

APPEAL, CLOSED, E-Filing

**U.S. District Court
California Northern District (San Francisco)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 3:07-cv-00693-VRW
Internal Use Only**

Shubert et al v. Bush et al
Assigned to: Hon. Vaughn R. Walker
Lead case: [M:06-cv-01791-VRW](#)
Member cases:

Date Filed: 02/02/2007
Date Terminated: 01/21/2010
Jury Demand: Plaintiff
Nature of Suit: 440 Civil Rights: Other
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

- [3:06-cv-00672-VRW](#)
- [3:06-cv-06225-VRW](#)
- [3:06-cv-06570-VRW](#)
- [3:07-cv-00109-VRW](#)
- [3:07-cv-00693-VRW](#)
- [3:07-cv-01115-VRW](#)
- [3:06-cv-06434-VRW](#)
- [3:06-cv-06295-VRW](#)
- [3:06-cv-05066-VRW](#)
- [3:06-cv-06313-VRW](#)
- [3:06-cv-03596-VRW](#)
- [3:06-cv-03574-VRW](#)
- [3:06-cv-06254-VRW](#)
- [3:06-cv-06222-VRW](#)
- [3:06-cv-06387-VRW](#)
- [3:06-cv-06224-VRW](#)
- [3:06-cv-05065-VRW](#)
- [3:06-cv-05064-VRW](#)
- [3:06-cv-05267-VRW](#)
- [3:06-cv-05067-VRW](#)
- [3:06-cv-05269-VRW](#)
- [3:06-cv-06385-VRW](#)
- [3:06-cv-06924-VRW](#)
- [3:06-cv-05452-VRW](#)
- [3:06-cv-05343-VRW](#)
- [3:06-cv-05341-VRW](#)
- [3:07-cv-02538-VRW](#)
- [3:06-cv-07934-VRW](#)
- [3:07-cv-01243-VRW](#)
- [3:06-cv-03467-VRW](#)

[3:06-cv-04221-VRW](#)

[3:06-cv-05340-VRW](#)

[3:06-cv-06294-VRW](#)

[3:07-cv-00464-VRW](#)

[3:06-cv-05485-VRW](#)

[3:06-cv-05576-VRW](#)

[3:07-cv-02029-VRW](#)

[3:06-cv-06388-VRW](#)

Case in other court: Eastern District of New York, 1:06-02282

Cause: 42:1981 Civil Rights

Plaintiff

Virginia Shubert

represented by **Matthew Delmont Brinckerhoff**
Emery Celli Brinckerhoff & Abady
LLP
75 Rockefeller Plaza, 20th Floor
New York, NY 10019
212-763-5000
Fax: 212-763-5001
Email: mbrinckerhoff@ecbalaw.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ilann Margalit Maazel
Emery Celli Brinckerhoff & Abady
LLP
75 Rockefeller Plaza, 20th Floor
New York, NY 10019
212-763-5000
Fax: 212-763-5001
Email: imaazel@ecbalaw.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Noha Arafa

represented by **Matthew Delmont Brinckerhoff**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ilann Margalit Maazel
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Sarah Dranoff

represented by **Matthew Delmont Brinckerhoff**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ilann Margalit Maazel

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Hilary Botein

*individually and on behalf of all others
similarly situated*

represented by **Matthew Delmont Brinckerhoff**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ilann Margalit Maazel

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

All Plaintiffs

represented by **Cindy Ann Cohn**

Electronic Frontier Foundation

454 Shotwell Street

San Francisco, CA 94110

415-436-9333 x 108

Email: cindy@eff.org

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

George W. Bush

represented by **Alexander Kenneth Haas**

United States Department of Justice

Federal Programs Branch

20 Massachusetts Ave., NW

Washington, DC 20530

(202) 307-3937

Email: Alexander.Haas@usdoj.gov

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Anthony Joseph Copolino

U.S. Department of Justice, Civil Divisi

20 Massachusetts Avenue, N.W. Room
6102

Washington, DC 20530

(202) 514-4782dc

Email: tony.copolino@usdoj.gov

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Michael V. Hayden

represented by **Alexander Kenneth Haas**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Anthony Joseph Coppolino
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Keith B. Alexander

represented by **Alexander Kenneth Haas**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Anthony Joseph Coppolino
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Alberto Gonzales

represented by **Alexander Kenneth Haas**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Anthony Joseph Coppolino
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

John Ashcroft

represented by **Alexander Kenneth Haas**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

United States of America

represented by **Anthony Joseph Coppolino**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Paul Edward Ahern
U.S. Department of Justice
Civil Division, Federal Programs
Branch
20 Massachusetts Avenue NW
Washington, DC 20530

(202) 305-0633
 Email: Paul.Ahern@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
02/02/2007	 1	Case transferred in from the Eastern District of New York; Case Number 1:06-cv2282 FB-MDG. Original file certified copy of transfer order and docket sheet received.. Filed by Sarah Dranoff, Hilary Botein, Virginia Shubert, Noha Arafa. (gsa, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 2/2/2007) Additional attachment(s) added on 2/5/2007 (gsa, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 02/05/2007)
02/02/2007		CASE DESIGNATED for Electronic Filing. (gsa, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 2/2/2007) (Entered: 02/05/2007)
03/20/2007	 2	IT IS SO ORDERED AS MODIFIED: Pursuant to the stipulation: On or before 5/18/2007, the Government may file a dispositive motion and any assertion of the military and state secrets privilege in Shubert v. Bush, on or before 6/29/2007, Plaintiffs may file opposition to the dispositive motion; on or before 7/20/2007, the Government may file a reply brief in support of its dispositive motion. Oral argument on the dispositive motion has been set for 8/16/2007 at 2:00 PM. Signed by Chief Judge Vaughn R Walker on 3/20/2007. (cgk, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 3/20/2007) (Entered: 03/20/2007)
05/09/2007	 3	STIPULATION <i>and Proposed Order to Extend Briefing and Hearing Schedule in Shubert v. Bush, Case No. 07-00693</i> filed by Government Defendants in their official capacity by George W. Bush, Michael V. Hayden, Keith B. Alexander, Alberto Gonzales. (Coppolino, Anthony) (Filed on 5/9/2007) (Entered: 05/09/2007)
05/14/2007	 4	STIPULATION AND ORDER GRANTING to extend briefing and hearing schedule in Shubert v. Bush re 3 Stipulation, filed by Alberto Gonzales,, George W. Bush,, Keith B. Alexander,, Michael V. Hayden. On or 5/25/2007, the Government will file a dispositive motion, opposition to be filed on or before 7/13/2007, any reply in support of the dispositive motion shall be filed on or before 8/3/2007. The hearing is set for 8/30/2007 at 2:00 PM. Signed by Chief Judge Vaughn R Walker on 5/11/2007. (cgk, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 5/14/2007) (Entered: 05/14/2007)
06/22/2007	 5	Memorandum in Opposition re (253 in M:06-cv-01791-VRW) MOTION to Dismiss <i>or, in the Alternative, for Summary Judgment on State Secrets Grounds</i> filed by Dennis P. Riordan. (Pulgram, Laurence) (Filed on 6/22/2007) (Entered: 06/22/2007)
06/22/2007	 6	Declaration of Candace J. Morey in Support of (315 in M:06-cv-01791-VRW) Memorandum in Opposition to <i>Motion to Dismiss or In the Alternative for Summary Judgment by the United States</i> filed by Dennis P. Riordan. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A-Z# 2 Exhibit AA-II# 3 Exhibit JJ-

		KK)(Morey, Candace) (Filed on 6/22/2007) (Entered: 06/22/2007)
06/23/2007	7	Memorandum in Opposition re (273 in M:06-cv-01791-VRW) MOTION to Dismiss <i>Plaintiffs' Master Consolidated Complaint</i> filed byElaine Spielfogel-Landis(on behalf of herself and all others similarly situated). (Himmelstein, Barry) (Filed on 6/23/2007) (Entered: 06/23/2007)
06/23/2007	8	Appendix re (6 in 3:07-cv-00464-VRW, 5 in 3:07-cv-01187-VRW, 7 in 3:06-cv-06254-VRW, 7 in 3:06-cv-05576-VRW, 5 in 3:06-cv-07934-VRW, 4 in 3:07-cv-02029-VRW, 5 in 3:06-cv-06434-VRW, 6 in 3:06-cv-05269-VRW, 67 in 3:06-cv-03596-VRW, 7 in 3:06-cv-06570-VRW, 13 in 3:06-cv-06224-VRW, 5 in 3:06-cv-06294-VRW, 70 in 3:06-cv-03574-VRW, 6 in 3:06-cv-05268-VRW, 12 in 3:06-cv-06387-VRW, 5 in 3:07-cv-01323-VRW, 7 in 3:06-cv-05066-VRW, 13 in 3:06-cv-06222-VRW, 5 in 3:06-cv-06435-VRW, 7 in 3:06-cv-05063-VRW, 7 in 3:06-cv-06253-VRW, 7 in 3:07-cv-01396-VRW, 7 in 3:07-cv-00693-VRW, 7 in 3:06-cv-06295-VRW, 8 in 3:06-cv-06313-VRW, 7 in 3:06-cv-05065-VRW, 7 in 3:06-cv-05067-VRW, 5 in 3:06-cv-05452-VRW, 6 in 3:06-cv-05340-VRW, 319 in M:06-cv-01791-VRW, 7 in 3:06-cv-05064-VRW, 32 in 3:06-cv-03467-VRW, 5 in 3:07-cv-01326-VRW, 9 in 3:07-cv-00109-VRW, 7 in 3:06-cv-06225-VRW, 5 in 3:07-cv-01242-VRW, 5 in 3:06-cv-06388-VRW, 13 in 3:07-cv-01324-VRW, 351 in 3:06-cv-00672-VRW, 6 in 3:06-cv-05267-VRW, 5 in 3:06-cv-06385-VRW, 6 in 3:06-cv-05341-VRW, 5 in 3:07-cv-01243-VRW, 8 in 3:06-cv-05485-VRW, 7 in 3:06-cv-05343-VRW, 4 in 3:06-cv-06924-VRW, 4 in 3:07-cv-02538-VRW, 14 in 3:06-cv-04221-VRW) Memorandum in Opposition, to <i>Verizon's Motion to Dismiss Master Complaint</i> filed byElaine Spielfogel-Landis(on behalf of herself and all others similarly situated). (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit Tabs 4-12# 2 Exhibit Tabs 13-20)(Himmelstein, Barry) (Filed on 6/23/2007) (Entered: 06/23/2007)
07/12/2007	9	STIPULATION and Order to Extend Deadlines for Motion to Dismiss and Related Briefing in <i>Shubert v. Bush, Case No. 07-693</i> by Sarah Dranoff, Hilary Botein, Virginia Shubert, Noha Arafa. (Maazel, Ilann) (Filed on 7/12/2007) (Entered: 07/12/2007)
07/13/2007	10	STIPULATION AND ORDER re 9 filed by Hilary Botein, Virginia Shubert, Sarah Dranoff, Noha Arafa. On or before 7/20/2007, Plaintiffs will file an opposition to the Government's dispositive motion in <i>Shubert v Bush, C07-0693</i> . On or before 8/16/2007, the Government will file a reply brief in support of its dispositive motion. Signed by Chief Judge Vaughn R Walker on 7/13/2007. (cgk, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 7/13/2007) (Entered: 07/13/2007)
07/19/2007	11	Memorandum in Opposition to <i>Defendants' Motion to Dismiss</i> filed bySarah Dranoff, Hilary Botein, Virginia Shubert, Noha Arafa. (Attachments: # 1 Part 2 of Plaintiffs' Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Motion to Dismiss)(Maazel, Ilann) (Filed on 7/19/2007) (Entered: 07/19/2007)
07/19/2007	12	AFFIDAVIT in Opposition <i>Declaration of Ilann M. Maazel Pursuant to Rule 56(f) in Opposition to Defendants' Motion to Dismiss or for Summary Judgment</i> filed bySarah Dranoff, Hilary Botein, Virginia Shubert, Noha Arafa. (Maazel, Ilann) (Filed on 7/19/2007) (Entered: 07/19/2007)

08/30/2007	 13	Minute Entry: Motions Hearing held on 8/30/2007 before Chief Judge Vaughn R Walker. PROCEEDINGS:1. Verizon's Motion to Dismiss for Lack of Personal Jurisdiction. 2. Verizon's Motion to Dismiss Complaint in Chulsky, Riordan and Bready. 3. Verizon's Motion to Dismiss Plaintiffs Master Complaint.4. United States' Motion to Dismiss Complaints on State Secrets Grounds (Chulsky, Riordan, Bready). 4. United States' Motion to Dismiss in Shubert. 5. United States' Motion to Intervene - granted. RESULTS:The Court heard argument from counsel. The Court took the matter(s) under-submission.Court to issue written ruling. (Court Reporter Kathy Powell.) (cgk, COURT STAFF) (Date Filed: 8/30/2007). (Entered: 09/04/2007) (Entered: 09/04/2007)
09/21/2007	 14	MOTION Plaintiffs' Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence; Plaintiffs' Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence filed by All Plaintiffs'. Motion Hearing set for 10/25/2007 02:00 PM in Courtroom 6, 17th Floor, San Francisco. (Cohn, Cindy) (Filed on 9/21/2007) (Entered: 09/21/2007)
09/21/2007	 15	Declaration of Cindy A. Cohn <i>in Support of 14 Plaintiffs' Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence</i> filed by All Plaintiffs'. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A# 2 Exhibit B# 3 Exhibit C)(Cohn, Cindy) (Filed on 9/21/2007) Modified on 10/1/2007 (gsa, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 09/21/2007)
09/21/2007	 16	Proposed Order [<i>Proposed</i>] <i>Interim Order to Preserve Evidence</i> by All Plaintiffs'. (Cohn, Cindy) (Filed on 9/21/2007) (Entered: 09/21/2007)
10/01/2007	 17	Cover sheet of TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings held on 8/30/2007 before Judge Vaughn R. Walker. Court Reporter: Katherine A. Powell. Complete transcript is in MDL 06-1791 VRW. (gsa, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 10/1/2007) (Entered: 10/02/2007)
10/03/2007	 18	MOTION to Amend/Correct 14 MOTION Plaintiffs' Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence; Plaintiffs' Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence filed by All Plaintiffs'. Motion Hearing set for 11/15/2007 02:00 PM in Courtroom 6, 17th Floor, San Francisco. (Cohn, Cindy) (Filed on 10/3/2007) (Entered: 10/03/2007)
10/25/2007	 19	Memorandum in Opposition re 14 MOTION Plaintiffs' Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence; Plaintiffs' Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence, 18 MOTION to Amend/Correct 14 MOTION Plaintiffs' Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence; Plaintiffs' Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence MOTION to Amend/Correct 14 MOTION Plaintiffs' Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence; Plaintiffs' Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence filed by George W. Bush, Michael V. Hayden, Keith B. Alexander, Alberto Gonzales, John Ashcroft. (Attachments: # 1 Affidavit Coppolino Declaration & Exhibits Thereto)(Haas, Alexander) (Filed on 10/25/2007) (Entered: 10/25/2007)
10/25/2007	 20	NOTICE by George W. Bush, Michael V. Hayden, Keith B. Alexander, Alberto Gonzales, John Ashcroft re 19 Memorandum in Opposition,,, of

		<i>Lodging of Classified Supplement & accompanying Declaration</i> (Haas, Alexander) (Filed on 10/25/2007) (Entered: 10/25/2007)
11/02/2007	21	RESPONSE in Support re 14 MOTION Plaintiffs' Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence; Plaintiffs' Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence filed by All Plaintiffs'. (Cohn, Cindy) (Filed on 11/2/2007) (Entered: 11/02/2007)
11/06/2007		(Court only) ***Motions terminated: (18 in 3:07-cv-00693-VRW) MOTION to Amend/Correct (14) MOTION Plaintiffs' Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence. (gsa, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 11/6/2007) Modified on 9/8/2008 (cgk, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 11/06/2007)
11/06/2007		(Court only) ***Motions terminated: 14 MOTION Plaintiffs' Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence; Plaintiffs' Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence filed by All Plaintiffs'. (cgk, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 11/6/2007) (Entered: 05/07/2008)
12/14/2007	22	NOTICE by George W. Bush, Michael V. Hayden, Keith B. Alexander, Alberto Gonzales, John Ashcroft of <i>Manual Filing</i> (Haas, Alexander) (Filed on 12/14/2007) (Entered: 12/14/2007)
03/25/2008	23	REVISED PRACTICE AND PROCEDURE ORDER re (370 in M:06-cv-01791-VRW) Order filed September 10, 2007 signed by Judge Vaughn R Walker on 3-24-08. (vrwlc3, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 3/25/2008) (Entered: 03/25/2008)
11/06/2008	24	Transcript of Proceedings held on 9-12-2008, before Judge Vaughn R. Walker. Court Reporter/Transcriber Debra L. Pas, Telephone number (415) 431-1477. Per General Order No. 59 and Judicial Conference policy, this transcript may be viewed only at the Clerks Office public terminal or may be purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber until the deadline for the Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Any Notice of Intent to Request Redaction, if required, is due no later than 5 business days from date of this filing. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 2/2/2009. (Pas, Debra) (Filed on 11/6/2008) (Entered: 11/06/2008)
05/05/2009	25	Letter from Ilann M. Maazel to Judge Vaughn R. Walker re 9th circuit authority. (Maazel, Ilann) (Filed on 5/5/2009) (Entered: 05/05/2009)
05/14/2009	26	ORDER re 25 Letter filed by Hilary Botein, Virginia Shubert, Sarah Dranoff, Noha Arafa. Signed by Judge Vaughn R Walker on 5/14/2009. (vrwlc3, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 5/14/2009) (Entered: 05/14/2009)
07/31/2009	27	CASE MANAGEMENT STATEMENT <i>Joint Request to Schedule Case Management Conference</i> filed by United States of America. (Coppolino, Anthony) (Filed on 7/31/2009) (Entered: 07/31/2009)
07/31/2009	29	ERRONEOUS DOCKET ENTRY - Please ignore NOTICE OF APPEAL. Filing fee \$ 455. (Attachments: # 1 2nd part of Notice of Appeal)(gsa, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 7/31/2009) Modified on

		8/7/2009 (gsa, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 08/05/2009)
08/05/2009	28	CLERKS NOTICE : PER COUNSEL'S REQUEST, Case Management Conference has been scheduled in this case for September 3, 2009 at 3:30 p.m. Parties joint case management statement shall be due one week prior to the conference. Counsel for the plaintiffs and the defendants has been granted leave to appear telephonically. The clerk shall initiate the call. Parties requesting a continuance shall submit a stipulation and proposed order. If parties are unable to reach a stipulation, the requesting party shall submit an exparte application with a proposed order. Case Management Conference set for 9/3/2009 03:30 PM. Case Management Statement due by 8/27/2009. (cgk, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 8/5/2009) (Entered: 08/05/2009)
08/27/2009	30	CASE MANAGEMENT STATEMENT <i>Joint Case Management Statement</i> filed by United States of America. (Coppolino, Anthony) (Filed on 8/27/2009) (Entered: 08/27/2009)
09/03/2009	29	Set/Reset Hearings: Case Management Conference reset for 9/10/2009 03:30 PM. (cgk, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 9/3/2009) (Entered: 09/08/2009)
09/10/2009	31	Minute Entry: Case Management Conference (Telephonic) held on 9/10/2009 before Chief Judge Vaughn R Walker. Attorneys : For Plaintiff (s): Ilann Maazel (by phone). Cindy Cohn. For Defendant(s): Anthony Coppolino (by phone). James Whitman (phone). Govt to File Motion: 10/8/2009. Opposition: 11/5/2009. Reply: 11/19/2009. Hearing: 12/15/2009 at 10:00 AM. (Court Reporter not reported.) (cgk, COURT STAFF) (Date Filed: 9/10/2009) (Entered: 09/16/2009)
10/02/2009	32	STIPULATION <i>to Extend Time to Renew Motion to Dismiss and For Summary Judgment</i> by United States of America. (Ahern, Paul) (Filed on 10/2/2009) (Entered: 10/02/2009)
10/07/2009	33	STIPULATION AND ORDER granting doc 32 in C07-0693 Shubert v Bush filed by United States of America. The government defendants' renewed motion to dismiss and for summary judgment shall be filed no later than 10/20/2009. The plaintiffs' opposition to that motion shall be filed no later than 11/24/2009. Reply shall be filed no later than 12/4/2009. The hearing shall remain set for 12/15/2009 at 10:00 AM. Signed by Judge Vaughn R Walker on 10/7/2009. (cgk, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 10/7/2009) (Entered: 10/07/2009)
10/16/2009	34	STIPULATION (<i>Second</i>) <i>to Extend Time to Renew Motion to Dismiss and for Summary Judgment</i> by United States of America. (Attachments: # 1 Proposed Order, # 2 Exhibit 1)(Ahern, Paul) (Filed on 10/16/2009) (Entered: 10/16/2009)
10/22/2009	35	STIPULATION AND ORDER re 34 Stipulation filed by United States of America. Govt to file motion no later than 10/27/2009. Opposition due no later than 12/2/2009. Reply due no later than 12/8/2009. Hearing on Govt Defendants motion to dismiss and for summary judgment 12/15/2009 at 10:00 AM. Signed by Judge Vaughn R Walker on 10/21/2009. (cgk,

		COURT STAFF) (Filed on 10/22/2009) (Entered: 10/22/2009)
10/26/2009	36	STIPULATION (<i>Third</i>) to Extend Time to Renew Motion to Dismiss and for Summary Judgment by United States of America. (Attachments: # 1 Proposed Order)(Ahern, Paul) (Filed on 10/26/2009) (Entered: 10/26/2009)
10/29/2009	37	STIPULATION AND ORDER. Government's motion due 10/30/09; plaintiffs' opposition due 12/04/09; reply due 12/08/09; hearing 12/15/09 at 10:00 am. Signed by Judge Vaughn R Walker on 10/28/09. (vrwlc3, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 10/29/2009) (Entered: 10/29/2009)
10/30/2009	38	MOTION to Dismiss <i>and for Summary Judgment</i> filed by United States of America. Motion Hearing set for 12/15/2009 10:00 AM in Courtroom 6, 17th Floor, San Francisco. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1, Public Declaration of Dennis C. Blair, Director of National Intelligence, # 2 Exhibit 2, Public Declaration of Keith B. Alexander, Director of the National Security Agency, # 3 Exhibit 3, Policies and Procedures Governing Invocation of the State Secrets Privilege)(Ahern, Paul) (Filed on 10/30/2009) (Entered: 10/30/2009)
10/30/2009	39	NOTICE by United States of America re 38 MOTION to Dismiss <i>and for Summary Judgment of Lodging of In Camera, Ex Parte Classified Declaration of Dennis C. Blair, Director of National Intelligence</i> (Ahern, Paul) (Filed on 10/30/2009) (Entered: 10/30/2009)
10/30/2009	40	NOTICE by United States of America re 38 MOTION to Dismiss <i>and for Summary Judgment of Lodging of In Camera, Ex Parte Classified Declaration of Lieutenant General Keith B. Alexander, Director of the National Security Agency</i> (Ahern, Paul) (Filed on 10/30/2009) (Entered: 10/30/2009)
10/30/2009	41	NOTICE by United States of America re 38 MOTION to Dismiss <i>and for Summary Judgment of Lodging of In Camera, Ex Parte Classified Supplemental Memorandum of Points and Authorities</i> (Ahern, Paul) (Filed on 10/30/2009) (Entered: 10/30/2009)
11/03/2009	42	STIPULATION AND ORDER re doc 36 THIRD STIPULATION TO EXTEND TIME TO FILE RENEWED MOTION TO DISMISS AND FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT filed by United States of America. Signed by Judge Vaughn R Walker on 11/2/2009. (cgk, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 11/3/2009) (Entered: 11/03/2009)
11/20/2009		NOTICE of Hearing on Motion : The 12/15/2009 hearing on the United States' motion to dismiss and for summary judgment, doc #38 has been moved from 10:00 AM to 02:00 PM in Courtroom 6, 17th Floor, San Francisco. (cgk, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 11/20/2009) (Entered: 11/20/2009)
12/03/2009	43	Memorandum in Opposition re 38 MOTION to Dismiss <i>and for Summary Judgment</i> filed by Noha Arafa, Hilary Botein, Sarah Dranoff, Virginia Shubert. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A, # 2 Exhibit B, # 3 Exhibit C, # 4 Exhibit D, # 5 Exhibit E)(Maazel, Ilann) (Filed on 12/3/2009) (Entered: 12/03/2009)

12/08/2009	 44	Reply Memorandum re 38 MOTION to Dismiss <i>and for Summary Judgment</i> filed by United States of America. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1)(Ahern, Paul) (Filed on 12/8/2009) (Entered: 12/08/2009)
12/15/2009	 45	Minute Entry: Motion Hearing held on 12/15/2009 before Chief Judge Vaughn R Walker re doc 38 MOTION to Dismiss and for Summary Judgment filed by United States of America ; the court submitted the matter, the court to issue order. (Court Reporter Jim Yeomans.) (cgk, COURT STAFF) (Date Filed: 12/15/2009) (Entered: 12/16/2009)
01/21/2010	 46	ORDER by Judge Vaughn R. Walker granting (680) Motion to Dismiss in case M:06-cv-01791-VRW; granting (38) Motion to Dismiss in case 3:07-cv-00693-VRW; granting Motion to Dismiss in 3:08-cv-4373 VRW. (Attachments: # 1 Appendix) (hlk, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 1/21/2010) (Entered: 01/21/2010)
01/21/2010		(Court only) ***Civil Case Terminated. (slh, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 1/21/2010) (Entered: 01/22/2010)
01/25/2010	 47	JUDGMENT. IT IS ORDERED AND ADJUDGED that in accordance with the Court's January 21, 2010 Order, judgment is hereby entered in member case Shubert et al v Bush et al, No C 07-0693 in favor of defendants and against plaintiffs. (cgk, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 1/25/2010) (Entered: 01/25/2010)
02/04/2010	 48	ORDER re (Doc #46 in 3:07-cv-00693-VRW, Doc #703 in M:06-cv-01791-VRW) 1/21/2010 Order on Motion to Dismiss. Signed by Judge Vaughn R. Walker on 2/4/2010. (hlk, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 2/4/2010) (Entered: 02/04/2010)
03/19/2010	 49	NOTICE OF APPEAL as to (46 in 3:07-cv-00693-VRW) Order on Motion to Dismiss (47 in 3:07-cv-00693-VRW) Judgment by Virginia Shubert. Appeal Fee \$455, Receipt Number 34611043712. (far, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 3/19/2010) (Entered: 03/22/2010)