

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

GLANCY PRONGAY & MURRAY LLP
Lionel Z. Glancy (#134180)
Marc L. Godino (#182689)
Mark S. Greenstone (#199606)
1925 Century Park East, Suite 2100
Los Angeles, California 90067
Telephone: (310) 201-9150
Facsimile: (310) 201-9160
E-mail: info@glancylaw.com

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

JULIA RENIGER, GREG BATTAGLIA,
LUCIA SAITTA and ANN MANCUSO,
Individually and On Behalf of All Others
Similarly Situated,

Plaintiffs,

v.

HYUNDAI MOTOR AMERICA, a
California corporation, and HYUNDAI
MOTOR COMPANY, a foreign
corporation,

Defendants.

Case No. 4:14-cv-03612-CW

Hon. Claudia Wilken

**ORDER GRANTING PLAINTIFF'S
MOTION FOR AWARD OF ATTORNEYS'
FEES, COSTS, EXPENSES, AND SERVICE
AWARDS TO CLASS
REPRESENTATIVES**

1 The Court, having reviewed Julia Reniger, Greg Battaglia, Lucia Saitta and Ann
2 Mancuso's ("Plaintiffs") Motion for Award of Attorneys' Fees, Costs, Expenses, and Service
3 Awards to Class Representatives, the pleadings and other papers on file in this action, and the
4 statements of counsel and the parties, hereby finds that Plaintiffs' motion is GRANTED.

5 NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT:
6

7 1. The Court, for purposes of this Order, adopts the terms and definitions set forth
8 in the Class Action Settlement Agreement filed with this Court on June 21, 2016 ("Settlement
9 Agreement") [ECF #72].

10 2. The Court finds that Class Counsel, Glancy Prongay & Murray LLP ("GPM"),
11 incurred \$33,661.73 in reasonable costs and expenses in prosecuting this litigation as of the
12 date they filed their Motion for Award of Attorneys' Fees, Costs, Expenses, and Service
13 Awards to Class Representatives. The Court finds that these costs and expenses were
14 reasonably incurred in the ordinary course of prosecuting this case and were necessary given
15 the complex nature and scope of the case. Accordingly, the Court approves a payment to
16 GPM in the amount of their total costs and expenses incurred to reimburse them for such costs
17 and expenses.
18

19 3. The Court has confirmed the reasonableness of Plaintiffs' fee request by
20 conducting a lodestar cross-check. The Court finds that Plaintiffs' reasonable lodestar as of
21 the date they filed their Motion for Award of Attorneys' Fees, Costs, Expenses, and Service
22 Awards to Class Representatives was \$736,225.25. Accordingly, Plaintiff's requested fee
23 award of \$711,338.27 (\$745,000 minus \$33,661.73 in expenses) represents a negative
24 multiplier of 0.96 based on GPM's current hourly rates. This multiplier is within the range of
25 multipliers awarded in similar complex, class action cases and is well-justified here, given the
26
27
28

~~PROPOSED~~ ORDER GRANTING PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR ATTORNEYS' FEES, COSTS, AND
INCENTIVE AWARD

Case No. 4:14-cv-03612-CW

1 novelty and difficulty of this litigation, counsel's skillful handling of the difficult factual and
2 legal issues presented, the significant contingent risks in this case, and the quality of the result
3 achieved.

4 4. The Court further approves an incentive award of \$2,500 to each of the five
5 class representatives. The incentive award is justified by: (1) the risk to the class
6 representative in commencing suit, both financial and otherwise; (2) the amount of time and
7 effort spent by the class representative in this case; and (3) the duration of the litigation.
8

9 5. The attorneys' fees, costs and incentive awards set forth in this Order shall be
10 paid by Defendants in accordance with the terms of the Settlement Agreement.
11

12 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

13
14 Dated: March 28, 2017

15 
16 THE HONORABLE CLAUDIA ANN WILKEN
17 UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

~~PROPOSED~~ ORDER GRANTING PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR ATTORNEYS' FEES, COSTS, AND
INCENTIVE AWARD

Case No. 4:14-cv-03612-CW

Exhibit A – List of Persons Who Requested Exclusion

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28