

Exhibit 52

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SAN JOSE DIVISION

APPLE INC., A CALIFORNIA CORPORATION,)	C-11-01846 LHK
)	
)	SAN JOSE, CALIFORNIA
PLAINTIFF,)	
)	MAY 12, 2011
VS.)	
)	PAGES 1-52
SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD., A KOREAN BUSINESS ENTITY; SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC., A NEW YORK CORPORATION; SAMSUNG TELECOMMUNICATIONS AMERICA, LLC, A DELAWARE LIMITED LIABILITY COMPANY,)	
)	
)	
)	
)	
)	
)	
)	
DEFENDANTS.)	

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS
BEFORE THE HONORABLE LUCY H. KOH
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

APPEARANCES ON NEXT PAGE

OFFICIAL COURT REPORTER: LEE-ANNE SHORTRIDGE, CSR, CRR
CERTIFICATE NUMBER 9595

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

A P P E A R A N C E S:

FOR THE PLAINTIFF: MORRISON & FOERSTER
BY: HAROLD J. MCELHINNY,
MICHAEL A. JACOBS,
JASON R. BARTLETT, AND
GRANT L. KIM
425 MARKET STREET
SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94105

ALSO PRESENT: MAUREEN MCCALL AND JAMES WITT

FOR THE DEFENDANT: QUINN, EMANUEL, URQUHART,
OLIVER & HEDGES
BY: CHARLES K. VERHOEVEN AND
ERIK C. OLSON
50 CALIFORNIA STREET, 22ND FLOOR
SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94111

BY: VICTORIA F. MAROULIS AND
KEVIN P.B. JOHNSON
555 TWIN DOLPHIN DRIVE
SUITE 560
REDWOOD SHORES, CALIFORNIA 94065

1 OKAY. GO AHEAD, PLEASE.

2 MR. VERHOEVEN: SINCE THERE'S NO
3 OBJECTION, COULD I -- MAY I HAND UP THESE SLIDES,
4 YOUR HONOR?

5 THE COURT: YES, PLEASE.

6 (PAUSE IN PROCEEDINGS.)

7 MR. VERHOEVEN: AND AS TO THE ISSUE OF
8 TIME GOING PAST, YOUR HONOR, ON SLIDE 2, WE JUST
9 PUT THE BASIC CASE LAW THAT I'M SURE YOUR HONOR IS
10 AWARE OF.

11 IF YOU WAIT TOO LONG BEFORE YOU FILE A
12 PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION MOTION, YOU CAN'T SHOW
13 IRREPARABLE HARM AS A MATTER OF LAW.

14 AND HERE ON SLIDE 3, YOUR HONOR, WE PUT
15 FORTH THE ACCUSED PRODUCTS AND WHEN THEY WERE
16 RELEASED AND ANNOUNCED, AND YOU'LL SEE, YOUR HONOR,
17 THAT THE GALAXY -- ON SLIDE 3, THE GALAXY S WAS
18 FIRST ANNOUNCED IN MARCH OF 2010, NO PRELIMINARY
19 INJUNCTION.

20 RELEASED IN THE U.S., THE FIRST MODEL IN
21 THE U.S., THE GALAXY S VIBRANT WITH T-MOBILE
22 JULY 15TH, 2010. NO PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION MOTION.

23 THE GALAXY S CAPTIVATE WITH AT&T,
24 JULY 18TH, 2010; THE GALAXY S EPIC 4G WITH AT&T,
25 AUGUST 31, 2010; THE GALAXY S FASCINATE,

1 SEPTEMBER 9, 2010; GALAXY S MESMERIZE WITH U.S.
2 CELLULAR, OCTOBER 27TH, 2010; GALAXY S CONTINUUM,
3 VERIZON, NOVEMBER 11, 2010.

4 WHEN DID THEY SUE? NOT UNTIL APRIL 15TH,
5 2011. NO SEEKING OF A PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION.

6 THESE ARE THE -- THIS IS -- IF YOU READ
7 THEIR MOTION PAPERS, YOUR HONOR, THE THING THAT
8 THEY'RE ACCUSING AND SAYING THAT THEY WANT TO GET
9 EXPEDITED DISCOVERY TO MOVE FOR A PRELIMINARY
10 INJUNCTION ON, YOU CAN SEE THAT THIS SAME BASIS
11 THAT THEY'RE MOVING ON THEIR PAPERS THEY WOULD
12 ARGUE, AND HAVE ARGUED IN THEIR COMPLAINT, AS TO
13 ALL OF THESE PRODUCTS.

14 UNDER BLACK LETTER LAW, THERE'S NO WAY
15 THEY CAN SHOW IRREPARABLE HARM BECAUSE OF THIS
16 DELAY.

17 AND, YOU KNOW, YOUR HONOR, IN THE MOTION
18 PAPERS ON THEIR REPLY, WHAT I READ WAS APPLE
19 SAYING, "YOU GUYS, THE STANDARD ISN'T IRREPARABLE
20 HARM, THE STANDARD IS GOOD CAUSE."

21 OKAY, FINE. WHAT'S YOUR GOOD CAUSE?

22 WELL, THEIR GOOD CAUSE IS THEY WANT TO
23 FILE A PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION MOTION.

24 WELL, IN ORDER FOR THEM TO HAVE ANY
25 COLORABLE BASIS FOR A PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER

I, THE UNDERSIGNED OFFICIAL COURT
REPORTER OF THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR
THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA, 280 SOUTH
FIRST STREET, SAN JOSE, CALIFORNIA, DO HEREBY
CERTIFY:

THAT THE FOREGOING TRANSCRIPT,
CERTIFICATE INCLUSIVE, CONSTITUTES A TRUE, FULL AND
CORRECT TRANSCRIPT OF MY SHORTHAND NOTES TAKEN AS
SUCH OFFICIAL COURT REPORTER OF THE PROCEEDINGS
HEREINBEFORE ENTITLED AND REDUCED BY COMPUTER-AIDED
TRANSCRIPTION TO THE BEST OF MY ABILITY.

/s/

LEE-ANNE SHORTRIDGE, CSR, CRR
CERTIFICATE NUMBER 9595