4 5 6 7 8 9 10	ROBBINS GELLER RUDMAN & DOWD LLP JOHN J. STOIA, JR. (141757) BONNY E. SWEENEY (176174) THOMAS R. MERRICK (177987) ALEXANDRA S. BERNAY (211068) CARMEN A. MEDICI (248417) 655 West Broadway, Suite 1900 San Diego, CA 92101 Telephone: 619/231-1058 619/231-7423 (fax) johns@rgrdlaw.com bonnys@rgrdlaw.com tmerrick@rgrdlaw.com tmerrick@rgrdlaw.com cmedici@rgrdlaw.com THE KATRIEL LAW FIRM ROY A. KATRIEL (<i>pro hac vice</i>) 1101 30th Street, N.W., Suite 500 Washington, DC 20007 Telephone: 202/625-4342 202/330-5593 (fax)	
13	rak@katriellaw.com	
14	Co-Lead Counsel for Plaintiffs	
15	[Additional counsel appear on signature page.]	
16	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT	
17	NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA	
18		E DIVISION
19	THE APPLE IPOD ITUNES ANTI-TRUST LITIGATION) Lead Case No. C-05-00037-JW(HRL)) <u>CLASS ACTION</u>
20	This Document Relates To:) PLAINTIFFS' NOTICE OF MOTION AND
21	ALL ACTIONS.) MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE) PLAINTIFFS' OPPOSITION TO APPLE'S
22		 SUPPLEMENTAL OBJECTIONS TO REPLY DECLARATION OF ROGER G.
23) NOLL AND SUPPLEMENTAL OPPOSITION TO CLASS CERTIFICATION
24		MOTION
25 26		JUDGE: Hon. James Ware DATE: TBD
26 27		TIME:TBDCTRM:8, 4th Floor
27		
20		
	618870_1	Dockets.Justia.com

1

6188

Ш

TO: ALL PARTIES AND THEIR ATTORNEYS OF RECORD

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that pursuant to Local Rule 7-11, as soon as the Court's schedule
allows, in Courtroom 8, 4th Floor, of the above-captioned Court, located at 280 South First Street,
San Jose, California 95113, before the Honorable James Ware, Plaintiffs Melanie Tucker, Marianna
Rosen and Somtai Troy Charoensak (collectively, "Plaintiffs") will and hereby do through
undersigned counsel, move the Court for leave to respond to Apple's supplemental objections to the
reply declaration of Plaintiffs' expert, Professor Roger G. Noll, and to respond to Apple's improper
supplemental opposition to Plaintiffs' motion for class certification.

9 As Plaintiffs explain in their response to Apple's improper motion, Apple has completely mischaracterized the deposition of Professor Noll and has improperly filed a supplemental 10 11 opposition to Plaintiffs' class certification motion. Their motion is in violation of the Court's Order 12 setting a briefing schedule and gives Plaintiffs no opportunity to respond, effectively giving Apple 13 the last word on Plaintiffs' motion. It would be unfair to allow Apple's blatant distortion of 14 Professor Noll's testimony to go unrebutted. Contrary to Apple's characterization, Professor Noll 15 developed a workable preliminary regression model, which shows that impact and damages can be 16 proved by relying on common proof. Apple's selective quoting and out-of-context snippets do 17 nothing to change the fact that legal and factual issues predominate over any individual issues. 18 Plaintiffs submit that good cause exists to permit a short response to rebut Apple's improper 19 portrayal of Professor Noll's testimony.

20	DATED: April 15, 2011	Respectfully submitted,
21		ROBBINS GELLER RUDMAN & DOWD LLP
22	2	JOHN J. STOIA, JR. BONNY E. SWEENEY
23	3	THOMAS R. MERRICK
24	•	ALEXANDRA S. BERNAY CARMEN A. MEDICI
25	5	
26	5	s/ Bonny E. Sweeney
27	,	BONNY E. SWEENEY
28	3	
70_1	PLTFS' NOT & MOT FOR LEAVE TO FILE PLTFS OF NOLL & SUPP OPP TO CLASS CERT MOTION	

- 1 -

1		
2 3	655 West Broadway, Suite 1900 San Diego, CA 92101 Telephone: 619/231-1058 619/231-7423 (fax)	
4	THE KATRIEL LAW FIRM	
5	ROY A. KATRIEL 1101 30th Street, N.W., Suite 500	
6	Washington, DC 20007 Telephone: 202/625-4342 202/330-5593 (fax)	
7	Co-Lead Counsel for Plaintiffs	
8	BONNETT, FAIRBOURN, FRIEDMAN	
9 10	& BALINT, P.C. ANDREW S. FRIEDMAN FRANCIS J. BALINT, JR.	
10	ELAINE A. RYAN TODD D. CARPENTER	
	2901 N. Central Avenue, Suite 1000	
12 13	Phoenix, AZ 85012 Telephone: 602/274-1100 602/274-1199 (fax)	
14	BRAUN LAW GROUP, P.C.	
15	MICHAEL D. BRAUN 10680 West Pico Blvd., Suite 280 Los Angeles, CA 90064	
16	Telephone: 310/836-6000 310/836-6010 (fax)	
17	MURRAY, FRANK & SAILER LLP	
18	BRIAN P. MURRAY JACQUELINE SAILER	
19	275 Madison Avenue, Suite 801 New York, NY 10016	
20	Telephone: 212/682-1818 212/682-1892 (fax)	
21	GLANCY BINKOW & GOLDBERG LLP	
22	MICHAEL GOLDBERG 1801 Avenue of the Stars, Suite 311	
23	Los Angeles, CA 90067 Telephone: 310/201-9150	
24	310/201-9160 (fax)	
25	Additional Counsel for Plaintiffs	
26		
27		
28		
618870_1	PLTFS' NOT & MOT FOR LEAVE TO FILE PLTFS' OPP TO APPLE'S SUPP OBJ TO REPLY DECL OF NOLL & SUPP OPP TO CLASS CERT MOTION - C-05-00037-JW(HRL) - 2	

1	<u>CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE</u>		
2	I hereby certify that on April 15, 2011, I authorized the electronic filing of the foregoing with		
3	the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the		
4	e-mail addresses denoted on the attached Electronic Mail Notice List, and I hereby certify that I		
5	caused to be mailed the foregoing document or paper via the United States Postal Service to the non-		
6	CM/ECF participants indicated on the attached Manual Notice List.		
7	I certify under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the		
8	foregoing is true and correct. Executed on April 15, 2011.		
9	s/ Bonny E. Sweeney BONNY E. SWEENEY		
10	ROBBINS GELLER RUDMAN		
11	& DOWD LLP		
12	655 West Broadway, Suite 1900 San Diego, CA 92101-3301 Talanhanay (10/221 1058)		
13	Telephone: 619/231-1058 619/231-7423 (fax)		
14	E-mail: bonnys@rgrdlaw.com		
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			
28			
618870_1			

Mailing Information for a Case 5:05-cv-00037-JW

Electronic Mail Notice List

The following are those who are currently on the list to receive e-mail notices for this case.

- Francis Joseph Balint , Jr fbalint@bffb.com
- Alexandra Senya Bernay xanb@rgrdlaw.com
- Michael D Braun service@braunlawgroup.com
- Michael D. Braun service@braunlawgroup.com,clc@braunlawgroup.com
- Todd David Carpenter tcarpenter@bffb.com,pjohnson@bffb.com,rcreech@bffb.com
- Andrew S. Friedman khonecker@bffb.com,rcreech@bffb.com,afriedman@bffb.com
- Alreen Haeggquist alreenh@zhlaw.com,judyj@zhlaw.com
- Roy Arie Katriel rak@katriellaw.com,rk618@aol.com
- Thomas J. Kennedy tkennedy@murrayfrank.com
- David Craig Kiernan dkiernan@jonesday.com,lwong@jonesday.com
- Carmen Anthony Medici cmedici@rgrdlaw.com,slandry@rgrdlaw.com
- Thomas Robert Merrick tmerrick@rgrdlaw.com,e_file_sd@rgrdlaw.com,e_file_sf@rgrdlaw.com
- Caroline Nason Mitchell cnmitchell@jonesday.com,mlandsborough@jonesday.com,ewallace@jonesday.com

https://ecf.cand.uscourts.gov/cgi-bin/MailList.pl?109065980355971-L_366... 4/15/2011

- Robert Allan Mittelstaedt ramittelstaedt@jonesday.com,mlandsborough@jonesday.com
- Brian P Murray
 bmurray@murrayfrank.com
- George A. Riley griley@omm.com,lperez@omm.com,cchiu@omm.com
- Elaine A. Ryan eryan@bffb.com,pjohnson@bffb.com
- Jacqueline Sailer jsailer@murrayfrank.com
- Michael Tedder Scott michaelscott@jonesday.com,amhoward@jonesday.com
- Craig Ellsworth Stewart cestewart@jonesday.com,mlandsborough@jonesday.com
- John J. Stoia , Jr jstoia@rgrdlaw.com
- Bonny E. Sweeney bonnys@rgrdlaw.com,christinas@rgrdlaw.com,E_file_sd@rgrdlaw.com
- Helen I. Zeldes helenz@zhlaw.com

Manual Notice List

The following is the list of attorneys who are **not** on the list to receive e-mail notices for this case (who therefore require manual noticing). You may wish to use your mouse to select and copy this list into your word processing program in order to create notices or labels for these recipients.

• (No manual recipients)