1	HAROLD J. MCELHINNY (CA SBN 66781)	QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART &
2	hmcelhinny@mofo.com MICHAEL A. JACOBS (CA SBN 111664)	SULLIVAN, LLP Charles K. Verhoeven (Cal. Bar No. 170151)
3	mjacobs@mofo.com	50 California Street, 22nd Floor
	RACHEL KREVANS (CA SBN 116421) rkrevans@mofo.com	San Francisco, California 94111 Telephone: (415) 875-6600
4	JENNIFER LEE TAYLOR (CA SBN 161368) jtaylor@mofo.com	Facsimile: (415) 875-6700 Kevin P.B. Johnson (Cal. Bar No. 177129)
5	ALISON M. TUCHER (CA SBN 171363) atucher@mofo.com	Victoria F. Maroulis (Cal. Bar No. 202603) 555 Twin Dolphin Drive 5th Floor
6	RICHARD S.J. HUNG (CA SBN 197425) rhung@mofo.com	Redwood Shores, California 94065 Telephone: (650) 801-5000
7	JASÓN R. BARTLETT (CA SBN 214530)	Facsimile: (650) 801-5100
8	jasonbartlett@mofo.com MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP	Michael T. Zeller (Cal. Bar No. 196417) 865 S. Figueroa St., 10th Floor
9	425 Market Street San Francisco, California 94105-2482	Los Angeles, California 90017 Telephone: (213) 443-3000
10	Telephone: (415) 268-7000 Facsimile: (415) 268-7522	Facsimile: (213) 443-3100
11		Attorneys for SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD., SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA,
		INC. and SAMSUNG
12		TELECOMMUNICATIONS AMERICA, LLC
13	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT	
14	NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA	
15	SAN JOSE D	DIVISION
16		
16		
16 17	APPLE INC., a California corporation,	Case No. 11-cv-01846-LHK (PSG)
	APPLE INC., a California corporation, Plaintiff,	JOINT PRELIMINARY
17		
17 18 19	Plaintiff, v.	JOINT PRELIMINARY STATEMENT PROPOSING
17 18 19 20	Plaintiff, v. SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD., A Korean business entity; SAMSUNG	JOINT PRELIMINARY STATEMENT PROPOSING
17 18 19 20 21	Plaintiff, v. SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD., A Korean business entity; SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC., a New York corporation; SAMSUNG	JOINT PRELIMINARY STATEMENT PROPOSING
 17 18 19 20 21 22 	Plaintiff, v. SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD., A Korean business entity; SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC., a New York	JOINT PRELIMINARY STATEMENT PROPOSING
 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 	Plaintiff, v. SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD., A Korean business entity; SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC., a New York corporation; SAMSUNG TELECOMMUNICATIONS AMERICA, LLC, a	JOINT PRELIMINARY STATEMENT PROPOSING
 17 18 19 20 21 22 	Plaintiff, v. SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD., A Korean business entity; SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC., a New York corporation; SAMSUNG TELECOMMUNICATIONS AMERICA, LLC, a Delaware limited liability company.,	JOINT PRELIMINARY STATEMENT PROPOSING
 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 	Plaintiff, v. SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD., A Korean business entity; SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC., a New York corporation; SAMSUNG TELECOMMUNICATIONS AMERICA, LLC, a Delaware limited liability company.,	JOINT PRELIMINARY STATEMENT PROPOSING
 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 	Plaintiff, v. SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD., A Korean business entity; SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC., a New York corporation; SAMSUNG TELECOMMUNICATIONS AMERICA, LLC, a Delaware limited liability company.,	JOINT PRELIMINARY STATEMENT PROPOSING
 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 	Plaintiff, v. SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD., A Korean business entity; SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC., a New York corporation; SAMSUNG TELECOMMUNICATIONS AMERICA, LLC, a Delaware limited liability company.,	JOINT PRELIMINARY STATEMENT PROPOSING
 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 	Plaintiff, v. SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD., A Korean business entity; SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC., a New York corporation; SAMSUNG TELECOMMUNICATIONS AMERICA, LLC, a Delaware limited liability company.,	JOINT PRELIMINARY STATEMENT PROPOSING

Dockets.Justia.com

1	Additional attorneys for Plaintiff and Counterclaim-Defendant APPLE INC.
2	WILLIAM F. LEE
3	william.lee@wilmerhale.com WILMER CUTLER PICKERING
4	HALE AND DORR LLP 60 State Street
5	Boston, MA 02109 Telephone: (617) 526-6000
6	Facsimile: (617) 526-5000
7	MARK D. SELWYN (SBN 244180) mark.selwyn@wilmerhale.com
8	WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP
9	950 Page Mill Road Palo Alto, California 94304
10	Telephone: (650) 858-6000 Facsimile: (650) 858-6100
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
	JOINT PRELIMINARY STATEMENT PROPOSING POST-VERDICT P

1	Pursuant to the Court's July 19, 2012 Minute Order and Case Management Statement
2	(Dkt. No. 1267), the parties submit the following preliminary statement proposing post-verdict
3	proceedings.
4	Apple's position: Apple proposes that, upon a jury verdict of liability, the Court entertain
5	expedited briefing on a preliminary injunction according to the following schedule:
6	• Apple's opening brief: 7 days after the verdict
7	• Samsung's opposition brief: 14 days after the verdict
8	• Apple's reply brief: 17 days after the verdict
9	• Decision on preliminary injunction: On the papers or after an expedited hearing.
10	This schedule is consistent with Judge Bryson's observation in the first appeal in these
11	proceedings that a preliminary injunction can be entered "immediately at the end of trial." (Oral
12	recording at http://oralarguments.cafc.uscourts.gov/default.aspx?fl=2012-1105.mp3 at 12:23-47.)
13	The Court then can conduct a subsequent permanent injunction hearing according to a less
14	abbreviated schedule of its choosing.
15	Apple agrees with Samsung that other post-trial motions can follow the ordinary schedule
16	(e.g., with opening briefs due 28 days after entry of judgment or the jury is discharged under Fed.
17	R. Civ. P. 50).
18	Samsung's position: Samsung proposes that the Court rule on the parties' respective
19	requests for a permanent injunction only after it has the opportunity to decide post-trial briefing
20	pursuant to Rule 50. Thus, Samsung proposes the following schedule:
21	Briefing on Judgment as a Matter of Law
22	• Opening briefs: 28 days from entry of judgment
23	• Opposition briefs: 14 days after opening briefs;
24	• Reply briefs: 7 days after opposition briefs;
25	Briefing on Permanent Injunction
26	• Opening briefs: 21 days from order on motions for judgment as a matter of law
27	• Opposition briefs: 21 days after opening briefs
28	

1	• Reply briefs: 14 days after opposition	
2	While Samsung believes that the Court should resolve its request for a permanent injunction as	
3	soon as possible, grant of a permanent injunction prior to rulings on briefs for judgment as a	
4	matter of law would be premature and inefficient. The fact that Judge Bryson posed to Apple's	
5	counsel a question in which he noted the possibility that a court could grant an injunction	
6	immediately after trial is not an endorsement of that procedure. To the contrary, the Court's	
7	resources would be wasted deciding a request for preliminary injunction if the verdict on the	
8	claim that forms the basis for the injunction is later overturned pursuant to Rule 50. To avoid this	
9	inefficiency, the Court should first resolve motions for judgment as a matter of law before	
10	determining whether to grant a preliminary injunction.	
11		
12	Dated: August 1, 2012	
13	MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART & SULLIVAN, LLP	
14	SOLLIVAN, LLI	
15	By: /s/ Michael A. Jacobs By: /s/ Victoria F. Maroulis	
16	HAROLD J. MCELHINNYCHARLES K. VERHOEVENMICHAEL A. JACOBSKEVIN P.B. JOHNSON	
17	JENNIFER LEE TAYLOR VICTORIA F. MAROULIS ALISON M. TUCHER EDWARD DEFRANCO	
18	RICHARD S.J. HUNG MICHAEL T. ZELLER JASON R. BARTLETT	
19	Attorneys for SAMSUNG ELECTRONICSWILLIAM F. LEECO. LTD, SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS	
20	MARK D. SELWYN AMERICA, INC., AND SAMSUNG TELECOMMUNICATIONS AMERICA,	
21	Attorneys for APPLE INC. LLC.	
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
	JOINT PRELIMINARY STATEMENT PROPOSING POST-VERDICT PROCEEDINGS CASE NO. 11-CV-01846-LHK (PSG) 4 sf-3177972	

1	ATTESTATION	
2	I, Michael A. Jacobs, am the ECF User whose ID and password are being used to file this	
3	Declaration. In compliance with General Order 45, X.B., I hereby attest that Victoria F. Maroulis	
4	has concurred in this filing.	
5		
6	Dated: August 1, 2012/s/ Michael A. JacobsMichael A. Jacobs	
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26 27		
27 28		
20	JOINT PRELIMINARY STATEMENT PROPOSING POST-VERDICT PROCEEDINGS	