

1 RUSSELL S. ROECA (State Bar # 97297)
 EDWARD D. HAAS (State Bar # 76647)
 2 DANIEL W. HAGER (State Bar #121515)
 ROECA HAAS HAGER LLP
 3 351 California Street, Suite 900
 San Francisco, CA 94104
 4 Telephone: (415) 352-0980
 Facsimile: (415) 352-0988
 5 Email: dhager@r2hlaw.com

6 Attorneys for Defendant HELLENIC REPUBLIC

7
 8 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
 9 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
 10 (OAKLAND DIVISION)

11 GEORGE G. BENETATOS and
 12 CHOULOS, CHOULOS & WYLE, LLC,

13 Plaintiff,

14 vs.

15 HELLENIC REPUBLIC,

16 Defendant.

Case No. C 06-06819 SBA

ORDER RE TAXING OF COSTS

Date: February 10, 2009
 Time: 1:00 p.m.
 Location: Courtroom 3
 Judge: Hon. Sandra Brown Armstrong

17 **I. BACKGROUND**

18 After judgment was entered in this case, defendant Hellenic Republic timely filed its bill
 19 of costs as the prevailing party. Plaintiff Benetatos did not file any objection, but the clerk of the
 20 court subsequently requested backup documentation from the Hellenic Republic. Not having
 21 received that information, the clerk subsequently taxed all of the requested costs for lack of
 22 documentation.

23 In this motion, counsel for Hellenic Republic submits that documentation, explains the
 24 circumstances surrounding his failure to submit them earlier, and asks the Court to review and
 25 revise the order taxing costs so that Hellenic Republic can recover the full amount of its costs as
 26 stated in the bill of costs.

1 **II. LEGAL STANDARD**

2 Local Rule 54 governs recovery of costs by prevailing parties in this Court. It requires
3 timely filing of a bill of costs, and further requires submission of supporting documentation.
4 Under Local Rule 54-1(a) any party disagreeing with the bill of costs must file an objection
5 within 10 days of its filing. Documentation supporting the bill of costs was not submitted when it
6 was filed; defendant asserted no objection to the costs sought by the Hellenic Republic.

7 **III. ANALYSIS**

8 As set forth in the Declaration of Daniel W. Hager, since there was no deadline stated in
9 the letter from the clerk requesting backup documentation, counsel for the Hellenic Republic did
10 not calendar a response date. He did, however, immediately gather the requested documentation
11 to send to the clerk. While counsel believed he had asked his assistant to have that
12 documentation filed, after receiving notice that he had not from the Clerk on December 29, 2008
13 (during the week between Christmas and New Years), counsel realized he had not in fact asked
14 his secretary to file the documentation. Counsel immediately called the clerk's office and spoke
15 to Deputy Clerk Frances Stone, who said counsel would need to submit this motion to Judge
16 Armstrong, who has the final word in the taxing of costs.

17 Defendant Hellenic Republic has now submitted, with this motion, all of the requested
18 documentation to support its bill of costs.

19 The bill of costs was never objected to by any opposing party within the time specified in
20 the Local Rules, or at any time. Thus, it is both unopposed and fully supported by the
21 documentation provided by defendant. There will be no possible prejudice to plaintiff Benetatos
22 if costs are awarded in the full amount specified in the bill of costs, since he did not object to such
23 an award in any event. Counsel for the Hellenic Republic has apologized for the delay in
24 providing the requested documentation in support of the bill of costs in the above matter.

25 **IV. CONCLUSION**

26 Plaintiff Benetatos having waived any objection to the bill of costs, and Hellenic
27 Republic having adequately explained its failure to provide the requested documentation earlier,
28 the Court finds there is good cause for accepting the late-submitted documentation and for

1 changing the order taxing costs, and that doing so will achieve the most equitable results under
2 the circumstances.

3 After considering the moving and any opposition papers, the arguments of counsel, and
4 all other matters presented to the Court,

5 **IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT** defendant Hellenic Republic's motion for the Court
6 to review and revise the order taxing costs so that it recovers the full amount of its costs as stated
7 in the bill of costs is GRANTED and, accordingly, costs in the amount of \$3,237.00 are therefore
8 awarded to the Hellenic Republic as the prevailing party in this action against Plaintiff
9 Benetatos.

10 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

11
12
13 Dated: 2/4/09



HON. SAUNDRA BROWN ARMSTRONG

14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

GEORGE G. BENETATOS et al,

Plaintiff,

v.

HELLENIC REPUBLIC et al,

Defendant.

_____ /

Case Number: CV06-06819 SBA

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, hereby certify that I am an employee in the Office of the Clerk, U.S. District Court, Northern District of California.

That on February 5, 2009, I SERVED a true and correct copy(ies) of the attached, by placing said copy(ies) in a postage paid envelope addressed to the person(s) hereinafter listed, by depositing said envelope in the U.S. Mail, or by placing said copy(ies) into an inter-office delivery receptacle located in the Clerk's office.

George G. Benetatos
Law Office of George G. Benetatos
244 California Street Suite 300
San Francisco, CA 94111

Dated: February 5, 2009

Richard W. Wieking, Clerk

By: LISA R CLARK, Deputy Clerk

Roecca Haas Hager LLP
351 California Street, Suite 900, San Francisco, CA 94104
415.352.0980 Fax 415.352.0988