

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
(OAKLAND DIVISION)**

FATEMAH AZZIZIAN, <i>et al.</i> ,	)	CA Civil No. 4:03 C 03359 SBA
Plaintiffs,	)	<b><u>CLASS ACTION</u></b>
v.	)	<b><u>SPECIAL MASTER'S REPORT AND</u></b>
FEDERATED DEPARTMENT	)	<b><u>RECOMMENDATION</u></b>
STORES, INC.; <i>et al.</i> ,	)	
Defendants.	)	

---

I.

INTRODUCTION

Judge Charles B. Renfrew was appointed Special Master in this case by this Court's Order dated May 25, 2004, pursuant to Rules 23(h)(4), 53, and 54(d)(2)(D) of the FRCP, as revised by this Court's Order of June 17, 2004, pursuant to Rule 53 (b)(4) of the FRCP.

1 On March 30, 2005, this Court entered a Final Judgment approving the settlement of this  
2 case, and delegating to the Special Master the authority to conduct further proceedings with  
3 regard to the administration of the settlement.

4 Under the terms of the Statement of the Parties, the Coordinated Objectors and Objecting  
5 States Concerning the Adequacy of The Proposed Settlement and Plan of Distribution, dated  
6 March 8, 2005 (hereinafter the "Statement"), a copy of which is attached hereto as Exhibit A, a  
7 Product Review Committee (hereinafter the "PRC") was created, and the Special Master and the  
8 PRC were each given certain responsibilities in connection with the product distribution to be  
9 conducted under the terms of the settlement of this case.<sup>1</sup> The specific responsibilities of the  
10 Special Master and the PRC under the provisions of the Statement are the following: (1) Review  
11 of the Products to be Distributed; (2) Review of the In-Store Notice; and (3) Review of the  
12 Month in Which the Distribution Will Take Place.

14 The Statement further provides that, "Pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 53, the Special Master  
15 will make a report, order or recommendation which the Court shall review pursuant to that rule."  
16 (Statement, ¶c) The following constitutes the Special Master's Report and Recommendation  
17 with respect to each of the above-mentioned responsibilities assigned to the Special Master and  
18 the PRC under the Statement.  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23

---

24 <sup>1</sup> The PRC consists of "three persons from among the counsel representing Class Plaintiffs,  
25 one counsel representing the state A.G.s, and one counsel representing the Coordinated  
26 Objectors. (Statement, ¶c)  
27  
28

II.

REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION

A. Review of the Products to Be Distributed

The Statement provides that the PRC shall review the products to be distributed by Defendants “to ensure that the [products] are consistent, in value, quality and desirability, with the products that heretofore have been presented to the Special Master and the Court in connection with the settlement approval process, and with the terms of the Settlement Agreement.” (Statement, ¶c)

The PRC held three meetings, on January 6, 2008, March 19, 2008 and October 2, 2008, respectively, attended by members of the PRC,<sup>2</sup> the Special Master and counsel for the Defendants, at which the products that the various Manufacturer Defendants proposed to include in the product distribution were examined. The Manufacturer Defendants also furnished to the Special Master and the PRC information demonstrating that the total retail value of the products being included in the product distribution is \$175,000,000, as specified in the Settlement Agreement. Pursuant to Revised Exhibit C to the Settlement Agreement, ¶11, following the product distribution, Defendants will provide Certifications that appropriate product was supplied by the Manufacturer Defendants and was distributed or otherwise properly disposed of by the Department Store Defendants. Actual samples of each of the proposed products and information about them were presented to the Special Master and the PRC, and representatives

---

<sup>2</sup> At the various PRC meetings conducted in this matter, the Class Plaintiffs representatives have been Francis Scarpulla, Michele Jackson and Tracy Kirkham; the counsel representing the state A.G.s has been Jennifer Kirk; and the counsel representing the Coordinated Objectors has been Mitchell Toups or his designee.

1 of the Manufacturer Defendants responded to many questions from the Special Master and  
2 members of the PRC concerning the value, quality and desirability of the products.

3 The specific products reviewed and ultimately approved by the Special Master and the  
4 PRC are as follows:

5 Boucheron (USA) Ltd.:  
6 Femme Eau de Toilette (1 ounce/30 ml)

7 Chanel, Inc.:  
8 Coco Mademoiselle body lotion (3.4 fluid oz)

9 Christian Dior Perfumes, Inc.:  
10 J'Adore Eau de Parfum (15 ml)

11 Clarins U.S.A., Inc. (customers will have a choice of ONE of two products, while  
12 supplies last):

13 Clarins Energizing Morning Cream (30 ml)

14 OR

15 Clarins Beauty Flash Bomb (30 ml)

16 Conopco, Inc. (distributed by Coty, Inc. on behalf of Conopco, Inc.) (customers  
17 will have a choice of ONE of three products, while supplies last):

18 Calvin Klein Euphoria Bath and Shower Crème (6.7 oz)

19 OR

20 Vera Wang Princess Body Polish (5 oz)

21 OR

22 Lovely Sarah Jessica Parker Shower Gel (6.7 oz)

23 The Estée Lauder Companies Inc. (customers will have a choice of ONE of two  
24 products, while supplies last):

25 Estée Lauder Advanced Night Repair (15 ml/0.5 oz)

26 OR

27 Clinique Moisture Surge (30 ml/1 oz)

28 Guerlain, Inc.:

My Insolence Eau de Toilette (15 ml)

1 L'Oréal USA, Inc. (formerly known as Cosmair, Inc.) (customers will have a  
2 choice of ONE of eight products, while supplies last):

3 Lancôme UV Expert 20

4 OR

5 Lancôme Cils Design Pro Mascara

6 OR

7 Lancôme Fatale Mascara

8 OR

9 Lancôme Courbe Virtuose Mascara

10 OR

11 Lancôme Primordial Skin Defense OR

12 OR

13 Ralph Lauren Romance Shower Gel (6.7 oz.) OR

14 OR

15 Giorgio Armani ACM Shower Gel (6.7 oz)

16 OR

17 Lancôme Hypnôse Shower Gel

18 Parfums Givenchy, Inc.:

19 Very Irresistible Givenchy Eau de Toilette (15 ml)

20  
21 Based upon their review and examination of the above products, both the members of the  
22 PRC and the Special Master unanimously concluded that the above-listed products are consistent  
23 in value, quality and desirability with the products that previously had been presented to the  
24 Special Master and the Court in connection with this settlement approval process, and with the  
25  
26  
27

1 terms of the Settlement Agreement in this case, and should be approved for use in the product  
2 distribution.

3 Thus, the Special Master hereby reports that the above-described products have been  
4 approved for use in the distribution, and recommends that the foregoing be approved by the  
5 Court.

6 B. Review of the In-Store Notice

7 The Statement provides that there shall be an in-store notice of the distribution, which  
8 shall be consistent with the notice to be published in fifty newspapers across the country  
9 immediately prior to the distribution (referred to as the “back-end” notice), and which shall  
10 include the limit of one product per customer. The in-store notice is to be displayed at prominent  
11 places in the cosmetics departments of the stores participating in the distribution. The Statement  
12 provides that “the contents of the in-store notice and the period during which it will be displayed  
13 shall be submitted by Defendants to the Special Master for approval and the . . .PRC. . . for  
14 comment at least 90 days prior to the commencement of the distribution.” (Statement, ¶b)  
15

16 On October 2, 2008,<sup>3</sup> a meeting was held among members of the PRC, the Special  
17 Master, and representatives of Defendants, at which Defendants submitted the content of the in-  
18 store notice and the period during which it would be displayed, for comment by the PRC and for  
19 approval for the Special Master.  
20

21 There was extensive discussion of the content and format of the in-store notice,  
22 with numerous comments and suggestions made by members of the PRC. The Special Master  
23 invited one of the members of the PRC, the representative of the State AGs, to submit her  
24

25 <sup>3</sup> As provided in the Statement, ¶b, this was at least 90 days prior to the commencement of the  
26 distribution, which, as noted below, is scheduled to take place in January 2009.  
27

1 proposal for a modified version of the in-store notice, which, following the meeting, she did. In  
2 consultation with the Special Master, additional informal discussions were held between a  
3 representative of the Defendants and members of the PRC, which culminated in further  
4 modifications, and, ultimately, in an agreed-upon version of the in-store notice that was accepted  
5 by all concerned parties, namely, the Defendants, the representative of the State AGs and the  
6 other members of the PRC, as meeting the requirements of the Statement.

7           The Special Master, having reviewed the current version of the in-store notice, a  
8 copy of which is attached hereto as Exhibit B, and having considered all of the various  
9 comments and suggestions of the PRC and the fact that the PRC has accepted this current version  
10 of the in-store notice, concludes that the in-store notice meets the requirements of the Statement  
11 and hereby approves it for use in the product distribution.  
12

13           In addition, pursuant to the Statement, Defendants were also to submit to the PRC  
14 for comment, and to the Special Master for approval, the period during which the in-store notice  
15 will be displayed. (Statement, ¶b) At the October 2, 2008 PRC meeting at which the in-store  
16 notice was considered, Defendants stated that the in-store notice will be displayed beginning five  
17 days before the product distribution is scheduled to commence, and will remain on display for  
18 the duration of the distribution. The PRC approved that timing, and, having considered the  
19 various comments made by defendants and the members of PRC, the Special Master concludes  
20 that the timing of the display of the in-store notice, as proposed by Defendants, is appropriate.  
21

22           Thus, the Special Master hereby reports that it has approved the in-store notice,  
23 and that it has approved the display of the in-store notice beginning five days before the product  
24 distribution commences and continuing for the duration of the distribution, and recommends that  
25 the foregoing be approved by the Court.  
26

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

C. Review of the Month in Which the Distribution Will Take Place

The Statement provides that the Special Master "will be responsible for reviewing and approving the month of the year in which the distribution of [products] will actually take place." (Statement, ¶d). At the first PRC meeting, held on January 16, 2008, Defendants advised that they intend to commence the product distribution within the month of January 2009.

The selection of the month of January for the product distribution is consistent with Revised Exhibit C to the Settlement Agreement, which was approved as part of the settlement of this case, and which contemplated that the distribution will take place within the month of January. Both the parties and the PRC continue to consider that month to be acceptable. Accordingly, the Special Master concludes that the month of January is acceptable and appropriate for the distribution.

Thus, the Special Master hereby reports that it has approved January as the month within which the distribution will take place, and recommends that the foregoing be approved by the Court.

III.

CONCLUSION

For the reasons set forth above, the Special Master recommends that the Court approve and adopt this Report and Recommendation (1) approving the products to be distributed in the product distribution; (2) approving the in-store notice and the timing of its display; and (3) approving the month in which the product distribution will take place.

DECEMBER 5, 2008  
Dated November 2, 2008

LAW OFFICES OF CHARLES RENFREW

12/03/2008 08:20 4159291757  
12/03/2008 08:20:00 PM

UYA\_1

RENFREW

RAY'S DENROIER LLP

PAGE 12/30

Page 10

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

  
The Honorable Charles B. Renfrew  
Special Master

RECEIVED, ADOPTED AND SO ORDERED

  
Sandra Brown Armstrong  
United States District Judge

Dated: 12/18/08

# EXHIBIT A

1 GUIDO SAVERI (No. 22349)  
R. ALEXANDER SAVERI (No. 173102)  
2 LISA SAVERI (No. 112043)  
SAVERI & SAVERI, INC.  
3 111 Pine Street, Suite 1700  
San Francisco, California 94111-5619  
4 Telephone: (415) 217-6810

5 Attorneys for Class Plaintiffs

6 FREDERIC W. YERMAN (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
DAVID S. COPELAND (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
7 KARIN E. GARVEY (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
KAYE SCHOLER LLP  
8 425 Park Avenue  
New York, New York 10022  
9 Telephone: (212) 836-8000

10 Attorneys for Defendant The Estée Lauder Companies Inc.  
11 (Additional Counsel Listed on Signature Page)

12 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
13 FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
14 (OAKLAND DIVISION)

15 FATEMAH AZIZIAN, et al.

16 Plaintiffs,

17 vs.

18 FEDERATED DEPARTMENT STORES,  
19 INC., et al.

20 Defendants.

) Civil No. 3:03 CV-03359 SBA

) CLASS ACTION

) STATEMENT OF THE PARTIES, THE  
) COORDINATED OBJECTORS AND  
) OBJECTING STATES CONCERNING  
) THE ADEQUACY OF THE PROPOSED  
) SETTLEMENT AND PLAN OF  
) DISTRIBUTION

) Date: March 8, 2005  
) Time: 1:00 p.m.  
) Place: Courtroom 3, 3rd Floor  
) Judge: Hon. Sandra B. Armstrong

21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
51356.1

STATEMENT OF PARTIES AND OBJECTORS CONCERNING THE ADEQUACY OF THE PROPOSED  
SETTLEMENT AND PLAN OF DISTRIBUTION

EXHIBIT A

1 Pursuant to the Court's directive at the January 11, 2005 hearing, counsel for  
 2 the Coordinated Objectors,<sup>1</sup> the state Attorneys General<sup>2</sup> ("A.G.s"), the Class Plaintiffs<sup>3</sup> and  
 3 the Defendants<sup>4</sup> have met and hereby report to the Special Master the agreements they have  
 4 reached concerning the plan of distribution for the proposed settlement.

5 The parties and the undersigned objectors have agreed to modifications to the  
 6 plan of distribution that have resulted in their supporting final approval of the settlement,  
 7 including the plan of distribution. Their agreement is as follows:

8 a. The plan of distribution will be modified to permit each Class  
 9 member<sup>5</sup> to obtain only one DSCP<sup>6</sup> from the Manufacturer Defendant of his or her choice.

11 <sup>1</sup> The Coordinated Objectors, as referred to herein, are: Tamara Mixon, Robby G.  
 12 Fletcher, Aaron Jordan, Sharon A. Harris, Brenda Matthews, Mary Swift, Jennifer R. Hill,  
 13 Jeanine M. Schewenberg, Patricia Corbin, Jane Curtman-Schroeder, Shiela Horn, Lisa M.  
 14 Rice, Joyce Sproule, Wendy Bullock, Susan Casenza, Valerie Theng-Matherne, Nikki  
 15 Gibson, and Patricia Corbins. These objectors are 13 of the 16 groups of private objectors  
 16 who are represented by counsel. Although Hannah Feldman and Grace Wright have joined  
 in some briefing as Coordinated Objectors, they, through their counsel John Pentz and  
 Steven Helfand, do not join in this submission. Richard LeClair, representing objector  
 Kamela Wilkinson, was unable to reach his client in advance of the filing deadline and does  
 not currently join in this submission.

17 <sup>2</sup> The A.G.s of the following states are represented in this objection: Alabama,  
 18 Arizona, Colorado, Hawaii, Kansas, Massachusetts, Mississippi, New Mexico,  
 Pennsylvania, Tennessee and Wisconsin.

19 <sup>3</sup> The named plaintiffs are: Fatemah Azizian, Soraya Farrah, Eunice Fey, Rose  
 20 Gonzales, Kazuko Y. Morgan, Nicola Nelson-Torres, Judith Pogran, Shirley Powell,  
 Monique Patrick, Pamela Powell and Rose Skillman.

21 <sup>4</sup> The term "defendants" encompasses the Department Store Defendants and the  
 22 Manufacturer Defendants. The Department Store Defendants herein are: Federated  
 23 Department Stores, Inc. ("Federated"), The Neiman-Marcus Group, Inc. ("Neiman-  
 24 Marcus"), Nordstrom, Inc. ("Nordstrom"), The May Department Stores Company  
 ("May"), Saks Incorporated, Gottschalks Inc. ("Gottschalks"), Target Corporation, and  
 Dillard's Inc. ("Dillard's"). The Manufacturer Defendants herein are: The Estée Lauder  
 Companies Inc. ("Estée Lauder"), L'Oréal USA, Inc. ("L'Oréal"), Conopco, Inc.  
 ("Conopco"), Christian Dior Perfumes, Inc. ("Dior"), Guerlain, Inc. ("Guerlain"),  
 Parfums Givenchy, Inc. ("Givenchy"), Boucheron (USA) Ltd. ("Boucheron"), Chanel, Inc.  
 ("Chanel"), and Clarins U.S.A., Inc. ("Clarins").

25 <sup>5</sup> The proposed Settlement Class, which the Court preliminarily certified in an order  
 26 dated September 21, 2003, is as follows:

27 All persons who currently reside in the United States and who purchased  
 28 Department Store Cosmetic Products in the United States, which products  
 were manufactured, distributed and/or sold by the Manufacturer Defendants  
 or Department Store Defendants, at any time during the period May 29,

1 In the event that the Manufacturer Defendant from which the Class member had previously  
2 purchased products has run out of DSCPs to be distributed, the Class member may obtain a  
3 DSCP that is being distributed by another Manufacturer Defendant.

4 b. The parties and objectors agree that, in addition to the back-end  
5 published distribution notice, the Department Store Defendants will display at prominent  
6 places in the cosmetic departments of their stores a written notice that will describe the  
7 distribution, including the limit of one DSCP per customer. This in-store notice will be  
8 consistent with the back-end published notice. The content of the in-store notice and the  
9 period during which it will be displayed shall be submitted by Defendants to the Special  
10 Master for approval and to the Product Review Committee ("PRC") described below for  
11 comment at least 90 days prior to the commencement of the distribution.

12 c. The parties and objectors agreed to create a PRC that would consist of  
13 three persons from among the counsel representing Class Plaintiffs, one counsel  
14 representing the state A.G.s, and one counsel representing the Coordinated Objectors. The  
15 PRC will review the DSCPs to be distributed by Defendants to ensure that the DSCPs are  
16 consistent, in value, quality and desirability, with the products that heretofore have been  
17 presented to the Special Master and the Court in connection with this settlement approval  
18 process, and with the terms of the Settlement Agreement. Pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 53,  
19 the Special Master will make a report, order or recommendation, which the Court shall  
20 review pursuant to that rule. The schedule for the PRC's meetings will be worked out prior  
21 to the time of final product selection.

22  
23 1994 through July 16, 2003 (the "Class Period"). Excluded from this  
24 Settlement Class are all employees, officers, directors or agents (including  
25 attorneys) of any defendants, as well as any judge, justice or judicial officer  
presiding over this matter, and each such person's immediate family.

26 <sup>6</sup> DSCPs are defined in paragraph 2 of the settlement agreement herein as high-end,  
27 prestige or specialty beauty and cosmetic products and product lines (including color  
28 products, treatment and fragrances) sold by the Manufacturer Defendants under various  
brand names from May 29, 1994 through July 16, 2003. These products are sold primarily  
through traditional department and/or specialty stores and not through mass distribution  
channels.

1 d. The Special Master will also be responsible for reviewing and  
2 approving the month of the year in which the distribution of DSCPs will actually take place.

3 Dated: February 23, 2005

4 Respectfully submitted,

5  
6 By: /s/ Guido Saveri  
7 GUIDO SAVERI (22349)  
8 R. ALEXANDER SAVERI (173102)  
9 LISA SAVERI (112043)  
10 SAVERI & SAVERI, INC.  
11 111 Pine Street, Suite 1700  
12 San Francisco, CA 94111-5619  
13 Telephone: (415) 217-6810

14 FRANCIS O. SCARPULLA (41059)  
15 LAW OFFICES OF FRANCIS O.  
16 SCARPULLA  
17 44 Montgomery Street, Suite 3400  
18 San Francisco, CA 94104  
19 Telephone: (415) 788-7210

20 WILLIAM BERNSTEIN (65200)  
21 JOSEPH R. SAVERI (194857)  
22 MICHELE C. JACKSON (90807)  
23 LIEFF, CABRASER, HEIMANN &  
24 BERNSTEIN  
25 Embarcadero Center West  
26 275 Battery Street, 30th Floor  
27 San Francisco, CA 94111  
28 Telephone: (415) 956-1000

JOSEF D. COOPER (53015)  
TRACY R. KIRKHAM (69913)  
COOPER & KIRKHAM, P.C.  
655 Montgomery Street, 17th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Telephone: (415) 788-3030

JOSEPH M. ALIOTO (42680)  
THERESA MOORE (99978)  
ANGELINA GRACE (206899)  
THE ALIOTO LAW FIRM  
555 California Street, 31st Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94104  
Telephone: (415) 434-8900

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

DANIEL J. MOGIN (95624)  
THE MOGIN LAW FIRM, P.C.  
110 Juniper Street  
San Diego, CA 92101-1502  
Telephone: (619) 687-6611

J. GARRETT KENDRICK (61698)  
KENDRICK & NUTLEY  
468 North Camden Drive, Suite 200  
Beverly Hills, CA 90210  
Telephone: (310) 858-5571

TERRY GROSS (103878)  
GROSS & BELSKY  
180 Montgomery Street, Suite 2200  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Telephone: (415) 544-0200

W. TIMOTHY NEEDHAM (95642)  
JANSSEN, MALLOY, NEEDHAM,  
MORRISON & KOSHKIN  
730 Fifth Street  
Post Office Drawer 1288  
Eureka, CA 95502  
Telephone: (707) 445-2071

GRETCHEN M. NELSON (112566)  
LAW OFFICES OF GRETCHEN M.  
NELSON  
707 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 5000  
Los Angeles, CA 90017  
Telephone: (213) 622-6469

ROBERT DISKINT  
CRITCHLOW & DISKINT  
938 B Street  
San Rafael, CA 94901  
Telephone: (415) 721-7900

MICHAEL J. FLANNERY  
THE DAVID DANIS LAW FIRM, PC  
8235 Forsyth Boulevard, Suite 1100  
St. Louis, MO 63105  
Telephone: (314) 725-7700

JOHN H. BOONE  
THE LAW OFFICES OF JOHN H.  
BOONE  
555 California Street, 31st Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94104  
Telephone: (415) 434-1133

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

SUSAN TAYLOR  
MILBERG, WEISS, BERSHAD,  
HYNES & LERACH, L.L.P.  
600 West Broadway  
1800 One America Plaza  
San Diego, CA 92101-3356  
Telephone: (619) 231-1058

CRAIG C. CORBITT (83250)  
ZELLE, HOFMANN, VOELBEL  
MASON & GETTE, LLP  
44 Montgomery Street, Suite 3400  
San Francisco, CA 94104  
Telephone: (415) 693-0700

JOHN L. BURRIS (69888)  
LAW OFFICES OF JOHN L. BURRIS  
7677 Oakport, Suite 1120  
Oakland, CA 94612  
Telephone: (510) 839-5200

FREDERICK P. FURTH (38438)  
MICHAEL LEHMANN (77152)  
THE FURTH FIRM LLP  
225 Bush Street, 15th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94104  
Telephone: (415) 433-2070

ALAN R. PLUTZIK (77785)  
BRAMSON, PLUTZIK, MAHLER &  
BIRKHAUSER, LLP  
2125 Oak Grove Road, Suite 120  
Walnut Creek, CA 94598  
Telephone: (925) 945-0200

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**JOHN W. ALLURED (84770)  
LAW OFFICES OF JOHN W.  
ALLURED  
One Maritime Plaza, Suite 1040  
San Francisco, California 94111  
Telephone: (415) 675-2960**

**Counsel for Class Plaintiffs**

By: /s/ Mitchell A. Toups  
Mitchell A. Toups  
WELLER, GREEN, TOUPS,  
TERRELL, L.L.P.  
Post Office Box 350  
Beaumont, Texas 77704  
Telephone: (409) 838-0101  
Facsimile: (409) 832-8577  
matoups@wgttlaw.com

Michael A. Caddell  
John B. Scofield, Jr.  
CADDELL & CHAPMAN  
1331 Lamar, Suite 1070  
Houston, Texas 77010-3027  
Telephone: (713) 751-0400  
Facsimile: (713) 751-0906  
mac@caddellchapman.com  
jbs@caddellchapman.com

Steven C. Finley  
FINLEY & DEATON  
425 California Street, 19th Floor  
San Francisco, California 94104  
Telephone: (415) 296-0111  
(415) 644-0100  
Facsimile: (415) 296-7111  
finley@finleydeaton.com

Robert W. Bishop  
BISHOP & ASSOCIATES, P.S.C.  
6520 Glenridge Park, Suite 6  
Louisville, Kentucky 40213  
Telephone: (502) 425-2600  
Facsimile: (502) 425-9115  
firm@bishoplegal.net  
joe@bishoplegal.net

Bryan D. Marcus, Esq.  
BRYAN D. MARCUS, P.C.  
26400 Lahser Road, Suite 215  
Southfield, Michigan 48034  
Telephone: (248) 354-4121  
Facsimile: (248) 354-7367  
bluexdom@comcast.net

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

Mr. Dennis Gibson  
Ms. Nikki Gibson  
GIBSON, MCCLURE, WALLACE  
& DANIELS, L.L.P.  
8080 N. Central Expressway, Suite 1300  
Dallas, Texas 75206  
Frank H. Tomlinson

PRITCHARD, MCCALL  
& JONES, L.L.C.  
800 Financial Center  
Birmingham, Alabama 35203  
Telephone: (205) 328-9190  
Facsimile: (205) 458-0035  
hilton@pm-j.com

N. Albert Bacharach, Jr.  
115 N.E. 6th Ave.  
Gainesville, Florida 32601  
Telephone: (352) 378-9859  
Facsimile: (352) 338-1858  
NABacharach@worldnet.att.net

Edward W. Cochran  
2872 Broxton Road  
Shaker Heights, Ohio 44120  
Telephone: (216) 751-5546  
Facsimile: (216) 751-6630  
cochranjd@msn.com

Paul S. Rothstein  
Attorney at Law  
626 N.E. First Street  
Gainesville, Florida 32601  
Telephone: (352) 376-7650  
Facsimile: (352) 374-7133  
paul.s.rothstein@att.net  
Jeanine M. Schweinberg

Charles M. Thompson  
CHARLES M. THOMPSON &  
ASSOCS.  
5130 Cyrus Circle  
Birmingham, Alabama 35242  
Telephone: (205) 995-0068  
Facsimile: (205) 995-1050  
CMTLAW@aol.com  
www.victimlaw.com

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

J. Scott Kessinger  
7304 Michigan Avenue  
Saint Louis, Missouri 63111  
Telephone: (314) 369-5115  
Facsimile: (314) 754-8370  
jskess@charter.net

Kearney Dee Hutsler  
KEARNEY DEE HUTSLER, P.C.  
The Overlook Bldg., Ste. 250  
3620 8th Ave. South  
Birmingham, Alabama 35222  
Telephone: (205) 324-8282  
Facsimile: (205) 324-8284  
kdhlaw@bellsouth.net

Paul D. Wexler  
BRAGAR WEXLER EAGLES  
& MORGENSTERN, LLP  
885 Third Avenue  
New York, New York 10022  
Telephone: (212) 308-5858  
Facsimile: (212) 486-0462  
Wexler@bragarwexler.com

LARRY D. DRURY, LTD.  
205 West Randolph, Suite 1430  
Chicago, Illinois 60606  
Telephone: (312) 346-7950  
Facsimile: (312) 346-5777  
ldrurylaw@aol.com

Andrew James Kopp  
LAW OFFICE OF ANDREW J. KOPP  
400 29th Street, Suite 518  
Oakland, California 94609  
Telephone: (510) 763-9504  
Facsimile: (510) 763-3322  
kopplaw@pacbell.net

Steven B. Witman  
LAW OFFICES OF STEVEN B.  
WITMAN  
3850 North Causeway Blvd., Suite 1960  
Metairie, Louisiana 70002  
Telephone: (504) 836-2200  
Facsimile: (504) 836-2201  
switman@witmanlaw.com

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

R. Stephen Griffis  
R. STEPHEN GRIFFIS, P.C.  
2142 Highland Avenue South  
Birmingham, Alabama 35205  
Telephone: (205) 939-6400  
Facsimile: (205) 939-4346  
rsglaw@bellsouth.net

John H. McKinley  
BROWN, HALL, SHORE  
& MCKINLEY, LLP  
3031 West March Lane, Suite 230 West  
Stockton, California 95219-6500  
Telephone: (209) 477-8171  
Facsimile: (209) 477-2549  
jmckinley@bhsmck.com

Nicholas M. Fausto  
617 Stokes Road, Suite 4-150  
Medford, New Jersey 08055  
Telephone: (215) 735-5787  
Facsimile: (609) 714-2644  
email: nfausto@comcast.net

**Counsel for Coordinated Objectors**

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

By: /s/ Fredric W. Yerman  
Fredric W. Yerman  
David S. Copeland  
Karin E. Garvey  
Kaye Scholer LLP  
425 Park Avenue  
New York, New York 10022  
Telephone: (212) 836-8000  
Facsimile: (212) 836-8689

Michael W. Bien  
Rosen, Bien & Asaro, LLP  
155 Montgomery Street, 8<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Francisco, California 94104  
Telephone: (415) 433-6830  
Facsimile: (415) 433-7104

Penelope A. Prevolos, Esq.  
Terri Garland, Esq.  
Kristin J. Moody, Esq.  
MORRISON & FOERSTER, LLP  
425 Market Street  
San Francisco, California 94105  
Telephone: (415) 268-7000  
Facsimile: (415) 268-7522

Bruce H. Jackson, Esq.  
Christopher Van Gundy, Esq.  
BAKER & MCKENZIE  
Two Embarcadero Center, Suite 2400  
San Francisco, California 94111  
Telephone: (415) 576-3000  
Facsimile: (415) 576-3099

James T. Fousekis, Esq.  
PIPER RUDNICK LLP  
333 Market Street, Suite 3200  
San Francisco, California 94105  
Telephone: (415) 777-3999  
Facsimile: (415) 442-0839

Phillip A. Proger, Esq.  
JONES, DAY, REAVIS & POGUE  
51 Louisiana Ave., N.W.  
Washington, DC 20001-2113  
Telephone: (202) 879-3939  
Facsimile: (202) 626-1700

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

Joel S. Sanders, Esq.  
G. Charles Nierlich, Esq.  
GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER, LLP  
One Montgomery Street  
Telesis Tower, 26<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Francisco, California 94104  
Telephone: (415) 393-8200  
Facsimile: (415) 986-5309

Donn P. Pickett, Esq.  
Holly A. House, Esq.  
Marta Miyar, Esq.  
BINGHAM MCCUTCHEN LLP  
Three Embarcadero Center  
San Francisco, California 94111  
Telephone: (415) 393-2000  
Facsimile: (415) 393-2286

James L. McGinnis, Esq.  
SHEPPARD, MULLIN, RICHTER  
& HAMPTON, LLP  
Four Embarcadero Center, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Francisco, California 94111-4106  
Telephone: (415) 434-9100  
Facsimile: (415) 434-3947

Peter J. Venaglia, Esq.  
Teresa Boyle, Esq.  
DORNBUSH MENSCH  
MANDELSTAM & SCHAEFFER, LLP  
747 Third Avenue  
New York, New York 10017  
Telephone: (212) 759-3300  
Facsimile: (212) 753-7673

Robert Oppenheim, Esq.  
COBLENCÉ & WARNER  
415 Madison Avenue  
New York, New York 10017  
Telephone: (212) 593-8382  
Facsimile: (212) 593-9058

Amy Anne Stathos, Esq.  
Jeffrey A. LeVee, Esq.  
JONES, DAY, REAVIS & POGUE  
555 West Fifth Street, Suite 4600  
Los Angeles, California 90013  
Telephone: (213) 489-3939  
Facsimile: (213) 243-2539

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

Ronald J. Dolan, Esq.  
Betty T. Tierney, Esq.  
The May Department Stores Company  
611 Olive Street  
St. Louis, Missouri 63101  
Telephone: (314) 342-6512  
Facsimile: (314) 342-3066

Garry L. Halling, Esq.  
Thomas D. Nevins, Esq.  
SHEPPARD, MULLIN, RICHTER  
& HAMPTON, LLP  
Four Embarcadero Center, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Francisco, California 94111  
Telephone: (415) 434-9100  
Facsimile: (415) 434-3947

J. Thomas Rosch, Esq.  
Karen E. Silverman, Esq.  
Ellen K. Brown, Esq.  
LATHAM & WATKINS  
505 Montgomery Street, Suite 1900  
San Francisco, California 94111  
Telephone: (415) 391-0600  
Facsimile: (415) 395-8095

E. Perry Johnson  
BRYAN CAVE LLP  
One Metropolitan Square  
211 North Broadway, #3600  
St. Louis, Missouri 63102  
Telephone: (314) 259-2000  
Facsimile: (314) 259-2020

Aton Arbisser, Esq.  
KAYE SCHOLER LLP  
1999 Avenue of the Stars, Suite 1600  
Los Angeles, California 90076  
Telephone: (310) 788-1000  
Facsimile: (310) 788-1200

Bruce Colbath, Esq.  
Sharon Selby, Esq.  
WEIL, GOTSHAL & MANGES, LLP  
767 Fifth Avenue  
New York, New York 10153  
Telephone: (212) 310-8000  
Facsimile: (212) 310-8007

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

Larry S. Gangnes, Esq.  
Nancy W. Anderson, Esq.  
LANE, POWELL, SPEARS,  
LUBERSKY, LLP  
1420 Fifth Ave., Suite 4100  
Seattle, Washington 98101  
Telephone: (206) 223-7000  
Facsimile: (206) 223-7107

Peter H. Goldsmith, Esq.  
Ariela Freed, Esq.  
LEGAL STRATEGIES GROUP  
5905 Christie Ave.  
Emeryville, California 94608  
Telephone: (510) 450-9600  
Facsimile: (510) 450-9601

Anita F. Stork, Esq.  
COOLEY GODWARD LLP  
One Maritime Plaza, 20<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Francisco, California 94111  
Telephone: (415) 693-2000  
Facsimile: (415) 951-3699

Jeffrey G. Knowles, Esq.  
A. Marisa Chun, Esq.  
COBLENTZ, PATCH, DUFFY  
& BASS, LLP  
1 Ferry Building, Suite 200  
San Francisco, California 94111  
Telephone: (415) 391-4800  
Facsimile: (415) 989-1663

Robert A. Weikert, Esq.  
Marlene J. Williams, Esq.  
THELEN REID & PRIEST, LLP  
101 Second Street, Suite 1800  
San Francisco, California 94105  
Telephone: (415) 371-1200  
Facsimile: (415) 371-1211

Elizabeth R. Geise, Esq.  
Matthew W. Hoffman, Esq.  
GOODWIN PROCTER LLP  
901 New York Ave., N.W.  
Washington, DC 20001  
Telephone: (202) 346-4000  
Facsimile: (202) 346-4444

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

Elizabeth A. Bousquette, Esq.  
Robert J. Dwyer, Esq.  
BRYAN CAVE LLP  
245 Park Avenue  
New York, New York 10167-0034  
Telephone: (212) 692-1800  
Facsimile: (212) 692-1900

Samuel R. Miller, Esq.  
M. Kay Martin, Esq.  
FOLGER LEVIN & KAHN LLP  
Embarcadero Center West  
275 Battery St., 23<sup>rd</sup> Floor  
San Francisco, California 94111  
Telephone: (415) 986-2800  
Facsimile: (415) 986-2827

Peter Goldsmith, Esq.  
TOWNSEND & TOWNSEND &  
CREW  
Two Embarcadero Center, 8<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Francisco, California 94111-3834  
Telephone: (415) 576-0200  
Facsimile: (415) 576-0300

**Counsel for Defendants**

By: /s/ Jennifer S. Kirk  
Thomas W. Corbett, Jr.  
Attorney General  
James A. Donahue, III  
Chief Deputy Attorney General  
Jennifer Kirk (Bar No. 90544)  
Deputy Attorney General  
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania  
Office of Attorney General  
Antitrust Section  
14<sup>th</sup> Floor, Strawberry Square  
Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17120  
Telephone: (717) 787-4530  
Facsimile: (717) 705-7110

Troy King  
Attorney General of Alabama  
by: Jeff Long  
Assistant Attorney General  
11 South Union Street  
Montgomery, Alabama 36130  
Telephone: (334) 353-8035

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

Terry Goddard  
Attorney General of Arizona  
by: James Walsh  
Chief, Deputy Attorney General  
Emma Lehner  
Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Attorney General  
1275 West Washington Street  
Phoenix, Arizona 85007-2926  
Telephone: (602) 542-7752

Ken Salazar  
Attorney General of Colorado  
by: Jan Michael Zavislan  
Deputy Attorney General for Consumer  
Protection  
1525 Sherman Street  
Denver, CO 80203  
Telephone: (303) 866-4745

Mark J. Bennett  
Attorney General of Hawaii  
by: Rodney I. Kimura  
Deputy Attorney General  
425 Queen Street  
Honolulu, Hawaii 96813  
Telephone: (808) 586-1108

Phill Kline  
Attorney General of Kansas  
by: Karl R. Hansen  
Assistant Attorney General  
120 S.W. 10<sup>th</sup> Avenue, 2d Floor  
Topeka, Kansas 66612-3751  
Telephone: (785) 296-3751

Thomas F. Reilly  
Attorney General  
Commonwealth of Massachusetts  
by: Jesse M. Caplan  
Assistant Attorney General  
Consumer Protection & Antitrust  
Division  
One Ashburton Place, 19<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Boston, Massachusetts 02108  
Telephone: (617) 727-2200

Jim Hood  
Attorney General of Mississippi  
by: Sondra Simpson McLemore,  
Special Assistant Attorney General  
Consumer Protection Division  
P.O. Box 22947  
Jackson, Mississippi 39225  
Telephone: (601) 359-3748

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

Patricia A. Madrid  
Attorney General of New Mexico  
by: Deyonna Young  
Assistant Attorney General  
111 Lomas Boulevard NW, Suite 300  
Albuquerque, New Mexico 87102  
Telephone: (505) 222-9089

Paul G. Summers  
Attorney General and Reporter of  
Tennessee  
by: Dennis J. Garvey  
Deputy Attorney General  
Elizabeth Martin  
Senior Counsel  
Antitrust Division  
425 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue North  
Nashville, Tennessee 37243  
Telephone: (615) 741-3694

Peggy A. Lautenschlager  
Attorney General of Wisconsin  
by: Eric J. Wilson  
Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Attorney General  
P.O. Box 7857  
17 West Main Street  
Madison, WI 53703-7857  
Telephone: (608) 266-8986

**Counsel for Objecting States**

# EXHIBIT B

Legal Notice

**If You Purchased Department Store Cosmetics  
or Fragrance Products at Certain Department Stores  
during the period May 29, 1994 through July 16, 2003,**

You may be entitled to obtain, on a first come, first served basis, a free product under an approved class action settlement. Products will be available starting January 20, 2009 at this store and participating stores identified at [www.cosmeticssettlement.com](http://www.cosmeticssettlement.com).

**Which Cosmetics and Fragrance Products  
Were Included in the Lawsuit?**

This lawsuit involved high-end, or specialty beauty and cosmetic products and product lines, including color products (such as foundation, eye shadow and lipsticks), treatments (such as skin creams and moisturizers) and fragrances sold in certain department stores ("Department Store Cosmetics"). These products are manufactured, distributed and/or sold by the Manufacturer Defendants through the Retailer Defendants' department stores.

**What Do I Have to do to Get Free Cosmetics?**

- Have purchased Department Store Cosmetics or Fragrances at this or other Department Stores between May 29, 1994 through July 16, 2003 and you did not previously exclude yourself.
- Visit a participating Department Store starting on January 20, 2009 but only while supplies last, to claim your product.
- Sign a form at the time you receive your product stating that you are a member of the class.
- Not be an employee, officer, director, agent or attorney of any Defendant, or the judge presiding over this matter or a member of each such person's immediate family.

**What Free Products Are Being Provided?**

\$175 million worth of free cosmetics and fragrance products are being provided. See list of brands to be distributed on right.

The products will be distributed on a **first come, first served basis, while supplies last**, and no rain checks will be provided.

**One (1) Item Per Customer.  
NO RETURNS – NO EXCHANGES**

**Boucheron (USA) Ltd.:**

Boucheron

**Chanel, Inc.:**

Chanel

**Christian Dior Perfumes, Inc.:**

Christian Dior

**Clarins U.S.A., Inc.:**

Clarins

**Coty, Inc. (on behalf of Conopco Inc.):**

Calvin Klein

Vera Wang

Sarah Jessica Parker

**The Estée Lauder Companies, Inc.:**

Estée Lauder

Clinique

**Guerlain, Inc.:**

Guerlain

**L'Oréal USA, Inc.:**

Lancôme

Ralph Lauren

Giorgio Armani

**Parfums Givenchy, Inc.:**

Givenchy

**ALL BRANDS ARE NOT AVAILABLE  
IN ALL STORE LOCATIONS**