

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SAN JOSE DIVISION**

JONATHAN LALO, individually and On Be-
half of a Class of Similarly Situated Individu-
als,

Plaintiff,

v.

APPLE INC, a California Corporation;
BACKFLIP, a Delaware Corporation;
DICTIONARY.COM, a California
Corporation; PANDORA, INC., a California
Corporation; THE WEATHER CHANNEL, a
Georgia Corporation,

Defendants.

Case No. CV-10-5878 LHK (PSG)

**STIPULATION AND ORDER CONSOLI-
DATING CASES; AND ADOPTING
PRELIMINARY CASE SCHEDULE,
EXCEPT AS MODIFIED BY THE
COURT HEREIN**

DUSTIN FREEMAN, JARED PARSLEY,
COLE PARR, and PRECIOUS ARRANG-
TON, on behalf of themselves and all similar-
ly situated,

Plaintiffs,

v.

APPLE, INC., a Delaware Corporation; GO-
GII, INC., a Delaware Corporation; PANDO-
RA MEDIA, INC., a California Corporation;

Case No. CV-10-5881 LHK (PSG)

1 BACKFLIP STUDIOS, INC., a Delaware
2 Corporation; THE WEATHER CHANNEL,
3 INC., a Georgia Corporation; DICTIO-
4 NARY.COM, LLC., a California Corporation;
5 OUTFIT7 LTD, a Foreign Corporation;
6 ROOM CANDY, INC., a California Corpora-
7 tion; SUNSTORM INTERACTIVE, Inc., an
8 Indiana Corporation,
9 Defendants.

7 ANTHONY CHIU, individually and on behalf
8 of all others similarly situated,
9 Plaintiff,
10 v.
11 APPLE, INC., a California Corporation, and
12 DOES 1 to 50 inclusive,
13 Defendants.

Case No. CV-11-0407 LHK

13 DANIEL RODIMER, et al.
14 Plaintiffs

Case No. CV-11-0700 PSG

15 v.
16 APPLE, INC., FLURRY, INC., MEDIALETS,
17 INC., PINCH MEDIA, INC., QUATTRO
18 WIRELESS, INC., IAC/INTERACTIVE
19 CORP., DICTIONARY.COM, PANDORA,
20 INC., and THE WEATHER CHANNEL
21 Defendants.

22 **STIPULATION AND ORDER**

23 Subject to the Court's review and approval, IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND
24 AGREED AND ORDERED as follows:

25 WHEREAS, the related actions *Lalo, et al. v. Apple Inc., et al.*, CV-10-5878-LHK;
26 *Freeman, et al. v. Apple Inc., et al.*, CV-10-5881-LHK, *Chiu v. Apple, Inc., et al.*, CV-11-0407-
27 LHK and *Rodimer v. Apple, Inc., et al.*, CV 11-0700 PSG (collectively, the "Actions") are
28 pending before this Court; and,

1 WHEREAS, counsel for the various plaintiffs have each concluded that it is in the best
2 interests of the respective parties and absent putative class members that the above-captioned
3 actions be consolidated for all purposes and proceed as contemplated herein; and,

4 WHEREAS, all parties that have appeared, through their respective counsel have stipu-
5 lated to the terms provided herein;

6 WHEREAS, it is anticipated that additional related actions may be transferred to, re-
7 moved to, or filed in this Court; and,

8 WHEREAS, the existence of common questions of law and fact in the Actions now
9 pending before this Court, the interests of fair and efficient administration of the Actions, the
10 avoidance of unnecessary duplicative efforts and the avoidance of inconsistency in outcomes,
11 warrants the consolidation of the Actions, establishment of an organizational structure for
12 plaintiffs' counsel, and the setting of a status conference to discuss, among other things, sche-
13 dules for the filing of pleadings, motion practice and discovery, and good cause appearing
14 therefore:

15 **IT IS HEREBY ORDERED AS FOLLOWS:**

16 **I. CONSOLIDATION AND TREATMENT OF SUBSEQUENT ACTIONS**

17 1. The Court finds that *Lalo, et al. v. Apple Inc., et al.*, CV-10-5878-LHK; *Free-*
18 *man, et al. v. Apple Inc., et al.*, CV-10-5881-LHK, *Chiu v. Apple, Inc.*, CV-11-0407-LHK and
19 *Rodimer, et al. v. Apple, Inc., et al.* CV-11-0700-PSG present substantially similar issues of law
20 and fact, have been previously related, and are hereby consolidated into *Lalo, et al. v. Apple*
21 *Inc., et al.*, CV-10-5878, and are referred to herein as the Consolidated Action. Each document
22 filed by a party to this litigation shall bear the following caption:

23 _____
24 In re iPhone Application Litigation No. CV-10-5878 LHK (PSG)
25 _____

26 2. The terms of this Order shall apply to the Consolidated Action and to any and all
27 actions later instituted in, removed to, or transferred to this Court that involve the same or sub-
28 stantially similar issues of law and fact, subject to the following procedures:

1 a. When such a case is filed in, removed to, or transferred to this Court, **and only**
2 **after counsel call to the attention of the Court and the Clerk the filing or transfer of any**
3 **such case that might be properly consolidated with this Consolidated Action**, the Clerk of
4 Court shall:

- 5 (1) place a copy of this Order in the separate file for such action; and
- 6 (2) make an appropriate entry on the docket for the Consolidated Action.

7 b. Each new case that arises out of the subject matter of the Consolidated Action
8 which is filed in this Court or transferred to this Court, shall be consolidated with the
9 Consolidated Action and this Order shall apply thereto, unless a party in such newly-
10 filed or transferred action objects to consolidation, as provided for herein, or any provi-
11 sion of this order, within ten (10) days after the date upon which a copy of this Order is
12 served on counsel for such party, by filing an application for relief and this Court deems
13 it appropriate to grant such application.

14 3. Counsel shall call to the attention of the Court and the Clerk the filing or trans-
15 fer of any case that might properly be consolidated with the Consolidated Action. Mailing or
16 other delivery of a copy of this Order by Defendants' counsel or Plaintiffs' Interim Class Coun-
17 sel (see II. Below), as appropriate, to the counsel in any newly filed or transferred actions shall
18 constitute valid notice thereof for purposes of establishing its applicability to such action in ac-
19 cordance herewith.

20 **II. ORGANIZATION OF PLAINTIFFS' COUNSEL**

21 1. Plaintiffs shall use their best efforts to self-organize and recommend to the
22 Court counsel to serve as Interim Class Counsel under FRCP 23(g). Such recommendation
23 shall be submitted to the Court with papers supporting the qualifications for such Interim Class
24 Counsel within ten days of the entry of this Order. Any Plaintiff may oppose such recommen-
25 dation by filing an opposition within 10 days of notice of consolidation of their case or the fil-
26 ing of said recommendation, whichever is later.

27 2. Interim Class Counsel, acting on behalf of Plaintiffs, shall have the following
28 duties:

- 1 a. To coordinate all proceedings, including preparing, structuring, and pre-
2 senting pretrial and other management related orders;
- 3 b. To encourage full cooperation and efficiency among all counsel;
- 4 c. To create any necessary committees and appoint committee chairs and
5 otherwise delegate responsibilities for specific tasks in a manner to as-
6 sure that pretrial and trial preparation is conducted effectively, efficient-
7 ly, and economically;
- 8 d. To delegate work responsibilities and monitor the activities of counsel to
9 assure that schedules are met and unnecessary expenditures of time and
10 expense are avoided;
- 11 e. To act as spokespersons at all court conferences;
- 12 f. To call meetings of themselves and/or other counsel as appropriate or
13 necessary from time to time;
- 14 g. To initiate and conduct settlement negotiations with counsel for the vari-
15 ous Defendants;
- 16 h. To determine Plaintiffs' position on all matters arising during this litiga-
17 tion (after such consultation with other counsel as they deem appropri-
18 ate) and present such position orally and/or in writing to the Court and
19 opposing parties;
- 20 i. To consult with and employ experts, as necessary;
- 21 j. To initiate, coordinate and conduct discovery;
- 22 k. To represent Plaintiffs at trial and on any appeal of this matter;
- 23 l. To negotiate and execute agreements with local counsel or other coope-
24 rating attorneys;
- 25 m. To determine the appropriate fee allocation among Plaintiffs' counsel as
26 they contributed to resolution or otherwise provided benefit to the class;
27 and
28

1 n. To perform such other duties as are necessary in connection with the
2 prosecution of this litigation.

3 3. Interim Class Counsel shall be the contact between Plaintiffs' counsel
4 and Defendant's counsel as well as the spokesperson for Plaintiffs' counsel. All agreements
5 reached with the Interim Class Counsel shall be binding on all other Plaintiffs' counsel in the
6 Consolidated Action.

7 4. Interim Class Counsel are hereby designated as the counsel for Plaintiffs
8 in the Consolidated Action upon whom all notices, orders, pleadings, motions, discovery, and
9 memoranda relating to the Consolidated Action shall be served, and Defendants shall effect
10 service of papers on Plaintiffs in the Consolidated Action by serving Interim Class Counsel.

11 5. No motion or request for discovery shall be served or filed by Plaintiffs,
12 or other pretrial proceedings initiated by Plaintiffs, except by or with the authorization of Inte-
13 rim Class Counsel.

14 6. The organizational structure set forth in this section applies to all Plain-
15 tiffs' counsel in the Consolidated Action, including any action subsequently governed by this
16 Order.

17 7. No communications among Plaintiffs' counsel shall be taken as a waiver
18 of any privilege or protection to which they would otherwise be entitled.

19 **III. FILING OF PLEADINGS**

20 Within **21 days** of appointment by the Court, Interim Class Counsel shall file an
21 amended consolidated pleading. Defendants' shall move or respond to the consolidated com-
22 plaint within **30 days** thereafter. If defendants shall move to dismiss, Interim Class Counsel
23 shall have **21 days** to respond and Defendants shall have **14 days** thereafter to file a reply. De-
24 fendants shall have no obligation to respond to any prior filed pleading in the actions consoli-
25 dated herein. No other deadlines shall be superseded this Order, unless ordered by the Court.

26 **IV. STATUS CONFERENCE**

27 The Case Management Conference previously set by Court for April 6, 2011 shall re-
28 main on calendar as a status conference, and not the Initial Case Management Conference con-

1 templated by Civil Local Rule 16-2. In advance of the April 6 status conference, the parties
2 will meet and confer concerning a schedule for the Initial Case Management Conference and
3 related matters and will either present a proposed schedule to the Court or present their respec-
4 tive positions for resolution by the Court at the April 6 status conference. **However, the par-**
5 **ties must still file a single joint Case Management Statement by March 30, 2011, present-**
6 **ing their proposed schedule (or respective positions) to the Court.**

7 **V. MODIFICATION OF THIS ORDER**

8 This Order may be modified, supplemented, or superseded by order of the Court, or,
9 upon the Court's approval, by any party for good cause shown.

10 Dated: March 3, 2011

KAMBERLAW, LLP

11
12 By: s/Avi Kreitenberg

13 Avi Kreitenberg

14 One of the Attorneys for Plaintiff Lalo,
15 Individually, and on Behalf of a Class of
Similarly Situated Individuals

16 SCOTT A. KAMBER (admitted *pro hac vice*)
17 DAVID A. STAMPLEY (admitted *pro hac vice*)
18 *skamber@kamberedelson.com*
19 *dstampley@kamberedelson.com*
20 KAMBERLAW, LLC
100 Wall Street, 23rd Floor
New York, New York 10005
Telephone: (212) 920-3072
Facsimile: (212) 202-6364

21 AVI KREITENBERG
22 KAMBERLAW, LLP
1180 South Beverly Drive, Suite 601
23 Los Angeles, CA 90035
24 Telephone: 1.310.400.1052
25 Facsimile: 1.310.400.1056

26
27
28 PARISI & HAVENS LLP

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Dated: March 4, 2011

By: s/William M. Audet
William M. Audet
One of the Attorneys for Plaintiff Rodimer,
Individually, and on Behalf of a Class of
Similarly Situated Individuals

WILLIAM M. AUDET
JONAS P. MANN
MICHAEL A. MCSHANE
waudet@audetlaw.com
jmann@audetlaw.com
mmcshane@audetlaw.com
AUDET & PARTNERS LLP
221 Main Street, Suite 1460
San Francisco, California 94105
Telephone: (415) 568-2555
Facsimile: (415) 568-2556

JOSEPH H. MALLEY
malleylaw@gmail.com
LAW OFFICE OF JOSEPH H. MALLEY
1045 North Zang Blvd.
Dallas, Texas 75208
Telephone: (214) 943-6100

RICHARD A. LOCKERIDGE
ROBERT K. SHELQUIST
rlockridge@locklaw.com
rshelquist@locklaw.com
Lockridge Grindal Nauen P.L.L.P.
100 Washington Ave., S., Suite 2200
Minneapolis, MN 55401
Telephone (612) 339-6900
Facsimile (612) 339-0981

ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFFS

HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP

1
2 Dated: March 4, 2011

By: s/Michael L. Charlson
Michael L. Charlson
On Behalf of Defendant Apple, Inc.

3
4 MICHAEL L. CHARLSON (Cal. Bar No. 122125)

5 HOGAN & HARTSON
6 Michael.charlson@hoganlovells.com
7 525 University Avenue, 4th Fl
8 Palo Alto, CA 94301
9 Telephone: (650) 463-4000
10 Facsimile: (650) 463-4199

11 CHRISTOPHER WOLF (Admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)

12 HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP
13 Columbia Square
14 555 Thirteenth Street, NW
15 Washington, DC 20004
16 Telephone: (202) 637-5600

17 CLAYTON C. JAMES (Admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)

18 HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP
19 One Tabor Center
20 1200 Seventeenth Street
21 Denver, CO 80204
22 Telephone: (303) 899-7300

23 ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT APPLE, INC.

24
25
26
27
28
COOLEY LLP

29 Dated: March 7, 2011

By: s/Michael G. Rhodes
Michael G. Rhodes
On Behalf of Defendants Backflip Studios, The
Weather Chanel, and Medialets

30 MICHAEL G. RHODES

31 rhodesmg@cooley.com

32 MICHAEL D. BROWN

33 mbrown@cooley.com

34 COOLEY LLP

35 101 California Street, 5th Fl

36 San Francisco, CA 94111

37 Telephone: (415) 693-2000

38 Facsimile: (415) 693-2222

1 ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANTS BACKFLIP STUDIOS,
2 THE WEATHER CHANNEL, AND MEDIALETS

3
4 DURIE TANGRI LLP

5
6 Dated: March 4, 2011

By: s/Michael H. Page
Michael H. Page

7
8 On Behalf of Defendant Pandora, Inc.,
IAC/Interactive Corp., Dictionary.com, LLC and
9 Yelp

10 MICHAEL H. PAGE
11 JOSEPH C. GRATZ
mpage@durietangri.com
jgratz@durietangri.com
12 DURIE TANGRI LLP
217 Leidesdorff Street
13 San Francisco, CA 94111
Telephone: (415) 362-6666
14 Facsimile: (415) 236-6300

15 ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT PANDORA, INC.,
16 IAC/INTERACTIVE CORP., DICTIONARY.COM, LLC AND YELP

17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27 SHEPPARD MULLIN RICHTER &
28 HAMPTON LLP

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Dated: March 8, 2011

By: s/Sacha Von Mende Henry
Sascha Von Mende Henry
On behalf of Defendant Gogii, Inc.

SASCHA VON MENDE HENRY
JONATHAN D. MOSS
shenry@sheppardmullin.com
jmoss@sheppardmullin.com
SHEPPARD MULLIN RICHTER & HAMPTON LLP
333 South Home Street, 43d Fl
Los Angeles, CA 90071-1422
Telephone: (213) 620-1780
Facsimile: (213) 620-1398

ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT GOGII, INC.

FENWICK & WEST LLP

Dated: March 9, 2011

By: s/Laurence F. Pulgram
Laurence F. Pulgram
On Behalf of Defendant Groupon, Inc.

LAURENCE F. PULGRAM
lpulgram@fenwick.com
FENWICK & WEST LLP
555 California Street, 12th Fl
San Francisco, CA 94104
Telephone: (415) 875-2390
Facsimile: (415) 281-1350

ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT GROUPON, INC.

SHERMAN & STERLING LLP

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Dated: March 9, 2011

By: s/James Donato

James Donato

On Behalf of Defendant Webmd Health Services Group, Inc

JAMES DONATO
jdonato@sherman.com
SHERMAN & STERLING LLP
515 Market Street
San Francisco, CA 94105
Telephone: (415) 616-1143
Facsimile: (415) 616-1343

ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT WEBMD HEALTH SERVICES GROUP, INC.

PURSUANT TO THE STIPULATION AS MODIFIED, IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: March 15, 2011



LUCY H. KOH
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT JUDGE