| Lalo v. Apple | , Inc et al | | Doc. 34 |
|---------------|--|---|-----------------|
| | | | |
| | | | |
| 1 | | | |
| 2 | | | |
| 3 | | | |
| 4 | | | |
| 5 | | | |
| 6 | | | |
| 7 | UNITED STATES | DISTRICT COURT | |
| 8 | NORTHERN DISTRI | ICT OF CALIFORNIA | |
| 9 | SAN JOSE | DIVISION | |
| 10 | | | |
| 11 | | | |
| 12 | JONATHAN LALO, individually and On Be- | Case No. CV-10-5878 LHK (PSG) | |
| 13 | half of a Class of Similarly Situated Individuals, | | |
| 14 | Plaintiff, | STIPULATION AND [Proposed] CASE MANAGEMENT ORDER NO. 1 | |
| 15 | v. | | |
| 16 | | | |
| 17 | APPLE INC, a California Corporation; | | |
| 18 | BACKFLIP, a Delaware Corporation; DICTIONARY.COM, a California | | |
| 19 | Corporation; PANDORA, INC., a California Corporation; THE WEATHER CHANNEL, a | | |
| 20 | Georgia Corporation, | | |
| 21 | Defendants. | | |
| 22 | DUSTIN FREEMAN, JARED PARSLEY, COLE PARR, and PRECIOUS ARRING- | Case No. CV-10-5881 LHK (PSG) | |
| 23 | TON, on behalf of themselves and all similarly situated, | | |
| 24 | Plaintiffs, | | |
| 25 | V. | | |
| 26 | | | |
| 27 | APPLE, INC., a Delaware Corporation; | | |
| 28 | GOGII, INC., a Delaware Corporation; PAN- DORA MEDIA, INC., a California Corpora- | | |
| | CASE MANAGEMENT ORDER NUMBER 1 | 1 | |
| | | Doc | kets.Justia.com |

| 1 2 3 | tion; BACKFLIP STUDIOS, INC., a Delaware Corporation; THE WEATHER CHANNEL, INC., a Georgia Corporation; DICTIONARY.COM, LLC., a California Corporation; OUTFIT7 LTD, a Foreign Corporation; ROOM CANDY, INC., a California Corpora- | | |
|----------|---|-----------------------------|--|
| 4 | tion; SUNSTORM INTERACTIVE, Inc., an Indiana Corporation, | | |
| 5 | Defendants. | | |
| 6 | | | |
| 7 8 | ANTHONY CHIU, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated, | Case No. CV-11-0407 LHK | |
| 9 | Plaintiff, | | |
| 10 | v. | | |
| 11 | APPLE, INC., a California Corporation, and DOES 1 to 50 inclusive, | | |
| 12 | Defendants. | | |
| 13 | | | |
| 14 | DANIEL RODIMER, et al. | Case No. CV-11-0700 PSG | |
| 15 | Plaintiffs | | |
| 16 | V. | | |
| 17 | APPLE, INC., FLURRY, INC., MEDIALETS, INC., PINCH MEDIA, INC., QUATTRO | | |
| 18 | WIRELESS, INC., IAC/INTERACTIVE | | |
| | CORP., DICTIONARY.COM, PANDORA, INC., and THE WEATHER CHANNEL | | |
| 19 20 | Defendants. | | |
| 21 | | | |
| 22 | | | |
| | STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED] CAS | E MANAGEMENT ORDER NUMBER 1 | |
| 23 | Subject to the Court's review and approval, IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND | | |
| 24 | AGREED AND ORDERED as follows: | | |
| 25 | WHEREAS, the related actions Lalo, et al. v. Apple Inc., et al., CV-10-5878-LHK; | | |
| 26 | Freeman, et al. v. Apple Inc., et al., CV-10-5881-LHK, Chiu v. Apple, Inc., et al., CV-11-0407- | | |
| 27 | LHK and Rodimer v. Apple, Inc., et al., CV 11-0700 PSG (collectively, the "Actions") are | | |
| 28 | pending before this Court; and, | | |
| | | | |

CASE MANAGEMENT ORDER NUMBER 1

WHEREAS, counsel for the various plaintiffs have each concluded that it is in the best interests of the respective parties and absent putative class members that the above-captioned actions be consolidated for all purposes and proceed as contemplated herein; and,

WHEREAS, all parties that have appeared, through their respective counsel have stipulated to the terms provided herein;

WHEREAS, it is anticipated that additional related actions may be transferred to, removed to, or filed in this Court; and,

WHEREAS, the existence of common questions of law and fact in the Actions now pending before this Court, the interests of fair and efficient administration of the Actions, the avoidance of unnecessary duplicative efforts and the avoidance of inconsistency in outcomes, warrants the consolidation of the Actions, establishment of an organizational structure for plaintiffs' counsel, and the setting of a status conference to discuss, among other things, schedules for the filing of pleadings, motion practice and discovery, and good cause appearing therefore:

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED AS FOLLOWS:

I. CONSOLIDATION AND TREATMENT OF SUBSEQUENT ACTIONS

1. The Court finds that *Lalo*, *et al.* v. *Apple Inc.*, *et al.*, CV-10-5878-LHK; *Free-man*, *et al.* v. *Apple Inc.*, *et al.*, CV-10-5881-LHK, *Chiu v. Apple, Inc.*, CV-11-0407-LHK and *Rodimer*, *et al.* v. *Apple, Inc.*, *et al.* CV-11-0700-PSG present substantially similar issues of law and fact, have been previously related, and are hereby consolidated into *Lalo*, *et al.* v. *Apple Inc.*, *et al.*, CV-10-5878, and are referred to herein as the Consolidated Action. Each document filed by a party to this litigation shall bear the following caption:

| T 'DI A 1' ' T'' ' | N CV 10 5070 LUV (DCC) |
|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|
| In re iPhone Application Litigation | No. CV-10-5878 LHK (PSG) |

2. The terms of this Order shall apply to the Consolidated Action and to any and all actions later instituted in, removed to, or transferred to this Court that involve the same or substantially similar issues of law and fact, subject to the following procedures:

- a. When such a case is filed in, removed to, or transferred to this Court, the Clerk of Court shall:
 - (1) place a copy of this Order in the separate file for such action;
 - (2) provide a copy of this Order by mail or electronically pursuant to the local rules to counsel for plaintiff(s) in the newly filed or transferred action and to any defendant(s) in the newly filed or transferred action; and
 - (3) make an appropriate entry on the docket for the Consolidated Action.
- b. Each new case that arises out of the subject matter of the Consolidated Action which is filed in this Court or transferred to this Court, shall be consolidated with the Consolidated Action and this Order shall apply thereto, unless a party in such newly-filed or transferred action objects to consolidation, as provided for herein, or any provision of this order, within ten (10) days after the date upon which a copy of this Order is served on counsel for such party, by filing an application for relief and this Court deems it appropriate to grant such application.
- 3. Counsel shall call to the attention of the Court and the Clerk the filing or transfer of any case that might properly be consolidated with the Consolidated Action. Mailing or other delivery of a copy of this Order by Defendants' counsel or Plaintiffs' Interim Class Counsel (see II. Below), as appropriate, to the counsel in any newly filed or transferred actions shall constitute valid notice thereof for purposes of establishing its applicability to such action in accordance herewith.

II. ORGANIZATION OF PLAINTIFFS' COUNSEL

1. Plaintiffs shall use their best efforts to self-organize and recommend to the Court counsel to serve as Interim Class Counsel under FRCP 23(g). Such recommendation shall be submitted to the Court with papers supporting the qualifications for such Interim Class Counsel within ten days of the entry of this Order. Any Plaintiff may oppose such recommendation by filing an opposition within 10 days of notice of consolidation of their case or the filing of said recommendation, whichever is later.

| 1 | 2. | Interir | m Class Counsel, acting on behalf of Plaintiffs, shall have the following |
|----|---------|---------|---|
| 2 | duties: | | |
| 3 | | a. | To coordinate all proceedings, including preparing, structuring, and pre- |
| 4 | | | senting pretrial and other management related orders; |
| 5 | | b. | To encourage full cooperation and efficiency among all counsel; |
| 6 | | c. | To create any necessary committees and appoint committee chairs and |
| 7 | | | otherwise delegate responsibilities for specific tasks in a manner to as- |
| 8 | | | sure that pretrial and trial preparation is conducted effectively, efficient- |
| 9 | | | ly, and economically; |
| 10 | | d. | To delegate work responsibilities and monitor the activities of counsel to |
| 11 | | | assure that schedules are met and unnecessary expenditures of time and |
| 12 | | | expense are avoided; |
| 13 | | e. | To act as spokespersons at all court conferences; |
| 14 | | f. | To call meetings of themselves and/or other counsel as appropriate or |
| 15 | | | necessary from time to time; |
| 16 | | g. | To initiate and conduct settlement negotiations with counsel for the vari- |
| 17 | | | ous Defendants; |
| 18 | | h. | To determine Plaintiffs' position on all matters arising during this litiga- |
| 19 | | | tion (after such consultation with other counsel as they deem appropri- |
| 20 | | | ate) and present such position orally and/or in writing to the Court and |
| 21 | | | opposing parties; |
| 22 | | i. | To consult with and employ experts, as necessary; |
| 23 | | j. | To initiate, coordinate and conduct discovery; |
| 24 | | k. | To represent Plaintiffs at trial and on any appeal of this matter; |
| 25 | | 1. | To negotiate and execute agreements with local counsel or other cooper- |
| 26 | | | ating attorneys; |
| 27 | | | |
| 28 | | | |

- m. To determine the appropriate fee allocation among Plaintiffs' counsel as they contributed to resolution or otherwise provided benefit to the class;
 and
- n. To perform such other duties as are necessary in connection with the prosecution of this litigation.
- 3. Interim Class Counsel shall be the contact between Plaintiffs' counsel and Defendant's counsel as well as the spokesperson for Plaintiffs' counsel. All agreements reached with the Interim Class Counsel shall be binding on all other Plaintiffs' counsel in the Consolidated Action.
- 4. Interim Class Counsel are hereby designated as the counsel for Plaintiffs in the Consolidated Action upon whom all notices, orders, pleadings, motions, discovery, and memoranda relating to the Consolidated Action shall be served, and Defendants shall effect service of papers on Plaintiffs in the Consolidated Action by serving Interim Class Counsel.
- 5. No motion or request for discovery shall be served or filed by Plaintiffs, or other pretrial proceedings initiated by Plaintiffs, except by or with the authorization of Interim Class Counsel.
- 6. The organizational structure set forth in this section applies to all Plaintiffs' counsel in the Consolidated Action, including any action subsequently governed by this Order.
- 7. No communications among Plaintiffs' counsel shall be taken as a waiver of any privilege or protection to which they would otherwise be entitled.

III. FILING OF PLEADINGS

Within 30 days of appointment by the Court, Interim Class Counsel shall file an amended consolidated pleading. Defendants' shall move or respond to the consolidated complaint within 45 days thereafter. If defendants shall move to dismiss, Interim Class Counsel shall have 30 days to respond and Defendants shall have 20 days thereafter to file a reply. Defendants shall have no obligation to respond to any prior filed pleading in the actions consolidated herein. No other deadlines shall be superseded by entry of this Order.

IV. STATUS CONFERENCE

The Case Management Conference previously set by Court for April 6, 2011 shall remain on calendar as a status conference, and not the Initial Case Management Conference contemplated by Civil Local Rule 16-2. In advance of the April 6 status conference, the parties will meet and confer concerning a schedule for the Initial Case Management Conference and related matters and will either present a proposed schedule to the Court or present their respective positions for resolution by the Court at the April 6 status conference.

V. MODIFICATION OF THIS ORDER

This Order may be modified, supplemented, or superseded by order o the Court or upon any party for good cause shown.

Dated: March 3, 2011 KAMBERLAW, LLP

By: <u>s/Avi Kreitenberg</u>
Avi Kreitenberg

One of the Attorneys for Plaintiff Lalo, Individually, and on Behalf of a Class of Similarly Situated Individuals

SCOTT A. KAMBER (admitted *pro hac vice*) DAVID A. STAMPLEY (admitted *pro hac vice*)

18 || skamber@kamberedelson.com

dstampley@kamberedelson.com

19 KAMBERLAW, LLC

100 Wall Street, 23nd Floor

New York, New York 10005 Telephone: (212) 920-3072

21 | Facsimile: (212) 202-6364

AVI KREITENBERG KAMBERLAW, LLP

1180 South beverly Drive, Suite 601

Los Angeles, CA 90035

24 Telephone: 1.310.400.1052 Facsimile: 1.310.400.1056

26

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

20

22

23

27

28

PARISI & HAVENS I I P

| 1 | | PARISI & HAVENS LLP |
|----|---|---|
| 2 | | |
| 3 | Dated: March 3, 2011 | By:s/David C. Parisi |
| | | DAVID C. PARISI |
| 5 | | One of the Attorneys for Plaintiff Freeman, Individually and on Behalf of a Class of Similarly Situated Individuals |
| 6 | DAVID C. PARISI | Similarly Situated individuals |
| 7 | dcparisi@parisihavens.com PARISI & HAVENS LLP | |
| 8 | 15233 Valleyheart Drive Sherman Oaks, CA 91403 | |
| | Telephone (818) 990-1299 Facscimile (818) 501-7852 | |
| 9 | , , | |
| 10 | JEREMY R. WILSON jeremy@wtlfirm.com | |
| 11 | WILSON TROSCLAIR & LOVINS 302 N. Market St., Suite 501 | |
| 12 | Dallas, Texas 75202 Telephone: (214) 430-1930 | |
| 13 | NABIL MAJED NACHAWATI, II | |
| 14 | mn@fnlawfirm.com FEARS NACHAWATI | |
| 15 | 4925 Greenville Avenue, Suite 715 | |
| 16 | Dallas, Texas 75206 Telephone: (214) 890-0711 | |
| 17 | Facsimile: (214) 890-0712 | |
| 18 | | MILBERG LLP |
| 19 | | |
| 20 | Dated: March 7, 2011 | By: <u>s/Jeff S. Westerman</u> Jeff S. Westerman |
| 21 | | One of the Attorneys for Plaintiff Chiu, Individually, and on Behalf of a Class of |
| 22 | | Similarly Situated Individuals |
| 23 | JEFF S. WESTERMAN | |
| 24 | SABRINA S. KIM jwesterman@milberg.com | |
| 25 | skim@milberg.com MILBERG LLP | |
| 26 | One California Plaza 300 South Grand Avenue, Ste 3900 | |
| 27 | Los Angeles, California 90071 | |
| 28 | Telephone: (213) 617-1200 Facsimilie: (213) 617-1975 | |
| | | 0 |

| 1 | | AUDET & PARTNERS LLP |
|----|--|--|
| 2 | | |
| 3 | Dated: March 4, 2011 | By: s/William M. Audet |
| 4 | | William M. Audet One of the Attorneys for Plaintiff Rodimer, |
| 5 | | Individually, and on Behalf of a Class of Similarly Situated Individuals |
| 6 | | · |
| 7 | WILLIAM M. AUDET JONAS P. MANN | |
| 8 | MICHAEL A. MCSHANE waudet@audetlaw.com | |
| 9 | jmann@audetlaw.com mmcshane@audetlaw.com | |
| 10 | AUDET & PARTNERS LLP 221 Main Street, Suite 1460 | |
| 11 | San Francisco, California 94105 Telephone: (415) 568-2555 | |
| 12 | Facscimile: (415) 568-2556 | |
| 13 | JOSEPH H. MALLEY malleylaw@gmail.com | |
| 14 | LAW OFFICE OF JOSEPH H. MALLEY 1045 North Zang Blvd. | |
| 15 | Dallas, Texas 75208 Telephone: (214) 943-6100 | |
| 16 | RICHARD A. LOCKERIDGE | |
| 17 | ROBERT K. SHELQUIST rlockridge@locklaw.com | |
| 18 | rshelquist@locklaw.com Lockridge Grindal Nauen P.L.L.P. | |
| 19 | 100 Washington Ave., S., Suite 2200 | |
| 20 | Minneapolis, MN 55401 Telephone (612) 339-6900 | |
| 21 | Facsimile (612) 339-0981 | |
| 22 | ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFFS | |
| 23 | | |
| 24 | | |
| 25 | | |
| 26 | | |
| 27 | | |

| 1 | | HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP | |
|----|--|---|-----|
| 2 | | | |
| 3 | Dated: March 4, 2011 | By:s/Michael L. Charlson | |
| 4 | , , , | Michael L. Charlson | |
| 5 | MICHAEL I CHARLSON (C.1 D., N. 1 | On Behalf of Defendant Apple, Inc. | |
| 6 | MICHAEL L. CHARLSON (Cal. Bar No. 1 HOGAN & HARTSON | 22123) | |
| 7 | Michael.charlson@hoganlovells.com 525 University Avenue, 4 th Fl | | |
| 8 | Palo Alto, CA 94301 Telephone: (650) 463-4000 | | |
| 9 | Facsimile: (650) 463-4199 | | |
| 10 | CHRISTOPHER WOLF (Admitted Pro Had | c Vice) | |
| 11 | HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP Columbia Square | | |
| 12 | 555 Thirteenth Street, NW | | |
| 13 | Washington, DC 20004 Telephone: (202) 637-5600 | | |
| 14 | CLAYTON C. JAMES (Admitted <i>Pro Hac</i>) | Vice) | |
| 15 | HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP One Tabor Center | | |
| 16 | 1200 Seventeenth Street | | |
| 17 | Denver, CO 80204 Telephone: (303) 899-7300 | | |
| 18 | ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT APPLE, | INC. | |
| 19 | | | |
| 20 | | COOLEY LLP | |
| 21 | | | |
| 22 | Dated: March 7, 2011 | By: s/Michael G. Rhodes | |
| 23 | | Michael G. Rhodes On Behalf of Defendants Backflip Studios, | The |
| 24 | MICHAEL G. RHODES | Weather Chanel, and Medialets | |
| 25 | rhodesmg@cooley.com | | |
| 26 | MICHAEL D. BROWN mbrown@cooley.com | | |
| 27 | COOLEY LLP | | |
| 28 | 101 California Street, 5 th Fl San Francisco, CA 94111 | | |
| | CASE MANAGEMENT ORDER NUMBER 1 | 10 | |

| 1 | Telephone: Facsimile: | (415) 693-2000 (415) 693-2222 | | | | |
|----|--|--|---------|--|--|--|
| 2 | ATTORNEY | ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANTS BACKFLIP STUDIOS, | | | | |
| 3 | THE WEATH | HER CHANNEL, AND ME | DIALET | S | | |
| 4 | | | | | | |
| 5 | | | Ι | OURIE TANGRI LLP | | |
| 6 | | | | | | |
| 7 | Dated: Marc | ch 4, 2011 | By: | s/Michael H. Page | | |
| 8 | | | · | Michael H. Page | | |
| 9 | | | | Behalf of Defendant Pandora, Inc., Interactive Corp., Dictionary.com, LLC and | | |
| 10 | MICHAEL H | I. PAGE | Yelp | | | |
| 11 | JOSEPH C. C | | | | | |
| 12 | mpage@durietangri.com jgratz@durietangri.com | | | | | |
| 13 | | DURIE TANGRI LLP 217 Leidesdorff Street | | | | |
| 14 | San Francisco, CA 94111 Telephone: (415) 362-6666 | | | | | |
| 15 | | 415) 236-6300 | | | | |
| 16 | ATTORNEY | S FOR DEFENDANT PAN | DORA, I | INC., | | |
| 17 | IAC/INTERA | ACTIVE CORP., DICTION | ARY.CO | M, LLC AND YELP | | |
| 18 | | | | | | |
| 19 | | | | | | |
| 20 | | | | | | |
| 21 | | | | | | |
| 22 | | | | | | |
| 23 | | | | | | |
| 24 | | | | | | |
| 25 | | | | | | |
| 26 | | | | | | |
| 27 | | | | | | |
| 28 | | | | | | |
| | ii. | | | | | |

CASE MANAGEMENT ORDER NUMBER 1 11

SHEPPARD MULLIN RICHTER & 1 HAMPTON LLP 2 3 Dated: March 8, 2011 By: ____s/Sacha Von Mende Henry____ 4 Sascha Von Mende Henry On behalf of Defendant Gogii, Inc. 5 SASCHA VON MENDE HENRY 6 JONATHAN D. MOSS shenry@sheppardmullin.com 7 jmoss@sheppardmullin.com SHEPPARD MULLIN RICHTER & HAMPTON LLP 8 333 South Home Street, 43d Fl 9 Los Angeles, CA 90071-1422 Telephone: (213) 620-1780 10 Facsimile: (213) 620-1398 11 ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT GOGII, INC. 12 13 FENWICK & WEST LLP 14 15 Dated: March 9, 2011 By: <u>s/Laurence F. Pulgram</u> Laurence F. Pulgram 16 On Behalf of Defendant Groupon, Inc. 17 LAURENCE F. PULGRAM 18 lpulgram@fenwick.com FENWICK & WEST LLP 19 555 California Street, 12th Fl 20 San Francisco, CA 94104 Telephone: (415) 875-2390 21 Facsimile: (415) 281-1350 22 ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT GROUPON, INC. 23 24 25 26 27 28

| 1 | | SHERMAN & STERLING LLP |
|---------------------------------|-------------------------------|---|
| 2 | | |
| 3 | Dated: March 9, 2011 | By: <u>s/James Donato</u> James Donato |
| 4 | | On Behalf of Defendant Webmd Health Services Group, Inc |
| 5 6 | IAMES DONATO | |
| 7 | jdonato@sherman.com | |
| 8 | 515 Market Street | |
| 9 | Telephone: (415) 616-1143 | |
| 10 | ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT WEBMD | HEALTH |
| 11 | SERVICES GROUP, INC. | |
| 12 | | |
| 13 | | |
| 14 | | |
| 15 | | |
| 16 | PURSUANT TO THE STIPULATION | ON, IT IS SO ORDERED. |
| 17 | | |
| 18 | | |
| 19 | | |
| 20 | UNITE | D STATES DISTRICT COURT JUDGE |
| 21 | | |
| 22 | | |
| 23 | | |
| 2425 | | |
| 26 | | |
| 27 | | |
| 28 | | |
| 20 | ′ ∥ | |