

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

[COUNSEL LISTED ON SIGNATURE PAGES]

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
OAKLAND DIVISION

WILLIAM GRECIA,  
  
Plaintiff,  
  
v.  
  
DISH NETWORK L.L.C.,  
  
Defendant.

Case No. 4:16-cv-00588-YGR  
*[Lead Case]*

**JOINT STATEMENT AND STIPULATION  
ON STAY OF CASE**

Hon. Yvonne Gonzalez Rogers

WILLIAM GRECIA,  
  
Plaintiff,  
  
v.  
  
ADOBE SYSTEMS INCORPORATED,  
  
Defendant.

Case No. 4:16-cv-06283-YGR

WILLIAM GRECIA,  
  
Plaintiff,  
  
v.  
  
TARGET CORPORATION,  
  
Defendant.

Case No. 4:16-cv-00323-YGR

Plaintiff William Grecia (“Grecia”) and Defendants DISH Network L.L.C. (“DISH”), Adobe Systems Incorporated (“Adobe”), and Target Corporation (“Target”), pursuant to the Court’s Orders of February 23, 2017, March 6, 2017, and March 8, 2017 (in the *DISH*, *Adobe*, and *Target* cases respectively), by and through their respective counsel of record, hereby provide the following joint statement informing the Court of the status of related cases pending before

1 Judge Richard J. Sullivan in the Southern District of New York. Those cases are: *Grecia v.*  
2 *MasterCard Inc.*, 15-cv-9059; *Grecia v. Visa Inc.*, 15-cv-9210 (collectively, the “Credit Card  
3 Actions”); *Grecia v. Samsung Electronics America*, 16-cv-9691 (the “Samsung Action”); and  
4 *Grecia v. 1-800-Flowers.com, Inc.*, 16-cv-7022; *Grecia v. BestBuy.com, LLC*, 16-cv-7024;  
5 *Grecia v. J Crew Group, Inc.*, 16-cv-7025; and *Grecia v. Adorama Camera, Inc.*, 16-cv-7111  
6 (these four, collectively, the “Retailer Actions”).<sup>1</sup> This joint statement and stipulation will be  
7 submitted in the *DISH*, *Adobe*, and *Target* cases.

8 By the Court Orders referenced above, this Court stayed the captioned cases pending the  
9 issuance of a claim construction order by Judge Sullivan in the Credit Card Actions.<sup>2</sup> (D.I. 52, 33,  
10 and 41.)

11 On April 3, 2017, Judge Sullivan lifted a stay of the Credit Card Actions and the Samsung  
12 Action and ordered the parties thereto to submit a case management plan. On April 12, 2017,  
13 Judge Sullivan entered a case management plan in those cases which *inter alia* set dates for claim  
14 construction exchanges and briefing through November 28, with a hearing to follow at the court’s  
15 convenience. (S.D.N.Y. Case No. 15-cv-9059, D.I. 48 at 6.) The parties in the Credit Card  
16 Actions and the Samsung Action are engaged in the claim construction process and have  
17 exchanged proposed constructions. (S.D.N.Y. Case No. 15-cv-9059, D.I. 60 at 2.) The Retailer  
18 Actions remain stayed pending the issuance of Judge Sullivan’s claim construction order and no  
19 substantive events have transpired therein since this Court’s February/March, 2017 orders.

20 In light of the foregoing, Grecia and Defendants ask on stipulation that this Court continue  
21 its stay of these actions pending Judge Sullivan’s claim construction order and reset the

---

22 <sup>1</sup> Since the Court’s March 6, 2017 order, two related cases once pending before Judge Sullivan  
23 have been dismissed: *Grecia v. American Express Co.*, 15-cv-9217 (settled on February 26,  
24 2017); and *Grecia v. Neiman Marcus Group, Inc.*, 16-cv-7026 (settled on April 22, 2017).

25 <sup>2</sup> Adobe did not, however, agree to be bound by Judge Sullivan’s claim construction order. (D.I.  
26 33 at 2.) The stay in the Target case (4:17-cv-00323) was not the result of a stipulated request but  
27 of Target’s motion. (Dkt. No. 25). DISH and Target have not agreed to be bound by Judge  
28 Sullivan’s claim construction order either. The Defendants reserve their rights to raise their  
requests to stay the cases beyond the issuance of Judge Sullivan’s claim construction order as  
appropriate.

1 compliance hearing scheduled for Friday, September 15, 2017 to Friday, January 19, 2018. The  
2 parties will file another joint statement informing the Court of the status of the cases pending  
3 before Judge Sullivan no later than January 12, 2018.

4 Dated: September 8, 2017

Respectfully Submitted,

5 /s/ Matthew M. Wawrzyn  
6 Todd C. Atkins (SBN 208879)  
7 tatkins@atkinsdavidson.com  
8 ATKINS & DAVIDSON, APC  
9 2261 Rutherford Road  
10 Carlsbad, CA 92008  
11 Tel: 619.665.3476

/s/ Victoria Q. Smith  
James F. Valentine (SBN 149269)  
JValentine@perkinscoie.com  
Victoria Q. Smith (SBN 236045)  
VSmith@perkinscoie.com  
Matthew J. Moffa (*pro hac vice*)  
MMoffa@perkinscoie.com  
Amisha K. Manek (SBN 305163)  
AManek@perkinscoie.com  
PERKINS COIE LLP  
3150 Porter Drive  
Palo Alto, CA 94304-1212  
Telephone: 650.838.4300  
Facsimile: 650.838.4350

9 Matthew M. Wawrzyn (*pro hac vice*)  
10 matt@wawrzynlaw.com  
11 Stephen C. Jarvis (*pro hac vice*)  
12 stephen@wawrzynlaw.com  
13 WAWRZYN & JARVIS LLC  
14 2700 Patriot Blvd, Suite 250  
15 Glenview, IL 60026  
16 Telephone: 847.656.5864

Attorneys for Defendant  
ADOBE SYSTEMS INCORPORATED

Attorneys for Plaintiff  
WILLIAM GRECIA

15 /s/ John Kitchura, Jr.  
16 Colin G. Cabral  
17 PROSKAUER ROSE LLP  
18 2049 Century Park East, Suite 3200  
19 Los Angeles, CA 90067  
20 Telephone: (310) 557-2900  
21 ccabral@proskauer.com

/s/ Hector Ribera  
Hector Ribera (SBN 221511)  
hector@martonribera.com  
Ryan Marton (SBN 223979)  
ryan@martonribera.com  
Marton Ribera Schumann & Chang LLP  
548 Market St. Suite 36117  
San Francisco, CA 94104  
Tel: (415) 360 2511

20 Steven M. Bauer (*pro hac vice*)  
21 John M. Kitchura, Jr. (*pro hac vice*)  
22 PROSKAUER ROSE LLP  
23 One International Place  
24 Boston, MA 02110-2600  
25 Telephone: (617) 526-9600  
26 sbauer@proskauer.com  
27 jkitchura@proskauer.com

Attorneys for Defendant  
TARGET CORPORATION

24 Robert Laurenzi (*pro hac vice*)  
25 KAYE SCHOLER LLP  
26 250 W. 55th Street  
27 New York, NY 10019-9710  
28 Telephone: (212) 836-8000  
robert.laurenzi@kayescholer.com

Attorneys for Defendant  
DISH Network L.L.C.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.**

DATED: September 12, 2017



DISTRICT JUDGE YVONNE GONZALEZ ROGERS

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**ATTESTATION FOR SIGNATURE**

Pursuant to Civil L.R. 5-1(i)(3) regarding signatures, I attest under penalty of perjury that concurrence in the filing of this document has been obtained from the other signatories.

Dated: September 8, 2017

/s/ Matthew M. Wawrzyn  
Matthew M. Wawrzyn