

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

United States District Court
Northern District of California

Michael A. Hood (SBN 71258)
Erin W. Kendrella (SBN 273504)
JACKSON LEWIS P.C.
200 Spectrum Center Drive, Suite 500
Irvine, California 92618
Telephone: (949) 885-1360
Facsimile: (949) 885-1380
Email: michael.hood@jacksonlewis.com
erin.kendrella@jacksonlewis.com

Attorneys for Defendant
PERDUE FOODS LLC

[Additional Counsel on the Next Page]

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

BARBARA PERRY,

Plaintiff,

vs.

PERDUE FOODS, LLC and
COLEMAN NATURAL FOODS,
LLC,

Defendants.

CASE NO.: 3:17-cv-03502-JST
18-cv-02664-JST

Judge Jon S. Tigar
Courtroom 9 – 19th Floor

Mag. Judge Jacqueline Scott Corley
Courtroom F – 15th Floor

**STIPULATED PROTECTIVE
ORDER**

Complaint filed: June 16, 2017
Trial date: June 10, 2019

1 Hunter Pyle, SBN 191125
2 Tanya P. Tambling, SBN 262979
3 HUNTER PYLE LAW
4 428 Thirteenth Street, 11th Floor
5 Oakland, California 94612
6 Telephone: (510) 444-4400
7 Facsimile: (510) 444-4410
8 Email: hunter@hunterpylelaw.com,
9 ttambling@hunterpylelaw..com

6 Alex G. Tovarian, SBN 264547
7 LAW OFFICES OF ALEKSEY G. TOVARIAN
8 50 California Street, Ste. 3325
9 San Francisco, CA 94111
10 Telephone: (415) 984-9990
11 Facsimile: (415) 520-5830
12 Email: tovarianlaw@gmail.com

10 Attorneys for Plaintiff
11 BARBARA PERRY

12
13 **STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER**

14 **1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS**

15 Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production
16 of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from
17 public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation
18 may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court
19 to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this
20 Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery
21 and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the
22 limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the
23 applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section
24 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file
25 confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures
26 that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks
27 permission from the court to file material under seal.

28 ///

1 2.10 Party: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors,
2 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their
3 support staffs).

4 2.11 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
5 Discovery Material in this action.

6 2.12 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support
7 services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
8 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
9 and their employees and subcontractors.

10 2.13 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
11 designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

12 2.14 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material
13 from a Producing Party.

14 **3. SCOPE**

15 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only
16 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted
17 from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of
18 Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties
19 or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material. However, the protections
20 conferred by this Stipulation and Order do not cover the following information: (a)
21 any information that is in the public domain at the time of disclosure to a Receiving
22 Party or becomes part of the public domain after its disclosure to a Receiving Party as
23 a result of publication not involving a violation of this Order, including becoming part
24 of the public record through trial or otherwise; and (b) any information known to the
25 Receiving Party prior to the disclosure or obtained by the Receiving Party after the
26 disclosure from a source who obtained the information lawfully and under no
27 obligation of confidentiality to the Designating Party. Any use of Protected Material at
28 trial shall be governed by a separate agreement or order.

1 **4. DURATION**

2 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations
3 imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees
4 otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be
5 deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this action, with or
6 without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and exhaustion
7 of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this action, including the time
8 limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to
9 applicable law.

10 **5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

11 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

12 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this
13 Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies
14 under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for protection
15 only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that
16 qualify – so that other portions of the material, documents, items, or communications
17 for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of
18 this Order.

19 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations
20 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper
21 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber or retard the case development process or to
22 impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) expose the Designating
23 Party to sanctions.

24 If it comes to a Designating Party’s attention that information or items that it
25 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
26 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

27 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in
28 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise

1 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection
2 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or
3 produced.

4 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

5 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic
6 documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial
7 proceedings), that the Producing Party affix the legend “CONFIDENTIAL” to each
8 page that contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a
9 page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the
10 protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

11 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents or materials available for
12 inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has
13 indicated which material it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and
14 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be
15 deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has identified the documents
16 it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents,
17 or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing the
18 specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the “CONFIDENTIAL” legend
19 to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the
20 material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly
21 identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the
22 margins).

23 (b) for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial proceedings,
24 that the Designating Party identify on the record, before the close of the deposition,
25 hearing, or other proceeding, all protected testimony.

26 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for
27 any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the
28 exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the

1 legend “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information or item
2 warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the
3 protected portion(s).

4 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
5 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the
6 Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material.
7 Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable
8 efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this
9 Order.

10 **6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS**

11 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
12 designation of confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating
13 Party’s confidentiality designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial
14 unfairness, unnecessary economic burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the
15 litigation, a Party does not waive its right to challenge a confidentiality designation by
16 electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the original designation is disclosed.

17 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute
18 resolution process by providing written notice of each designation it is challenging
19 and describing the basis for each challenge. To avoid ambiguity as to whether a
20 challenge has been made, the written notice must recite that the challenge to
21 confidentiality is being made in accordance with this specific paragraph of the
22 Protective Order. The parties shall attempt to resolve each challenge in good faith and
23 must begin the process by conferring directly (in voice to voice dialogue; other forms
24 of communication are not sufficient) within 14 days of the date of service of notice. In
25 conferring, the Challenging Party must explain the basis for its belief that the
26 confidentiality designation was not proper and must give the Designating Party an
27 opportunity to review the designated material, to reconsider the circumstances, and, if
28 no change in designation is offered, to explain the basis for the chosen designation. A

1 Challenging Party may proceed to the next stage of the challenge process only if it has
2 engaged in this meet and confer process first or establishes that the Designating Party
3 is unwilling to participate in the meet and confer process in a timely manner.

4 6.3 Judicial Intervention. If the Parties cannot resolve a challenge without
5 court intervention, the Designating Party shall file and serve a motion to retain
6 confidentiality under Civil Local Rule 7 (and in compliance with Civil Local Rule 79-
7 5, if applicable) within 21 days of the initial notice of challenge or within 14 days of
8 the parties agreeing that the meet and confer process will not resolve their dispute,
9 whichever is earlier. Each such motion must be accompanied by a competent
10 declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet and confer
11 requirements imposed in the preceding paragraph. Failure by the Designating Party to
12 make such a motion including the required declaration within 21 days (or 14 days, if
13 applicable) shall automatically waive the confidentiality designation for each
14 challenged designation. In addition, the Challenging Party may file a motion
15 challenging a confidentiality designation at any time if there is good cause for doing
16 so, including a challenge to the designation of a deposition transcript or any portions
17 thereof. Any motion brought pursuant to this provision must be accompanied by a
18 competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet and
19 confer requirements imposed by the preceding paragraph.

20 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the
21 Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose
22 (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may
23 expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived
24 the confidentiality designation by failing to file a motion to retain confidentiality as
25 described above, all parties shall continue to afford the material in question the level
26 of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the
27 court rules on the challenge.

28 **7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

1 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
2 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this case
3 only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Such Protected
4 Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions
5 described in this Order. When the litigation has been terminated, a Receiving Party
6 must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

7 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a
8 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
9 authorized under this Order.

10 7.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless
11 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a
12 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated “CONFIDENTIAL”
13 only to:

14 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this action, as well
15 as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to
16 disclose the information for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment
17 and Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A;

18 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the
19 Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and
20 who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

21 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom
22 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the
23 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

24 (d) the court and its personnel;

25 (e) court reporters and their staff, professional jury or trial consultants,
26 mock jurors, and Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary
27 for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be
28 Bound” (Exhibit A);

1 (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is
2 reasonably necessary and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to
3 Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered
4 by the court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that
5 reveal Protected Material must be separately bound by the court reporter and may not
6 be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order.

7 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a
8 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

9 **8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED**
10 **IN OTHER LITIGATION**

11 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation
12 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as
13 “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

14 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall
15 include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

16 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to
17 issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or
18 order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this
19 Stipulated Protective Order; and

20 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued
21 by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

22 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with
23 the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this
24 action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the
25 subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s
26 permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking
27 protection in that court of its confidential material – and nothing in these provisions
28 should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this action to

1 disobey a lawful directive from another court.

2 **9. A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE**
3 **PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION**

4 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a
5 Non-Party in this action and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL." Such information
6 produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the
7 remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be
8 construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

9 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to
10 produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is
11 subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's
12 confidential information, then the Party shall:

13 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party
14 that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement
15 with a Non-Party;

16 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated
17 Protective Order in this litigation, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably
18 specific description of the information requested; and

19 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-
20 Party.

21 (c) If the Non-Party fails to object or seek a protective order from this court
22 within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving
23 Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the
24 discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving
25 Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to
26 the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court.
27 Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense
28 of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

1 **10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

2 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed
3 Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this
4 Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in
5 writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts
6 to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or
7 persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order,
8 and (d) request such person or persons to execute the “Acknowledgment and
9 Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

10 **11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE**
11 **PROTECTED MATERIAL**

12 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain
13 inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection,
14 the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil
15 Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure
16 may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior
17 privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the
18 parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or
19 information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the
20 parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to
21 the court.

22 **12. MISCELLANEOUS**

23 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any
24 person to seek its modification by the court in the future.

25 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this
26 Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to
27 disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this
28 Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any

1 ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

2 12.3 Filing Protected Material. Without written permission from the
3 Designating Party or a court order secured after appropriate notice to all interested
4 persons, a Party may not file in the public record in this action any Protected Material.
5 A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material must comply with Civil
6 Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court
7 order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at issue. Pursuant to
8 Civil Local Rule 79-5, a sealing order will issue only upon a request establishing that
9 the Protected Material at issue is privileged, protectable as a trade secret, or otherwise
10 entitled to protection under the law. If a Receiving Party's request to file Protected
11 Material under seal pursuant to Civil Local Rule 79-5(d) is denied by the court, then
12 the Receiving Party may file the information in the public record pursuant to Civil
13 Local Rule 79-5(e) unless otherwise instructed by the court.

14 **13. FINAL DISPOSITION**

15 Within 60 days after the final disposition of this action, as defined in paragraph
16 4, each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or
17 destroy such material. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes
18 all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or
19 capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or
20 destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing
21 Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day
22 deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material
23 that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not
24 retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format
25 reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this
26 provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion
27 papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence,
28 deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and

1 expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such
2 archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this
3 Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

4

5 **IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.**

6

HUNTER PYLE LAW
LAW OFFICES OF
ALEKSEY G. TOVARIAN

7

8

9

DATED: December 14, 2018 By: /s/ Tanya P. Tambling
Hunter Pyle
Tanya P. Tambling
Alex G. Tovarian

10

11

Attorneys for Plaintiff
BARBARA PERRY

12

13

JACKSON LEWIS P.C.

14

15

DATED: December 14, 2018 By: /s/ Erin W. Kendrella
Michael A. Hood, Esq.
Erin W. Kendrella, Esq.

16

17

Attorneys for Defendant
PERDUE FOODS LLC dba Coleman
Natural Foods (erroneously named a
Coleman Natural Foods, LLC)

18

19

20

21 PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.

22

23

DATED: December 18, 2018


Hon. Jon S. Tigar
United States District Judge

24

25

26

27

28

1 EXHIBIT A

2 ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

3 I, _____ [print or type full name], of
4 _____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that
5 I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was
6 issued by the United States District Court for the Northern District of California on
7 _____ [date] in the case of BARBARA PERRY v. PERDUE FOODS,
8 LLC and COLEMAN NATURAL FOODS, LLC, US. District Court Case No. 3:17-cv-
9 03502-JST. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated
10 Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could
11 expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise
12 that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this
13 Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the
14 provisions of this Order.

15 I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court
16 for the Northern District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this
17 Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after
18 termination of this action.

19 I hereby appoint _____ [print or type full name] of
20 _____ [print or type full address and
21 telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with
22 this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective
23 Order.

24
25 Date: _____

26 City and State where sworn and signed: _____

27 Printed name: _____

28 Signature: _____