EXHIBIT 1

Dockets.Justia.com

In The Matter Of:

CERTAIN ELECTRONIC DEVICES INCLUDING WIRELESS, ET AL.

SEUNG-HO AHN March 15, 2012

CONFIDENTIAL BUSINESS INFORMATION SUBJECT TO PROTECTION ORDER

MERRILL CORPORATION

LegaLink, Inc.

179 Lincoln Street Suite 401 Boston, MA 02110 Phone: 617.542.0039 Fax: 617.542.2119

CONFIDENTIAL BUSINESS INFORMATION SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER SEUNG-HO AHN - 3/15/2012

UNITED STATES INTERNATIONAL TRADE COMMISSION WASHINGTON, D.C.	Page 1
In the Matter of CERTAIN ELECTRONIC DEVICES) Investigation INCLUDING WIRELESS,) No. 337-TA-794 ET AL.,)	
"CONFIDENTIAL BUSINESS INFORMATION SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER" VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION OF SEUNG-HO AHN	
Thursday, March 15, 2012 AT: 9:00 a.m. Taken at:	
Renaissance Seoul Hotel Seoul, S. Korea	
Court Reporter: Jeanne Bullis RPR, CSR	

Merrill Corporation - Boston

617-542-0039

		Page	2	
1		TES DISTRICT COURT CT OF CALIFORNIA		
2	SAN JOSE DIVISION			
3	Shire Coold			
4	APPLE INC., a California corporation,))		
5	Plaintiff,)		
6	VS	,) Case No.) 11-cv-01846-LHK		
7	SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD., a Korean business)		
8	entity; SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA,)		
9	INC., a New York corporation, SAMSUNG)		
10	TELECOMMUNICATIONS AMERICA, LLC, a Delaware)		
11	limited liability company,)		
12	Defendants.))		
13				
14	"CONFIDENTIAL - ATT	ORNEYS' EYES ONLY"		
15				
16	VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITI	ON OF SEUNG-HO AHN		
	Thursday, Ma	rch 15, 2012		
17				
	AT: 9:	00 a.m.		
18				
19		n at:		
		e Seoul Hotel		
20	Seoul, S	outh Korea		
21				
22	Court Reporter:			
	Jeanne Bullis			
23	RPR, CSR			
24				
25				

617-542-0039

	Page 3
1	APPEARANCES
2	
3	APPEARING ON BEHALF OF THE PLAINTIFF:
4	JOSEPH MUELLER, ESQ. Wilmer, Cutler, Pickering, Hale & Dorr, LLP 60 State Street
5	Boston, MA 02109 (617) 526-6396
6	joseph.mueller@wilmerhale.com
7	
8	APPEARING ON BEHALF OF THE DEFENDANT:
9	THOMAS D. PEASE, ESQ. Quinn, Emanuel, Urquhart & Sullivan, LLP 51 Madison Avenue
10	22nd Floor New York, NY 10010
11	(212) 849-7223 thomaspease@quinnemanuel.com
12	
13	INTERPRETERS:
14	Ted Kim – Main Interpreter Ann Park – Check Interpreter
15	
16	ALSO PRESENT:
17	Brian Kim - Samsung
18	
19	VIDEOGRAPHER:
	Joe Cheung
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

617-542-0039

		Page 19
09:53:11	1	A. Yes.
09:53:12	2	Q. And this is 2000, when you graduated?
09:53:21	3	A. Yes.
09:53:22	4	Q. For how long did you work for that law firm?
09:53:33	5	A. I worked there for two years prior to
09:53:44	6	graduation. Subsequent to my graduation, I worked
09:53:49	7	there one, possibly up to two years.
09:53:53	8	Q. Where was this, which location?
09:54:00	9	A. San Jose, California.
09:54:04	10	Q. And what did you do after you completed your
09:54:06	11	work at this law firm?
09:54:19	12	A. I rejoined Samsung Electronics.
09:54:24	13	Q. And what was your position when you rejoined
09:54:26	14	Samsung?
09:54:36	15	A. I was the team leader for the IP team at LCD
09:54:53	16	business division.
09:54:56	17	Q. What were your responsibilities in that
09:54:58	18	position?
09:55:12	19	A. I handled all aspects relating to patent
09:55:17	20	prosecution, license, for the LCD business division.
09:55:23	21	Q. For how long did you serve in that position?
09:55:39	22	A. Seven, eight years. I'm not sure. Say about
09:55:45	23	eight years.
09:55:48	24	Q. And what was your next position?
09:56:13	25	A. Thereafter, I became the team leader for IP

617-542-0039

		Page 20
09:56:28	1	strategy at the site which is Samsung Advanced
09:56:36	2	Institute Of Technology.
09:56:39	3	Q. What were your responsibilities in that role?
09:56:50	4	A. It just had to do with the patent prosecution
09:57:18	5	for the SAIT itself, as well as the common aspect or
09:57:27	6	commonalities for, or the patents aspects throughout
09:57:32	7	the SEC; that is, not just confined to any particular
09:57:38	8	division.
09:57:41	9	Q. What types of technologies does Samsung
09:57:48	10	develop at the SAIT?
09:57:56	11	A. I do not really know.
09:58:00	12	Q. You don't know?
09:58:05	13	CHECK INTERPRETER: "I don't really know the
09:58:07	14	details."
09:58:08	15	Q. Can you tell me at the high level the types
09:58:12	16	of technologies that SAIT develops?
09:58:25	17	MR. PEASE: Objection, vague.
09:58:43	18	A. Well, each of the business divisions would
09:58:47	19	develop technology related to that particular business
09:58:52	20	division, and so what's developed at the site is
09:59:02	21	technology that is not related to any particular
09:59:09	22	business division.
09:59:11	23	Q. It would be general scientific research, for
09:59:14	24	example?
09:59:23	25	A. That would be an example as well.

617-542-0039

		Page 21
09:59:25	1	Q. Can you think of other examples?
09:59:37	2	A. My understanding is that bio, biotechnology,
09:59:45	3	is also carried out there.
09:59:50	4	Q. And I believe you said that during this time
09:59:52	5	period, you were also developing IP strategy for other
09:59:57	6	business groups; is that right?
10:00:10	7	A. No.
10:00:15	8	Q. Did you have any duties that went beyond the
10:00:20	9	SAIT?
10:00:24	10	A. Well, even then I still carried out the
10:00:51	11	duties of IP for the LCD business division. Let me
10:00:59	12	elaborate.
10:01:01	13	I did not handle all aspects of IP for the LCD
10:01:19	14	business division. That is, I did not handle patent
10:01:23	15	prosecution. But I did handle license or licensing
10:01:29	16	for the LCD IP.
10:01:36	17	Q. So you kept your LCD licensing duties even
10:01:41	18	after you joined the SAIT?
10:01:52	19	A. Correct.
10:01:52	20	Q. Were you doing anything else at the time you
10:01:56	21	were working with the SAIT?
10:02:06	22	MR. PEASE: Objection, vague.
10:02:07	23	A. No.
10:02:09	24	BY MR. MUELLER:
10:02:09	25	Q. For how long did you work with the SAIT?
L		

617-542-0039

		Page 22
10:02:21	1	A. A year, year and a half.
10:02:25	2	Q. And you began work there about, when was it,
10:02:28	3	2009, 2010?
10:02:38	4	A. I think that should be about right.
10:02:42	5	Q. Do you recall when you completed your work
10:02:44	6	there, which year?
10:02:50	7	A. That would have been either July or August of
10:02:59	8	2010, but I do not know exactly.
10:03:01	9	Q. What did you do next?
10:03:07	10	A. Thereafter I became the head of the IP
10:03:19	11	center, which I still do.
10:03:20	12	Q. What is the IP center?
10:03:24	13	A. This is the place where it handles, or it
10:03:41	14	oversees the general patent-related work for Samsung
10:03:48	15	Electronics Company.
10:03:54	16	Q. All divisions?
10:04:21	17	A. Well, previously IP teams used to belong to
10:04:26	18	each of the business divisions, but right now you can
10:04:33	19	say that through the IP center, you are able to
10:04:44	20	oversee all the aspects.
10:04:48	21	Q. When was the IP center created?
10:04:54	22	A. Once again, that would have been July or
10:05:04	23	August of 2010, which I'm not quite certain.
10:05:07	24	Q. Were you the first head of the IP center?
10:05:18	25	A. Well, I'm the first head of the IP center in

617-542-0039

		Page 24
10:08:28	1	licensing executive at Samsung?
10:08:43	2	A. Yes.
10:08:44	3	Q. To whom do you report?
10:08:50	4	A. That is the CEO.
10:08:58	5	Q. And who directly reports to you?
10:09:08	6	A. There are four team leaders at the IP center.
10:09:18	7	Q. And just so the record is clear, I'm going to
10:09:22	8	ask you to give each person's name, and let's start
10:09:24	9	with the CEO.
10:09:46	10	A. Surname is Choi, and first name Jiseong. A
10:10:00	11	common spelling, but that's probably not the correct
10:10:04	12	spelling. I myself I know that that is not it, but
10:10:07	13	I don't know how it is spelled.
10:10:09	14	Q. No problem. And could you name for me,
10:10:12	15	please, sir, the four team leaders that report to you?
10:10:26	16	A. Seung-Geon Park. Minhyung Chung. Jaewan Ji.
10:11:09	17	Gijoong Kang.
10:11:17	18	Q. And I should have asked this earlier, but do
10:11:21	19	you prefer Dr. Ahn or Mr. Ahn?
10:11:29	20	A. (In English) Anything's okay. I forgot the
10:11:32	21	fact that I was a doctor before, so all right.
10:11:36	22	Call me Mr. Ahn. That's all right.
10:11:40	23	Q. Thank you. Mr. Ahn, what are your day-to-day
10:11:50	24	responsibilities today at the IP center?
10:12:18	25	A. I think it would be difficult to pinpoint

617-542-0039

		Page 85
16:48:20	1	BY MR. MUELLER:
16:48:22	2	Q. Well, Samsung has licensed to companies in
16:48:25	3	the industry patents relating to mobile
16:48:29	4	telecommunications technology; correct?
16:48:45	5	A. Could you repeat that, please?
16:48:47	6	Q. Sure. Samsung has licensed to companies in
16:48:50	7	the industry patents relating to mobile
16:48:53	8	telecommunications technology; correct?
16:49:08	9	MR. PEASE: Objection, vague.
16:49:10	10	A. I do not really know, not exactly.
16:49:15	11	BY MR. MUELLER:
16:49:15	12	Q. You don't know whether Samsung has licensed
16:49:19	13	patents relating to mobile telecommunications
16:49:21	14	technology to companies in the industry?
16:49:41	15	MR. PEASE: Objection, vague.
16:50:48	16	A. Earlier I was referring to the establishment
16:50:51	17	of the IP center, but I did not know of the work
16:50:57	18	related to mobile business division, and after its
16:51:04	19	establishment, there was that work for the mobile
16:51:12	20	business as well as other areas of work. And as far
16:51:19	21	as I can recall, there has not been any such related
16:51:25	22	work in terms of the mobile business division.
16:51:31	23	And on top of which, prior to that time frame,
16:51:38	24	what kind of work had been carried out in terms of the
16:51:44	25	mobile business division, I do not know and I do not

617-542-0039

Page 86 16:51:48 1 recall. 16:51:51 2 (Interpreters conferring.) 16:52:01 CHECK INTERPRETER: "Like I told you earlier, 3 16:52:03 4 before the IP center was formed, I was not involved in 16:52:08 5 the mobile business division, and after the IP center 16:52:11 6 was formed, there was the work that was related to the 16:52:16 7 mobile division, as well as other business divisions. 16:52:19 8 So I do not really recall precisely as to what might 16:52:25 9 have occurred in terms of the business division, the 16:52:28 10 mobile business division. And if you're talking about 16:52:31 11 the time period before the IP center was formed, I do 16:52:36 12 not really know as to what type of activities that 16:52:39 13 they were involved in." 16:52:40 14 BY MR. MUELLER: 16:52:40 15 Q. But since the IP center was formed, you have 16:52:44 16 been involved in mobile telecommunications patent 16:52:47 17 licensing; correct? 16:53:05 18 Yes. Α. 16:53:06 19 MR. MUELLER: Let's take a break. 16:53:08 20 VIDEOGRAPHER: Going off the record, here marks 16:53:11 21 the end of tape No. 5. The time is 16:53. 16:53:19 22 (A break was taken.) (Exhibit 8 - 9 marked for identification.) 17:11:37 23 17:11:38 24 VIDEOGRAPHER: Here marks the beginning of tape 17:11:46 25 No. 6. Going on the record, the time is 17:11.

Merrill Corporation - Boston

617-542-0039

		Page 117
19:03:17	1	BY MR. MUELLER:
19:03:18	2	Q. Mr. Ahn, as the head
19:03:23	3	MAIN INTERPRETER: It's not 17, it's 19.
19:03:26	4	VIDEOGRAPHER: Oh, sorry. 19:03.
	5	BY MR. MUELLER:
19:03:29	6	Q. Mr. Ahn, as the head of licensing at Samsung,
19:03:32	7	what do you consider the best support for Samsung's
19:03:37	8	demand that Apple pay 2.4% for each relevant end
19:03:42	9	product in return for the rights to Samsung patents
19:03:45	10	essential to comply with ETSI standards?
19:04:36	11	MR. PEASE: Objection. Lacks foundation, calls
19:04:37	12	for a legal conclusion.
19:05:16	13	A. I keep repeating myself here. I'm not the
19:05:18	14	head of licensing, I'm the head of the IP center, of
19:05:24	15	which licensing is but one of the areas, and, as such,
19:05:32	16	I do not get involved directly in the details for
19:05:38	17	licensing, even though I do get reports on them. And
19:05:45	18	I do not exactly know how the percentage was derived.
19:05:52	19	I do not know that directly.
19:05:55	20	BY MR. MUELLER:
19:05:56	21	Q. Mr. Ahn, do you know anything about how the
19:05:58	22	2.4% number was derived?
19:06:12	23	A. No.
19:06:12	24	Q. Do you know any reason or basis to support
19:06:16	25	that number?

617-542-0039

		Page 133
1	CERTIFI	CATE OF DEPONENT
2		
3	I, SEUNG-HO AHN, hereb	y certify that I have read the
4	foregoing pages of my	deposition of testimony taken in
5	these proceedings on t	his 15th day of March, 2012, and
6	with the exception of	the changes listed on the next
7	page and/or correction	s, if any, find them to be a
8	true and accurate tran	scription thereof.
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14	Signed:	
15	Name:	SEUNG-HO AHN
16	Date:	
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

617-542-0039