\_,” with the blanks filled in as appropriate. If disputed, each  
26     version of the instruction shall be inserted together, back to back, in their logical place in the  
27     overall sequence. Each such disputed instruction shall be identified as, for example, “Disputed  
28     Instruction No. \_\_\_\_ Re \_\_\_\_\_ Offered by \_\_\_\_\_,” with the blanks filled

1 in as appropriate. All disputed versions of the same basic instruction shall bear the same number.  
2 Any modifications to a form instruction must be plainly identified. If a party does not have a  
3 counter version and simply contends that no such instruction in any version should be given, then  
4 that party should so state (and explain why) on a separate page inserted in lieu of an alternate  
5 version. With respect to form preliminary instructions, general instructions, or concluding  
6 instructions, please simply cite to the numbers of the requested instructions in the current edition  
7 of the Ninth Circuit Model Jury Instructions. Other than citing the numbers, the parties shall not  
8 include preliminary, general, or concluding instructions in the packet.

9           3.       File a separate memorandum of law in support of each party’s disputed  
10 instructions, if any, organized by instruction number.

11           4.       File a joint set of proposed voir dire questions supplemented as necessary  
12 by separate requests.

13           5.       File trial briefs on any controlling issues of law.

14           6.       File proposed verdict forms, joint or separate.

15           7.       File and serve any objections to exhibits.

16           8.       File a joint simplified Statement of the Case to be read to the jury during  
17 voir dire as part of the proposed jury instructions. Unless the case is extremely complex, this  
18 statement should not exceed one page.

19           B.       Any motions in limine shall be submitted as follows: at least twenty (20) calendar  
20 days before the conference, the moving party shall serve, but not file, the opening brief. At least  
21 ten (10) calendar days before the conference, the responding party shall serve the opposition.  
22 There will be no reply. When the oppositions are received, the moving party should collate the  
23 motion and the opposition together, back-to-back, and then file the paired sets at least seven (7)  
24 calendar days before the conference. Each motion should be presented in a separate memorandum  
25 and properly identified, for example, “Plaintiff’s Motion in Limine No. 1 to Exclude . . . .” Each  
26 party is limited to bringing five motions in limine. The parties are encouraged to stipulate where  
27 possible, for example, as to the exclusion of witnesses from the courtroom. Each motion should  
28 address a single, separate topic, and contain no more than seven pages of briefing per side.

1 C. Hard-copy courtesy copies of the above documents shall be delivered by NOON  
2 the day after filing. The Joint Proposed Final Pretrial Order, jury instructions, and verdict form  
3 shall be submitted via e-mail as attachments to JSCpo@cand.uscourts.gov. The Court requests that  
4 all hard-copy submissions be three-hole-punched.

5 **IV. PRETRIAL ARRANGEMENTS**

6 A. Should a daily transcript and/or real-time reporting be desired, the parties shall  
7 make arrangements with Debra Campbell, Supervisor of the Court Reporting Services, at  
8 (415) 522-2079, at least ten (10) calendar days prior to the trial date.

9 B. During trial, counsel may wish to use overhead projectors, laser-disk/computer  
10 graphics, poster blow-ups, models, or specimens of devices. Equipment should be shared by all  
11 counsel to the maximum extent possible. The Court provides no equipment other than an easel.  
12 The United States Marshal requires a court order to allow equipment into the courthouse. For  
13 electronic equipment, parties should be prepared to maintain the equipment or have a technician  
14 handy at all times. The parties shall tape extension cords to the carpet for safety. The parties may  
15 work with the deputy clerk, Ada Means (415-522-2015), on all courtroom-layout issues.

16 **SCHEDULING**

17 Trial will be conducted from 8:30 a.m. to 2:30 or 3:00 p.m., depending on the availability  
18 of witnesses, Monday through Friday. Counsel must arrive by 8:15 a.m., or earlier as needed, for  
19 any matters to be heard out of the presence of the jury. The jury will be called at 8:30 a.m.

20 **THE JURY**

21 In civil cases, there are no alternate jurors and the jury is selected as follows:  
22 Eighteen to twenty jurors are called to fill the jury box and the row in front of the bar, and are  
23 given numbers (1 through 18). The remaining potential jurors will be seated in the public benches.  
24 Hardship excuses will usually be considered at this point. The Court will then ask questions of  
25 those in the box and in the front of the bar. Counsel may then conduct a limited voir dire.  
26 Challenges for cause will then be addressed out of the presence of the potential jurors. The Court  
27 will consider whether to fill in the seats of the stricken jurors. If so, questions will be asked of the  
28 additional jurors and cause motions as to them will be considered. After a short recess, each side

1 may exercise its allotment of peremptory challenges out of the presence of the potential jurors.  
2 The eight (or such other size as will constitute the jury) surviving the challenge process with the  
3 lowest numbers become the final jury. For example, if the plaintiff strikes 1, 5, and 7 and the  
4 defendant strikes 2, 4, and 9, then 3, 6, 8, 10, 11, 12, 13, and 14 become the final jury. If more (or  
5 fewer) than eight jurors are to be seated, then the starting number will be adjusted. So too if more  
6 than a total of six peremptories are allowed. Once the jury selection is completed, the jurors'  
7 names will be read again and they will be seated in the jury box and sworn. The Court may alter  
8 this procedure in its discretion and after consultation with the parties.

9 **WITNESSES**

10 At the close of each trial day, all counsel shall exchange a list of witnesses for the  
11 next two full court days and the exhibits that will be used during direct examination (other than  
12 for impeachment of an adverse witness). Within 24 hours of such notice, all other counsel shall  
13 provide any objections to such exhibits and shall provide a list of all exhibits to be used with the  
14 same witness on cross-examination (other than for impeachment). The first notice shall be  
15 exchanged prior to the first day of trial. All such notices shall be provided in writing.

16 **EXHIBITS**

17 A. Prior to the Final Pretrial Conference, counsel must meet and confer in person to  
18 consider all exhibit numbers and objections and to eliminate duplicate exhibits and confusion over  
19 the precise exhibit.

20 B. Use numbers only, not letters, for exhibits, preferably the same numbers as were  
21 used in depositions. Blocks of numbers should be assigned to fit the need of the case (e.g.,  
22 Plaintiff has 1 to 100, Defendant A has 101 to 200, Defendant B has 201 to 300, etc.). A single  
23 exhibit should be marked only once. If the plaintiff has marked an exhibit, then the defendant  
24 should not re-mark the exact document with another number. Different versions of the same  
25 document, e.g., a copy with additional handwriting, must be treated as different exhibits with  
26 different numbers. To avoid any party claiming "ownership" of an exhibit, all exhibits shall be  
27 marked and referred to as "Trial Exhibit No. \_\_\_\_\_," not as "Plaintiff's Exhibit" or "Defendant's  
28 Exhibit."

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

C. The exhibit tag shall be in the following form:

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
<b>TRIAL EXHIBIT 100</b>
Case No. _____
Date Entered _____
By _____ Deputy Clerk

Counsel preferably will make the tag up in a color that will stand out (yet still allow for photocopying), but that is not essential. Place the tag on or near the lower right-hand corner or, if a photograph, on the back. Counsel should fill in the tag but leave the last two spaces blank. The parties must jointly prepare a single set of all trial exhibits that will be the official record set to be used with the witnesses and on appeal. Each exhibit must be tagged, three-hole-punched, separated with a label divider identifying the exhibit number, and placed in 3-ring binders. Spine labels should indicate the numbers of the exhibits that are in the binders. Each set of exhibit binders should be marked as “Original.” Deposit the exhibits with the deputy clerk seven (7) days before the Pretrial Conference.

D. Counsel must consult with each other and with the deputy clerk at the end of each trial day and compare notes as to which exhibits are in evidence and any limitations thereon. If there are any differences, counsel should bring them promptly to the Court’s attention.

E. In addition to the official record exhibits, three sets of bench binders containing copies of the exhibits must be provided to the Court seven (7) days before the Pretrial Conference, one should be marked as “Chambers Copies”, and the other two as “Clerk’s Copies.” Each exhibit must be separated with a label divider identifying the exhibit number. (An exhibit tag is unnecessary for the bench set.) Spine labels should indicate the numbers of the exhibits that are in the binders.

F. Before the closing arguments, counsel must confer with the deputy clerk to make

1 sure the exhibits in evidence are in good order.

2 G. Exhibit notebooks for the jury will not be permitted without prior permission from  
3 the Court. Publication must be by poster blow-up, overhead projection, or such other method as is  
4 allowed in the circumstances. It is permissible to highlight, circle or underscore in the  
5 enlargements as long as it is clear that it was not on the original.

6 **CHARGING CONFERENCE**

7 As the trial progresses and the evidence is heard, the Court will fashion a comprehensive  
8 set of jury instructions to cover all issues actually being tried. Prior to the close of the evidence,  
9 the Court will provide a draft final charge to the parties. After a reasonable period for review, one  
10 or more charging conferences will be held at which each party may object to any passage, ask for  
11 modifications, or ask for additions. Any instruction request must be renewed specifically at the  
12 conference or it will be deemed waived, whether or not it was requested prior to trial. If, however,  
13 a party still wishes to request an omitted instruction after reviewing the Court's draft, then it must  
14 affirmatively re-request it at the charging conference in order to give the Court a fair opportunity  
15 to correct any error. Otherwise, as stated, the request will be deemed abandoned or waived.

16 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

17 Dated: March 24, 2016

18   
19 \_\_\_\_\_  
20 JACQUELINE SCOTT CORLEY  
21 United States Magistrate Judge  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28