

1 Mark F. Anderson (SBN 44787)  
 2 Anderson, Ogilvie & Brewer LLP  
 3 1736 Stockton Street, Ground Floor  
 4 San Francisco, CA 94133  
 5 Phone: 415.651.1951  
 6 Email: mark@aoblawyers.com

7 Attorney for Plaintiff Aaron M. Weil

8 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
 9 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

10 **Aaron M. Weil,**  
 11 **Plaintiff,**  
 12 **v.**  
 13 **Pennsylvania Higher Education Assistance**  
 14 **Agency, et al,**  
 15 **Defendants.**

**Case No. 4:17-cv-03306 YGR**

**[STIPULATED] PROTECTIVE ORDER**

**\*AS MODIFIED BY THE COURT\***

16 1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

17 Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production of  
 18 confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public  
 19 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted.  
 20 Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated  
 21 Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on  
 22 all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure  
 23 and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment  
 24 under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section  
 25 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential  
 26 information under seal and that Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be  
 27 followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to  
 28 file material under seal.

1       2.     DEFINITIONS

2       2.1    Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or  
3 items under this Order.

4       2.2    “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is  
5 generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule  
6 of Civil Procedure 26(c).

7       2.3    Counsel (without qualifier): Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as  
8 well as their support staff).

9       2.4    Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that  
10 it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

11       2.5    Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the  
12 medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things,  
13 testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or  
14 responses to discovery in this matter.

15       2.6    Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to  
16 the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a  
17 consultant in this action.

18       2.7    House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this action. House  
19 Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.

20       2.8    Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal  
21 entity not named as a Party to this action.

22       2.9    Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this  
23 action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this action and have appeared in this action  
24 on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of that party.

25       2.10   Party: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors, employees,  
26 consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).

27       2.11   Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery  
28 Material in this action.

1           2.12 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support services  
2 (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and  
3 organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and  
4 subcontractors.

5           2.13 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as  
6 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

7           2.14 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a  
8 Producing Party.

9       3.     SCOPE

10           The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material  
11 (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2)  
12 all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony,  
13 conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.  
14 However, the protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order do not cover the following  
15 information: (a) any information that is in the public domain at the time of disclosure to a  
16 Receiving Party or becomes part of the public domain after its disclosure to a Receiving Party as  
17 a result of publication not involving a violation of this Order, including becoming part of the  
18 public record through trial or otherwise; and (b) any information known to the Receiving Party  
19 prior to the disclosure or obtained by the Receiving Party after the disclosure from a source who  
20 obtained the information lawfully and under no obligation of confidentiality to the Designating  
21 Party. Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by a separate agreement or order.

22       4.     DURATION

23           Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by  
24 this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court  
25 order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all  
26 claims and defenses in this action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after  
27 the completion and exhaustion of all appeals, re-hearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this  
28

1 action, including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time  
2 pursuant to applicable law.

3 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

4 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each Party  
5 or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care  
6 to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards.  
7 The Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents,  
8 items, or oral or written communications that qualify – so that other portions of the material,  
9 documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept  
10 unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

11 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are  
12 shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to  
13 unnecessarily encumber or retard the case development process or to impose unnecessary  
14 expenses and burdens on other parties) expose the Designating Party to sanctions.  
15 If it comes to a Designating Party’s attention that information or items that it designated for  
16 protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other  
17 Parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

18 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this Order  
19 (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered,  
20 Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so  
21 designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

22 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

23 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but  
24 excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing  
25 Party affix the legend “CONFIDENTIAL” to each page that contains protected material. If only a  
26 portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also  
27 must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the  
28 margins). A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents or materials available for

1 inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated  
2 which material it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the  
3 designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed  
4 “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants copied and  
5 produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for  
6 protection under this Order. Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party  
7 must affix the “CONFIDENTIAL” legend to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a  
8 portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also  
9 must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the  
10 margins).

11 (b) for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial proceedings, that the  
12 Designating Party identify on the record, before the close of the deposition, hearing or other  
13 proceeding, all protected testimony that contains confidential information, may be designated  
14 “CONFIDENTIAL” and thereby obtain the protections accorded other “CONFIDENTIAL”  
15 information.

16 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other  
17 tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container  
18 or containers in which the information or item is stored the legend “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a  
19 portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the  
20 extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

21 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to  
22 designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party’s  
23 right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a  
24 designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is  
25 treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

## 26 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

27 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of  
28 confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating Party’s confidentiality

1 designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic  
2 burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a Party does not waive its right to  
3 challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the  
4 original designation is disclosed.

5           6.2    Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution  
6 process by providing written notice of each designation it is challenging and describing the basis  
7 for each challenge. To avoid ambiguity as to whether a challenge has been made, the written  
8 notice must recite that the challenge to confidentiality is being made in accordance with this  
9 specific paragraph of the Protective Order. The parties shall attempt to resolve each challenge in  
10 good faith and must begin the process by conferring directly (in voice to voice dialogue; other  
11 forms of communication are not sufficient) within 14 days of the date of service of notice. In  
12 conferring, the Challenging Party must explain the basis for its belief that the confidentiality  
13 designation was not proper and must give the Designating Party an opportunity to review the  
14 designated material, to reconsider the circumstances, and, if no change in designation is offered,  
15 to explain the basis for the chosen designation. A Challenging Party may proceed to the next  
16 stage of the challenge process only if it has engaged in this meet and confer process first or  
17 establishes that the Designating Party is unwilling to participate in the meet and confer process in  
18 a timely manner.

19           **6.3    Judicial Intervention. If the Parties cannot resolve a challenge without court**  
20 **intervention, the parties shall follow the Court’s Standing Order in Civil Cases regarding**  
21 **Discovery and Discovery Motions. The parties may file a joint letter brief regarding**  
22 **retaining confidentiality within 21 days of the initial notice of challenge or within 14 days of**  
23 **the parties agreeing that the meet and confer process will not resolve their dispute,**  
24 **whichever is earlier. Failure by a Designating Party to file such discovery dispute letter**  
25 **within the applicable 21 or 14 day period (set forth above) with the Court shall**  
26 **automatically waive the confidentiality designation for each challenged designation. If,**  
27 **after submitting a joint letter brief, the Court allows that a motion may be filed, any such**  
28 **motion must be accompanied by a competent declaration affirming that the movant has**

1 complied with the meet and confer requirements imposed in the preceding paragraph. The  
2 Court, in its discretion, may elect to transfer the discovery matter to a Magistrate Judge.

3 In addition, the parties may file a joint letter brief regarding a challenge to a  
4 confidentiality designation at any time if there is good cause for doing so, including a  
5 challenge to the designation of a deposition transcript or any portions thereof. If, after  
6 submitting a joint letter brief, the Court allows that a motion may be filed, any motion  
7 brought pursuant to this provision must be accompanied by a competent declaration  
8 affirming that the movant has complied with the meet and confer requirements imposed by  
9 the preceding paragraph. The Court, in its discretion, may elect to refer the discovery  
10 matter to a Magistrate Judge.

11 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the  
12 Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to  
13 harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the  
14 Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived the confidentiality  
15 designation by failing to file a letter brief to retain confidentiality as described above, all  
16 parties shall continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is  
entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the court rules on the challenge.

17 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

18 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or  
19 produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this case only for prosecuting,  
20 defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to  
21 the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the litigation has  
22 been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL  
23 DISPOSITION).

24 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and  
25 in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

26 7.2 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered  
27 by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any  
28 information or item designated "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:

1 (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this action, as well as  
2 employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the  
3 information for this litigation and who have signed the;

4 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving  
5 Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation;

6 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is  
7 reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and  
8 Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

9 (d) the court and its personnel;

10 (e) court reporters and their staff, professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors,  
11 and Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who  
12 have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

13 (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is reasonably  
14 necessary and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A),  
15 unless otherwise covered in subparagraphs 7.2(a)-(e) or agreed by the Designating Party or  
16 ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that  
17 reveal Protected Material must be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be  
18 disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order.

19 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or  
20 other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

21 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER  
22 LITIGATION

23 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels  
24 disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as "CONFIDENTIAL," that Party  
25 must:

26 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a  
27 copy of the subpoena or court order;

28 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in



1 the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to  
2 this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order;  
3 and

4 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the  
5 Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

6 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the  
7 subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as  
8 “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order  
9 issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s permission. The Designating Party  
10 shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material –  
11 and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving  
12 Party in this action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

13 9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN THIS  
14 LITIGATION

15 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in  
16 this action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information produced by Non-Parties in  
17 connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order.  
18 Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking  
19 additional protections.

20 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a  
21 Non-Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement  
22 with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s confidential information, then the Party shall:

23 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some  
24 or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;

25 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order  
26 in this litigation, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the  
27 information requested; and

28 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party.

1 (c) If the Non-Party fails to object or seek a protective order from this court within 14  
2 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the  
3 Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely  
4 seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession  
5 or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a  
6 determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the  
7 burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

8 10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

9 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected  
10 Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective  
11 Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the  
12 unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the  
13 Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were  
14 made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the  
15 "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

16 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED  
17 MATERIAL

18 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently  
19 produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the  
20 Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This  
21 provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery  
22 order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of  
23 Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a  
24 communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product  
25 protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order  
26 submitted to the court.

27 12. MISCELLANEOUS

28 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to

1 seek its modification by the court in the future, and nothing in this Protective Order shall be  
2 construed to prevent a Party from seeking such further provisions enhancing or limiting  
3 confidentiality as may be appropriate.

4 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective  
5 Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any  
6 information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no  
7 Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered  
8 by this Protective Order.

9 12.3 Filing Protected Material. Without written permission from the Designating Party  
10 or a court order secured after appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file in  
11 the public record in this action any Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any  
12 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may only be filed  
13 under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at  
14 issue. Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 79-5, a sealing order will issue only upon a request  
15 establishing that the Protected Material at issue is privileged, protectable as a trade secret, or  
16 otherwise entitled to protection under the law. If a Receiving Party's request to file Protected  
17 Material under seal pursuant to Civil Local Rule 79-5(d) is denied by the court, then the  
18 Receiving Party may file the information in the public record pursuant to Civil Local Rule 79-5(e)  
19 unless otherwise instructed by the court.

20 12.4 Waiver. No action taken in accordance with this Protective Order shall be  
21 construed as a waiver of any claim or defense in the action or of any position as to discoverability  
22 or admissibility of evidence. Neither the entry of this Order nor the designation of any  
23 information as "Confidential," nor the failure to make such designation, shall constitute evidence  
24 with respect to any issue in this action.

25 12.5 The Court retains the right to allow disclosure of any subject covered by this  
26 stipulation or to modify this stipulation at any time in the interest of justice.

27 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

28 Within 60 days after the final disposition of this action, as defined in paragraph 4, each

1 Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such  
2 material. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts,  
3 compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected  
4 Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must  
5 submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the  
6 Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all  
7 the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has  
8 not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or  
9 capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to  
10 retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts,  
11 legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work  
12 product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected  
13 Material. Any such archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to  
14 this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

15 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

16 Dated: October 3, 2017

Anderson, Ogilvie & Brewer LLP

18 By: /s/ Mark F. Anderson

19 Mark F. Anderson

20 Counsel for Plaintiff

21 Dated: October 3, 2017

Musick, Peeler & Garrett LLP

23 By: /s/ Donald E. Bradley

24 Donald E. Bradley

25 Counsel for Defendant  
26 PHEAA

27 Dated: October 3, 2017

Nokes & Quinn

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

By: /s/ Thomas P. Quinn  
Thomas P. Quinn

Counsel for Defendant  
EQUIFAX INFORMATION SERVICES,  
LLC

**FILER ATTESTATION**


Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 5.1(i)(3), I, Mark F. Anderson attests under penalty of perjury that concurrence in the filing of this document has been obtained from all of the signatories.

Dated: October 3, 2017.

*/s/ Mark F. Anderson*

**PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.**

Dated: October 4, 2017.

  
Yvonne Gonzalez Rogers  
United States District Court Judge