

United States District Court
For the Northern District of California

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SAN JOSE DIVISION

APPLE, INC., a California corporation,)	Case No.: 12-CV-00630-LHK
)	
Plaintiff and Counterdefendant,)	ORDER ON APPLE’S OBJECTIONS TO
)	SAMSUNG’S DISCLOSURES
v.)	REGARDING CHANDLER, CHASE,
)	DICARLO, ERDEM, RANGEL,
SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD., a)	REIBSTEIN, SCHILLER, AND
Korean corporation; SAMSUNG)	WINSHIP
ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC., a New York)	
corporation; and SAMSUNG)	
TELECOMMUNICATIONS AMERICA, LLC,)	
a Delaware limited liability company,)	
)	
Defendants and Counterclaimants.)	
)	

On April 16, 2014, Apple filed objections to Samsung’s disclosures. ECF No. 1709-3. On April 16, 2014, Samsung filed a response. ECF No. 1710-3. After reviewing the parties’ briefing, considering the record in the case, and balancing the considerations set forth in Federal Rule of Evidence 403, the Court rules on Apple’s objections as follows:

APPLE OBJECTION	COURT’S RULING ON OBJECTION
Sarah Chandler	
DX489 (pp. 1-28, 32-55, 68-91) (Apple teardowns)	Overruled.
Jeffrey Chase	
DX328 (Freedman e-mail)	Sustained.

1	SDX3602 (Windows Mobile 5.0 video)	Overruled.
2	Nick DiCarlo	
3	DX493 (news summaries)	Overruled. The document shall not be considered for the truth of the matters asserted therein.
4	Tulin Erdem	
5	DX404 (Apple market research)	Sustained.
6	SDX3544 (Hauser article excerpt)	Sustained.
7	SDX3541 (Erdem numbers)	Sustained.
8	Art Rangel	
9	6/25/13 Depo. at 40-42, 132-34	Overruled.
10	David Reibstein	
11	DX454A (Reibstein pretest data)	Overruled.
12	SDX3171, SDX3138, SDX3139, SDX3175 (Hauser excerpts)	Sustained. The parties may not circumvent limits on objections by arguing that the same objection applies to other exhibits.
13	Philip Schiller	
14	7/23/13 Depo. at 87:24-88:15	Overruled.
15	Daniel Winship	
16	DX319, DX320, DX323 (Evolution 2.4 code and user guide)	Overruled.

17 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

18 Dated: April 17, 2014

19 
20 _____
21 LUCY H. KOH
22 United States District Judge
23
24
25
26
27
28