

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

MONIQUE PEREZ, et al.,
Plaintiffs,
v.
WELLS FARGO & COMPANY, et al.,
Defendants.

Case No. 14-cv-0989-PJH

**ORDER RE DEFENDANTS'
OPPOSITION TO CLASS
CERTIFICATION MOTION**

The court is in receipt of a chambers copy of defendants' opposition to plaintiffs' motion for class certification. The court has reviewed the opposition and finds it incomprehensible. Whether the problem is with the opposition itself or with the chambers copy is difficult to determine.

Defendants' chambers copy consists of a single bound document bearing the caption "Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for Class Certification." Following a 27-page memorandum of points and authorities is a tab and a divider page, both marked "Exhibit A." Behind the "Exhibit A" divider and tab is the Declaration of Rachel M. Hoffer in support of the opposition. The Hoffer Declaration describes 11 exhibits that are attached following the declaration, and which appear to be the documents marked with tabs numbered 1-11. The declaration describes Exhibit 11 as a summary chart of declarations of class members, and also states that "copies of the 26 declarations are attached as Exhibit C-1 to C-26 to Defendants' opposition." Hoffer Decl. ¶ 13.

Following the Hoffer Declaration and Exhibits 1-11 is a divider page marked "Exhibit B." However, there is no explanation of what this is an exhibit to. Following the

1 "Exhibit B" divider is a Declaration by Mary D. Evans. Following the Evans Declaration is
2 a divider sheet marked "Exhibit C," again with no explanation as to what this is an exhibit
3 to. Following that divider is a Declaration by Teresa Swanson. Following the Swanson
4 Declaration is a divider sheet marked "Exhibit D," again with no explanation as to what
5 this is an exhibit to. Following the "Exhibit D" divider are a series of divider sheets
6 marked "Exhibit 1" through "Exhibit 11." Behind each of those dividers is a declaration.
7 Following the last of those 11, the Declaration of Mildred Alicea, is another divider sheet
8 marked "Exhibit 12." Following this divider are tabs marked "Exhibit 12" through "Exhibit
9 26," each preceded by a divider sheet marked with the same exhibit number.

10 Because the court cannot make any sense out of this submission, the document is
11 not usable for its intended purpose. No later than May 12, 2016, defendants shall
12 provide the court with a usable chambers copy of their opposition papers, to include a
13 separately fastened copy of the memorandum of points and authorities, and a separately
14 fastened copy of the Hoffer Declaration that has its exhibits attached with tabs that match
15 the exhibit numbers listed in the declaration. Divider sheets are of no use if there is no
16 corresponding tab.

17

18 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

19 Dated: May 10, 2016

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28



PHYLLIS J. HAMILTON
United States District Judge