

Exhibit A

1 HAROLD J. MCELHINNY (CA SBN 66781)
hmcclhinny@mofo.com
2 MICHAEL A. JACOBS (CA SBN 111664)
mjacobs@mofo.com
3 JENNIFER LEE TAYLOR (CA SBN 161368)
jtaylor@mofo.com
4 ALISON M. TUCHER (CA SBN 171363)
atucher@mofo.com
5 RICHARD S.J. HUNG (CA SBN 197425)
rhung@mofo.com
6 JASON R. BARTLETT (CA SBN 214530)
jasonbartlett@mofo.com
7 MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP
425 Market Street
8 San Francisco, California 94105-2482
Telephone: (415) 268-7000
9 Facsimile: (415) 268-7522

WILLIAM F. LEE
william.lee@wilmerhale.com
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING
HALE AND DORR LLP
60 State Street
Boston, MA 02109
Telephone: (617) 526-6000
Facsimile: (617) 526-5000

MARK D. SELWYN (SBN 244180)
mark.selwyn@wilmerhale.com
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING
HALE AND DORR LLP
950 Page Mill Road
Palo Alto, California 94304
Telephone: (650) 858-6000
Facsimile: (650) 858-6100

10
11 Attorneys for Plaintiff and
12 Counterclaim-Defendant APPLE INC.

13
14 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
15 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
16 SAN JOSE DIVISION

17 APPLE INC., a California corporation,

18 Plaintiff,

19 v.

20 SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD., a
Korean corporation; SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS
21 AMERICA, INC., a New York corporation; and
SAMSUNG TELECOMMUNICATIONS
22 AMERICA, LLC, a Delaware limited liability
company,

23 Defendants.
24

Case No. 11-cv-01846-LHK

**APPLE'S OBJECTION TO REPLY
EVIDENCE**

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

OBJECTION TO REPLY EVIDENCE

Apple objects to Samsung’s use of Exhibit 25 to the Declaration of Bill Trac in Support of Samsung’s Reply in Support of Motion for Summary Judgment (Dkt. No. 1068-25).

Samsung uses this new exhibit to contend that the date identified as the “Date Modified” – “1/12/2005” – for a file named “tablecloth_27.htm” is the creation date for the “Tablecloth” application discussed in Samsung’s Motion for Summary Judgment. (See Dkt. No. 1068-25 and Dkt. No. 1068 at ¶ 28.)

This characterization of the 6 kilobyte file is inaccurate and extremely misleading. As discussed in the attached Supplemental Declaration of Ravin Balakrishnan, Ph.D. in Support of Apple’s Opposition to Samsung’s Motion for Summary Judgment (“Supp. Balakrishnan Decl.”), the actual “Tablecloth” application file is named “tablecloth_27.swf”, and bears a “Date Modified” of “6/13/2005”. (See Supp. Balakrishnan Decl. ¶¶ 2-12.) Accordingly, the earliest date Samsung may rely on for a functioning version of the “Tablecloth” application is June 13, 2005, which is after the conception date for U.S. Patent No. 7,469,381.

Dated: June 22, 2012

MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP

By: /s/ Michael A. Jacobs
Michael A. Jacobs
Attorneys for Plaintiff
APPLE INC.