

# **QUINN EMANUEI** trial lawyers | san francisco

50 California Street, 22nd Floor, San Francisco, California 94111-4788 | TEL: (415) 875-6600 FAX: (415) 875-6700

WRITER'S DIRECT DIAL NO. (415) 875-6313

WRITER'S INTERNET ADDRESS albedecarre@quinnemanuel.com

February 12, 2012

### <u>Confidential</u> <u>Via E-Mail</u>

Mia Mazza Morrison & Foerster 425 Market Street San Francisco, CA 94105-2482 (415) 268-7000

## Re: Apple v. Samsung, No. 11-cv-1846 (ND Cal)

#### Dear Mia:

As we previously informed Apple, Samsung's design expert Samuel Lucente has a pending patent application in Europe for the same graphic user interface invention that he created in the 1990's. The counterpart United States patent issued in 2003, as disclosed in his curriculum vitae. The European application was filed over ten years ago in January of 2002. The last substantive action by Mr. Lucente was nearly 20 months ago in the form of a June 2010 response to an EPO office action. On February 1, 2012, Mr. Lucente requested a decision on the file and indicated that he would put forward no additional arguments in the application proceedings. Given the EPO's last office action in December 2009, and its more recent December 2011 request for hearing, it is highly likely that the patent application will be rejected without any additional argument.

Samsung believes this should more than satisfy any legitimate concerns Apple may have that Mr. Lucente will somehow misuse Apple's confidential information in the prosecution of this pending patent application. Nevertheless, Samsung understands it is a high priority of both

#### quinn emanuel urguhart & sullivan, llp

LOS ANGELES | 865 South Figueroa Street, 10th Floor, Los Angeles, California 90017-2543 | TEL (213) 443-3000 FAX (213) 443-3100 NEW YORK | 51 Madison Avenue, 22nd Floor, New York, New York 10010-1601 | TEL (212) 849-7000 FAX (212) 849-7100 SILICON VALLEY | 555 Twin Dolphin Drive, 5th Floor, Redwood Shores, California 94065-2139 | TEL (650) 801-5000 FAX (650) 801-5100 CHICAGO | 500 W. Madison Street, Suite 2450, Chicago, Illinois 60661-2510 | TEL (312) 705-7400 FAX (312) 705-7401 WASHINGTON, DC | 1299 Pennsylvania Avenue NW, Suite 825, Washington, District of Columbia 20004-2400 | TEL (202) 538-8000 FAX (202) 538-8100 LONDON | 16 Old Bailey, London EC4M 7EG, United Kingdom | TEL +44(0) 20 7653 2000 FAX +44(0) 20 7653 2100 TOKYO | NBF Hibiya Building, 25F, 1-1-7, Uchisaiwai-cho, Chiyoda-ku, Tokyo 100-0011, Japan | TEL +81 3 5510 1711 FAX +81 3 5510 1712 MANNHEIM | Mollstraße 42, 68165 Mannheim, Germany | TEL +49(0) 621 43298 6000 FAX +49(0) 621 43298 6100 MOSCOW | Voentorg Building, 3rd Floor, 10 Vozdvizhenka Street, Moscow 125009, Russia | TEL +7 495 797 3666 FAX +7 495 797 3667 Mia Mazza Feb. 12, 2012

parties to protect their confidential information, so Samsung further proposes that in exchange for Apple withdrawing its objections to Mr. Lucente, Samsung's outside counsel will agree not to show Mr. Lucente any documents or materials related to Apple's graphical user interface utility patents or technologies, such as source code. Indeed, Mr. Lucente is a design expert and will not be opining on those issues, so it was never Samsung's or Mr. Lucente's intention for him to receive technical materials.

Please confirm by Monday, February 13, that Apple will withdraw its objections to Mr. Lucente on the above stated grounds. If not, please identify what specific and legitimate concerns Apple still has regarding Mr. Lucente's access to design-related materials and what specific limitations Apple believes are necessary to resolve this concern so that the issue can be addressed appropriately at the lead counsel meet and confer on Tuesday.

Sincerely,

/s/ Albert P. Bedecarré

Albert P. Bedecarré