

United States District Court
For the Northern District of California

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SAN JOSE DIVISION

APPLE, INC., a California corporation,)	Case No.: 12-CV-00630-LHK
)	
Plaintiff and Counterdefendant,)	ORDER ON SAMSUNG'S
)	OBJECTIONS TO APPLE'S
v.)	DISCLOSURES
)	
SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD., a)	
Korean corporation; SAMSUNG)	
ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC., a New York)	
corporation; and SAMSUNG)	
TELECOMMUNICATIONS AMERICA, LLC,)	
a Delaware limited liability company,)	
)	
Defendants and Counterclaimants.)	
)	

Samsung has filed objections to Apple's disclosures. ECF No. 1605-1. Apple has filed a response. ECF No. 1600-3. After reviewing the parties' briefing, considering the record in the case, and balancing the considerations set forth in Federal Rule of Evidence 403, the Court rules on Samsung's objections as follows:

Exhibit Number	COURT'S RULING ON OBJECTION
PDX93.10	Overruled.
PDX93.11	Overruled.
PX146	Sustained in part and overruled in part. Dr. Velturo may discuss this exhibit but he may not give any opinion regarding whether Samsung copied Apple.

PDX92.22	Sustained.
----------	------------

Samsung also requests to seal various documents. ECF No. 1605-1. Having considered Samsung’s motion, and compelling reasons having been shown, the Court seals the following documents as follows:

Exhibit and pages requested to be sealed	COURT’S RULING ON SEALING REQUEST
PX 142 in its entirety	GRANTED except for page 1 which is the cover page.
PX 158 in its entirety	GRANTED.
PX 160 in its entirety	GRANTED.
PX 161: pages 1, 7-18	GRANTED.
PX 162 in its entirety	GRANTED.
PX 208: pages 1-4	GRANTED.
PX 222 in its entirety	DENIED. Apple has replaced this exhibit with PX 222A.
PX 222A in its entirety	GRANTED as to pages 11, 13, 15, 17, 21, 30, 31, 32, 34, 35, 39, 41, and 42. DENIED as to the rest of the exhibit.
PX 223 in its entirety	DENIED. Apple has replaced this exhibit with PX 223A.
PX 223A in its entirety	GRANTED as to pages 5-8, 11-14, 17-20, 23-26, 29-32, and 59-63. DENIED as to the rest of the exhibit.
DX 431: page 6	GRANTED.
PX 154: pages 5, 9, 10	GRANTED.
PX 226 in its entirety	GRANTED.
DX 432 (pages not used during an examination)	DENIED without prejudice. Samsung’s requests to seal “pages not used during an examination” are overbroad. From now on, the parties must explicitly state what pages they request be sealed during a witness examination, or the sealing request will not be granted. Samsung can refile these sealing requests (the ones for which Samsung asked that all “pages not used during an examination” be sealed) by 8:00 p.m. April 7, 2014.
DX 433: Page 17 and pages not used during an	GRANTED as to page 17, DENIED without prejudice as to rest of exhibit.

1	examination.	
2	DX 434: pages not used during an examination	DENIED without prejudice.
3	DX 435: pages not used during an examination	DENIED without prejudice.
4	DX 436: pages not used during an examination	DENIED without prejudice.
5	DX 437: pages not used during an examination	DENIED without prejudice.
6	DX 438: pages not used during an examination	DENIED without prejudice.
7	DX 439: pages not used during an examination	DENIED without prejudice.
8	PX 217: pages not used during an examination	DENIED without prejudice.
9	PX 182: pages not used during an examination	DENIED without prejudice.
10	PX 185: pages not used during an examination	DENIED without prejudice.

18 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

19 Dated: April 7, 2014

20 
21 LUCY H. KOH
22 United States District Judge