OBJECTIONS - Case No. C 13-05996 PJH

Doc. 179

Dockets.Justia.com

Campbell et al v. Facebook Inc.

Pursuant to the discussion at the hearing on Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification held on March 16, 2016, and this Court's Minute Order dated March 16, 2016 (Dkt. 174), Plaintiffs and Defendant Facebook, Inc. jointly file replacement versions of the following documents accompanying their class certification briefs and evidentiary objections:

- (1) **Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification (Dkt. 178-1)**: Exhibits 3, 6-18, 27-30, and 33-34 to the Declaration of Melissa Gardner in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification ("Gardner Cert. Declaration");
- (2) **Defendant Facebook, Inc.'s Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification** (**Dkt. 178-2**): Exhibits A, B, L, N, R, U, BB, CC, DD, FF, II, JJ, KK, and LL to the Declaration of Christopher Chorba In Support of Defendant Facebook, Inc.'s Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification ("Chorba Declaration"); Exhibit NN to the Declaration of Alex Himel In Support of Defendant Facebook, Inc.'s Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification ("Himel Declaration"); and
- (3) Plaintiffs' Reply in Support of Motion for Class Certification (Dkt. 178-3): Exhibits 2, 6-11, and 14-20 to the Declaration of David Slade in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification ("Slade Cert. Declaration"); and the Supplemental Declaration of Melissa Gardner in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification ("Supplemental Gardner Cert. Declaration"); and
- (4) Defendant Facebook, Inc.'s Objection to and Request to Strike New Evidence and Misstatements of Fact Contained in Plaintiffs' Reply in Support of their Motion for Class Certification (Dkt. 178-4): The Declaration of Dale Harrison In Support of Defendant Facebook, Inc.'s Objection to and Request to Strike New Evidence and Misstatements of Fact in Plaintiffs' Reply in Support Of Their Motion For Class Certification ("Harrison Declaration").

In its Minute Order, this Court ordered that "all of the administrative motions to seal (Dkt. 137, 147, 166, 169 and 171) are denied without prejudice to filing a limited, narrowly tailored request for sealing as stated on the record." (Dkt. 174.) The Court also ordered that "[t]he briefs shall be filed unredacted in the public record by Monday 3/21/16," and that while a new motion to seal must be filed "for any request to seal trade secrets," the Court would "allow redactions of source code,

names, addresses and phone numbers without a Court order." (*Id.*) There are three filings to comply with the Court's Minute Order:

- (1) <u>Briefing</u>: On March 21, 2016, the parties filed a joint notice containing replacement versions of their class certification briefs and evidentiary objections that contained corrected redactions consistent with the Court's Minute Order (i.e., redactions the Court authorized to be made without a Court Order). (*See* Dkt. 178.) In that joint notice, the parties notified the Court in their filing that they were in the process of conferring about filing a joint administrative motion to seal limited portions of the documents accompanying their class certification briefs and evidentiary objections that would be consistent with the Court's Order, and that they would file that motion by March 28, 2016. (*Id.*)
- (2) Evidence with Approved Redactions: This joint notice contains replacement versions of the documents accompanying the parties' class certification briefs and evidentiary objections that contain corrected redactions (if any) consistent with the Court's Minute Order (i.e., redactions the Court authorized to be made without a Court Order).¹
- (3) Evidence with New Motion to Seal: Concurrently with the filing of this joint notice, the parties have filed a joint administrative motion to seal limited portions of certain documents accompanying the parties' briefs reflecting redactions that require the Court's approval (i.e., not fully in the categories mentioned in the Court's Minute Order).

Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification (Dkt. 178-1)

Attached as **Exhibit 1** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit 3 to the Gardner Cert. Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 137-12 and 138-4. The only redactions in Exhibit 1 are by Facebook, and they are of names of non-parties (specifically, Facebook employees) (*see* pp. 8:9; 8:10; 8:12; 8:13; 8:14; 8:15; 8:16; 8:17; 8:19; 8:20; 8:22; 8:23; 9:18; 9:19; 9:21: 9:22; 9:23; 9:24; 9:25; 9:26; 10:1; 10:2; 10:4; 10:5; 10:6; 10:7; 10:9; 10:10; 10:11; 10:12; 10:14; 10:15; 10:17; 10:18;

As with the parties' filing of March 21, 2016, the courtesy copies of this filing will also include copies of all Exhibits with highlighting that reflects the redactions in the as-filed versions of the exhibits. For the Court's convenience, Plaintiffs' redactions will appear in yellow highlighting, and Facebook's redactions will appear in blue highlighting.

10:20; 10:21; 10:23; 10:24; 11:1; 11:2; 11:4; 11:5; 11:7; 11:8; 11:10; 11:11; 11:13; 11:14; 11:16; 11:17; 11:19; 11:20; 11:22; 11:23).

Attached as **Exhibit 2** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit 6 to the Gardner Cert. Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 137-15 and 138-4. The only redactions in Exhibit 2 are by Facebook, and they are of names of non-parties (specifically, Facebook employees).

Attached as **Exhibit 3** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit 7 to the Gardner Cert. Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 137-16 and 138-4. The only redactions in Exhibit 3 are by Facebook, and they are of names of non-parties (specifically, Facebook employees).

Attached as **Exhibit 4** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit 8 to the Gardner Cert. Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 137-17 and 138-4. The only redactions in Exhibit 4 are by Facebook, and they are of names of non-parties (specifically, Facebook employees).

Attached as **Exhibit 5** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit 9 to the Gardner Cert. Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 137-18 and 138-4. The only redactions in Exhibit 5 are by Facebook, and they are of names of non-parties (specifically, Facebook employees).

Attached as **Exhibit 6** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit 10 to the Gardner Cert. Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 137-19 and 138-4. The only redactions in Exhibit 6 are by Facebook, and they are of names of non-parties (specifically, Facebook employees).

Attached as **Exhibit 7** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit 11 to the Gardner Cert. Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 137-20 and 138-4. The only redactions in Exhibit 7 are by Facebook, and they are of names of non-parties (specifically, Facebook employees).

Attached as **Exhibit 8** is a true and correct copy of Exhibit 12 to the Gardner Cert. Declaration, originally filed Dkt. 137-21 and 138-4. Exhibit 8 contains no redactions.

Attached as Exhibit 9 is a true and correct copy of Exhibit 13 to the Gardner Cert.

Declaration, originally filed Dkt. 137-22 and 138-4. Exhibit 9 contains no redactions.

Attached as **Exhibit 10** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit 14 to the Gardner Cert. Declaration, originally filed Dkt. 137-23 and 138-4. The only redactions in Exhibit 11 are by Facebook, and they are of names of non-parties (specifically, Facebook employees).

Attached as Exhibit 11 is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit 15 to the

Gardner Cert. Declaration, originally filed Dkt. 137-24 and 138-4. The only redactions in Exhibit 11 are by Facebook, and they are of names of non-parties (specifically, Facebook employees).

Attached as **Exhibit 12** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit 16 to the Gardner Cert. Declaration, originally filed Dkt. 137-25 and 138-4. The only redactions in Exhibit 12 are by Facebook, and they are of names of non-parties (specifically, Facebook employees).

Attached as **Exhibit 13** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit 17 to the Gardner Cert. Declaration, originally filed Dkt. 137-26 and 138-4. The only redactions in Exhibit 13 are by Facebook, and they are of names of non-parties (specifically, Facebook employees).

Attached as **Exhibit 14** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit 18 to the Gardner Cert. Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 137-27 and 138-4. The only redactions in Exhibit 14 are by Facebook, and they are of names of non-parties (specifically, Facebook employees).

Attached as **Exhibit 15** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit 27 to the Gardner Cert. Declaration, originally filed Dkt. 137-28 and 138-4. The only redactions in Exhibit 15 are by Facebook, and they are of names of non-parties (specifically, Facebook employees).

Attached as **Exhibit 16** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit 28 to the Gardner Cert. Declaration, originally filed Dkt. 137-29 and 138-4. The only redactions in Exhibit 16 are by Facebook, and they are of names of non-parties (specifically, Facebook employees).

Attached as **Exhibit 17** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit 29 to the Gardner Cert. Declaration, originally filed Dkt. 137-30 and 138-4. The only redactions in Exhibit 17 are by Facebook, and they are of names of non-parties (specifically, Facebook employees).

Attached as **Exhibit 18** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit 30 to the Gardner Cert. Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 137-31 and 138-4. The only redactions in Exhibit 18 are by Facebook, and they are of names of non-parties (specifically, Facebook employees).

Attached as **Exhibit 19** is a true and correct copy of Exhibit 33 to the Gardner Cert. Declaration, originally filed Dkt. 137-8 and 138-4. Exhibit 19 contains no redactions.

Attached as **Exhibit 20** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit 34 to the Gardner Cert. Declaration, originally filed Dkt. 137-32 and 138-4. The only redactions in Exhibit 20 are by Facebook, and they are of names of non-parties (specifically, Facebook employees).

Defendant Facebook's Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification (Dkt. 178-2):

Attached as **Exhibit 21** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit A to the Chorba Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 150-5 and 158-1. The only redactions in Exhibit 21 are by Plaintiffs, and they are of names of non-parties (specifically, absent putative class members).

Attached as **Exhibit 22** is a true and correct copy of Exhibit B to the Chorba Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 150-5 and 158-2. Exhibit 22 contains no redactions.

Attached as **Exhibit 23** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit L to the Chorba Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 150-9 and 159-1. The only redactions in Exhibit 23 are by Plaintiffs, and they are of names of non-parties (specifically, absent putative class members).

Attached as **Exhibit 24** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit N to the Chorba Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 1501-1 and 159-3. The only redactions in Exhibit 24 are by Plaintiffs, and they are of names of non-parties (specifically, absent putative class members).

Attached as **Exhibit 25** is a true and correct copy of Exhibit R to the Chorba Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 147-8 and 159-7. Exhibit 25 contains no redactions.

Attached as **Exhibit 26** is a true and correct copy of Exhibit U to the Chorba Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 151-6 and 159-10. Exhibit 26 contains no redactions.

Attached as **Exhibit 27** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit BB to the Chorba Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 148-2 and 160-4. The only redactions in Exhibit 27 are by Facebook, and they are of the email address of a non-party (specifically, a Facebook employee) (*see* pp. 50:20) and the names of non-parties (specifically, Facebook employees) (*see* Errata pages 1-2).

Attached as **Exhibit 28** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit CC to the Chorba Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 148-4 and 160-5. The only redactions in Exhibit 28 are by Facebook, and they are of the names of non-parties (specifically, Facebook employees) (*see* Errata p. 2) and of source code (*see* Errata pp. 3-4).

Attached as **Exhibit 29** is a true and correct copy of Exhibit DD to the Chorba Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 148-6 and 160-6. Exhibit 29 contains no redactions.

Attached as Exhibit 30 is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit FF to the

Chorba Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 150-8 and 160-8. The only redactions in Exhibit 30 are by Plaintiffs, and they are of a name of a non-party (specifically, an absent putative class member).

Attached as **Exhibit 31** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit II to the Chorba Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 150-1 and 160-11. The only redactions in Exhibit 31 are by Facebook, and they are of source code and source code file names (*see* pp. 43:10-11; 43:14; 83:5; 83:10-11; and Errata pp. 2-9).

Attached as **Exhibit 32** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit KK to the Chorba Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 152-1 and 160-13. The only redactions in Exhibit 32 are by Facebook, and they are of the names of non-parties (specifically, Facebook employees).

Attached as **Exhibit 33** is a true and correct copy of Exhibit LL to the Chorba Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 152-2 and 160-14. Exhibit 33 contains no reductions.

Attached as **Exhibit 34** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit NN to the Himel Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 152-8 and 161-2. The only redactions in Exhibit 34 are by Facebook, and they are of names of non-parties (specifically, Facebook employees).

Plaintiffs' Reply in Support of Motion for Class Certification (Dkt. 178-3)

Attached as **Exhibit 35** is a true and correct copy of Exhibit 2 to the Slade Cert. Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 166-8 and 167-1. Exhibit 35 contains no reductions.

Attached as **Exhibit 36** is a true and correct copy of Exhibit 6 to the Slade Cert. Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 166-14 and 167-1. Exhibit 36 contains no reductions.

Attached as **Exhibit 37** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit 7 to the Slade Cert. Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 166-15 and 167-1. Redactions in Exhibit 37 are by both Facebook and Plaintiffs, and they are of the names, email addresses, and Facebook IDs of one of the Plaintiffs and one or more non-parties (specifically, absent putative class members).

Attached as **Exhibit 38** is a true and correct copy of Exhibit 8 to the Slade Cert. Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 166-16 and 167-1. Exhibit 38 contains no reductions.

Attached as **Exhibit 39** is a true and correct copy of Exhibit 9 to the Slade Cert. Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 166-12 and 167-1. Exhibit 39 contains no reductions.

Attached as Exhibit 40 is a true and correct copy of Exhibit 10 to the Slade Cert. Declaration,

originally filed at Dkt. 166-17 and 167-1. Exhibit 40 contains no redactions.

Attached as **Exhibit 41** is a true and correct copy of Exhibit 11 to the Slade Cert. Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 166-18 and 167-1. Exhibit 41 contains no redactions.

Attached as **Exhibit 42** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit 14 to the Slade Cert. Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 166-20 and 167-1. Redactions in Exhibit 42 are by both Facebook and Plaintiffs, and they are of the names, email addresses, and Facebook IDs of one of the Plaintiffs and one or more non-parties (specifically, absent putative class members).

Attached as **Exhibit 43** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit 15 to the Slade Cert. Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 166-21 and 167-1. Redactions in Exhibit 43 are by both Facebook and Plaintiffs, and they are of the names, email addresses, and Facebook IDs of one of the Plaintiffs and one or more non-parties (specifically, absent putative class members).

Attached as **Exhibit 44** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit 16 to the Slade Cert. Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 166-22 and 167-1. Redactions in Exhibit 44 are by both Facebook and Plaintiffs, and they are of the names, email addresses, and Facebook IDs of one of the Plaintiffs and one or more non-parties (specifically, absent putative class members).

Attached as **Exhibit 45** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit 17 to the Slade Cert. Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 166-23 and 167-1. Redactions in Exhibit 45 are by both Facebook and Plaintiffs, and they are of the names, email addresses, and Facebook IDs of one of the Plaintiffs and one or more non-parties (specifically, absent putative class members).

Attached as **Exhibit 46** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit 18 to the Slade Cert. Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 166-24 and 167-1. Redactions in Exhibit 46 are by both Facebook and Plaintiffs, and they are of the names, email addresses, and Facebook IDs of one of the Plaintiffs and one or more non-parties (specifically, absent putative class members).

Attached as **Exhibit 47** is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit 19 to the Slade Cert. Declaration, originally filed at Dkt. 166-25 and 167-1. Redactions in Exhibit 47 are by both Facebook and Plaintiffs, and they are of the names, email addresses, and Facebook IDs of one of the Plaintiffs and one or more non-parties (specifically, absent putative class members).

Attached as Exhibit 48 is a true and correct copy of a redacted version of Exhibit 20 to the