

1 JAMES V. FITZGERALD, III (State Bar No. 55632)  
 2 NOAH G. BLECHMAN (State Bar No. 197167)  
 3 McNAMARA, NEY, BEATTY, SLATTERY,  
 4 BORGES & AMBACHER LLP  
 5 1211 Newell Avenue  
 6 Walnut Creek, CA 94596  
 7 Telephone: (925) 939-5330  
 8 Facsimile: (925) 939-0203

9 Attorneys for Defendants  
 10 OFFICER JAMES COLLEY; ANTIOCH POLICE  
 11 DEPARTMENT; and CITY OF ANTIOCH

12 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
 13 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

14 ANTHONY MICHAEL MABUTAS, JR.,

15 Plaintiff,

16 vs.

17 OFFICER JAMES COLLEY, in his official  
 18 and individual capacities, ANTIOCH  
 19 POLICE DEPARTMENT, and CITY OF  
 20 ANTIOCH, CALIFORNIA,

21 Defendants.

Case No. C14-3796 KAW

**REVISED STIPULATED PROTECTIVE  
 ORDER**

22 1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

23 Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production of  
 24 confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public  
 25 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted.  
 26 Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated  
 27 Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on  
 28 all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure  
 and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment  
 under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section  
 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential

REVISED STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER  
 – C14-3796 KAW

1 information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and  
2 the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material  
3 under seal.

4 2. DEFINITIONS

5 2.1 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of  
6 information or items under this Order.

7 2.2 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is  
8 generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of  
9 Civil Procedure 26(c).

10 2.3 Counsel (without qualifier): Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as  
11 well as their support staff).

12 2.4 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that  
13 it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

14 2.5 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the  
15 medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things,  
16 testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or  
17 responses to discovery in this matter.

18 2.6 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to  
19 the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a  
20 consultant in this action.

21 2.7 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this action. House  
22 Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.

23 2.8 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal  
24 entity not named as a Party to this action.

25 2.9 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this  
26 action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this action and have appeared in this action  
27 on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of that party.  
28

1           2.10 Party: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors, employees,  
2 consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).

3           2.11 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery  
4 Material in this action.

5           2.12 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support services  
6 (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and  
7 organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and  
8 subcontractors.

9           2.13 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as  
10 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

11           2.14 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a  
12 Producing Party.

13 3. SCOPE

14           The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material  
15 (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2)  
16 all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony,  
17 conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.  
18 However, the protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order do not cover the following  
19 information: (a) any information that is in the public domain at the time of disclosure to a  
20 Receiving Party or becomes part of the public domain after its disclosure to a Receiving Party as  
21 a result of publication not involving a violation of this Order, including becoming part of the  
22 public record through trial or otherwise; and (b) any information known to the Receiving Party  
23 prior to the disclosure or obtained by the Receiving Party after the disclosure from a source who  
24 obtained the information lawfully and under no obligation of confidentiality to the Designating  
25 Party. Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by a separate agreement or order.

26 4. DURATION

27           Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by  
28 this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court

1 order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all  
2 claims and defenses in this action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after  
3 the completion and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this action,  
4 including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to  
5 applicable law.

6 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

7 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each Party or  
8 Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care to  
9 limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The  
10 Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or  
11 oral or written communications that qualify – so that other portions of the material, documents,  
12 items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within  
13 the ambit of this Order.

14 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are shown  
15 to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily  
16 encumber or retard the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens  
17 on other parties) expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

18 If it comes to a Designating Party’s attention that information or items that it designated  
19 for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other  
20 Parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

21 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this Order  
22 (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered,  
23 Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so  
24 designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

25 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:  
26  
27  
28

1 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but excluding  
2 transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party affix the  
3 legend “CONFIDENTIAL” to each page that contains protected material. If only a portion or  
4 portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly  
5 identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

6 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents or materials available for inspection  
7 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which material  
8 it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the  
9 material made available for inspection shall be deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting  
10 Party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must  
11 determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then,  
12 before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the “CONFIDENTIAL”  
13 legend to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the material on  
14 a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected  
15 portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

16 (b) for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial proceedings, that the  
17 Designating Party identify on the record, before the close of the deposition, hearing, or other  
18 proceeding, all protected testimony.

19 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other  
20 tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container  
21 or containers in which the information or item is stored the legend “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a  
22 portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the  
23 extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

24 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to  
25 designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party’s  
26 right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a  
27 designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is  
28 treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

1       6.       CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

2           6.1       Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of  
3 confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating Party's confidentiality  
4 designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic  
5 burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a Party does not waive its right to  
6 challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the  
7 original designation is disclosed.

8           6.2       Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution  
9 process by providing written notice of each designation it is challenging and describing the basis  
10 for each challenge. To avoid ambiguity as to whether a challenge has been made, the written  
11 notice must recite that the challenge to confidentiality is being made in accordance with this  
12 specific paragraph of the Protective Order. The parties shall attempt to resolve each challenge in  
13 good faith and must begin the process by conferring directly (in voice to voice dialogue; other  
14 forms of communication are not sufficient) within 14 days of the date of service of notice. In  
15 conferring, the Challenging Party must explain the basis for its belief that the confidentiality  
16 designation was not proper and must give the Designating Party an opportunity to review the  
17 designated material, to reconsider the circumstances, and, if no change in designation is offered,  
18 to explain the basis for the chosen designation. A Challenging Party may proceed to the next  
19 stage of the challenge process only if it has engaged in this meet and confer process first or  
20 establishes that the Designating Party is unwilling to participate in the meet and confer process in  
21 a timely manner.

22           6.3       Judicial Intervention. If the Parties cannot resolve a challenge without court  
23 intervention, the Designating Party shall file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality under  
24 Civil Local Rule 7 (and in compliance with Civil Local Rule 79-5, if applicable) within 21 days  
25 of the initial notice of challenge or within 14 days of the parties agreeing that the meet and confer  
26 process will not resolve their dispute, whichever is earlier. Each such motion must be  
27 accompanied by a competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet  
28 and confer requirements imposed in the preceding paragraph. Failure by the Designating Party to

1 make such a motion including the required declaration within 21 days (or 14 days, if applicable)  
2 shall automatically waive the confidentiality designation for each challenged designation. In  
3 addition, the Challenging Party may file a motion challenging a confidentiality designation at any  
4 time if there is good cause for doing so, including a challenge to the designation of a deposition  
5 transcript or any portions thereof. Any motion brought pursuant to this provision must be  
6 accompanied by a competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet  
7 and confer requirements imposed by the preceding paragraph.

8 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating  
9 Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose  
10 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to  
11 sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived the confidentiality designation by failing to  
12 file a motion to retain confidentiality as described above, all parties shall continue to afford the  
13 material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's  
14 designation until the court rules on the challenge.

15 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

16 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or  
17 produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this case only for prosecuting,  
18 defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to  
19 the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the litigation has  
20 been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL  
21 DISPOSITION).

22 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and  
23 in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

24 7.2 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered  
25 by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any  
26 information or item designated "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:

27 (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this action, as well as employees  
28 of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information

1 for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” that  
2 is attached hereto as Exhibit A;

3 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving  
4 Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the  
5 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

6 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is  
7 reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and  
8 Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

9 (d) the court and its personnel;

10 (e) court reporters and their staff, professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and  
11 Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have  
12 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

13 (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is reasonably  
14 necessary and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A),  
15 unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed  
16 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material must be separately  
17 bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this  
18 Stipulated Protective Order.

19 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or  
20 other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

21 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER  
22 LITIGATION

23 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels  
24 disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party  
25 must:  
26  
27  
28



1 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a  
2 copy of the subpoena or court order;

3 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the  
4 other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this  
5 Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

6 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the  
7 Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

8 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the  
9 subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as  
10 “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order  
11 issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s permission. The Designating Party  
12 shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material –  
13 and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving  
14 Party in this action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

15  
16 9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN THIS  
17 LITIGATION

18 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in this  
19 action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information produced by Non-Parties in  
20 connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order.  
21 Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking  
22 additional protections.

23 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-  
24 Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with  
25 the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s confidential information, then the Party shall:  
26  
27  
28

1 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some  
2 or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-  
3 Party;

4 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order  
5 in this litigation, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of  
6 the information requested; and

7 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party.

8 (c) If the Non-Party fails to object or seek a protective order from this court within 14  
9 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the  
10 Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely  
11 seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession  
12 or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a  
13 determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the  
14 burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

15 10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

16 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected  
17 Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective  
18 Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the  
19 unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the  
20 Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were  
21 made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the  
22 "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

23 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED  
24 MATERIAL

25 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently  
26 produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the  
27 Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This  
28 provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery

1 order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of  
2 Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a  
3 communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product  
4 protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order  
5 submitted to the court.

6 12. MISCELLANEOUS

7 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to  
8 seek its modification by the court in the future.

9 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order  
10 no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any  
11 information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no  
12 Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by  
13 this Protective Order.

14 12.3 Filing Protected Material. Without written permission from the Designating Party  
15 or a court order secured after appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file in  
16 the public record in this action any Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any  
17 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may only be filed  
18 under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at  
19 issue. Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 79-5, a sealing order will issue only upon a request  
20 establishing that the Protected Material at issue is privileged, protectable as a trade secret, or  
21 otherwise entitled to protection under the law. If a Receiving Party's request to file Protected  
22 Material under seal pursuant to Civil Local Rule 79-5(d) is denied by the court, then the  
23 Receiving Party may file the information in the public record pursuant to Civil Local Rule 79-5(e)  
24 unless otherwise instructed by the court.

25 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

26 Within 60 days after the final disposition of this action, as defined in paragraph 4, each  
27 Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such  
28 material. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts,

1 compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected  
2 Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must  
3 submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the  
4 Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all  
5 the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has  
6 not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or  
7 capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to  
8 retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts,  
9 legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work  
10 product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected  
11 Material. Any such archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to  
12 this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

13 I hereby attest that concurrence in the filing of these documents has been obtained from each  
14 of the other Signatories, which shall serve in lieu of their signatures on the document.

15 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

16 Dated: July 8, 2015 Law Offices of Mark W. Kelsey  
17 By: /s/ Kelsey, Mark  
18 Mark Kelsey  
19 Attorneys for Plaintiff

20 Dated: July 8, 2015 McNAMARA, NEY, BEATTY, SLATTERY,  
21 BORGES & AMBACHER LLP  
22  
23 By: /s/ Blechman, Noah  
24 James V. Fitzgerald, III  
25 Noah G. Blechman  
26 Attorneys for Defendants  
27 OFFICER JAMES COLLEY; ANTIOCH POLICE  
28 DEPARTMENT; and CITY OF ANTIOCH

McNAMARA, NEY, BEATTY, SLATTERY, BORGES & AMBACHER LLP  
ATTORNEYS AT LAW  
1211 NEWELL AVENUE, WALNUT CREEK, CA 94596  
TELEPHONE: (925) 939-5330

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED:**

Dated: July 17, 2015

By: *Kandis Westmore*  
Hon. Kandis A. Westmore  
Magistrate Judge of the District Court

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full name], of \_\_\_\_\_  
[print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Northern District of California on \_\_\_\_\_ [date] in the case of ***Mabutas v. Officer Colley et al., C14-3796 KAW***. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the Northern District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.

I hereby appoint \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full name] of \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

City and State where sworn and signed: \_\_\_\_\_

Printed name: \_\_\_\_\_

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_