

1 VANESSA H. WIDENER (Bar No. 203967)
vhw@amclaw.com
2 JENNIFER S. MUSE (Bar No. 211779)
jsm@amclaw.com
3 ANDERSON, McPHARLIN & CONNERS LLP
444 South Flower Street
4 Thirty-First Floor
Los Angeles, California 90071-2901
5 TELEPHONE: (213) 688-0080 ♦ FACSIMILE: (213) 622-7594

6 Attorneys for FEDERAL DEPOSIT
INSURANCE CORPORATION as
7 Receiver for INDYMAC BANK, F.S.B.

8
9
10 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
11 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA, SAN JOSE DIVISION

12 FEDERAL DEPOSIT INSURANCE
13 CORPORATION as Receiver for
14 INDYMAC BANK, F.S.B.,

15 Plaintiff,

16 vs.

17 BORIS FRANKEL, an individual and
18 dba APPRAISAL CHOICE; and
ALEXANDER FURMAN, an
individual and dba REAL WORLD,

19 Defendants.

Case No. C11-03279-LHK (PSG)

20
21 **STIPULATED PROTECTIVE
ORDER FOR STANDARD
LITIGATION**

22 1. **PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS**

23 Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve
24 production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special
25 protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than
26 prosecuting this litigation may be warranted.

27 Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to
28 enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this
Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to

ANDERSON, MCPHARLIN & CONNERS LLP
LAWYERS
444 SOUTH FLOWER STREET, THIRTY-FIRST FLOOR
LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA 90071-2901
TEL (213) 688-0080 • FAX (213) 622-7594

discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

2. DEFINITIONS

2.1 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or items under this Order.

2.2 "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c).

2.3 Counsel (without qualifier): Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their support staff).

2.4 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as "CONFIDENTIAL."

2.5 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

2.6 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this action.

2.7 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this action. House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.

1 2.8 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation,
2 association, or other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

3 2.9 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of
4 a party to this action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this action and
5 have appeared in this action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm
6 which has appeared on behalf of that party.

7 2.10 Party: any party to this action, including all of its officers,
8 directors, employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record
9 (and their support staffs).

10 2.11 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure
11 or Discovery Material in this action.

12 2.12 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation
13 support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
14 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
15 and their employees and subcontractors.

16 2.13 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
17 designated as "CONFIDENTIAL."

18 2.14 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery
19 Material from a Producing Party.

20 3. SCOPE

21 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only
22 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or
23 extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or
24 compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or
25 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.
26 However, the protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order do not cover the
27 following information: (a) any information that is in the public domain at the time of
28 disclosure to a Receiving Party or becomes part of the public domain after its

1 disclosure to a Receiving Party as a result of publication not involving a violation of
2 this Order, including becoming part of the public record through trial or otherwise;
3 and (b) any information known to the Receiving Party prior to the disclosure or
4 obtained by the Receiving Party after the disclosure from a source who obtained the
5 information lawfully and under no obligation of confidentiality to the Designating
6 Party. Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by a separate
7 agreement or order.

8 4. **DURATION**

9 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality
10 obligations imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party
11 agrees otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall
12 be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this action,
13 with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and
14 exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this action,
15 including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time
16 pursuant to applicable law.

17 5. **DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

18 5.1 **Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for**
19 **Protection.** Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for
20 protection under this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific
21 material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must
22 designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or
23 written communications that qualify - so that other portions of the material,
24 documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not
25 swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

26 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited.
27 Designations that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an
28 improper purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber or retard the case development

process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

(a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party affix the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" to each page that contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portions) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents or materials available for inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which material it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the "CONFIDENTIAL" legend to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the

1 Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portions) (e.g., by making
2 appropriate markings in the margins).

3 (b) for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial
4 proceedings, that the Designating Party identify on the record, before the close of
5 the deposition, hearing, or other proceeding, all protected testimony.

6 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary
7 and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place
8 on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is
9 stored the legend "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a portion or portions of the
10 information or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the extent
11 practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

12 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an
13 inadvertent failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing
14 alone, waive the Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Order for
15 such material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must
16 make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the
17 provisions of this Order.

18 6. **CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS**

19 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
20 designation of confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a
21 Designating Party's confidentiality designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable,
22 substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic burdens, or a significant disruption or
23 delay of the litigation, a Party does not waive its right to challenge a confidentiality
24 designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the original
25 designation is disclosed.

26 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the
27 dispute resolution process by providing written notice of each designation it is
28 challenging and describing the basis for each challenge. To avoid ambiguity as to

1 whether a challenge has been made, the written notice must recite that the challenge
2 to confidentiality is being made in accordance with this specific paragraph of the
3 Protective Order. The parties shall attempt to resolve each challenge in good faith
4 and must begin the process by conferring directly (in voice to voice dialogue; other
5 forms of communication are not sufficient) within 14 days of the date of service of
6 notice. In conferring, the Challenging Party must explain the basis for its belief that
7 the confidentiality designation was not proper and must give the Designating Party
8 an opportunity to review the designated material, to reconsider the circumstances,
9 and, if no change in designation is offered, to explain the basis for the chosen
10 designation. A Challenging Party may proceed to the next stage of the challenge
11 process only if it has engaged in this meet and confer process first or establishes that
12 the Designating Party is unwilling to participate in the meet and confer process in a
13 timely manner.

14 6.3 Judicial Intervention. If the Parties cannot resolve a challenge
15 without court intervention, the Designating Party shall file and serve a motion to
16 retain confidentiality under Civil Local Rule 7 (and in compliance with Civil Local
17 Rule 79-5, if applicable) within 21 days of the initial notice of challenge or within
18 14 days of the parties agreeing that the meet and confer process will not resolve
19 their dispute, whichever is earlier. Each such motion must be accompanied by a
20 competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet and
21 confer requirements imposed in the preceding paragraph. Failure by the
22 Designating Party to make such a motion including the required declaration within
23 21 days (or 14 days, if applicable) shall automatically waive the confidentiality
24 designation for each challenged designation. In addition, the Challenging Party may
25 file a motion challenging a confidentiality designation at any time if there is good
26 cause for doing so, including a challenge to the designation of a deposition transcript
27 or any portions thereof. Any motion brought pursuant to this provision must be
28 ///

1 accompanied by a competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied
2 with the meet and confer requirements imposed by the preceding paragraph.

3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on
4 the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper
5 purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other
6 parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating
7 Party has waived the confidentiality designation by failing to file a motion to retain
8 confidentiality as described above, all parties shall continue to afford the material in
9 question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's
10 designation until the court rules on the challenge.

11 7. **ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

12 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material
13 that is disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with
14 this case only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Such
15 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the
16 conditions described in this Order. When the litigation has been terminated, a
17 Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL
18 DISPOSITION).

19 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party
20 at a location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
21 authorized under this Order.

22 7.2 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless
23 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a
24 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated
25 "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:

26 (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this action,
27 as well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably
28 necessary to disclose the information for this litigation and who have signed the

"Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A;

(b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

(c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

(d) the court and its personnel;

(e) court reporters and their staff, professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

(f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material must be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order.

(g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

8. **PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED
PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION**

If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as "CONFIDENTIAL," that Party must:

1 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such
2 notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

3 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or
4 order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the
5 subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include
6 a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

7 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be
8 pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

9 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party
10 served with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information
11 designated in this action as "CONFIDENTIAL" before a determination by the court
12 from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the
13 Designating Party's permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and
14 expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in
15 these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving
16 Party in this action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

17 9. **A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE**
18 **PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION**

19 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced
20 by a Non-Party in this action and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL." Such
21 information produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected
22 by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions
23 should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

24 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request,
25 to produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is
26 subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's
27 confidential information, then the Party shall:

28 ///

1 1. promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-
2 Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality
3 agreement with a Non-Party;

4 2. promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated
5 Protective Order in this litigation, the relevant discovery request(s), and a
6 reasonably specific description of the information requested; and

7 3. make the information requested available for inspection by the
8 Non-Party.

9 (c) If the Non-Party fails to object or seek a protective order from
10 this court within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the
11 Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to
12 the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the
13 Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is
14 subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination
15 by the court.¹ Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the
16 burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

17 10. **UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED**
18 **MATERIAL**

19 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has
20 disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized
21 under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a)
22 notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its
23 best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform
24 the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms

25 _____
26 ¹ The purpose of this provision is to alert the interested parties to the existence of
27 confidentiality rights of a Non-Party and to afford the Non-Party an opportunity to
28 protect its confidentiality interests in this court.

of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

11. **INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL**

When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to the court.

12. **MISCELLANEOUS**

12.1 **Right to Further Relief**. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the court in the future.

12.2 **Right to Assert Other Objections**. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

12.3 **Filing Protected Material**. Without written permission from the Designating Party or a court order secured after appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file in the public record in this action any Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may only be filed under seal

1 pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at
2 issue. Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 79-5, a sealing order will issue only upon a
3 request establishing that the Protected Material at issue is privileged, protectable as
4 a trade secret, or otherwise entitled to protection under the law. If a Receiving
5 Party's request to file Protected Material under seal pursuant to Civil Local
6 Rule 79-5(d) is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the
7 information in the public record pursuant to Civil Local Rule 79-5(e) unless
8 otherwise instructed by the court.

9 13. **FINAL DISPOSITION**

10 Within 60 days after the final disposition of this action, as defined in
11 paragraph 4, the Producing Party shall send a letter to each Receiving Party
12 requesting (1) the return of all Protected Material to the Propounding Party or (2) the
13 destruction of all Protected Material ("Demand Letter"). As used in this
14 subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations,
15 summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected
16 Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving
17 Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same
18 person or entity, to the Designating Party) within 30 days of receipt of Demand
19 Letter that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material
20 that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not
21 retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format
22 reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this
23 provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion
24 papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence,
25 deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant
26 and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any

27 ///

28 ///

1 such archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to
2 this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4.

3
4 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD:

5
6 DATED: October 5, 2011 ANDERSON, McPHARLIN & CONNERS LLP

7
8 By: /s/ Jennifer S. Muse /s/
9 Vanessa H. Widener
10 Jennifer S. Muse
11 Attorneys for Plaintiff FEDERAL DEPOSIT
12 INSURANCE CORPORATION as Receiver for
13 INDYMAC BANK, F.S.B.

14 DATED: October 5, 2011 MANNING & KASS, ELLROD, RAMIREZ,
15 TRESTER, LLP

16 By: /s/ Peter C. Catalanotti
17 (w/permission)
18 Peter C. Catalanotti
19 Attorneys for Defendant BORES FRENKEL

20 DATED: October 5, 2011

21 By: /s/ Neil a. Helfam /s/
22 (w/permission)
23 Neil A. Helfam
24 Attorneys for Attorney for Defendant
25 ALEXANDER FURMAN

26
27 PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.

28 DATED: _10/11/2011 Paul S. Grewal
PAUL SINGH GREWAL
UNITED STATES DISTRICT
MAGISTRATE JUDGE

EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I _____ [print or type full name], of

[print
or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety
and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States
District Court for the Northern District of California on _____, 2011 in the
case of *Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation as Receiver for IndyMac Bank,*
F.S.B. v. Boris Frankel, an individual and dba Appraisal Choice; and Alexander
Furman, an individual and dba Real World, United States District Court, Northern
District of California, San Jose Division, Case No. CV11-03279-LHK (PSG) . I
agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective
Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me
to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I
will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this
Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with
the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court
for the Northern District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this
Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after
termination of this action.

///

///

///

///

///

///

///

1 I hereby appoint _____ [print or type full name] of
2 _____ [print or
3 type full address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of
4 process in connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of
5 this Stipulated Protective Order.

6
7 Date: _____

8 City and State where sworn and signed: _____
9

10 Printed name: _____
11 [printed name]

12 Signature: _____
13 [signature]
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28