

United States District Court  
Northern District of California

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
**NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA – OAKLAND DIVISION**

<p>RED REAPER a.k.a. BRETT C. HUSKA,</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">Plaintiff,</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">vs.</p> <p>ACE AMERICAN INSURANCE COMPANY, a Pennsylvania corporation; and DOES 1 through 10, inclusive,</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">Defendant.</p>	}	<p>CASE NO. 4:21-CV-05876-HSG</p> <p><b>PROTECTIVE ORDER</b></p>
--	---	--

After having reviewed the Stipulation of the Parties Regarding Confidentiality of Documents and Things, and good cause appearing, this Court orders as follows:

1. **PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS**

Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that

1 are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles. The parties further  
2 acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does  
3 not entitle them to file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth  
4 the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party  
5 seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

6 **2. DEFINITIONS**

7 2.1 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of  
8 information or items under this Order.

9 2.2 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is  
10 generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal  
11 Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c).

12 2.3 Counsel (without qualifier): Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel  
13 (as well as their support staff).

14 2.4 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items  
15 that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

16 2.5 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the  
17 medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other  
18 things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in  
19 disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

20 2.6 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter  
21 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert  
22 witness or as a consultant in this action.

23 2.7 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this action. House  
24 Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.

25 2.8 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other  
26 legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

27 2.9 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this  
28

1 action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this action and have appeared in this  
2 action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf  
3 of that party.

4 2.10 Party: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors,  
5 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support  
6 staffs).

7 2.11 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery  
8 Material in this action.

9 2.12 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support  
10 services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations,  
11 and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and  
12 subcontractors.

13 2.13 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as  
14 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

15 2.14 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a  
16 Producing Party.

17 3. **SCOPE**

18 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected  
19 Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected  
20 Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3)  
21 any testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal  
22 Protected Material. However, the protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order do not  
23 cover the following information: (a) any information that is in the public domain at the time  
24 of disclosure to a Receiving Party or becomes part of the public domain after its disclosure to  
25 a Receiving Party as a result of publication not involving a violation of this Order, including  
26 becoming part of the public record through trial or otherwise; and (b) any information known  
27 to the Receiving Party prior to the disclosure or obtained by the Receiving Party after the  
28

1 disclosure from a source who obtained the information lawfully and under no obligation of  
2 confidentiality to the Designating Party. Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be  
3 governed by a separate agreement or order.

4 **DURATION**

5 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed  
6 by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a  
7 court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1)  
8 dismissal of all claims and defenses in this action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final  
9 judgment herein after the completion and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands,  
10 trials, or reviews of this action, including the time limits for filing any motions or  
11 applications for extension of time pursuant to applicable law.

12 **DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

13 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each  
14 Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must  
15 take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the  
16 appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts  
17 of material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify – so that other  
18 portions of the material, documents, items, or communications for which protection is not  
19 warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

20 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are  
21 shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to  
22 unnecessarily encumber or retard the case development process or to impose unnecessary  
23 expenses and burdens on other parties) expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

24 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it designated for  
25 protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other  
26 Parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

27 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this  
28

1 Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or  
2 ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must  
3 be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

4 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

5 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but  
6 excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing  
7 Party affix the legend “CONFIDENTIAL” to each page that contains protected material. If  
8 only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing  
9 Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate  
10 markings in the margins).

11 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents or materials available for inspection  
12 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which  
13 material it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the  
14 designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed  
15 “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants copied  
16 and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents, or portions thereof,  
17 qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing the specified documents, the  
18 Producing Party must affix the “CONFIDENTIAL” legend to each page that contains  
19 Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for  
20 protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by  
21 making appropriate markings in the margins).

22 (b) for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial proceedings, that  
23 the Designating Party identify on the record, before the close of the deposition, hearing, or  
24 other proceeding, all protected testimony.

25 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any  
26 other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the  
27 container or containers in which the information or item is stored the legend  
28

1 “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information or item warrant  
2 protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected  
3 portion(s).

4 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to  
5 designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating  
6 Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction  
7 of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material  
8 is treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

9 **6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS**

10 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of  
11 confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating Party’s  
12 confidentiality designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness,  
13 unnecessary economic burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a Party  
14 does not waive its right to challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a  
15 challenge promptly after the original designation is disclosed.

16 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution  
17 process by providing written notice of each designation it is challenging and describing the  
18 basis for each challenge. To avoid ambiguity as to whether a challenge has been made, the  
19 written notice must recite that the challenge to confidentiality is being made in accordance  
20 with this specific paragraph of the Protective Order. The parties shall attempt to resolve each  
21 challenge in good faith and must begin the process by conferring directly (in voice to voice  
22 dialogue; other forms of communication are not sufficient) within 14 days of the date of  
23 service of notice. In conferring, the Challenging Party must explain the basis for its belief  
24 that the confidentiality designation was not proper and must give the Designating Party an  
25 opportunity to review the designated material, to reconsider the circumstances, and, if no  
26 change in designation is offered, to explain the basis for the chosen designation. A  
27 Challenging Party may proceed to the next stage of the challenge process only if it has  
28

1 engaged in this meet and confer process first or establishes that the Designating Party is  
2 unwilling to participate in the meet and confer process in a timely manner.

3       6.3    Judicial Intervention. If the Parties cannot resolve a challenge without court  
4 intervention, the Designating Party shall file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality  
5 under Civil Local Rule 7 (and in compliance with Civil Local Rule 79-5, if applicable)  
6 within 21 days of the initial notice of challenge or within 14 days of the parties agreeing that  
7 the meet and confer process will not resolve their dispute, whichever is earlier. Each such  
8 motion must be accompanied by a competent declaration affirming that the movant has  
9 complied with the meet and confer requirements imposed in the preceding paragraph. Failure  
10 by the Designating Party to make such a motion including the required declaration within 21  
11 days (or 14 days, if applicable) shall automatically waive the confidentiality designation for  
12 each challenged designation. In addition, the Challenging Party may file a motion  
13 challenging a confidentiality designation at any time if there is good cause for doing so,  
14 including a challenge to the designation of a deposition transcript or any portions thereof.  
15 Any motion brought pursuant to this provision must be accompanied by a competent  
16 declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet and confer requirements  
17 imposed by the preceding paragraph.

18       The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the  
19 Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to  
20 harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the  
21 Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived the confidentiality  
22 designation by failing to file a motion to retain confidentiality as described above, all parties  
23 shall continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled  
24 under the Producing Party's designation until the court rules on the challenge.

25   7.       **ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

26       7.1    Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is  
27 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this case only  
28

1 for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Such Protected Material  
2 may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this  
3 Order. When the litigation has been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the  
4 provisions of section 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

5 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location  
6 and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this  
7 Order.

8 7.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless otherwise  
9 ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may  
10 disclose any information or item designated “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

11 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this action, as well as  
12 employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose  
13 the information for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and  
14 Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A;

15 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the  
16 Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have  
17 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

18 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is  
19 reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and  
20 Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

21 (d) the court and its personnel;

22 (e) court reporters and their staff, professional jury or trial consultants, mock  
23 jurors, and Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this  
24 litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit  
25 A);

26 (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is  
27 reasonably necessary and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be  
28

1 Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the  
2 court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal  
3 Protected Material must be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed  
4 to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order.

5 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a  
6 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

7 8. **PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN**  
8 **OTHER LITIGATION**

9 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that  
10 compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as  
11 “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

12 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall  
13 include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

14 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue  
15 in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is  
16 subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated  
17 Protective Order; and

18 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by  
19 the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

20 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the  
21 subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as  
22 “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order  
23 issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s permission. The Designating  
24 Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential  
25 material – and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging  
26 a Receiving Party in this action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

27 9. **A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED**

1                   **IN THIS LITIGATION**

2                   (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party  
3 in this action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information produced by Non-  
4 Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by  
5 this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from  
6 seeking additional protections.

7                   (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a  
8 Non-Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an  
9 agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s confidential information, then  
10 the Party shall:

11                   (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that  
12 some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-  
13 Party;

14                   (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective  
15 Order in this litigation, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific  
16 description of the information requested; and

17                   (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party.

18                   (c) If the Non-Party fails to object or seek a protective order from this court  
19 within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party  
20 may produce the Non-Party’s confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If  
21 the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any  
22 information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with  
23 the Non-Party before a determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the  
24 Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its  
25 Protected Material.

26                   **10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

27                   If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed  
28

1 Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated  
2 Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating  
3 Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized  
4 copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized  
5 disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons  
6 to execute the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as  
7 Exhibit A.

8 11. **INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE**  
9 **PROTECTED MATERIAL**

10 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently  
11 produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the  
12 Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This  
13 provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery  
14 order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of  
15 Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure  
16 of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product  
17 protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order  
18 submitted to the court.

19 12. **MISCELLANEOUS**

20 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person  
21 to seek its modification by the court in the future.

22 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective  
23 Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing  
24 any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order.  
25 Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the  
26 material covered by this Protective Order.

27 12.3 Filing Protected Material. Without written permission from the Designating  
28

1 Party or a court order secured after appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may  
2 not file in the public record in this action any Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file  
3 under seal any Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected  
4 Material may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the  
5 specific Protected Material at issue. Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 79-5, a sealing order will  
6 issue only upon a request establishing that the Protected Material at issue is privileged,  
7 protectable as a trade secret, or otherwise entitled to protection under the law. If a Receiving  
8 Party's request to file Protected Material under seal pursuant to Civil Local Rule 79-5(d) is  
9 denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public record  
10 pursuant to Civil Local Rule 79-5(e) unless otherwise instructed by the court.

11 13. **FINAL DISPOSITION**

12 Within 60 days after the final disposition of this action, as defined in paragraph 4,  
13 each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy  
14 such material. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies,  
15 abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the  
16 Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving  
17 Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person  
18 or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category,  
19 where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms  
20 that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or  
21 any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding  
22 this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers,  
23 trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and  
24 trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product,  
25 even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or  
26 constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4  
27 (DURATION).

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.**

DATED: 9/19/2022

  
HAYWOOD S. GILLIAM, JR.  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

**EXHIBIT A**

**ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND**

I, \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full name], of \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Northern District of California on [date] in the case of Red Reaper a.k.a. Brett C. Huska, Plaintiff, vs. Ace American Insurance Company, Defendant, Case No.: 4:21-cv-05876-HSG. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the Northern District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.

I hereby appoint \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full name] of \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

City and State where sworn and signed: \_\_\_\_\_

Printed name: \_\_\_\_\_

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_